# Analysis and Experiments on LSB-Based and ATD Steganographic Methods for Gray Scale and Color Images 

Hajer Ahmed Alaswed

Submitted to the<br>Institute of Graduate Studies and Research in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Science<br>in<br>Computer Engineering

Approval of the Institute of Graduate Studies and Research

Prof. Dr. Mustafa Tümer<br>Director

I certify that this thesis satisfies the requirements as thesis for the degree of Master of Science in Computer Engineering.

Prof. Dr. Ișık Aybay<br>Chair, Department of Computer Engineering

We certify that we have read this thesis and that in our opinion it is fully adequate in scope and quality as a thesis for the degree of Master of Science in Computer Engineering.

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alexander Chefranov

Co-Supervisor

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Gürcü Öz<br>Supervisor

Examining Committee

1. Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alexander Chefranov
2. Assoc. Prof. Dr. Gürcü Öz
3. Asst. Prof. Dr. Adnan Acan
4. Asst. Prof. Dr. Yiltan Bitirim
5. Asst. Prof. Dr. Ahmet Ünveren


#### Abstract

The aim of this thesis is the analysis and experiments on steganographic methods for gray scale and color images and study of quality measures of the stego-images. For gray images, the Algorithm with Ternary Digits (ATD) and Least Significant Bits with Threshold (LSBT) are explained in detail. In the existing studies, for LSBT algorithm, some information is not provided such as how to set the values of threshold, $T$, and two moduli, $m u, m l$. Moreover, our analysis proves that LSBT encounters problems when the value of a pixel is close to the threshold value, $T$. In the study, LSBT problems are resolved by imposing constraints on the threshold and moduli values. Known results are displayed as Peak Signal to Noise Ratio (PSNR) for different values of embedding capacity, without presenting the formula for threshold; hence, the threshold is formalized herein as a function of embedding capacity.


In ATD, the main idea is embedding a secret message (in each pixel, embedding two ternary digits) as a ternary numbers. In LSBT, the embedding capacity of each pixel is determined by comparing the pixel value versus the threshold, $T$ : if the pixel value is greater than or equal to T , then floor $\left(\log _{2} m u\right)$, otherwise $f l o o r\left(\log _{2} m l\right)$ is used as embedding capacity. According to our analysis, PSNR of LSBDT is greater than that of ATD when the embedding capacity is less than or equal to 3 BPP.

For color images, LSB and ATD are implemented for different color combinations of 8 BPP embedding capacity. According to our experiments, PSNR of LSB for color images had fluctuations in different combinations with the same embedding capacity

8 BPP while the PSNR of ATD was stable in different combinations. However, the value of WMSNR ( $1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3$ ) for LSB with different combinations looked invariant for different combinations when compared with other weights. For LSB algorithm when comparison between different metrics is made by deviation evaluation of the metrics, the best metric for LSB algorithm is found as WMSNR $(1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3)$, with the minimal deviation value 0.211 . And the maximal deviation is obtained for WPSNR $(0.4,0.243,0.357)$ corresponding to the human eye color perception. Thus, human color perception-originated weights are not appropriate for the images assessment.

Keywords: Steganography, Algorithm with Ternary Digits (ATD), Least Significant Bit with Threshold Algorithm (LSBT), Gray Scale Image, Color Image, Embedding Capacity, Image Quality Metrics, Peak Signal-to-Noise Ratio (PSNR).

## ÖZ

Bu tezin amacı, gri tonlamalı ve renkli görüntüler için stenografik yöntemler kullanarak analiz ve deneyler yapmak ve stego görüntülerinin kalite ölçümlerini incelemektir. Burada gri görrüntüler, üç basamaklı algoritma (ATD) ve eşiğe sahip en az anlamlı bitler (LSBT) detaylı olarak açıklanmıştır. LSBT algoritmaları için mevcut araştırmalarda, eşik değeri $T$ ve iki modül olan $m u$ ve $m l$ değerlerinin nasıl ayarlandığı gibi bazı bilgiler verilmemiştir. Ayrıca, analizimiz bir pikselin değeri eşik değerine ( $T$ ) yakın olduğunda, LSBT'nin sorunlarla karşılaştığını kanıtlıyor. Çalışmadaki, LSBT problemleri, eşik ve modül değerlerine kısıtlamalar getirerek çözüldü. Bilinen sonuçlar, gömme kapasitesinin farklı değerleri kullanılarak eşik için formül sunmadan tepe sinyal-gürültü oranı (PSNR) olarak biçimlendirilmiştir. Bu çalışmada eşik, gömme kapasitesinin bir fonksiyonu olarak biçimlendirilir.

ATD'de temel fikir, üç rakamlı olarak gizli bir mesaj gömmektir (her pikselde, iki üçer sayı gömülüdür). LSBT'de her pikselin gömme kapasitesi, piksel değeri eşik ( $T$ ) ile karşılaştırılarak belirlenir: Eğer piksel değeri $T$ 'den fazla veya eşit ise, gömme kapasitesi olarak floor $\left(\log _{2} m u\right)$, değilse floor $\left(\log _{2} m l\right)$, kullanılır. Bizim analizlerimize göre gömme kapasitesi 3 BPP'den daha az veya eşit ise, LSBDT'nin PSNR değeri ATD'den fazladır.

Renkli görüntülerde LSB ve ATD uygulanırken 8 BPP yerleştirme kapasitesinin farklı renk kombinasyonları kullanıldı. Deneyimlerimize dayanarak, renkli görüntüler için LSB'nin PSNR'si, aynı gömme kapasitesi 8 BPP olan farklı kombinasyonlarda dalgalanma göstermekteyken, ATD'nin PSNR'ı fark1ı
kombinasyonlarda sabit kalmıştır. Bununla birlikte LSB için WMSNR değeri (1/3, 1/3, 1/3), kombinasyonları ile birlikte farklı kombinasyonlara baktığımızda, diğer ağırlklara kıyasla farklı kombinasyonlar için değişmez görünüyordu. LSB algoritması için farklı metrikler arasındaki karşılaştırma, metrikler için sapma değerlendirmesiyle yapılması durumunda, LSB algoritması için minimum sapma değeri 0.211 olan en iyi metrik olarak WMSNR ( $1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3$ ) elde edildi. Yapılan deney sonuçlarına göre en fazla sapma, insan göz rengi algısına karşılık gelen $\operatorname{WPSNR}(0.4,0.243,0.357)$ değerlerinde saptandı. Çıkan sonuçlardan, insan renk algılamasına dayalı ağırlıkların görüntü değerlendirmesi için uygun olmadığı saptandı.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Steganografi, Üç Basamaklı Algoritma (ATD), En Az Önemli Bit Eşik Algoritması (LSBT), Gri Ölçekli Görüntü, Renkli Görüntü, Gömme Kapasitesi, Görüntü Kaliteli Metrikleri, Tepe Sinyal -Gürültü Oranı(PSNR).

## DEDICATION

## To my beloved husband, Ahmed.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENT

First of all, I thank Allah so much for giving me the strength and potential to finish my Master. Secondly, I would like to express my special appreciation and thanks to my beloved husband for his love and support throughout my life. Also, I would like to thank my supervisors Assoc. Prof. Dr. Alexander Chefranov, and Assoc. Prof. Dr. Gürcü̈ Öz for their guidance and support throughout this study.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ..... iii
ÖZ ..... vi
DEDICATION ..... viii
ACKNOWLEDGMENT ..... ix
LIST OF TABLES ..... xiv
LIST OF FIGURES ..... xiii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS ..... xviii
1 INTRODUCTION .....  1
2 RELATED WORK AND PROBLEM DEFINITION .....  .5
2.1 Overview of Steganography ..... 5
2.2 Categories of Steganography .....  .5
2.3 Methods of Steganography .....  6
2.3.1 Survey of Frequency Domain Methods ..... 6
2.3.2 Survey of Spatial Domain Methods .....  9
2.3.3 LSB Method ..... 13
2.3.4 Algorithm with Ternary Digits (ATD) ..... 16
2.3.5 LSB with Threshold Algorithm (LSBT) ..... 29
2.4 Color Perception ..... 40
2.5 Known Metrics for Evaluating Quality of Stego Images ..... 41
2.6 Known Experiments Setups and Results ..... 42
2.7 Problem Definition ..... 44
2.8 Summary of Chapter 2 ..... 46
3 ATD AND LSBT ANALYSIS AND RECOVERED PROBLEMS FIXING ..... 47
3.1 Proof of ATD Correctness ..... 47
3.2 LSBT problems fixing and Proof of fixed LSBT Correctness ..... 49
3.3 Summary of Chapter 3 ..... 61
4 IMPLEMENTATION OF ATD and LSBT-M ALGORITHMS FOR GRAY
SCALE IMAGES ..... 62
4.1 ATD Implementation ..... 62
4.2 LSBT-M Implementation ..... 65
4.3 Summary of Chapter 4 ..... 69
5 IMPLEMENTATION OF ATD AND LSB ALGORITHMS FOR COLOR
IMAGES ..... 70
5.1 LSB Implementation ..... 70
5.1.1 Traditional LSB with Different Combinations ..... 70
5.1.2 Adaptive LSB (ALSB) Implementation ..... 73
5.2 ATD Implementation ..... 74
5.3 Summary of Chapter 5 ..... 75
6 EXPERIMENTS RESULTS ..... 76
6.1 Gray Scale Images Results for ATD, LSBCT, and LSBDT ..... 76
6.1.1 ATD Results ..... 77
6.1.2 LSBCT Results ..... 79
6.1.3 LSBDT Results ..... 81
6.1.4 ATD, LSBDT, and LSBCT Comparison Results ..... 84
6.1.5 Comparison Versus Known Experiments Results ..... 86
6.2 Results for Color Scale Images ..... 86
6.2.1 LSB and ALSBmax, ALSBmin Results ..... 86
6.2.2 ATD Results ..... 89
6.2.3 ATD and LSB Comparison Results ..... 91
6.2.4 Comparison Versus Known Experiments Results ..... 92
6.3 Study of the Quality Metrics ..... 92
6.3.1 MSNR and APSNR for Gray Scale Images ..... 93
6.3.2 MSNR and APSNR for Color Scale images ..... 98
6.3.3 Evaluation of Different Metrics ..... 105
6.4 Performance of ATD and LSB for Color Scale Images Depending on the
Embedding Capacity ..... 108
6.5 Summary of Chapter 6 ..... 109
7 CONCLUSION AND FUTURE WORK ..... 111
REFERENCES ..... 114
APPENDICES ..... 119
Appendix A ..... 120
Appendix B ..... 133
Appendix C. ..... 143
Appendix D ..... 149
Appendix E ..... 172
Appendix F ..... 183

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1: PSNR (dB) of LSBT and ATD [28] for Random Secret Message with
Embedding Capacity 3.1699 BPP for 8 Cover Images Figure 2.16 ..... 43
Table 2.2: LSB PSNR (dB) and MSE for LSB [24]. ..... 44
Table 4.1: ATD Results for Lena Image ..... 64
Table 4.2: LSBDT Implementation for Baboon Image ..... 68
Table 4.3: LSBCT Implementation for Baboon Image; $T=160$ ..... 68
Table 6.1: PSNR of ATD ..... 78
Table 6.2: PSNR for LSBCT Algorithm ..... 80
Table 6.3: PSNR for LSBDT Algorithm ..... 83
Table 6.4: PSNR (dB) for LSBCT ( $T=160$ ), LSBDT, and ATD Dependence on $E C$ (BPP) ..... 85
Table 6.5: PSNR (dB) for LSB in Different Combinations and ALSBmax, ALSBmin
$\ldots$ ..... 88
Table 6.6: PSNR (dB) for ATD for Different Combinations Results ..... 90
Table 6.7: MSNR (dB) for LSB and ALSB Methods Results ..... 100
Table 6.8: MSNR (dB) for ATD for Different Combinations ..... 102
Table 6.9: Deviation of Results in Each Criterion Measure for LSB Algorithm ..... 106
Table 6.10: Deviation of Results in Each Criterion Measure for ATD Algorithm . ..... 107

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1: Flowchart of the Thesis Study .....  4
Figure 2.1: Flowchart of the LSB Embedding Algorithm ..... 14
Figure 2.2: Flowchart of the LSB Extraction Algorithm ..... 15
Figure 2.3: Flowchart of the ATD Embedding Algorithm ..... 19
Figure 2.4: Flowchart of Check sub1ij Part of the ATD Embedding Algorithm ..... 20
Figure 2.5: Flowchart of Check sub2ij Part of the ATD Embedding Algorithm ..... 21
Figure 2.6: Flowchart of Embedding $S k$ in sub1ij` Part of the ATD Embedding
Algorithm ..... 21
Figure 2.7: Flowchart of Embedding $S k$ in $v i j$ Part of the ATD Embedding
Algorithm ..... 22
Figure 2.8: Flowchart of ATD Extraction Algorithm. ..... 23
Figure 2.9: Flowchart for LSBT Embedding Algorithm ..... 31
Figure 2.10: Flowchart of Embedding Algorithm Below Threshold Part of LSBT. ..... 32
Figure 2.11: Flowchart of Embedding Algorithm Above Threshold of LSBT ..... 33
Figure 2.12: Flowchart of Case. 1 in Figures 2.10, 2.11 ..... 33
Figure 2.13: Flowchart of Case. 2 in Figures 2.10, 2.11 ..... 34
Figure 2.14: Flowchart for LSBT the Extraction Algorithm ..... 35
Figure 2.15: The Color Matching Experiment for RGB [20]. ..... 40
Figure 2.16: Cover Images Used in [28] ..... 42
Figure 2.17: PSNR Values (dB) for ATD and LSBT Obtained in [28] for RandomSecret Messages of Different Sizes and Averaged Over 8 Cover Images from Figure
$\qquad$
Figure 2.18: Cover Images Used in [24] ..... 44
Figure 4.1: Lena Cover Image and Stego Image for ATD Implementation withSecret
Message Size 644288 bits, Appendix A. 6 ..... 64
Figure 4.2: Baboon Cover Image and Stego Image for LSBDT Implementation ..... 67
Figure 5.1: Lena Cover Image and Stego Image for LSB with Combination (134)
Implementation Appendix D. 9 ..... 72
Figure 5.2: Quality Measures for Lena Image After Secret Message Embedding by LSB for Combination (134) ..... 72
Figure 5.3: Quality Measures for ALSBmin for Lena Image ..... 74
Figure 5.4: ATD Quality Measures for Lena Cover Image ..... 75
Figure 6.1: Gray Scale Cover Images Used in ATD, LSBCT, and LSBDT Simulation76
Figure 6.2: Flowchart for Gray Scale Simulation Steps ..... 77
Figure 6.3: Average PSNR of ATD ..... 78
Figure 6.4: Average PSNR for LSBCT ..... 81
Figure 6.5: Average PSNR for LSBDT ..... 84
Figure 6.6: PSNR (dB) for ATD and LSBCT $(\mathrm{T}=160)$ and LSBDT Dependence on
EC (BPP) ..... 85
Figure 6.7: Cover Images Used for Experiments with ATD and LSB ..... 87
Figure 6.8: Flowchart for Color Scale Simulation Steps ..... 87
Figure 6.9: PSNR for LSB for Different Combinations and ALSBmax, ALSBmin ..... 88
Figure 6.10: SNR for LSB for Different Combinations and ALSBmax, ALSBmin ..... 89
Figure 6.11: PSNR for ATD for Different Combinations ..... 90
Figure 6.12: SNR for ATD in Different Combinations ..... 91
Figure 6.13: PSNR for ATD and LSB ..... 91
Figure 6.14: SNR (dB) for ATD and LSB ..... 92
Figure 6.15: APSNR (dB) of ATD ..... 94
Figure 6.16: MSNR (dB) of ATD ..... 94
Figure 6.17: APSNR (dB) for LSBCT ..... 95
Figure 6.18: MSNR (dB) for LSBCT ..... 95
Figure 6.19: APSNR (dB) for LSBDT ..... 96
Figure 6.20: MSNR (dB) for LSBDT ..... 96
Figure 6.21: APSNR (dB) for ATD and LSBCT and LSBDT ..... 97
Figure 6.22: MSNR (dB) for ATD and LSBCT and LSBDT ..... 97
Figure 6.23: Weighed PSNR (dB) by $(0.4,0.243$, and 0.357$)$ for LSB for Different
Embedding Combinations ..... 98
Figure 6.24: Weighed PSNR (dB) by $(0.4,0.3,0.3)$ for LSB for Different
Embedding Combinations ..... 99
Figure 6.25: Weighed PSNR (dB) by $(1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3)$ for LSB for Different Embedding Combinations and ALSBmax, ALSBmin ..... 99
Figure 6.26: MSNR (dB) for LSB for Different Embedding Combinations and
ALSBmax, ALSBmin ..... 100
Figure 6.27: Weighed MSNR (dB) by ( $0.4,0.3$, and 0.3 ) for LSB for Different
Embedding Combinations and ALSBmax, ALSBmin ..... 101
Figure 6.28: Weighed MSNR (dB) by ( $0.4,0.243$, and 0.357 ) for LSB for Different
Embedding Combinations and ALSBmax, ALSBmin ..... 101
Figure 6.29: Weighed MSNR (dB) by ( $1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3$ ) for LSB for Different
Embedding Combinations and ALSBmax, ALSBmin ..... 101
Figure 6.30: MSNR (dB) for ATD for Different Embedding Combinations ..... 103
Figure 6.31: WPSNR (dB) for ATD and LSB with Different Weights (0.4, 0.243,
$0.357),(0.4,0.3,0.3)$, and ( $1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3$ ) ..... 104

Figure 6.32: MSNR (dB) for ATD and LSB.......................................................... 104
Figure 6.33: WMSNR (dB) for ATD and LSB with Different Weights (0.4, 0.243, $0.357),(0.4,0.3,0.3)$, and (1/3,1/3,1/3)................................................................ 105

Figure 6.34: Deviation of Results in Each Criterion Measure for LSB Algorithm.. 106 Figure 6.35: Deviation of Results in Each Criterion Measure for LSB Algorithm.. 108 Figure 3.36: WAPSNR (dB) Dependence on Embedding Capacity for LSB and ATD. 109

Figure A.1: Cover Images Used in Gray Scale Images. ......................................... 120
Figure D.1: Color Cover Images Used. ................................................................. 149

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

| ATD | Algorithm with Ternary Digits |
| :--- | :--- |
| AC | Average Color |
| ALSBmax | Adaptive Least Significant Bit max |
| ALSBmin | Adaptive Least Significant Bit min |
| APSNR | Actual Peak Signal to Noise Ratio |
| BPP | Bit Per Pixel |
| C-TDH | Coded Ternary Data Hiding |
| DWT | Discrete Wavelet Transform |
| DCT | Discrete Cosine Transform |
| ETLSM | Extended Table Lookup Substitution |
| EC | Fast Fourier Transform |
| FFT | (Hue, Saturation, Value) |
| HSV | Improved Rightmost Digit Replacement |
| IRMDR | Integer Wavelength Transform |
| IWT | Least Significant Bit Signal to Noise Ratio |
| LSB | Least Significant Bit with Threshold Significant Bit with Constant Threshold |
| LSBT | Meast Significant Bit with Threshold Modified |
| LSBT-M | LSearicant Bit with Dynamic Threshold |
| LSBCT | LSBDT |


| PPM | Pixel Pair Matching |
| :--- | :--- |
| PBPVD | Parity Bit Pixel Value Differencing |
| RGB | (Red, Green, Blue) |
| SNR | Signal to Noise Ratio |
| SMVQ | Side Match Vector Quantization |
| TLSM | Table Lookup Substitution |
| TDH | Ternary Data Hiding |
| WPSNR | Weighted Peak Signal to Noise Ratio |
| WAPSNR | Weighted Mean Signal to Noise Ratio |
| WMSNR |  |

## Chapter 1

## INTRODUCTION

Steganography is an art of embedding information in other media files for example text, image, etc, where the embedding information will not be discovered [2], There are basically two types of techniques in the Steganography: spatial domain and frequency domain. In the spatial domain, the actual values are impacted to embed the secret information while in frequency domain, the cover object is converted to the frequency domain by Discrete Wavelet Transform (DWT) and then the secret information is embedded [3].

In this thesis, we consider three steganographic schemes in the spatial domain, Algorithm with Ternary Digits (ATD) [28] [18], Least Significant Bit (LSB) [10] [27], and LSB with Threshold (LSBT) [26] [9] in the gray and the color scale images. In [28], in ATD, the secret message is divided to non-overlapping pixel blocks, then that it is converted to the ternary number with digits from $\{0,1,2\}$. In each pixel of cover image, two ternary digits are embedded by converting the pixel of the cover image to binary ( 8 bits) and dividing it to two sub-segments and embedding one ternary digit in each sub-segment. In the embedding phase, a secret digit is compared versus (the value of sub segment modulo 3 ); if the result is equal to the secret ternary digit then sub segment is not modified, otherwise it is increased or decreased by one.

LSBT [26], uses the threshold value, $T$, and two moduli numbers (modulus upper, $m u$, modulus lower, $m l$ ). In the embedding phase, the pixel value of cover image is compared with the threshold value $T$. If it is larger than or equal to the threshold, $m u$ is used, otherwise $m l$ is used. The number of bits embedded in each pixel is determined according to value, Ec, and the secret message is divided into blocks according to the value, $E c$, where $1 \leq E c \leq 8$; it gives better results when $E c<4$.

Experiments are conducted on ATD and LSBT with quality metrics Peak Signal to Noise Ratio (PSNR) [28], but they do not provide the proofs for the methods (LSBT and ATD). Also, sufficient information for their implementation in both algorithms (LSBT and ATD) such as how to select the value of the threshold $T$ and the values of $m u$ and $m l$ is not provided. Therefore, in this thesis, we provide the proofs for the methods (LSBT and ATD), and we fix the recovered problem with LSBT when the value of the pixel of cover image is close to the threshold value $T$ by imposing constraints on the threshold and moduli values. Also, we propose dynamic threshold modification, LSBDT, where threshold is defined according to the embedding capacity, measured in Bit Per Pixel (BPP), to have results compatible with those presented in [28]. Furthermore, for LSBT we determine the value of two moduli and extend ATD to work on the color scale images. We found that PSNR shows large variance for the same embedding capacity depending on the bits distribution across a pixel. Hence, we propose and implement new quality criteria MSNR and APSNR which show significantly lower variance and find the best of them.

For gray scale images, experiments are conducted with the cover images of the size
$512 \times 512$ pixels and random secret messages; the size of secret messages starts from (512*512*2) bits and increases by 30000 bits in each iteration. In every iteration, the values of PSNR are recorded. The comparison between three methods were considered: ATD, LSBCT, LSBDT. When embedding up to 3 BPP the LSBDT achieves a high value of PSNR 43 dB whereas ATD achieves 39 dB . However, when increasing the embedding capacity more than 3 BPP the PSNR of LSBDT drops sharply; it was 39 dB in 3 BPP then it slumps to 35 dB in 3.2 BPP while PSNR of ATD decreases slightly until 37 dB .

For color images, experiments are conducted with the cover image of the size $512 \times 512$ pixels and the constant size secret message. In this case, we implement LSB with different embedding combinations, (224, 242, 422, 134, 143, 314, 341, 413, 431), each of them representing 8 bits embedding in each pixel, for example, combination 134 means embedding one bit in Red, three bits in Green, and four bits in Blue color component of a pixel. Also, we modify LSB to adaptive LSB (ALSBmax, ALSBmin) and we extend ATD to work with color images which is implemented for different combinations $(112,211,121)$ as four ternary digits embedded in each pixel (8 bits in each pixel). For example, combination 112 means embedding one ternary digit in Red, one ternary digit in Green, and two ternary digits in Blue color component of a pixel. According to our results for color images, for the same embedding capacity in the different combinations, we get a fluctuating value of PSNR for LSB, therefore we have studied the quality metrics and improved PSNR by introducing new metrics, MSNR and APSNR. Also, we weighted PSNR, MSNR, and APSNR by three different groups of weighs $\left(R_{w}=0.4, G_{w}=0.3\right.$, $\left.B_{w}=0.3\right),\left(R_{w}=0.4, G_{w}=0.243, B_{w}=0.357\right)$, and $\left(R_{w}=1 / 3, G_{w}=1 / 3, B_{w}=1 / 3\right)$
where $R_{w}, G_{w}$, and $B_{w}$ are weights of Red, Green, and Blue, respectively. We have tested new metrics, MSNR, APSNR, on the color and gray scale images.

The thesis research is organized as shown in Figure 1.1. Chapter 2 discusses related work and introduces LSB, ATD, and LSBT methods, and the problem definition. In Chapter 3, ATD and LSBT are analyzed, problems for LSBT are recovered by building counterexamples, and fixed. Design and Implementation of ATD and LSBT-based methods on gray scale images are shown in Chapter 4. Design and implementation of ATD-based and LSB-based methods on color images are shown in Chapter 5. Chapter 6 shows results of experiments on the above methods and compares them with the known experiments results. Chapter 7 concludes the thesis.


Figure 1.1: Flowchart of the Thesis Study

## Chapter 2

## RELATED WORK AND PROBLEM DEFINITION

### 2.1 Overview of Steganography

Nowadays, with the recent developments in electronic computer and its intrusion into our daily life, the need for private communication has increased. We use various techniques to provide secrecy in communication. One of such techniques is steganography; steganography is used to protect important data from unauthorized user by hiding secret data into other media files like text, image, etc. Steganography is a combination of two words, the first word "stegano" means the "cover", and the second word "graphic" means "writing", they are both Greek words [1].

### 2.2 Categories of Steganography

There are different categories of steganography; these categories can be split to five broad categories as the following [16]:

- Text Steganography

This is the most popular technique of steganography, it is done by embedding secret data in text, by modifying the spacing between the words and line [16].

- Image Steganography

In this technique, the secret data is embedded in an image. This image can be a color scale image, gray scale image or binary image. Color scale image has large space for embedding secret data therefore color scale image Steganography is more popular than gray scale image in Steganography. Color scale images can be represented in different formats such as RGB (Red, Green, Blue), HSV (Hue, Saturation, Value)
[3].

## - Audio Steganography

Audio Steganography is hiding the secret data in an innocuous cover speech in a secure and robust manner. There are various ways popularly used in audio Steganography such as LSB coding, parity coding, and spread spectrum [16].

- Video Steganography

Video Steganography is a combination of image steganography and audio Steganography as the video consists of a set of images and audio [16].

- Protocol Steganography

In protocol steganography, the secret data is hidden in the header of a TCP/IP [16].

### 2.3 Methods of Steganography

There are two classes of methods of steganography techniques as that [3]:

1) Frequency Domain Methods.
2) Spatial Domain Methods.

### 2.3.1 Survey of Frequency Domain Methods

In transform domain, the cover object is converted to another domain to get the transformed coefficients, these coefficients are changed to hide the secret data. After that, these coefficients are transformed back to the spatial domain to get stego object. The widely used transforms are Discrete Wavelet Transform (DWT), Discrete Cosine Transform (DCT) and Fast Fourier Transform (FFT)[3].

In DCT is the core of image coding and video compression techniques. Such as for JPEG image format, image is divided into 8 x 8 pixel blocks then the DCT is applied to each block to get 64 DCT coefficients each [13]. The FFT is popularly used for frequency analysis which is easy to get the phase of a coefficient and change it by
secret data. As in DCT an image is divided into several non-overlapped blocks [12]. There are a number of schemes working in the frequency domain they are as the follows:

In 2002 Chang, Chen, and Chung proposed a scheme for hiding the secret message in the cover image based upon JPEG and quantization table modification [7]. This method uses the JPEG image as a cover image. the cover-image divided into nonoverlapping blocks of $8 * 8$ pixels, and then applies DCT on each block to transform into DCT coefficients, the secret message embedded in the middle frequency part of the quantized DCT coefficients for each block. after embedding, use entropy coding to compress each block to obtain a JPEG file. This scheme achieves the larger capacity and the quality of the stego-images is acceptable

In 2013, Acharya, Hemeletha, Renuka, and Kamath proposed a method for hiding gray scale image in color scale image by utilizing Integer Wavelet Transform (IWT) and Discrete Wavelet Transform (DWT) [4]. In this method, the secret image is not embedding in a cover image, instead, generated the key by using DWT then this key is hiding in color scale image with run length encoded by using IWT. So, this method achieves the improving the security and has a high quality of the stego image compared to other methods.

In 2013 Gupta and Sharma proposed a scheme for hiding gray scale image in audio by utilizing Discrete Wavelet Transform (DWT) and Least Significant Bit (LSB) [14]. In this method embedding secret image bits in the higher frequency component of the audio file after applying the DWT on the audio, for hiding the audio is divided into blocks, the size of each block is $8 * 8$ pixels and then store the image bits into the last 3 bits of the audio file.

In 2014 Chen, Zhang, Ma, and Yu proposed a method for reversible data hiding in DCT domain by recursive code construction [8]. In this method, the data is embedded over a special ternary cover that is suitable for any transform domain, for example, DCT domain. The likelihood density function of the transformed coefficients has a Laplacian distribution with a small variation. Thus, this technique has good image quality.

In 2014, Lavania, Matey, and Thanikaiselvan proposed a method for embedding secret data in the medical image (color scale image) for the real-time application by using the Integer Wavelength Transform (IWT) [21]. In this method, the data hiding in the red plane of cover image by dividing the cover image to non-overlapping pixel block the size of block $8 * 8$ pixels and then apply IWT on each block and embedding L random steno bit message in LH, HL and HH coefficient of a block. So, this scheme achieved high capacity and robustness.

In 2014, Garg and Mathur proposed a method for embedding the secret gray image in a gray image by using fractional Fourier transform (FFT) and wavelet coefficients (DWT) [15]. In this method apply FFT on both images (secret image and cover image) which are divided into real and imaginary part then apply DWT on the real part of both images, the embedding process done by add approximation of cover image and secret image by using alpha blending. So, this method achieves both robustness and higher security.

In 2015, Acharya, Hemalatha, and Renuka proposed a method for embedding audio in color scale image by using the wavelet transform [3]. In this method, the cover image is presented in YCbCr format, and then $\mathrm{Cb}, \mathrm{Cr}$ components and secret audio
are transferred to wavelet domain by using IWT. The approximate coefficients of secret audio are embedded in a second and third bit of high-frequency coefficients of Cb and Cr . This method shows a high quality of the stego image.

### 2.3.2 Survey of Spatial Domain Methods

Spatial domain implies the real location of a pixel in media forms such as text, image, video, sound, etc. While hiding secret data in a pixel, the location of a pixel is considered and then the pixel value is used to hide the data. There are many steganography algorithms working on color or gray scale images; each algorithm has its own protection mechanism and complication techniques since the basic aim for all of these algorithms is encoding a large amount of secret data and little effect on the cover file. It means large value for the Bit Per Pixel (BPP) embedding capacity with high image quality.
$>$ Survey of Steganography Methods for the Color Scale Images
There are many techniques of steganography working on color scale images as the follows:

In 2007, Yu, Chang and Lin proposed a scheme for embedding a color or a gray scale image in a true color scale image [29]. This scheme uses three different types of secret image: color scale image, a palette-based 256-color scale image, and a gray scale image. A secret image is converted to a binary representation, and then the secret data are protected by encrypting using DES algorithm. After that, each 8-bit byte of encrypted data is divided into 3 bits, 2 bits, and 3 bits. This method achieves high quality of the image.

In 2013, Kiruba and Karthikeyan proposed a method for detection of adaptive pixel pair matching in color scale images and gray scale images [19]. This technique is based on pixel pair matching (PPM) for data hiding. The basic idea of PPM is to
utilize the values of pixel pairs as a reference assortment and seeking a coordinate in the neighborhood set of this pixel pair according to a given message digit. In this method, the maximum value of the embedding capacity of the payload is 1.161 BPP . So, this method achieves the best quality image with less distortion.

In 2013, Maj, Pal and Roy proposed a method by using Sudoku puzzle for embedding a secret message in the color scale image [22]. In this method, the cover image is divided into equal-sized blocks, the size of a block 64 bits. In every block embedding a character of the secret message in each three pixels. So, this scheme achieved more robustness with less computation.

In 2015, Singh and Singh proposed a method to improve LSB for hiding secret data in color scale image [24]. In this method, the secret message embedding in LSB of color scale image uses 2-2-4 LSB insertion: this technique embeds 2, 2, and 4 bits of secret data into 2 LSB of a red component, 2 LSB of green component, and 4 LSB of blue component, respectively. This method achieved a high quality of the image and high embedding capacity.
$>$ Survey of Steganography Methods for Gray Scale Images
There are many techniques of steganography working on gray scale images, one of the easiest, fast and very publicly known technique of steganography is the Least Significant Bit (LSB). In this technique, least significant bit or bits of a pixel are replaced by the bits of the secret data to be hidden. LSB can change up to 4 least significant positions from a byte. Changing four bits of a pixel may cause distortion in an image due to a noticeable change in intensity of a cover object [2].

One of the most common techniques is the LSB substitution method; it is a simple
method [10]. The main idea of LSB substitution is to change the least significant bits of the cover file with the bits of secret data. The secret information is divided into blocks with size $M$ where $1 \leq M \leq 8$. Overall, this method can realize a good image quality when $M \leq 3$, however, for $4 \leq M \leq 8$, there is a sorely drop in the image quality.

To upgrade LSB substitution, many steganographic techniques were proposed. In 2001, Wang and Lin proposed a method that uses an optimal LSB substitution and genetic algorithm [27], to solve the problem of hiding data in the MLSB of the cover image by using genetic algorithm, when $M$ is large in order to get better image quality and high embedding capacity.

In 2003, Chang, Hsiao and Chan proposed method to find optimal LSB substitution in image hiding by dynamic programming strategy [9], this method, is the same as the previous method [27] but this method uses the dynamic programming instead of the genetic algorithm in finding the optimal value for $M$. Also, this method consumes less computation time. This method achieves a good quality image and less computational time.

In 2003, Zhang and Ping proposed a scheme for the reliable detection of least significant bit (LSB) basic on statistical observations on difference image histograms [30]. This method uses gray scale images with size $512 \times 512$ pixels, the secret messages are embedded by using the random LSB replacement method with embedding ratios varying from 0 to $100 \%$ in $10 \%$ increments. The algorithm is more accurate than the other techniques when embedding large messages.

In 2006, Chang, Tai and Lin proposed a scheme for digitally compressed images based on side match vector quantization (SMVQ) [6]. In this method, the cover image is encoded using SMVQ; then the compressed image is created. The SMVQcompressed cover image is divided into non-overlapping blocks then the secret data are embedded in the blocks. This method achieves a large size of secret data, visual quality and compression rate compare with other methods using SMVQ.

In 2012, Taur, Lin, lee and Tao proposed a method for hiding data in DNA sequences based on table lookup substitution (TLSM) [25]. TLSM is to enhance the performance of data embedding technique called the substitution. The Base-t TLSM encodes the secret message with radix $t$ to fully use the substitution table. In extended TLSM (ETLSM) method, the number of elements of selectable substitution table was raised by taking additional letters into account. This method has good capacity and security.

In 2015, Jheng, Chen and Huang proposed a method for data hiding based on histogram medication over ternary computers [18]. They proposed two methods for data hiding Ternary Data Hiding (TDH) and Coded-Ternary Data Hiding (C-TDH). In the both methods, the secret data was ternary (NAF format). TDH method achieves higher peak signal to noise (PSNR) and C-TDH method achieves increased amount of the embedded secret data compared to TDH method.

In 2016, Hussain, Wahab, Ho, Javed and Jung proposed a scheme for data embedding using parity bit pixel value differencing (PBPVD) and improved rightmost digit replacement (IRMDR) [17]. In this method, the cover image divided into non-overlapping pixel blocks, and then calculate the PBPVD and the IRMDR in
each block by calculating the difference between pixel values in blocks. If the difference value of the block exists in the $L_{0}$ level, then implement iRMDR; otherwise, PBPVD implement.

In this thesis, we investigated LSB, ATD, and LSBT in the spatial domain and detailed explained in the following:

### 2.3.3 LSB Method

One of simplest and fastest method is LSB. In this method, the binary secret message is divided into blocks with R bits, and in every pixel of the cover image hiding one block [10]. LSB method is shown below.

- LSB Embedding Algorithm

Input: Secret data as binary, $S$; cover image, $V[N, M]$; where $N$ is the number of rows; and $M$ is the number of columns; $R$ is size of the block.

Output: Stego image, $Y[N, M]$.
Step 1: Binary data $S$ divide into blocks $S_{i}$ of $R$ bits where $S_{i} \in\{0,1\}^{R}$.
Step 2: Hide $S_{i}$ in pixel $v_{i}, i \in\{0, . ., M N-1\}$.

$$
\begin{equation*}
y_{i}=v_{i}-\left(v_{i} \bmod 2^{R}\right)+S_{i} \tag{2.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

Where $v_{i}$ is the $i^{\text {th }}$ cover pixel of $V, y_{i}$ is the $i^{\text {th }}$ stego pixel of $Y, S_{i}$ is a decimal value of $R$-bits.

Step 3: End.
Figure 2.1 shows the flowchart of the LSB embedding algorithm.


Figure 2.1: Flowchart of The LSB Embedding Algorithm

- LSB Extraction Algorithm

Input: $Y$ is Stego image with size $[N, M] ; R$ is block size of the secret message.
Output: Secret data, $S$ as binary.
Step 1: Set $S=\{\quad\}$ empty set.
Step 2: Calculate the value of secret $S_{i}$ for each pixel of stego image $y_{i}$ at position $i$, $i \in\{0, . ., M N-1\}$ from next formula:

$$
\begin{equation*}
S_{i}=y_{i} \bmod ^{R} \tag{2.2}
\end{equation*}
$$

Where $y_{i}$ is the stego pixel of $Y$.
Step 3: Transform every $S_{i}$ into binary and insert $S_{i}$ into the secret data $S$.
Step 4: End
Figure 2.2 shows the flowchart of the LSB extraction algorithm.


Figure 2.2: Flowchart of The LSB Extraction Algorithm

- Example 1. LSB Method

Let the pixel values of cover be (160 161157 156), and the binary message be (11 01
$1001)$ and the size of block $R=2$ bits.
In block 1 , we have $(11)_{2}=(3)_{10}=S_{1}$ then

$$
\begin{gathered}
y_{i}=v_{i}-\left(v_{i} \bmod 2^{R}\right)+s_{i} \\
y_{1}=160-(160 \bmod 4)+3=163
\end{gathered}
$$

In block 2 , we have $(01)_{2}=(1)_{10}=S_{2}$ then
$y_{2}=161-(161 \bmod 4)+1=161$.
In block 3, we have $(10)_{2}=(2)_{10}=S_{3}$ then

$$
y_{3}=157-(157 \bmod 4)+2=158
$$

In block 4 , we have $(01)_{2}=(1)_{10}=S_{4}$ then

$$
y_{4}=156-(156 \bmod 4)+1=157
$$

In the extraction stage, if we have stego pixel values (163 161158 157). For each stego pixel $y_{i}$, we get

$$
\begin{gathered}
s_{i}=y_{i} \bmod 2^{R} \\
s_{1}=163 \bmod 4=3 \\
s_{2}=161 \bmod 4=1 \\
s_{3}=158 \bmod 4=2 \\
s_{4}=157 \bmod 4=1
\end{gathered}
$$

Finally, we get (3 121 1) $)_{10}$ and the binary secret message (11 011001$)_{2}$ is restored.

### 2.3.4 Algorithm with Ternary Digits (ATD)

As proposed in [28], in this method the secret data consist of digits $\{0,1$, and 2$\}$ in the form of a ternary string. Each pixel of a cover image takes two ternary digits from the secret data. The ATD is shown below:

- ATD Embedding Algorithm

Input: Ternary secret message $S=\left\{S_{k}\left|0 \leq k \leq|S|, S_{k} \in\{0,1,2\}\right\} ; V\right.$ is cover image
with size $[N, M], N$ is the number of rows; $M$ is the number of columns. $V=$ $\left\{v_{i j} \mid 0 \leq v_{i j} \leq 255 ; v_{i j}\right.$ is the $i^{t h}, j^{t h}$ cover pixel.

Output: Stego image, $\mathrm{v}^{\text {stego }}[\mathrm{N}, \mathrm{M}]$.
Step 0. $K=0$
Step 1: Convert the pixel value $\boldsymbol{v}_{i j}$ to binary $b_{7}, b_{6} \ldots \ldots b_{0}$ according to equation

$$
\begin{equation*}
v_{i j}=\sum_{r=0}^{7} b_{r} * 2^{r} \tag{2.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

Step 2: Divide $\boldsymbol{v}_{i j}$ into two sub-segments $s u b 1_{i j}=b_{7}, b_{6}, b_{5}, b_{4}, b_{3}, b_{2}$; and $s u b 2_{i j}=b_{1}, b_{0}$.

Step 3: Check overflow/underflow for $\operatorname{sub} 1_{i j}, s u b 2_{i j}$ according to (2.4), (2.5)

$$
\begin{align*}
& {\operatorname{sub} 1_{i j}}=\left\{\begin{array}{lr}
000001 & , \text { if sub1 } 1_{i j}=000000 \\
111110 & \text {, if sub1 } 1_{i j}=111111 \\
\text { sub1 } 1_{i j} & \text { Otherwise }
\end{array}\right\}  \tag{2.4}\\
& \text { sub2 }_{i j}=\left\{\begin{array}{lr}
01 & , \text { ifsub } 2_{i j}=00 \\
11 & \text { ifsub2 } 2_{i j}=11 \\
\text { sub2 } & \text { Otherwise }
\end{array}\right\} \tag{2.5}
\end{align*}
$$

Step 4: Embed the first ternary secret number $S_{k}$ in $s u b 1_{i j}$ according to the next cases:

Case 1: $\bmod \left(\operatorname{sub1} 1_{i j}, 3\right)=S_{k}$

$$
\begin{equation*}
\operatorname{sub1} 1_{i j}^{\text {stego }}=\operatorname{sub1} 1_{i j} \tag{2.6}
\end{equation*}
$$

Case 2: $\bmod \left(\operatorname{sub1}_{i j}+1,3\right)=S_{k}$

$$
\begin{equation*}
\operatorname{sub} 1_{i j}^{\text {stego }}=\operatorname{sub1} 1_{i j}+1 \tag{2.7}
\end{equation*}
$$

Case 3: $\bmod \left(\operatorname{sub1}_{i j}-1,3\right)=S_{k}$

$$
\begin{equation*}
\operatorname{sub}_{1 j}^{\text {stego }}=\operatorname{sub1} 1_{i j}-1 \tag{2.8}
\end{equation*}
$$

Step 5: Construct $\boldsymbol{v}_{i j}$ by using equation (2.9)

$$
\begin{equation*}
v_{i j}=\operatorname{sub} 1_{i j}^{\text {stego }} * 2^{2}+\operatorname{sub} 2_{i j} \tag{2.9}
\end{equation*}
$$

Step 6: If $(k=k+1)<|S|$ go to Step 7 else go to Step9.
Step 7: Embed the second ternary secret number $S_{k}$ into $v_{i j}^{\prime}$, according to next cases:
Case 1: $\bmod \left(v_{i j}^{\prime}, 3\right)=S_{k}$

$$
\begin{equation*}
v_{i j}^{\text {stego }}=v_{i j} \tag{2.10}
\end{equation*}
$$

Case 2: $\bmod \left(\dot{v}_{i j}+1,3\right)=S_{k}$

$$
\begin{equation*}
v_{i j}^{\text {stego }}=v_{i j}^{\grave{i}}+1 \tag{2.11}
\end{equation*}
$$

Case 3: $\bmod \left(v_{i j}^{\prime}-1,3\right)=S_{k}$

$$
\begin{equation*}
v_{i j}^{\text {stego }}=v_{i j}^{\grave{ }}-1 \tag{2.12}
\end{equation*}
$$

Step 8: $k=k+1$, if $k<|S|$, go to Step1
Step 9: End.
Note 1. Note that due to (2.5), embedding of the second digit by (2.10)-(2.12) does not change its subl part, i.e. $\operatorname{sub} 1\left(\mathrm{v}_{i j}^{\text {stego }}\right)=\operatorname{sub1}\left(v_{i j}\right)=\operatorname{sub1} 1_{i j}^{\text {stego }}$.

Figure 2.3 shows the flowchart of the embedding algorithm.


Figure 2.3: Flowchart of The ATD Embedding Algorithm


Figure 2.4: Flowchart of Check $\operatorname{sub1} 1_{i j}$ Part of The ATD Embedding Algorithm


Figure 2.5: Flowchart of Check $\operatorname{sub2} 2_{i j}$ Part of The ATD Embedding Algorithm


Figure 2.6: Flowchart of Embedding $S_{k}$ in sub1 $1_{\mathrm{ij}}$ Part of The ATD Embedding Algorithm


Figure 2.7: Flowchart of Embedding $S_{k}$ in $v_{i j}^{\prime}$ Part of The ATD Embedding Algorithm

- ATD Extraction Algorithm

Input: $V$ is stego image with size $[N, M], N$ is the number of rows; $M$ is the number of columns. $V=\left\{v_{i j} \mid 0 \leq v_{i j} \leq 255\right\} ; v_{i j}$ is the $i^{\text {th }}, j^{\text {th }}$ cover pixel.

Output: Ternary secret message, $S$.
Step 0. $k=0$
Step 1: Convert the pixel value $v_{i j}$ to binary $b_{7} b_{6} \ldots \ldots . b_{0}$ according to equation

Step 2: Divide $v_{i j}$ into two sub-segments $\operatorname{sub1} 1_{i j}=b_{7} b_{6} b_{5} b_{4} b_{3} b_{2}$; and $s u b 2_{i j}=$ $b_{1} b_{0}$.

Step 3: Extract first ternary number of $\operatorname{sub} 1_{i j}$, according equation (2.13)

$$
\begin{equation*}
S_{k}=\bmod \left(\operatorname{subl}_{i j}, 3\right) \tag{2.13}
\end{equation*}
$$

Step 4: $k=k+1$, if $k<|S|$ go to Step 5 else go to Step 7.
Step 5: Extract second ternary number from $\boldsymbol{v}_{\boldsymbol{i j}}$, according toequation (2.14)

$$
\begin{equation*}
S_{k}=\bmod \left(v_{i j}, 3\right) \tag{2.14}
\end{equation*}
$$

Step 6: $k=k+1$, if $k<|S|$ go to Step 1.
Step 7: End.
Figure 2.8 shows flowchart of the extraction algorithm.


Figure 2.8: Flowchart of ATD Extraction Algorithm

- Example 2. Example for ATD Embedding and Extraction

Let the cover pixel values are $(135137138)_{10}$, and the ternary message be (010212) ${ }_{3}$. We will embed two ternary digits into each cover pixel: 01 into 135, 02 into 157 , and 12 into 138.

Embed 01 into cover pixel $v_{1}=135$.
Step 1: Convert cover pixel to binary

$$
v_{1}=(135)_{10}=(10000111)_{2}
$$

Step 2: Divide binary value of cover pixel into $s u b_{1}, \operatorname{sub}_{2}$

$$
\begin{gathered}
s u b_{1}=(100001)_{2}=(33)_{10} \\
s u b_{2}=(11)_{2}=(3)_{10}
\end{gathered}
$$

Step 3: Check overflow/underflow for $s u b_{1}, s u b_{2}$; the result after Check overflow/underflow according to (2.4) and (2.5):

$$
\begin{gathered}
s u b_{1}=(33)_{10} \\
s u b_{2}=(01)_{2}=(2)_{10}
\end{gathered}
$$

Step 4: Embed the first ternary secret number $S_{1}=(0)_{3}$ to $s u b_{1}$ according to (2.6), (2.7) and (2.8):

$$
\begin{gathered}
\text { sub }_{1} \bmod 3=33 \bmod 3=0=S_{1} \\
\text { sub }_{1}^{\text {stego }}=33
\end{gathered}
$$

Hence, apply (2.6)
Step 5: $\grave{v_{1}}=33 * 2^{2}+2=134$.
Step 6: Read the second ternary number $S_{2}=(1)_{3}$ and embed it in $v_{1}$ according to (2.10), (2.11) and (2.12):

$$
\begin{gathered}
v_{1} \bmod 3=134 \bmod 3=2 \neq S_{2} \\
\left(v_{1}+1\right) \bmod 3=(134+1) \bmod 3=0 \neq S_{2} \\
\left(v_{1}-1\right) \bmod 3=(134-1) \bmod 3=133 \bmod 3=1=S 2
\end{gathered}
$$

Hence, $v_{1}$ stego=133
Embed (02) $)_{3}$ into cover pixel $\boldsymbol{v}_{\mathbf{2}}=137$.
Step 1: Convert cover pixel to binary

$$
v_{2}=(137)_{10}=(10001001)_{2}
$$

Step 2: Divide binary value of cover pixel into $s u b_{1}, \operatorname{sub}_{2}$

$$
\begin{gathered}
s u b_{1}=(100010)_{2}=(34)_{10} \\
s u b_{2}=(01)_{2}=(1)_{10}
\end{gathered}
$$

Step 3: Check overflow/underflow for $s u b_{1}, s u b_{2}$ according to (2.4) and (2.5); no need for change in this step.

Step 4: Embed $S_{3}=(0)_{3}$ into $s u b_{1}$ according to (2.6), (2.7) and (2.8):

$$
\begin{gathered}
\operatorname{sub}_{1} \bmod 3=34 \bmod 3=1 \neq S_{3} \\
\operatorname{sub}_{1} \bmod 3=(34+1) \bmod 3=2 \neq S_{3} \\
\text { sub }_{1} \bmod 3=(34-1) \bmod 3=33 \bmod 3=0=\mathrm{S} 3 .
\end{gathered}
$$

Hence, apply (2.6): $s u b_{1}$ stego=33
Step 5: $\grave{v_{2}}=33 * 2^{2}+1=133$.
Step 6: Read the next ternary number $S_{4}=(2)_{3}$ and embed it in $v_{2}$ according to (2.10), (2.11) and (2.12):

$$
\begin{gathered}
v_{2} \bmod 3=133 \bmod 3=1 \neq S_{4} \\
v_{2} \bmod 3=(133+1) \bmod 3=2=S_{4}
\end{gathered}
$$

Hence,
$v_{2}^{\text {stego }}=134$.
Embed (12) $)_{3}$ into cover pixel $v_{3}=138$.
Step 1: Convert cover pixel to binary

$$
v_{3}=(138)_{10}=(10001010)_{2}
$$

Step 2: Divide binary value of cover pixel into $s u b_{1}, \operatorname{sub}_{2}$

$$
\begin{gathered}
s u b_{1}=(100010)_{2}=(34)_{10} \\
\text { sub }_{2}=(10)_{2}=(2)_{10}
\end{gathered}
$$

Step 3: Check overflow/underflow for sub $_{1}$, sub $_{2}$ according to (2.4) and (2.5); no need for changes in this step.

Step 4: Embed $S_{5}=(1)_{3}$ into $s u b_{1}$ according to (2.6), (2.7) and (2.8):

$$
s u b_{1} \bmod 3=34 \bmod 3=1=S_{5}
$$

Hence, apply (2.6):

$$
\operatorname{sub}_{1}^{\text {stego }}=34 .
$$

Step 5: $\grave{v_{3}}=34 * 2^{2}+1=137$.
Step 6: Read the next ternary number $S_{6}=(2)_{3}$ and embed it in $v_{3}^{\prime}$ according to (2.10), (2.11) and (2.12):

$$
\begin{gathered}
v_{3}^{\text {stego }}=137 \bmod 3=2=S_{6} \\
v_{3}^{\text {stego }}=137
\end{gathered}
$$

The stego pixels are (133, 134, and 137).
In the extraction, if we have stego pixel value $(133,134,137)$
stego pixel $v_{1}=133$.
Step 1: Convert cover pixel to binary

$$
v_{1}=(133)_{10}=(10000101)_{2}
$$

Step 2: Divide the binary value of the cover pixel into $s u b_{1}, s u b_{2}$

$$
\begin{gathered}
\text { sub }_{1}=(100001)_{2}=(33)_{10} \\
\text { sub }_{2}=(01)_{2}=(1)_{10}
\end{gathered}
$$

Step 3: Extract first ternary number $S_{1}$ from $s u b_{1}$ according to (2.13)

$$
S_{1}=33 \bmod 3=0
$$

Step 4: Extract second ternary number $S_{2}$ from $v_{1}$, according to (2.14),
$S_{2}=133 \bmod 3=1$
The first part of the secret message $(01)_{3}$ is restored.
Next stego pixel $v_{2}=134$.
Step 1: Convert cover pixel to binary

$$
v_{2}=(134)_{10}=(10000110)_{2}
$$

Step 2: Divide the binary value of cover pixel into $s u b_{1}, s u b_{2}$

$$
\begin{gathered}
s u b_{1}=(100001)_{2}=(33)_{10} \\
s u b_{2}=(10)_{2}=(2)_{10}
\end{gathered}
$$

Step 3: Extract $S_{3}$ from $s u b_{1}$ according to (2.13)

$$
S_{3}=33 \bmod 3=0
$$

Step 4: Extract $S_{4}$ From $v_{2}$ according to (2.14)

$$
S_{4}=134 \bmod 3=2
$$

The second part of the secret message $(02)_{3}$ is restored.
Next stego pixel $v_{3}=137$.
Step 1: Convert cover pixel to binary

$$
v_{3}=(137)_{10}=(10001001)_{2}
$$

Step 2: Divide the binary value of the cover pixel into $s u b_{1}, s u b_{2}$

$$
\begin{gathered}
s u b_{1}=(100010)_{2}=(34)_{10} \\
s u b_{2}=(01)_{2}=(1)_{10}
\end{gathered}
$$

Step 3: Extract $S_{5}$ From $s u b_{1}$ according to (2.13)

$$
S_{5}=34 \bmod 3=1
$$

Step 4: Extract $S_{6}$ From $v_{3}$ according to (2.14)

$$
S_{6}=137 \bmod 3=2
$$

The third part of the secret message $(12)_{3}$ is restored.

Finally, we embedded $(010212)_{3}$ into $(135,137,138)_{10}$ and the ternary secret message $(010212)_{3}$ is restored from the stego pixels $(133,134,137)_{10}$.

### 2.3.5 LSB with Threshold Algorithm (LSBT)

As proposed in [26], this method uses a threshold value which indicates the number of bits of the secret data embedded into the cover image. The LSBT algorithm is presented below:

- LSBT Embedding Algorithm

Input: $B_{s}$ is a secret message as a bit string, two moduli numbers, $m u$ and $m l ; P$ as cover image with size $[N, M], M$ is the number of rows; $N$ is the number of columns; $k=0 ; T$ is the threshold value; $P=\left\{p_{i j} \mid 0 \leq p_{i j} \leq 255\right\} ; p_{i j}$ is the $i^{\text {th }}, j^{\text {th }}$ cover pixel.

Output: Stego image, $P_{s}$.
Step 0: $k=0$
Step 1: If $p_{i j} \geq T$

$$
\begin{align*}
E C & =\left\lfloor\log _{2} m u\right\rfloor,  \tag{2.15}\\
R E S & =p_{i j} \bmod m u, \tag{2.16}
\end{align*}
$$

Else

$$
\begin{align*}
E C & =\left\lfloor\log _{2} m l\right\rfloor,  \tag{2.17}\\
R E S & =p_{i j} \bmod m l, \tag{2.18}
\end{align*}
$$

where $\lfloor x\rfloor$ is the maximal integer less or equal to x .
Step 2: Compute

$$
\begin{equation*}
D=|R E S-D E C|, \tag{2.19}
\end{equation*}
$$

where DEC is the decimal value of the next EC bits from $B_{s}$. From (2.15), (2.16),
Step 3: Embed DEC into $p_{i j} . k=k+E C$.
Case 1: $p_{i j}<T$

Case 1.1: $p_{i j}<\frac{m l}{2}$

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=D E C \tag{2.20}
\end{equation*}
$$

Case $1.2 \frac{m l}{2} \leq p_{i j}<T-\frac{m l}{2}$
Case 1.2.1 $D>\frac{m l}{2}$

$$
\begin{equation*}
A V=m l-D \tag{2.23}
\end{equation*}
$$

Case 1.2.1.1 RES $\geq D E C$

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}+A V \tag{2.25}
\end{equation*}
$$

Case 1.2.1.2 RES < DEC

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}-A V \tag{2.27}
\end{equation*}
$$

Case 1.2.2 $D \leq \frac{m l}{2}$

$$
\begin{equation*}
A V=D \tag{2.29}
\end{equation*}
$$

Case 1.2.2.1 RES $\geq D E C$

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}-A V . \tag{2.31}
\end{equation*}
$$

Case 1.2.2.2 RES $<\mathrm{DEC}$

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}+A V \tag{2.33}
\end{equation*}
$$

Case $1.3\left(T-\frac{m l}{2}\right) \leq p_{i j}<T$

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}-R E S+D E C \tag{2.35}
\end{equation*}
$$

Case 2: $p_{i j} \geq T$

$$
k=k+E C
$$

Case 2.1 $p_{i j}>255-m u / 2+1$

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=255-m u+1+\mathrm{DEC} . \tag{2.37}
\end{equation*}
$$

Case 2.2 $\left(T+\frac{m u}{2}\right)<p_{i j} \leq\left(255-\frac{m u}{2}+1\right)$
Case 2.2.1 $D>\frac{m u}{2}$

$$
\begin{equation*}
A V=m u-D \tag{2.40}
\end{equation*}
$$

Case 2.2.1.1 RES $\geq D E C$

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}+A V \tag{2.42}
\end{equation*}
$$

Case 2.2.1.2RES < DEC

$$
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}-A V
$$

Case 2.2.2 $D \leq \frac{m u}{2}$

$$
A V=D
$$

Case 2.2.2.1 RES $\geq D E C$

$$
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}-A V
$$

Case 2.2.2.2. RES<DEC

$$
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}+A V
$$

Case $2.3 T \leq p_{i j}<T+\frac{m u}{2}$

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}-R E S+D E C \tag{2.53}
\end{equation*}
$$

Step 4: If $k<\left|B_{s}\right|$ go to Step 1.
Step 5: End.
Figure 2.9 shows the flowchart of the LSBT embedding algorithm.


Figure 2.9: Flowchart for LSBT Embedding Algorithm


Figure 2.10: Flowchart of Embedding Algorithm Below Threshold Part of LSBT


Figure 2.11: Flowchart of Embedding Algorithm Above Threshold of LSBT


Figure 2.12: Flowchart of Case. 1 in Figures 2.10, 2.11


Figure 2.13: Flowchart of Case. 2 in Figures 2.10, 2.11

- LSBT Extraction Algorithm

Input: $P_{s}$ is stego image with size $[\mathrm{N}, \mathrm{M}], T$ Threshold value, Two moduli, $m u, m l$.
Output: $B_{s}$ is a bit string with extracted secret message
Step 1: $k=0$; Compute RES and $E C$ as follows:
Case 1: $P_{s i j}<T$

$$
\begin{gather*}
E C=\left\lfloor\log _{2} m l\right\rfloor  \tag{2.54}\\
R E S=P_{s i j} \bmod m l  \tag{2.55}\\
k=k+E C
\end{gather*}
$$

Case 2: $P_{s i j} \geq T$

$$
\begin{gather*}
E C=\left\lfloor\log _{2} m u\right\rfloor  \tag{2.56}\\
R E S=P_{s i j} m o d m u  \tag{2.57}\\
k=k+E C
\end{gather*}
$$

Step 2: Convert RES into the bit string with the EC bits and insert it into the secret data $B_{s}$.

Step 3: if $k<\left|B_{s}\right|$ go to Step 1. Otherwise, go to Step 4.
Step 4: End
Figure 2.14 shows the flowchart of the LSBT extraction algorithm


Figure 2.14: Flowchart for LSBT The Extraction Algorithm

- Example 3. Example of LSBT embedding-extraction

Let the cover pixel values be (160 200255150$)_{10}$ for cover pixel, and $B_{s}$ be a secret bit string $(01110111101)_{2}, T=160, m u=8, m l=4$.

Embedding into $p_{1}=160$ :

## Step 1:

Check if $\left(p_{1} \geq T\right)=(160 \geq 160)$ ? yes
Hence, calculate $E C$ according to (2.15)
$E C=\left\lfloor\log _{2} 8\right\rfloor=3$. then read 3 bits from $B_{S},(011)_{2}$,
and convert them to decimal, $D E C=3$
Calculate RES according to (2.16)
$R E S=160 \bmod 8=0$.
Step 2: Compute $D$ according to (2.19)
$D=|0-3|=3$.
Step 3: Pixel, $p_{1}=160$, meets case 2 condition since $p_{1}=160 \geq T=160$
And it meets case 2.3 condition since
$T=160 \leq p i j=160 \leq \mathrm{T}+\frac{\mathrm{mu}}{2}=164$.
Hence, DEC=3 is embedded according to (2.53):
$p_{s}(1)=160-0+3=163$.
Now, embed into $p_{2}=200$.
Step 1:Since $p_{2}=200 \geq T=160$
calculate $E C$ according to (2.15)
$E C=\left\lfloor\log _{2} 8\right\rfloor=3$.
$E C=3$, then read 3 bits from $B_{s},(101)_{2}$, and convert them to decimal, $D E C$

$$
=5
$$

Calculate RES according to (2.16):
$R E S=200 \bmod 8=0$.
Step 2: Compute $D$ according to (2.19)
$D=|0-5|=5$.
Step 3: Embed $\mathrm{DEC}=5$ into $p_{2}=200$
according to case 2.2 since
$T+\frac{m u}{2}=\left(160+\frac{8}{2}\right)=164<p i j=200<255-\frac{m u}{2}+1=\left(255-\frac{8}{2}+1\right)=$ 252.

Case 2.2.1 condition holds:
$\mathrm{D}=5>\frac{\mathrm{mu}}{2}=4$.
Hence, calculate AV as (2.41):
$A V=\mathrm{mu}-\mathrm{D}=8-5=3$.
Since case 2.2.1.2 holds, according to (2.45)
$p_{s}(2)=\mathrm{pij}-\mathrm{AV}=200-3=197$.
Now, consider embedding into $p_{3}=255$ :
Step 1: Since $p_{3}=255 \geq T=160$
calculate $E C$ according to (2.15)
$E C=\left\lfloor\log _{2} 8\right\rfloor=3$.

$$
E C=3 \text {, read } 3 \text { bits from } B_{s}(111)_{2} \text { convert to decimal } D E C=7
$$

Calculate RES according to (2.16)
$R E S=255 \bmod 8=7$.
Step 2: Compute $D$ according to (2.19)
$D=|7-7|=0$.
Step 3: Embed DEC=7 into $p_{3}=255$
according to case 2.1 since according to (2.38)
$255>(255-8+1)$,
$p_{s}(3)=(255-8+1)+7=255$.
Embedding $(01)_{2}$ into $p_{4}=150$ :
Step 1:Since $\mathrm{p} 4=150<\mathrm{T}=160$
calculate $E C$ according to (2.17)
$E C=\left\lfloor\log _{2} 4\right\rfloor=2$,

$$
E C=2 \text {, read } 2 \text { bits from } B_{s}(01)_{2} \text { convert to decimal } D E C=1
$$

Calculate RES according to (2.18)
$R E S=150 \bmod 4=2$.
Step 2: Compute $D$ according to (2.19)
$D=|2-1|=1$.
Step 3: Embed $\mathrm{DEC}=1$ into $p_{3}=150$
according to case 1.2 since
$\frac{4}{2}<150<160-\frac{4}{2}$,
$2<150<158$.
Case 1.2.2 condition holds:
$\mathrm{D}=1 \leq \frac{\mathrm{mu}}{2}=2$.
Hence, calculate AV as (2.30):
$A V=\mathrm{D}=1$.
Since Case 1.2.2.1 holds, according to (2.32)

$$
p_{s}(4)=150-1=149 .
$$

The stego pixel are (163 197255 149 $)_{10}$.
In the extraction, we have stego pixel value (163 197255 149 $)_{10}$, and stego pixel,
$p_{s}(1)=163$.
According to Case $2 p_{s}(1) \geq T$
From (2.56) and (2.57)
$E C=\left\lfloor\log _{2} 8\right\rfloor=3$,

$$
R E S=163 \bmod 8=3
$$

Convert RES to binary with EC length:(011) $)_{2}$.
The secret message $(011)_{2}$ is restored.

The second stego pixel, $p_{s}(2)=197$.
According to Case $2 p_{s}(2) \geq T$
From (2.56) and (2.57)
$E C=\left\lfloor\log _{2} 8\right\rfloor=3$.

$$
R E S=197 \bmod 8=5 .
$$

Convert RES to binary with EC length (101) ${ }_{2}$
The secret message $(101)_{2}$ is restored.
The third stego pixel, $p_{s}(3)=255$.
According to Case $2 p_{s}(i) \geq T$.
From (2.56) and (2.57)
$E C=\left\lfloor\log _{2} 8\right\rfloor=3$,

$$
R E S=255 \bmod 8=7
$$

Convert RES to binary with EC length $(111)_{2}$
The secret message $(111)_{2}$ is restored.
And the fourth stego pixel, $p_{s}(4)=149$.
According to Case 1, $p_{s}(i)<T$.
From (2.54) and (2.55)
$E C=\left\lfloor\log _{2} 4\right\rfloor=2$,

$$
R E S=149 \bmod 8=1
$$

Convert RES to binary with EC length $(01)_{2}$
The secret message $(01)_{2}$ is restored.
Finally, we embedded $(01110111101)_{2}$ into $(160200255150)_{10}$, and the secret message $(01110111101)_{2}$ is restored from the stego pixels (163 197255149$)_{10}$.

### 2.4 Color Perception

The human eye distinguishes color by hue, saturation, and brightness. As we know, primary colors can be one-to-one correlated with light wavelength. Also, combinations of different light wavelengths can cause the same perception of color [23].

The RGB color model is a convenient means for representing color which was established in Commission Internationale de l'Eclairage (CIE) in 1931. R, G and B are three light waves with three different colors called reference color stimuli and denote wavelengths of monochromatic light of 700.0 nm for R which is selected from a wavelength region where human perception does not change much with changing wavelength 546.1 nm for $G$, and 435.8 nm for $B$ that correspond to emission lines of Hg lamp. To establish a broad array of colors by an additive color model, Red, Green, and Blue lights are mixed together in various ways. The color matching experiment mixes three primary colors to find a coincidence with the given color by human perception [20]. Figure 2.15 shows the color matching experiment for RGB.


Figure 2.15: The Color Matching Experiment for RGB [20].

### 2.5 Known Metrics for Evaluating Quality of Stego Images

Several metrics are used usually to measure the quality of the stego-images. In the following, we explain them.

- Mean Square Error (MSE)

MSE is the mean of squares of differences between the cover image and the stego image [28]:

$$
\begin{equation*}
M s e=\frac{\sum_{k=1}^{3} \sum_{i=1}^{M} \sum_{j=1}^{N}\left(X_{i j k}^{c}-X_{i j k}^{S}\right)^{2}}{3 * m * n} \tag{2.58}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $N, M$ is number of columns and rows, respectively, of cover image, $\mathrm{X}^{\mathrm{c}}$, and the stego image, $\mathrm{X}^{s}$

- Peak Signal to Noise Ratio (PSNR)

PSNR is calculated as follows:

$$
\begin{equation*}
P S N R=10 \log _{10} \frac{255^{2}}{M S E} \mathrm{~dB}, \tag{2.59}
\end{equation*}
$$

where 255 is the maximum possible value of gray scale pixel value [28]. PSNR uses potentially maximal pixel value, 255 , that actually may not be reached, that may result not in proper quality description by it.

- Signal to Noise Ratio (SNR)

Signal to noise ratio refers to the measurement of the level of an audio signal as compared to the level of noise that is present in that signal. A larger value of SNR implies a better quality [3], it is calculated as follows:

$$
\begin{equation*}
S N R=10 * \log _{10} \frac{\sigma_{\mathrm{Ri}}^{2}+\sigma_{\mathrm{G}}^{2}+\sigma_{\mathrm{Bi}}^{2}}{\sigma_{\mathrm{Rn}}^{2}+\sigma_{\mathrm{Gn}}^{2}+\sigma_{\mathrm{Bn}}^{2}} \mathrm{~dB} \tag{2.60}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $\sigma_{\mathrm{Ri}}^{2}, \sigma_{\mathrm{Gi}}^{2}$, and $\sigma_{\mathrm{Bi}}^{2}$ are color component variances of cover image, and $\sigma_{\mathrm{Rn}}^{2}, \sigma_{\mathrm{Gn}}^{2}$, and $\sigma_{\mathrm{Bn}}^{2}$ are color component variances of noise-added image[5]. Variance is calculated as follows:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\sigma^{2}=\frac{\sum_{i=1}^{M} \sum_{j=1}^{N}\left(\bar{x}-u_{i j}\right)^{2}}{M N}, \tag{2.61}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $\bar{x}$ is mean of the pixel image, $u_{i j}$ is the pixel value of an image, and, $N M$ is the number of pixels of the image, and mean is defined as follows:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\bar{x}=\frac{\sum_{i=1}^{M} \sum_{j=1}^{N} x_{i j}}{M N}, \tag{2.62}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $\bar{x}$ is mean of the pixel image, $x_{i j}$ is the pixel value of an image, and, $N M$ is the number of pixels of the image.

- Embedding capacity

Embedding capacity is defined as the number of bits of secret data embedded in each pixel of cover image.

$$
\begin{equation*}
E C=\frac{\text { Size of secret data in bits }}{\text { Size of cover image in bytes }} B P P . \tag{2.63}
\end{equation*}
$$

### 2.6 Known Experiments Setups and Results

1) For gray scale images, the eight cover images used in [28], are shown in Figure 2.16, and PSNR for the both schemes(ATD and LSBT), for random secret messages with different size and averaged over 8 cover images Figure 2.16 are shown in Table 2.1, Figure 2.17 shows PSNR for two schemes (ATD and LSBT) [28].


Figure 2.16: Cover Images Used in [28]


Figure 2.17: PSNR Values (dB) for ATD and LSBT Obtained in [28] for Random Secret Messages with Different Sizes and Averaged Over 8 Cover Images Figure 2.16.

Table 2.1: PSNR (dB) of LSBT and ATD [28] for Random Secret Message with Embedding Capacity 3.1699 BPP for 8 Cover Images Figure 2.16

| Cover image | LSBT | ATD |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Airplane | 36.11 | 37.45 |
| Baboon | 36.10 | 37.41 |
| Barb | 36.09 | 37.41 |
| Elain | 36.11 | 37.42 |
| Goldhill | 36.21 | 37.41 |
| Lena | 36.04 | 37.41 |
| Peppers | 36.07 | 37.39 |
| Zelda | 36.11 | 37.40 |

From Table 2.1 and Figure 2.17, we see that the ATD has better image quality when the embedding capacity greater is than 3 BPP, while LSBT achieves higher stego image quality when embedding capacity is less than 3 BPP.
2) For color scale images, Table 2.2 shows PSNR and MSE for LSB algorithm [24], and two cover images used in [24] to embed the secret message are shown in Figure 2.18 .

Table 2.2: LSB PSNR (dB) and MSE for LSB [24]

| Cover image | PSNR(dB) | MSE |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Lena | 55.9461 | 0.1654 |
| Baboon | 55.9238 | 0.1662 |



Figure 2.18: Cover Images Used in [24].

### 2.7 Problem Definition

In this thesis, we study ATD and LSBT for gray scale images, and LSB and ATD for color scale images.

- For gray scale images:

1) For LSBT and ATD, the papers [26] [28] do not provide the proofs of the methods, hence, we prove correctness of ATD
2) For LSBT, information is not provided in [26] how to set the threshold $T$ and two moduli $m u, m l$. We give examples showing that LSBT [26] works incorrectly in some cases, explain them, and fix the problems by proposing modified LSBT, LSBTM , for which we define parameter values such that the algorithm works correctly.
3) In [28], PSNR of ATD and LSBT is presented without theoretical explanation,
hence, we find a formula for threshold $T$ dependence of embedding capacity Bit Per Pixel (BPP).
4) In [28], ATD considers the secret message as the ternary stream, but conventional messages are binary, hence, we need solving the problem of binary-ternary conversions.
5) In [28], only 8 cover images were considered in the experiments, hence, we extend experiments to 15 cover images for the both algorithms (ATD, LSBT).

- For color images:

1) In [28], ATD works on the gray scale images only, hence, we extend ATD to work on the color scale images. and we test it for digit embedding combinations $(112,121,112)$, where, for example, combination 112 means that, one ternary digit is embedded into R component, one ternary digit is embedded into G component, and two ternary digits are embedded into B component of RGB pixel.
2) We implement LSB for bit embedding combinations (224, 242, 422, 134, 143, $314,341,413,431$ ), where, for example, combination 143, means that, one bit is embedded into R component, four bits are embedded into G component, and three bits are embedded into $B$ component of RGB pixel.
3) We modify LSB to the adaptive LSB, ALSB, which determines bit embedding combination depending on the color intensity of each component $\mathrm{R}, \mathrm{G}$, and B .
4) Study PSNR characteristics to find the most appropriate for color scale images quality description. From our experiments for the color scale images, we propose MSNR (Mean Signal to Noise Ratio), APSNR (Actual PSNR) for color scale image components (each of them is a gray scale image).

In MSNR as in (2.64) we calculate the mean value overall pixel image and change the possible peak signal which is 255 in equation (2.59) to the mean value of pixels.

$$
\begin{equation*}
M S N R=10 \log _{10} \frac{\bar{x}}{M S E} \mathrm{~dB}, \tag{2.64}
\end{equation*}
$$

Where $\bar{x}$ is the mean value of the pixels of the cover calculated according to (2.62). In APSNR as in (2.64), APSNR considers actual peak signal instead of possible peak signal which is 255 in equation (2.59).

$$
\begin{equation*}
A P S N R=10 \log _{10} \frac{X}{M S E} \mathrm{~dB}, \tag{2.65}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $X$ is the actual peak value of the pixels of the cover image.
5) Also, we propose weighted PSNR, APSNR, and MSNR for color scale images by three different groups of weights $\left(R_{w}=0.4, G_{w}=0.3, B_{w}=0.3\right),\left(R_{w}=\frac{1}{3}, G_{w}=\right.$ $\left.\frac{1}{3}, B_{w}=\frac{1}{3}\right)$, and ( $\left.R_{w}=0.4, G_{w}=0.243, B_{w}=0.357\right), R_{w}$ weights of Red, $G_{w}$ weights of Green, $B_{w}$ weights of Blue.

### 2.8 Summary of Chapter 2

Thus, in this chapter, we have done the following:

1. We have presented the overview of Steganography and methods of

Steganography.
2. We have presented the related work and known experiments on LSB, LSBT, and ATD. Also, we explain three algorithms (LSB, ATD, and LSBT) with numerical examples for each of them.
3. We have presented the color perception, and the known metrics for evaluation performance of Steganographic algorithms (LSB, LSBT, and ATD) and the results of known experiments from [28], [24].
4. Problem definition for the thesis is given.

## Chapter 3

## ATD AND LSBT ANALYSIS AND RECOVERED PROBLEMS FIXING

In this chapter, analysis of ATD and LSBT is given.

### 3.1 Proof of ATD Correctness

We embed digits by pairs, and the first digit in a pair, even-numbered secret digit is embedded into sub1 $1_{i j}$ by (2.6)-(2.8). After that, $\hat{v}_{i j}$ is defined by (2.9), and the second digit in the pair, odd-numbered digit, is embedded into $\hat{v}_{i j}$ by (2.10)-(2.12). Consider extraction of the first, even numbered secret digit $S_{k}^{\prime}$. It is extracted from sub1 $1_{i j}$ by (2.13). Consider the following cases:

Case 1: If the secret digit $S_{k}$ was embedded according to (2.6), then $\bmod \left(\operatorname{sub1} 1_{i j}, 3\right)=S_{k}$ holds, and due to Note 1,

$$
\begin{equation*}
S_{k}=\bmod \left(s u b 1_{i j}^{\text {stego }}, 3\right)=\bmod \left(\operatorname{sub1} 1_{i j}, 3\right)=S_{k} \tag{3.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

Hence, extracted digit, $S_{k}^{\prime}$, and embedded digit $S_{k}$ are the same, $S_{k}^{\prime}=S_{k}$.
Case 2: If the secret digit, $S_{k}$, was embedded according to (2.7), then $\bmod \left(s u b 1_{i j}+\right.$ $1,3)=S_{k}$ holds, and due to Note 1 ,

$$
\begin{equation*}
S_{k}^{\prime}=\bmod \left(\operatorname{sub} 1_{i j}^{\text {stego }}, 3\right)=\bmod \left(\operatorname{sub1} 1_{i j}^{\prime}+1,3\right)=S_{k} \tag{3.2}
\end{equation*}
$$

Hence, extracted digit ${S_{k}}_{\prime}^{\prime}$, and embedded digit $S_{k}$ are the same, $S_{k}^{\prime}=S_{k}$.
Case 3: If the secret digit $S_{k}$ was embedded according to (2.8), then $\bmod \left(\operatorname{sub1} 1_{i j}-\right.$ $1,3)=S_{k}$ holds. and due to Note 1 ,

$$
\begin{equation*}
S_{k}^{\prime}=\bmod \left(\operatorname{sub1} 1_{i j}^{\text {stego }}, 3\right)=\bmod \left(\operatorname{sub1} 1_{i j}-1,3\right)=S_{k} \tag{3.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

Hence, extracted digit, $S_{k}^{\prime}$, and embedded digit, $S_{k}$, are the same, $S_{k}^{\prime}=S_{k}$.
As far as embedding of the first digit is done only by three ways, (2.6)-(2.8), and in each one extraction from sub1 $1_{i j}^{\text {stego }}$ is done correctly, i.e., extracted digit is the same as the embedded one, hence, ATD correctness for the first digit in a pair is proved.

Now consider extraction of $S_{k}^{\prime}$, an odd numbered secret digit (the second digit in a pair), that is extraction from the pixel value $v_{i j}^{\text {stego }}$.

Embedding into the pixel value the second ternary digit is made by (2.10), (2.11), and (2.12). Consider each of the cases as follows:

Case 1: If the secret digit $S_{k}$ was embedded according to (2.10), then $\bmod \left(v_{i j}^{\prime}, 3\right)=S_{k}$ and

$$
\begin{equation*}
S_{k}^{\grave{\prime}}=\bmod \left(v_{i j}^{\text {stego }}, 3\right)=\bmod \left(v_{i j}, 3\right)=S_{k} \tag{3.4}
\end{equation*}
$$

Hence, $S_{k}^{\prime}=S_{k}$.
Case 2: If the secret digit $S_{k}$ was embedded according to (2.11), then $\bmod \left(v_{i j}^{\prime}+1,3\right)=S_{k}$ and

$$
\stackrel{S_{k}}{\prime}=\bmod \left(v_{i j}^{\text {stego }}+1,3\right)=\bmod \left(v i j^{\prime}+1,3\right)=S_{k}
$$

Hence, $S_{k}^{\prime}=S_{k}$.
Case 3: If the secret digit $S_{k}$ was embedded according to (2.12), then $\bmod \left(v_{i j^{-}}\right.$ $1,3)=S_{k}$ and

$$
\begin{equation*}
S_{k}^{\prime}=\bmod \left(v_{i j}^{\text {stego }}-1,3\right)=\bmod \left(v_{i j}^{\prime}-1,3\right)=S_{k} \tag{3.6}
\end{equation*}
$$

Hence, $S_{k}^{\prime}=S_{k}$.
Thus, as far as in all three cases of embedding, extraction returns the same second
digit as embedded, the algorithm correct work is fully proved.

### 3.2 LSBT Problems Fixing and Proof of Fixed LSBT Correctness

The embedding capacity of a pixel is determined according to the threshold value, $T$, by (2.15), (2.17). For this algorithm, we prove that, the value of stego pixel still is in the same range as it was in the cover image before embedding, and the algorithm works correctly extracted value is the same as it was embedded.

When the pixel value is less than $T$, we have three cases for embedding the secret message into a pixel value. We consider each of the cases as follows:

Case 1.1 $p_{i j}<\frac{m l}{2}$
From (2.18)

$$
\begin{equation*}
0 \leq R E S<m l \tag{3.7}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.17)

$$
\begin{equation*}
0 \leq D E C<2^{E C} \leq m l \tag{3.8}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.20), (2.21) and (3.8)

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=D E C<\mathrm{T} \tag{3.9}
\end{equation*}
$$

Thus, $P_{s i j}$ and $p_{i j}$ are both in the same, less than $T$. In extraction, from (2.55) and (3.9)

$$
R E S-E=D E C \bmod m l
$$

Since by (3.8), $D E C<m l, R E S-E=D E C$, i.e. extracted and embedded values are the same.

Case $1.2 \frac{m l}{2} \leq p_{i j}<T-\frac{m l}{2}$
Case 1.2.1.1 $\left(D>\frac{m l}{2}\right)$ and $(R E S \geq D E C)$
From (2.19) and (2.23),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D=|R E S-D E C|>\frac{m l}{2} . \tag{3.10}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.25) and (3.10),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D E C<R E S-\frac{m l}{2} . \tag{3.11}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.18),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D E C<p_{i j} \bmod m l-\frac{m l}{2} \tag{3.12}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.24), (2.25), and (3.10)

$$
\begin{equation*}
A V=m l-R E S+D E C . \tag{3.1.}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.26) and (3.13),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}+m l-R E S+D E C . \tag{3.14}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.18), (3.12), and (3.14),

$$
\begin{gather*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}+m l-R E S+D E C<p_{i j}+m l-p_{i j} \bmod m l+p_{i j} \bmod m l-  \tag{3.15}\\
\frac{m l}{2}=p_{i j}+\frac{m l}{2}
\end{gather*}
$$

Then, from (3.15) and (2.22),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}<p_{i j}+\frac{m l}{2}<T . \tag{3.16}
\end{equation*}
$$

Thus, we see that $P_{s i j}$ and $p_{i j}$ are both less than $T$.
In extraction algorithm, from (2.18), (2.55), (2.17), and (3.14),

$$
\begin{gathered}
R E S-E=\left(p_{i j}+m l-R E S+D E C\right) \bmod m l=\left(p_{i j}+m l-p_{i j} \bmod m l+\right. \\
D E C) \bmod m l=\left(p_{i j}-p_{i j} \bmod m l\right) \bmod m l+\operatorname{ml} \bmod m l+D E C \bmod m l= \\
0+0+D E C \bmod m l=D E C
\end{gathered}
$$

Thus, extracted value, $R E S-E$, and embedded value, $D E C$, are the same.
Case 1.2.1.2 RES $<D E C$
From (2.19) and (2.23),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D=|R E S-D E C|>\frac{m l}{2} \tag{3.17}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.27) and (3.17),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D E C>R E S+\frac{m l}{2} \tag{3.18}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.18) and (3.18),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D E C>p_{i j} \bmod m l+\frac{m l}{2} \tag{3.19}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.24), (2.27), and (3.17)

$$
\begin{equation*}
A V=m l-\mathrm{DEC}+\mathrm{RES} . \tag{3.20}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.28) and (3.20),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}-m l-\mathrm{RES}+\mathrm{DEC} \tag{3.21}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.17), (2.18), (2.22), and (3.21),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}-m l-p_{i j} \bmod m l+D E C<p i j-m l+\mathrm{DEC}<p i j<T \tag{3.22}
\end{equation*}
$$

Thus, from (3.22),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j} \leq T \tag{3.23}
\end{equation*}
$$

Thus, from (3.23), we have that both $P_{s i j}$ and $p_{i j}$ are less than $T$.
In extraction algorithm, from (3.22), (3.23),(2.17), and (2.55),

$$
\begin{gathered}
\text { RES }-E=\left(p_{i j}-p_{i j} \bmod m l\right) \text { mod } m l-m l \bmod m l+D E C \bmod m l \\
=0-0+D E C \bmod m l=D E C
\end{gathered}
$$

Thus, extracted $R E S-E$ value and embedded value, $D E C$, are the same.

## Case 1.2.2.1

From (2.19) and (2.29)

$$
\begin{equation*}
D=|R E S-D E C| \leq \frac{m l}{2} \tag{3.24}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.31) and (3.24),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D E C \geq R E S-\frac{m l}{2} \tag{3.25}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.18),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D E C \geq p_{i j} \bmod m l-\frac{m l}{2} \tag{3.26}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.30), (2.31), and (3.24),

$$
\begin{equation*}
A V=R E S-D E C \tag{3.27}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.32) and (3.27),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}-R E S+D E C \tag{3.28}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.18), (2.30), (2.22), (2.31), and (2.32),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}-p_{i j} \bmod m l+D E C \leq p_{i j}<T \tag{3.29}
\end{equation*}
$$

Thus,

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j} \leq T . \tag{3.30}
\end{equation*}
$$

Hence, from (2.22) and (3.30), both $p_{i j}$ and $P_{s i j}$ are less than $T$.
In extraction algorithm, from (3.28), (3.29), (2.17), and (2.55)

$$
\begin{gathered}
R E S-E=\left(p_{i j}-p_{i j} \bmod m l\right) \bmod m l+D E C \bmod m l \\
=0+D E C \bmod m l=D E C
\end{gathered}
$$

Hence, extracted value, $R E S-E$, and embedded value, $D E C$, are the same.

## Case 1.2.2.2

From (2.19) and (2.29)

$$
\begin{equation*}
D=|D E C-R E S| \leq \frac{m l}{2} \tag{3.31}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.33) and (3.31),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D E C \leq R E S+\frac{m l}{2} \tag{3.32}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.18) and (3.32),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D E C \leq p_{i j} \bmod m l+\frac{m l}{2} \tag{3.33}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.30), (2.33), and (3.31),

$$
\begin{equation*}
A V=D E C-R E S \tag{3.34}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.34) and (3.34),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}+D E C-R E S \tag{3.35}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.18), (2.22), (3.33), and (3.35),

$$
\begin{gather*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}-p_{i j} \bmod m l+D E C<p i j-p_{i j} \bmod m l+p_{i j} \bmod m l+\frac{m l}{2}=  \tag{3.36}\\
p_{i j}+\frac{m l}{2}<T
\end{gather*}
$$

Then, from (3.36),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}<T . \tag{3.37}
\end{equation*}
$$

Hence, from (3.37) and (2.22), both pij and $P_{s i j}$ are less than $T$.
In extraction algorithm, from (2.55), (2.17), and (3.35),

$$
\begin{gathered}
\operatorname{RES}-E=\left(p_{i j}-p_{i j} \bmod m l\right) \bmod m l+D E C \bmod m l= \\
=0+D E C \bmod m l=D E C .
\end{gathered}
$$

Thus, extracted value, $R E S-E$, and embedded value, $D E C$, are the same.
Case 1.3 Condition (2.35) holds.
From (2.17),

$$
\begin{equation*}
0 \leq D E C<2^{E C} \leq m l \tag{3.38}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.18), (2.35), and (2.36),

$$
\begin{gather*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}-p_{i j} \bmod m l+D E C,  \tag{3.39}\\
p_{i j}<T,  \tag{3.40}\\
p_{i j}-p_{i j} \bmod m l=k \mathrm{ml} . \tag{3.41}
\end{gather*}
$$

Using (3.41) in (3.39), we get:

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=k m l+D E C . \tag{3.42}
\end{equation*}
$$

Let us construct a counterexample, showing that $P_{s i j}$ (3.42) may be not less than $T$ contrary to $p_{i j}$ meeting (2.35).

Counterexample 1. Let the threshold value $T=160$, cover pixel $p_{i j}=159, m l=9$, and a secret message is $(111)_{2}$.

From (2.18),

$$
E C=\left\lfloor\log _{2} 9\right\rfloor=3 .
$$

From (2.19),

$$
R E S=159 \bmod 9=6
$$

$D E C$ is the decimal value of $E C=3$ bit length, and the secret message is $(111)_{2}$; then, $D E C=(7)_{10}$.

From (2.35) and (2.36),

$$
P_{s i j}=159-6+7=160=T .
$$

Thus, Counter example 1 shows that the value of stego pixel, $P_{s i j}$, is 160 that is not less than $T$, whereas original cover pixel value, $p_{i j}=159$, is less than $T$.

According to the Counter example 1, we suggest the first amendment of LSBT method

LSBT Amendment 1. Let $T$ and $m l$ in LSBT input satisfy the following condition (3.43):

$$
\begin{equation*}
T=k 1 * m l, \tag{3.43}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $k l$ is an integer.
Proof. Let us prove that in the condition of Counter example 1, when (3.42) holds, LSBT with Amendment 1 works correctly. From (3.40), (3.41),

$$
\begin{equation*}
k<\mathrm{k} 1 . \tag{3.44}
\end{equation*}
$$

Hence, from (3.43), (3.44) and (3.42),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=k m l+D E C<k m l+m l=(k+1) m l \leq T=k 1 * m l . \tag{3.45}
\end{equation*}
$$

In extraction algorithm, from (3.45), (2.17), and (2.55),

$$
\begin{gather*}
R E S-E=P_{s i j} \bmod m l=  \tag{3.46}\\
=(k m l+D E C) \bmod \mathrm{ml}=\mathrm{kml} \bmod \mathrm{ml}+D E C \bmod \mathrm{ml}=D E C \tag{3.47}
\end{gather*}
$$

Thus, extracted value, $R E S-E$, and embedded value, $D E C$, are the same, and LSBT with Amendment 1 works correctly in the conditions of the counter example 1 resulting from (3.42). All the proofs, preceding Counter example 1, are valid for LSBT with Amendment 1 since no condition was imposed in LSBT on $T$ and $m l$.

Now, continue the proof of LSBT with Amendment 1 correctness.
When the pixel value is larger than or equal to $T$, we have the three cases for embedding the secret message into the pixels. We consider the cases below:

Case 2.1 $p_{i j} \geq \mathrm{T}, p_{i j}>255-\frac{m u}{2}+1$.
From (2.16),

$$
\begin{equation*}
0 \leq R E S=p_{i j} \bmod m u<m u . \tag{3.48}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.15),

$$
\begin{equation*}
0 \leq D E C<2^{E C} \leq m u . \tag{3.49}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.37) and (2.38),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=256-m u+D E C . \tag{3.50}
\end{equation*}
$$

We face difficulty in proving that $P_{s i j}(3.50)$ is not less than $T$ as pij for the Case 2. We show in Counter example 2 that $P_{s i j}$ meeting (3.50), may, contrary to $p_{i j}$, be less than the threshold, $T$.

Counter example 2. Let $T=252, m u=18, p_{i j}=253>256-\frac{m u}{2}=256-9=$ 247, $D E C=1$, then $P_{s i j}=256-m u+D E C=256-18+1=237<T=252$. Hence, $P_{s i j}$ is less than $T$, where as original $p_{i j}>T$.

In Counter example 2, $T$ is an integer multiple of $m u$, and $m u$ is not a power of 2 . Let us consider one more counter example with $T$ not being a multiple of $m u$, and $m u$ being a power of 2 .

Counter example 3. Let $T=252, m u=16, p_{i j}=253>256-m u / 2=256-$ $8=248, D E C=1$, then $P_{s i j}=256-m u+\mathrm{DEC}=249<T=252$.

Hence, $P_{s i j}$ is less than $T$, where as $p_{i j}>T$.
To fix the problem seen from Counter examples 2, 3, let us consider the second amendment of LSBT.

LSBT Amendment 2. Let $T$ be a multiple of $m u$, that is a power of 2:

$$
\begin{gather*}
\mathrm{T}=k 1 * m u,  \tag{3.51}\\
m u=2^{k 2}, \tag{3.52}
\end{gather*}
$$

where $k 1, k 2$ are some positive integers.
Proof of the LSBT Amendment 2 correctness. Let us prove that when (3.50) in the conditions of the Case 2.1, LSBT works correctly if (3.51), (3.52) hold. From (2.37), and assuming that $256=k 3 * m u$,

$$
\begin{gather*}
p_{i j}>256-\frac{m u}{2}=k 3 * m u-\frac{m u}{2}=\left(k 3-\frac{1}{2}\right) * m u,  \tag{3.53}\\
p_{i j} \geq T=k 1 * m u . \tag{3.54}
\end{gather*}
$$

Since $T<256$,

$$
\begin{equation*}
k 1<k 3 . \tag{3.55}
\end{equation*}
$$

According to (3.50), (3.54), (3.55)

$$
\begin{gather*}
P_{s i j}=256-m u+D E C=(k 3-1) * m u+D E C \geq k 1 * m u+D E C  \tag{3.56}\\
=T+D E C \geq T
\end{gather*}
$$

From (3.56), we see that both, $P_{s i j}$ and $p_{i j}$, are not less than $T$.
In extraction algorithm, from (2.56), (2.57), (3.50), and (3.51)

$$
\begin{array}{r}
R E S-E=(256-m u+D E C) \bmod m u=  \tag{3.57}\\
((k 3-1) m u+D E C) \bmod m u=D E C \bmod m u=D E C .
\end{array}
$$

From (3.57), the extracted value, $R E S-E$, and embedded value, $D E C$, are the same. Since LSBT Amendment 2 does not affect conditions of LSBT Amendment 1, we can conclude, that LSBT with Amendments 1 and 2 works correctly in the conditions of Cases 1 and 2.1 of LSBT Embedding Algorithm.

Let us continue proving of LSBT with Amendments 1, 2 for the rest cases of LSBT Embedding Algorithm.

Case 2.2.1.1. $R E S>D E C$

From (2.19) and (2.40),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D=|R E S-D E C|>\frac{m u}{2} . \tag{3.58}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.42) and (3.58),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D E C<R E S-\frac{m u}{2} . \tag{3.59}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.16),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D E C<p_{i j} \bmod m u-\frac{m u}{2} . \tag{3.60}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.41), (2.42), and (3.58),

$$
\begin{equation*}
A V=m u-R E S+D E C . \tag{3.61}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.43) and (3.61)

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}+m u-R E S+D E C . \tag{3.62}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.16), (2.39), and (3.62),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}-p_{i j} \bmod m u+m u+\mathrm{DEC}>p_{i j}+D E C \geq p_{i j}>T . \tag{3.63}
\end{equation*}
$$

Then, from (3.63),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}>T . \tag{3.64}
\end{equation*}
$$

Thus, both $P_{s i j}$ and $p_{i j}$ are greater than $T$.
In extraction algorithm, from (2.15), (2.39), (3.63), and (2.57),

$$
\begin{gathered}
\text { RES-E }=\left(p_{i j}-p_{i j} \bmod m u\right) \bmod m u+\operatorname{mu} \bmod m u+D E C \bmod m u \\
0+0+D E C \bmod m u=D E C .
\end{gathered}
$$

Thus, the extracted value, $R E S-E$, is the same as the embedded value, $D E C$.
Case 2.2.1.2 RES $<D E C$
From (2.19) and (2.40),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D=|R E S-D E C|>\frac{m u}{2} . \tag{3.65}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.44) and (3.60),

$$
\begin{equation*}
\mathrm{DEC}>R E S+\frac{m u}{2} . \tag{3.66}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.16) and (3.66),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D E C>p_{i j} \bmod m u+\frac{m u}{2} . \tag{3.67}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.41), (2.44), and (3.60),

$$
\begin{equation*}
A V=m u-D E C+R E S . \tag{3.68}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.45) and (3.68),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}-m u-R E S+D E C . \tag{3.69}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.16),(3.67), and (3.69),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}>p_{i j}-p_{i j} \bmod m u-m u+p_{i j} \bmod m u+\frac{m u}{2} . \tag{3.70}
\end{equation*}
$$

Then, from (3.70) and (2.39),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}>p_{i j}-\frac{m u}{2}>T . \tag{3.71}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (3.71) and (2.39), both $P_{s i j}, p_{i j}$ are greater than $T$.
In the extraction algorithm, from (2.57), (3.69), (2.15), and (2.16),

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { RES-E }=\left(p_{i j}-p_{i j} \bmod m u\right) \bmod m u-m u \bmod m u+D E C \bmod m u= \\
& \qquad 0+D E C \bmod m u=D E C .
\end{aligned}
$$

Thus, the embedded value, $D E C$, is the same as the extracted value, $R E S-E$.
Case 2.2.2.1 $D \leq \frac{m u}{2}, R E S \geq D E C$
From (2.19) and (2.46),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D=|R E S-D E C| \leq \frac{m u}{2} . \tag{3.72}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.48) and (3.72),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D E C \geq R E S-\frac{m u}{2} . \tag{3.73}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.16) and (3.73),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D E C \geq p_{i j} \bmod m u-\frac{m u}{2} . \tag{3.74}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.47), (2.48), and (2.19),

$$
\begin{equation*}
A V=R E S-D E C . \tag{3.75}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.49) and (3.75),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}-R E S+D E C . \tag{3.76}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.16), (3.72), and (3.74),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j} \geq p_{i j}-p_{i j} \bmod m u+p_{i j} \bmod m u-\frac{m u}{2}=p_{i j}-\frac{m u}{2} \tag{3.77}
\end{equation*}
$$

Then according to (2.39), (3.77),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j} \geq p_{i j}-\frac{m u}{2}>T . \tag{3.78}
\end{equation*}
$$

Thus, from (2.39), (3.78), both $P_{s i j}$ and $p_{i j}$ are greater than $T$.
In the extraction algorithm, from (3.76), (2.15), (2.16), and (2.57),

$$
\begin{gathered}
R E S-E=\left(p_{i j}-p_{i j} \bmod m u\right) \bmod m u+D E C \bmod m u \\
=0+D E C \bmod m u=D E C .
\end{gathered}
$$

Thus, the extracted value, $R E S-E$, is the same as the embedded value, $D E C$.
Case 2.2.2.2. $R E S<D E C$.
From (2.19) and (2.46),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D=|D E C-R E S| \leq \frac{m u}{2} \tag{3.79}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.50) and (3.79),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D E C \leq R E S+\frac{m u}{2} . \tag{3.80}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.16),

$$
\begin{equation*}
D E C \leq p_{i j} \bmod m u+\frac{m u}{2} . \tag{3.81}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.47), (3.79), and (2.50),

$$
\begin{equation*}
A V=D=D E C-R E S \geq 0 \tag{3.82}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.51), (2.39), and (3.82),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}+\mathrm{D}=p_{i j}+\mathrm{DEC}-\mathrm{RES} \geq p_{i j}>T . \tag{3.83}
\end{equation*}
$$

Thus, from (2.39), (3.83), both $P_{s i j}, p_{i j}$ are greater than $T$.
In the extraction algorithm, from (3.82), (2.15) and (2.16),

$$
\begin{gathered}
\text { RES-E }=\left(p_{i j}-p_{i j} \bmod m u\right) \bmod m u+D E C \bmod m u= \\
0+D E C \bmod m u=D E C .
\end{gathered}
$$

Thus, the extracted value, $R E S-E$, is the same as the embedded value, $D E C$.
Case $2.3 T \leq p_{i j}<T+\frac{m u}{2}$.
From (2.16) and (2.53),

$$
\begin{gather*}
P_{s i j}=p_{i j}-p_{i j} \bmod m u+D E C .  \tag{3.84}\\
p_{i j}-p_{i j} \bmod m u=k * m u  \tag{3.85}\\
P_{s i j}=k * m u+D E C \tag{3.86}
\end{gather*}
$$

Due to LSBT Amendment 2, (3.51) holds. Hence, from (2.16), (3.85), and (2.52),

$$
\begin{equation*}
T+\frac{m u}{2}=k 1 * m u+\frac{m u}{2}>p_{i j}=k * m u+R E S \geq \mathrm{T}=k 1 * m u . \tag{3.87}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (3.87),

$$
\begin{equation*}
k 1 * m u \leq k * m u \leq k * m u+R E S<(k 1+0.5) m u<(k 1+1) m u . \tag{3.88}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (3.88) and (2.16),

$$
\begin{equation*}
k 1 \leq k<k 1+1 . \tag{3.89}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (3.89),

$$
\begin{equation*}
k=k 1 . \tag{3.90}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (3.51), (3.86), and (3.90),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=k * m u+D E C=k 1 * m u+D E C=T+D E C . \tag{3.91}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (2.15) and (3.91),

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{s i j}=T+D E C \geq T . \tag{3.92}
\end{equation*}
$$

Thus, from (3.92), we have that both stego-pixel value, $P_{s i j}$, and original cover pixel value, $p_{i j}$, are not less than $T$.

In the extraction algorithm, from (2.52), (3.51), (3.92), and (2.15),

$$
\begin{equation*}
R E S-E=P_{s i j} \bmod m u= \tag{3.93}
\end{equation*}
$$

$=(T+D E C) \bmod m u=(\mathrm{k} 1 * \mathrm{mu}+D E C) \bmod m u=0+D E C \bmod m u=D E C$.

Hence, from (3.93), the extracted value, RES-E, is the same as the embedded value,
$D E C$. Thus, we have proved that:

1. The LSBT algorithm works incorrectly under settings specified in [28]. It is proved by Counter examples 1-3 is showing that stego pixel value and original pixel value may belong to different ranges (not less than $T$, less than $T$, where $T$ is the threshold value) that generally leads to the extracted value different from the embedded value.
2. The LSBT has fixed by the proposed LSBT Amendments 1, 2, imposing conditions (3.43), (3.51), and (3.52). Under these conditions, we prove that LSBT with Amendments 1, 2 works correctly. LSBT modified with the Amendments 1, 2 we call LSBT-M.
3. Settings used for the experiments in [28] satisfy the conditions we have established in the LSBT-M (see conditions (3.43), (3.51), and (3.52)).

### 3.3 Summary of Chapter 3

In this chapter, we have proved correctness of ATD, and shown that LSBT is incorrect for its original settings as well as we solve LSBT problem by conditions (3.43), (3.51), and (3.52) on $T, \boldsymbol{m} \boldsymbol{u}$, and $\boldsymbol{m l}$; LSBT settings used in the experiments [28] satisfy the conditions of LSBT-M.

## Chapter 4

## IMPLEMENTATION OF ATD AND LSBT-M ALGORITHMS FOR GRAY SCALE IMAGES

Now, we will present implementation of ATD and LSBT-M algorithms.

### 4.1 ATD Implementation

We generate a message randomly as secret data, the size of secret data started with $524288=512 * 512 * 2$ bits. In every iteration, it increases by 30,000 bits and we record the values of MSE, PSNR, MSNR, and APSNR. The secret message is divided into non-overlapping blocks the size of block 64-bit; blocks that are converted, at first, to the decimal numeral system, and then to base 3 . We receive in the result of the conversion a block of 41 ternary digits.

A secret message is generated by the MATLAB function 'randi' as follows:
secret_massege= randi([0 1],1,start_length);

A secret message is converted to ternary by the following function: ternary_number=convertto__ternary(secret_massege);

In Appendix A.2, lines 1-37, in this function, the secret data are divided into blocks with size 64 bits; then each 64 -bit block is converted to 41 -ternary-digit block. The first function, in line 11, converts a block to decimal system, and the second function, in line 12 , converts the result of the first function, in line 11 , to ternary. The full code is displayed in Appendix A.2. After preparing the secret data (by converting it to ternary numbers), we embed two ternary digits in each pixel of a cover image.

Then according to Step 2 in ATD as in Appendix A.3, lines 4-13, in line 7 we convert each pixel of the cover image to the base-2 numeral system ( $8 \mathrm{bits} / \mathrm{pixel}$ ) according to (2.3). After that, we divide each pixel into two parts, the first sub segment consisting of the first six bits of the 8 bits (six most significant bits), and the second sub segment consisting of the last two bits (two least significant bits). Then, we modify the pixel according to (2.4), (2.5), as Appendix A.3, lines 14-25.

When embedding the secret message, there is a possibility of overflow/ underflow. An overflow may yield values of some pixel greater than 255 after embedding. The underflow may yield the values of some pixel less than 0 . We avoid them by adding one to the sub-segment (for underflow), or subtracting one from the sub-segment (for overflow), as shown in (2.4) and (2.5). For example,

$$
v_{1}=(11111100)_{2}, \operatorname{sub}_{1}=(111111)_{2}, \operatorname{sub}_{2}=(00)_{2}
$$

Assume the secret digits are $(1,2)$, and to embed this message into the pixel $v$, we should add 1 to $s u b_{1}=(111111)_{2}$ and subtract 1 from $s u b_{2}=(00)$ for embedding the secret data (1,2) as in (2.7), (2.12), but this operation will cause the overflow. Hence, by preprocessing operators (2.4), (2.5), we get sub ${ }_{1}=(111110)_{2}$ and $\operatorname{sub}_{2}^{\prime}=(01)_{2}$. Then, we embed two ternary digits into the pixel as (2.6) to (2.11), the first digit is embedded according to (2.6)- (2.8) as shown in Appendix A.3, lines 27-33, and then the second digit is embedded according to (2.9)-(2.11) as shown in Appendix A.3, lines 35-44.

After embedding all of the secret data into the cover image, we record the values of PSNR, MSNR, APSNR, and BPP as shown in Appendix A.1, lines 20-31, in lines 20 , and 21 , we calculate the mean value of the cover image for calculating the

MSNR (2.64) line 29. In line 28, we calculate the maximal value of the cover image for calculating the APSNR. In lines 27 and 31, we calculate the PSNR (2.59) and APSNR (2.65), respectively. The full code is given in Appendix A. 1 and the results are available in Appendix A.6.

As a sample output of our implementation, and the results for embedding the secret message in the cover image (Lena) are shown in Figures 4.1 and Table 4.2.


Cover image
Stego image
Figure 4.1: Lena Cover Image and Stego Image for ATD Implementation with Secret Message Size 644288 Bits, Appendix A. 6

Table 4.1: ATD Results for Lena Image

| cover_image | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ & \mathrm{dB}_{-} \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{db} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | size_secret_data | Bpp |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| lena. BMP | 39.341881 | 38.994399 | 33.082488 | 7.566452 | 524288 | 2.000000 |
| lena.BMP | 39.093979 | 38.746497 | 32.834586 | 8.010921 | 554288 | 2.114441 |
| lena. BMP | 38.863923 | 38.516441 | 32.604530 | 8.446720 | 584288 | 2.228882 |
| lena. BMP | 38.662911 | 38.315429 | 32.403518 | 8.846863 | 614288 | 2.343323 |
| lena.BMP | 38.435312 | 38.087830 | 32.175919 | 9.322861 | 644288 | 2.457764 |
| lena. BMP | 38.245145 | 37.897663 | 31.985753 | 9.740154 | 674288 | 2.572205 |
| lena. BMP | 38.055621 | 37.708139 | 31.796228 | 10.174622 | 704288 | 2.686646 |
| lena. BMP | 37.874323 | 37.526841 | 31.614930 | 10.608356 | 734288 | 2.801086 |
| lena. BMP | 37.695110 | 37.347628 | 31.435717 | 11.055271 | 764288 | 2.915527 |
| lena.BMP | 37.531930 | 37.184449 | 31.272538 | 11.478558 | 794288 | 3.029968 |
| lena. BMP | 37.396861 | 37.049379 | 31.137469 | 11.841160 | 824288 | 3.144409 |

For extraction stage, we extract a ternary message by extraction function, Appendix
A.4, lines $1-51$. In line 7 is the call the MATLAB function dec2bin to convert the pixel of stego image from decimal to binary, line 8 -10, we divide each binary byte ( 8 bits) into two parts: the first sub-segment consists of the first six bits of the 8 bits, and the second sub-segment consists of the last two bits. And then, we extract the first secret ternary digit from the first sub-segment (2.13), line 12 as well as the second secret ternary digit extract from the stego-pixel (2.14), line 14.

After extracting all the ternary message, we divide the ternary message into blocks with size 41 ternary digits, line 29 . After that, we convert each sequence of 41 ternary digits to decimal, line 48 , then convert the decimal to binary, line 49 . From each pixel, we extract two ternary digits, we continue until all the secret messages are extracted and then convert it to the binary. The text of the code can be viewed in Appendix A.

### 4.2 LSBT-M Implementation

This algorithm LSBT-M is applied with two different types of threshold:

1. Constant threshold ( $T=160$ ) (LSB with Constant Threshold, LSBCT), as in [28], Appendix B.
2. Dynamic threshold according to the next formulation (4.1) (LSB with Dynamic Threshold, LSBDT), Appendix C:

$$
T=\left\{\begin{array}{lr}
\lfloor 160 *(\lceil B P P\rceil-x)+10\rfloor & \text { when }\lceil B P P\rceil \neq x  \tag{4.1}\\
T=160 & \text { Otherwise }
\end{array}\right\},
$$

where $\lceil B P P\rceil$ is the maximal embedding capacity, $\lceil B P P\rceil=3.14, x$ is the number of secret bits embedded in each pixel of cover image in each loop calculated by using (2.63). The LSBDT works correctly by imposing conditions on LSBT-M regarding
$m l$ and $m u$ (3.43), (3.51), and (3.52); according to these conditions, the value of $T$ is a multiple of $m l$ and $m u$, while $m u$ is a power of 2 . The code to calculate $T$ is in Appendix C.1, lines 17-30, in line 17, Appendix C.1, we calculate the value of BPP according to (2.63), in lines 18-22, calculate the value of $T$ according to (4.1). As well as in line 23, we check that the value of $T$ meets the conditions of LSBDT.

In this algorithm, we use two moduli numbers $m u$ and $m l$ to determine how many bits will be embedded in the pixel of a cover image according to the value of a threshold. If the value of a pixel is larger than or equal to the threshold, we use $m u$, otherwise $m l$. From Appendix B.2, line 2-16. we calculate $E C, R E S$, and $D$ according to (2.15) and (2.17) for $E C$ in line 4, (2.16) and (2.18), for RES line 5, (2.19), for $D$ line 16 .

In embedding stage, Appendix B.2, lines 11-25, we check the value of pixel of the cover image; if the pixel value is greater than or equal to the threshold, we use $m u$, otherwise we use the $m l$. In line 13 , compute $E C$ detecting how many bits will be embedded in each pixel as in (2.15) and (2.17). And in line 14, we compute the residue $R E S$ as in (2.16) and (2.18). $D E C$ is the decimal value of $E C$ bit fetched from the secret message. In line 24 , we compute the $D E C$ by the MATLAB function bin2dec. Line 25 calculates $D$ from $D E C$ and RES according to (2.19). Then we embed the secret message according to Case 2 in LSBT:

In embedding part, appendix B.2, lines 26-50, we have two cases.

- The pixel of a cover image is greater than or equal to the threshold.
- The pixel of a cover image less than the threshold.

In each case, we have three different situations to compute the value of pixel of stego
image. The three different situations for the first case are presented in Appendix B.2, lines 26,29 , and 47 according to (2.37), (2.39), and (2.52), respectively. Also, three different situations for the second case are presented in the Appendix B.2, lines 66, 69 , and 87 as in (2.20), (2.22), and (2.35), respectively.

After embedding all of the secret data into the cover image, the values of PSNR (2.59), MSNR, and APSNR are recorded (see Appendix B.1, lines 5-6 and 22-32). In line 6 , we calculate the average value of the cover image to be used in calculating MSNR in line 30, and in line 29, we calculate the maximal value of the cover image for calculating APSNR. In lines 28 and 32, we calculate the PSNR and APSNR respectively. The full code is given in Appendix B. 1 and the results are available in Appendices B. 4 and C.2.

As a sample output of our implementation, the results of embedding the secret message in the cover image (Baboon) are shown in Figure 4.2 and Table 4.2 for LSBDT, and Table 4.3 show results for LSBCT, with $\mathrm{T}=160$.


Figure 4.2: Baboon Cover Image and Stego Image for LSBDT Implementation

Table 4.2: LSBDT Implementation for Baboon Image

| cover_ image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSVR } \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | Actual PSNR dB | $\begin{aligned} & \text { USVIR } \\ & d B \end{aligned}$ | 1198 | M1 | 140 | ? |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Baboon, brpo | 524288 | 43,637205 | 43,037940 | 37,728041 | 2.814232 | 4 | 8 | 192 |
| Baboon, bry | 588288 | 41,491961 | 40,892697 | 35.582797 | 4.611946 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| Baboon, bry | 642288 | 39,981432 | 39,382167 | 34.072268 | 6.530361 | 4 | 8 | 128 |
| Baboon, bryp | 702288 | 38,857527 | 38.258263 | 32.998863 | 8.459967 | 4 | 8 | 96 |
| Baboon, brop | 734288 | 38.378209 | 37,778944 | 32.469045 | 9,446251 | 4 | 8 | 64 |
| Baboon, brp | 764288 | 38.039312 | 37,490047 | 32.130148 | 10.212002 | 4 | 8 | 32 |
| Baboon, brp | 824288 | 35.435728 | 34,836463 | 29,526564 | 18,599770 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

Table 4.3: LSBCT Implementation for Baboon Image; $T=160$

| cover_ image | Size_secret_data | PSVR | Actual _SIVR | MSIR | 1.58 | 11 | 14 | I |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | dB | dB | $d B$ |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Baboon, bry | 524288 | 41.955945 | 41,356681 | 36.046782 | 4.144630 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| Baboon, bryp | 588288 | 41.486587 | 40,887323 | 35.577423 | 4.617657 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| Baboon, bry | 642288 | 36,553475 | 35.954210 | 30.644311 | 14,379139 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| Baboon, bry | 704288 | 36.170410 | 35.571146 | 30.261246 | 15.705051 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| Baboon, bry | 734288 | 35.985098 | 35,385834 | 30.075934 | 16,389683 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| Baboon, bryp | 764288 | 35.784355 | 35.185090 | 29.875191 | 17,165043 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| Baboon, brap | 824288 | 35.431005 | 34,831741 | 29.521841 | 18,620007 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

In the extraction part, for extracting the secret message from the stego image, we need the value of threshold, $T$, and values of two moduli $m u$ and $m l$.

As mentioned before, in Appendix B.3, lines 8-52, we compare the value of the pixel with the threshold value, if the threshold is greater than or equal to the pixel value, we use $m u$, else we use $m l$. In lines 9 and 29 , we compute the value of $E C$ by (2.15) and (2.17), and in lines 10 and 30, RES is calculated by (2.16) and (2.18). Then, we convert $R E S$ to decimal with $E C$ bits. This is the part of code when the pixel value is greater than the threshold, the all code is in Appendix B.3, and results are in

Appendices B. 4 and C.2.

### 4.3 Summary of Chapter 4

Thus, in this chapter, we have implemented and tested ATD, LSBCT, and LSBDT methods. In the ATD method, we take 'Lena' image as an example, and we take as example 'Baboon' image in LSBDT and LSBCT. The results and all codes of methods for all functions are available in the Appendices A, B, and C.

## Chapter 5

## IMPLEMENTATION OF ATD AND LSB ALGORITHMS FOR COLOR IMAGES

In this chapter, we present implementation of LSB and ATD for color images. We use 8 color cover images with size $512 * 512$ pixels and one binary message as a secret message. We use MSE (2.58), PSNR (2.59), SNR (2.60), WPSNR, MSNR (2.64), and WMSNR for evaluating the performance of the both algorithms (ATD and LSB).

### 5.1 LSB Implementation

We have implemented LSB in two different ways. The first way is the traditional LSB with different embedding combinations (224, 242, 422, 134, 143, 314, 341, 413, and 431). It means that, e.g., in combination 143, one-bit is embedded into the Red, four bits into Green, and three bits into the Blue component of the RGB color pixel. The second way is Adaptive LSB (ALSB). In this way, we have two cases:

1) Four bits are embedded into the largest, 3 bits in the middle, and one bit into the lowest color intensity pixel component (ALSBmax).
2) It uses the inverse order of embedding compared to ALSBmin: four bits are embedded into the lowest color intensity pixel component

### 5.1.1 Traditional LSB with Different Embedding Combinations

In the embedding phase, we create a function for embedding the secret message in the cover image. In this function, we split the cover image into three matrices (planes) R, G, and B. The number of bits embedded in each byte of matrixes (R, G,
and B) is determined from the combination that we use. In Appendix D.2, lines 1122; Line 11 detects how many bits to embed in Blue matrix. Line 21 converts bits of the secret image as binary string to decimal by using the MATLAB function bin2dec. Embedding the secret bits in Blue plane according to (2.1) is made in line 22. In lines 25-34, we embed 4 bits in green as in Blue, and in line 35-46 here embed one bit in Red as in Blue, $y$, $u$ return the number of pixel touch to embedding the secret message. The full code can be viewed in the Appendix D.2.

The results of traditional LSB with different embedding combinations (224, 242, 422, 134, 143, 314, 341, 413, and 431) are available in Appendix C.9. Then we calculate MSE (2.58), PSNR (2.59), SNR (2.60), WPSNR, MSNR (2.64), and WMSNR as in Appendix D.1, lines 24-44.

In Appendix D.1, line 24, we call a function, MSE, for calculating the MSE as in (2.58). This function receives the number of pixels modified for embedding the secret message cover image, and stego image as input, and calculates the mean square error in Red, Green, and Blue matrixes as in the Appendix D.4, lines 1-16.

In Appendix D.1, line 32, we call function to calculate the value of WAPSNR by calculating the actual maximal value in Red, Green, and Blue matrices. Then calculating APSNR (2.65) for each matrix (Red, Green, and Blue) then weigh them by equal weights ( $1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3$ ) ) as in Appendix D.7, line 11.

In Appendix D.1, line 25, we calculate the value of MSE over all the image. In line 26, Appendix D.1, we call function, PSNR, to calculate the PSNR as in (2.59) for the image as a whole and each matrix ( $\mathrm{R}, \mathrm{G}$, and B ). Code of PSNR function is given in Appendix D.5, lines 1-6.

In Appendix D.1, line 29, we call the function MSNR to calculate MSNR. In this function, first we calculate the mean value for each matrix ( $\mathrm{R}, \mathrm{G}$, and B ). Then, MSNR is calculated for each matrix (R, G, and B), Appendix D.6, lines 1-14.

In Appendix D.1, lines 40-43, we calculate value of SNR as in (2.60) by calling the function, SNR, Appendix D.8, lines 1-12, for calculating the variances of the color component (R, G, and B) of the cover image and variances of added noise in color component ( $\mathrm{R}, \mathrm{G}$, and B).

As a sample output of our implementation, the results for embedding the secret message in the cover image 'Lena', when using combination 134 are shown in Figures 5.1 and 5.2.


Figure 5.1: Lena Cover Image and Stego Image for LSB with Combination (134) Implementation. Appendix D. 9


Figure 5.2: Quality Measures for Lena Image After Secret Message Embedding by LSB for Combination (134)

In the extraction function, Appendix D.3, we need combination that is used in embedding phase to extract the secret message.

### 5.1.2 Adaptive LSB (ALSB) Implementation

In Adaptive LSB (see Appendix E) all of the functions are similar to the traditional LSB except for two differences. The first difference is that we calculate the color intensity by calculating the average of each matrix (Red, Green, and Blue matrices) according to the next formula (5.1):

$$
\begin{equation*}
A C k=\frac{\sum_{i=1}^{M} \sum_{j=1}^{N} C I(i, j, k)}{M N} . \tag{5.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

Where $C I$ is the color matrix (Red, Green, and Blue matrices), $\mathrm{k}=1,2,3, N M$ is the number of pixels of the image, and $A C k$ is the average of color for matrix $k$.

As we described before (Section 5.1, beginning), we have ALSBmax and ALSBmin variants of ALSB.

Appendix E.1, in line 9, 11, and 13, we calculate the mean of matrixes (Red, Green, and Blue). In Appendix E.1, lines 33-56, we compare the averages of the matrixes to detect the embedding capacity in each matrix.

In embedding stage, Appendix E.2, lines8-10, we embed the number of bits to be embedded into each matrix (Red, Green, and Blue) in first pixel of cover image for the future use in the extraction stage this the second difference.

The results for embedding the secret message in the cover image 'Lena' are shown in Figures 5.1 and 5.3.


Figure 5.3: Quality Measures for ALSBmin for Lena Image

For extraction, in main program, Appendix E, we call the extraction function. In this function, Appendix E.3, lines 8-10, we extract from the first pixel of the stego-image according (2.2) how many bits are embedded in each matrix ( $R, G$, and $B$ ), and then extract the secret message (see Appendix E.3).

### 5.2 ATD Implementation

We have implemented ATD with combinations $(112,121,211)$ defining number of ternary digits embedded in each component, ( $\mathrm{R}, \mathrm{G}, \mathrm{B}$ ) of a color pixel. Also in LSB, we have also considered combinations corresponding to 8 BPP. In this algorithm ATD, we calculate the MSE (2.58), PSNR (2.59), WPSNR, SNR (2.60), MSNR (2.64), and WMSNR only for modified pixel.

In the embedding and extraction phases, given in Appendices F.2, F.3, all of the functions are similar to ATD in gray scale image. Just here we have three matrixes (Red, Green, and Blue), and a number of ternary digits embedded in each matrix depend on the combination we use (112, 121, and 211). The all code of ATD is given in Appendix F.

Results of embedding of the secret message in the cover image 'Lena' for the combination (112) are shown in Figures 5.1 and 5.4.

| dB |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| lena_color.jpg | 1280000 | 37.550079 | 11.430689 |
| PSNR_R=37.353306 | PSNR_G |  | PSNR_B=37.652425 |
| MSNR_R=34.334176 | MSNR_G |  | MSNR_B=29.991048 |
| MSNR=31.580308 |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) $=37.532529$ |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR (0.4_0.3_0.3) $=37.532471$ |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR (1/3_1/3_1/3) $=37.552378$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) $=31.594103$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR (0.4_0.3_0.3) $=31.562625$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR (1/3_1/3_1/3) $=31.254675$ |  |  |  |
| Actual_PSNR_weight (1/3_1/3_1/3) $=36.915868$ |  |  |  |
| SNR=16.354770 |  |  |  |

Figure 5.4: ATD Quality Measures for Lena Cover Image

### 5.3 Summary of Chapter 5

Thus, in this chapter, we have implemented and explained ATD and LSB in two difference ways (Traditional LSB with combinations, ALSB), we have presented 'Lena' image result as an example. All results and full codes and all functions in ATD and LSB are available in the Appendix D, E, and F.

## Chapter 6

## EXPERIMENTS RESULTS

In this chapter, we discuss the experiments results of the algorithms for the gray scale (Section 6.1) and color scale (Section 6.2).

### 6.1 Gray Scale Image Results for ATD, LSBCT, and LSBDT

Fifteen gray scale cover images with size $512 \times 512$ pixels used in the experiments are shown in Figure 6.1. Secret messages in these experiments are generated randomly with different sizes. First, we start with the size of a secret message equal to 524288 $(512 * 512 * 2)$ bits, and then increase the size by 30,000 bits every iteration, and record the values of quality measures. The simulation steps show in Figure 6.2.


Figure 6.1: Gray Scale Cover Images Used in ATD, LSBCT, and LSBDT Simulation


Figure 6.2: Flowchart for Gray Scale Simulation Steps

### 6.1.1 ATD Results

Table 6.1 shows the PSNR for 15 cover images in Figure 6.3 and EC in the range [2, 3.14] BPP; raw data are in Appendix A.6.

Table 6.1: PSNR of ATD

| Cover <br> image | 2 | 2.22 | 2.46 | 2.69 | 2.80 | 2.92 | 3.14 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | ECNR (dB) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 39.86 | 38.86 | 38.41 | 38.02 | 37.85 | 37.69 | 37.39 |  |
| 2 | 39.32 | 38.86 | 38.44 | 38.04 | 37.87 | 37.69 | 37.41 |  |
| 3 | 39.34 | 38.86 | 38.43 | 38.04 | 37.87 | 37.69 | 37.38 |  |
| 4 | 39.33 | 38.87 | 38.42 | 38.05 | 37.85 | 37.71 | 37.40 |  |
| 5 | 39.35 | 38.87 | 38.44 | 38.06 | 37.86 | 37.69 | 37.38 |  |
| 6 | 39.33 | 38.86 | 38.44 | 38.06 | 37.86 | 37.68 | 37.41 |  |
| 7 | 39.32 | 38.87 | 38.44 | 38.05 | 37.90 | 37.69 | 37.41 |  |
| 8 | 39.34 | 38.87 | 38.45 | 38.05 | 37.87 | 37.68 | 37.41 |  |
| 9 | 39.35 | 38.86 | 38.44 | 38.06 | 37.87 | 37.69 | 37.40 |  |
| 10 | 39.25 | 38.79 | 38.37 | 37.99 | 37.82 | 37.63 | 37.35 |  |
| 11 | 39.33 | 38.86 | 38.44 | 38.04 | 37.88 | 37.69 | 37.40 |  |
| 12 | 39.33 | 38.87 | 38.42 | 38.05 | 37.86 | 38.68 | 37.39 |  |
| 13 | 39.33 | 38.85 | 38.44 | 38.05 | 37.86 | 37.70 | 37.41 |  |
| 14 | 39.25 | 38.70 | 38.27 | 37.81 | 37.59 | 37.41 | 37.12 |  |
| 15 | 39.29 | 38.84 | 38.40 | 38.01 | 37.83 | 37.67 | 37.36 |  |
| Average <br> PSNR <br> (dB) | 39.35 | 38.85 | 38.42 | 38.03 | 37.84 | 37.73 | 37.57 |  |

For 15 different cover images, we get close results for PSNR. Averaged over 15 images dependence on $E C$ is shown in Figure 6.3.


Figure 6.3: Average PSNR of ATD

From Table 6.1 and Figure 6.3, we see that PSNR slightly decreases from 39.35 dB
to 37.57 dB when the embedding capacity, $E C$, increases from 2 BPP to 3.14 BPP.

### 6.1.2 LSBCT Results

We have implemented this algorithm with constant threshold $T=160$ as in [26], and we use two different groups of moduli $((m l=4, m u=8)$ and $(m l=8, m u=16))$. These moduli values are defined according to the size of the secret message. Under assumption that the cover image pixel values are distributed uniformly in $\{0, . ., 255\}$, maximal embedding capacity, $M A X-E C$, dependence on threshold $m l$, and $m u$, $M A X-E C(T, m l, m u)$, may be defined as follows:

$$
\begin{equation*}
M A X-E C(T, m l, m u)=\frac{T}{256} * \log _{2} m l+\frac{256-T}{256} * \log _{2} m u . \tag{6.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (6.1),
$M A X-E C(160,4,8)=\frac{160}{256} * 2+(256-160) / 256 * 3=2.376 B P P$.
From (6.2), we see that the secret message for $E C<2.376$ may be embedded with $T=160, m l=4, m u=8$ (as in the first two columns of Table 6.2), but for $\mathrm{EC}>2.376$, it is necessary using $m l=8, m u=16$.

Actually, $M A X-E C(160,8,16)=\frac{160}{256} * 3+96 / 256 * 4=3.375 B P P$ and all the $E C$ in Table 6.2 are less than that value.

Table 6.2: PSNR for LSBCT Algorithm

| Cover image | EC (BPP) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 2 | 2.22 | 2.46 | 2.69 | 2.80 | 2.92 | 3.14 |
|  | ml |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | 4 | 8 | 8 | 8 | 8 | 8 |
|  | mu |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 8 | 8 | 16 | 16 | 16 | 16 | 16 |
|  | PSNR (dB) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 42.18 | 41.75 | 36.64 | 36.28 | 36.11 | 35.95 | 35.65 |
| 2 | 41.93 | 41.40 | 36.38 | 36.06 | 35.91 | 35.75 | 35.34 |
| 3 | 42.96 | 42.70 | 37.47 | 37.11 | 36.96 | 36.07 | 36.04 |
| 4 | 42.60 | 42.40 | 37.20 | 36.83 | 36.71 | 36.06 | 36.37 |
| 5 | 41.81 | 41.28 | 36.54 | 36.09 | 35.90 | 35.67 | 35.31 |
| 6 | 41.25 | 40.90 | 35.61 | 35.32 | 35.20 | 35.08 | 34.91 |
| 7 | 41.97 | 41.48 | 36.54 | 36.16 | 35.99 | 35.77 | 35.49 |
| 8 | 40.21 | 39.80 | 34.54 | 34.22 | 34.06 | 33.93 | 33.57 |
| 9 | 40.82 | 40.41 | 35.12 | 34.79 | 34.65 | 34.50 | 34.20 |
| 10 | 40.75 | 40.49 | 34.94 | 34.67 | 34.58 | 34.51 | 34.31 |
| 11 | 42.55 | 42.11 | 37.31 | 36.80 | 36.61 | 36.39 | 36.03 |
| 12 | 41.30 | 41.03 | 35.63 | 35.41 | 35.35 | 35.22 | 35.04 |
| 13 | 42.79 | 42.36 | 37.17 | 36.89 | 36.74 | 36.61 | 36.23 |
| 14 | 41.16 | 40.77 | 35.44 | 35.14 | 34.95 | 34.80 | 34.60 |
| 15 | 43.78 | 43.73 | 38.72 | 38.31 | 38.12 | 37.92 | 37.92 |
| Average PSNR dB | 41.87 | 41.51 | 36.35 | 36.01 | 35.86 | 35.70 | 35.41 |

Table 6.2 shows PSNR for LSBCT for 15 images and values of $m l$ and $m u$ we use in our experiment and BPP $\in[2,3.14]$. To evaluate the performance of LSBCT, we average PSNR overall the stego images, also shown in Figure 6.4. Raw results are given in Appendix B.4.


Figure 6.4: Average PSNR for LSBCT

From Figure 6.4, we see that the maximum value of PSNR is 41.87 dB for embedding capacity 2 BPP. On the other hand, when we increase the embedding capacity, we get the minimal value of PSNR about 35.41 for embedding capacity 3.14 BPP. Also, from the Figure 6.4, we see a sharp drop in the value of PSNR when the embedding capacity is higher than 2.22 BPP , which drops from 41.87 dB for 2.22 BPP to 36.35 dB for 2.46 BPP. To avoid the sharp drop as we mentioned before, we use the $m l=8$ and $m u=16$ instead of $m l=4, m u=8$ according to (6.1)-(6.3). This change leads to a great number of bits embedded and, hence, a great distortion.

### 6.1.3 LSBDT Results

We have implemented LSB with dynamic threshold. The value of the threshold is calculated according to (4.1). Also, here we use two different groups of moduli $((m l=4, m u=8)$ and $(m l=8, m u=16))$. These moduli values are defined according to the size of the secret message as in Section 6.1.2, All results are shown in Appendix C.2.
$>$ Example of the threshold value calculation:
From Table 6.3, if the size of the secret message is 764288 bits, the maximum embedding capacity in our experiment is 3.14 BPP , and the size of the cover image is $512 * 512$, then we first calculate the embedding capacity, x , according to (2.63).

$$
x=\frac{764288}{512 * 512}=2.92
$$

Then substitute x in (4.1):

$$
T=\lfloor 160 *([3.14\rceil-2.92)+10\rfloor=45 .
$$

Check if value of the threshold, $T$ is a multiple of $m u(m u=16)$ or not. If it is a multiple of $m u$, then keep it. Otherwise, choose a small number that is a multiple of $m u$. In this example, result is 45 that is not a multiple of $m u=16$. Hence, we select a small number that is a multiple of $m u=16$, it is 32 . After that, we calculate the maximal embedding capacity, $M A X-E C$, according to (6.1) as follows:

$$
M A X-E C(32,4,8)=\frac{32}{256} * 2+\frac{256-32}{256} * 3=2.875
$$

Since $\operatorname{Max}-E C(32,4,8)=2.875<x=2.92$ then we can't embed all secret message with this threshold. Thus, again decrease threshold by $m u$ and recheck the actual embedding capacity in our example $T=32$ after subtraction $T=32-16=$ 16 then recheck the as follows:
$M A X-E C(16,4,8)=\frac{16}{256} * 2+\frac{256-16}{256} * 3=2.9375, M A X-E C=2.9375>x=$ 2.92, hence we can embed all secret messages with this threshold, $T=16$.

Table 6.3: PSNR for LSBDT Algorithm

| Cover image | Size of secret message (Bits) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 524288 | 584288 | 644288 | 704288 | 734288 | 764288 | 824288 |
|  | EC(BPP) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 2 | 2.22 | 2.46 | 2.69 | 2.80 | 2.92 | 3.14 |
|  | ml |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 8 |
|  | $m u$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 8 | 8 | 8 | 8 | 8 | 8 | 16 |
|  | $T$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 192 | 160 | 128 | 80 | 48 | 16 | 160 |
|  | PSNR (dB) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 43.21 | 41.76 | 40.04 | 39.03 | 38.55 | 38.05 | 35.60 |
| 2 | 43.42 | 41.41 | 40.15 | 39.29 | 38.54 | 38.19 | 35.36 |
| 3 | 44.12 | 42.68 | 40.59 | 39.33 | 38.60 | 38.08 | 35.47 |
| 4 | 43.18 | 42.41 | 41.22 | 39.48 | 38.55 | 38.08 | 35.37 |
| 5 | 42.94 | 41.31 | 39.80 | 38.34 | 38.34 | 38.04 | 35.33 |
| 6 | 42 | 40.90 | 40.09 | 38.88 | 38.88 | 38.52 | 34.79 |
| 7 | 43.67 | 41.47 | 40 | 38.87 | 38.36 | 38.07 | 35.45 |
| 8 | 40.57 | 39.79 | 39.20 | 38.63 | 38.31 | 38.09 | 35.59 |
| 9 | 41.82 | 40.41 | 39.41 | 38.79 | 38.41 | 38.13 | 34.21 |
| 10 | 43.66 | 40.50 | 39.46 | 38.86 | 38.54 | 38.15 | 34.30 |
| 11 | 43.26 | 42.11 | 41.12 | 39.64 | 39.05 | 38.52 | 35.99 |
| 12 | 43.02 | 41.02 | 39.73 | 39.01 | 38.80 | 38.66 | 35.02 |
| 13 | 43.78 | 43.74 | 42.90 | 42.12 | 40.06 | 38.60 | 34.78 |
| 14 | 42.09 | 40.78 | 40.01 | 39.38 | 38.97 | 38.71 | 34.59 |
| 15 | 43.76 | 42.36 | 40.14 | 38.95 | 38.48 | 38.13 | 35.23 |
| Average PSNR dB | 42.97 | 41.51 | 40.26 | 39.30 | 38.70 | 38.27 | 35.48 |

Table 6.3 shows PSNR of LSBDT algorithm for all images, as well as average over all images, and values of T, $m l$, and $m u$ that we use in our experiments. As we see from the Table 6.3, the quality of a stego-image drops when the size of the secret message increases; raw results are shown in Appendix C.2.


Figure 6.5: Average PSNR for LSBDT

From Figure 6.5, we can see that the maximum value of PSNR it reaches 42.97 dB when the embedding capacity is equal to 2 BPP . Figure 6.5 illustrates a noticeable drop in the value of PSNR when the embedding capacity is between 2 BPP and 2.92 BPP which drops from 42.97 dB to 38.27 dB . Then we see a sharp drop in the value of PSNR when the embedding capacity is higher than 2.92 BPP. PSNR drops rapidly from 38.27 dB for 2.92 BPP to 35.48 dB for $E C=3.14 \mathrm{BPP}$, because the number of distorted bits increases from $\{2,3\}$ for $m l=4, m u=8$ to $\{3,4\}$ for $m l=8$, $m u=16$.

### 6.1.4 ATD, LSBDT, and LSBCT Comparison Results

Comparison results for the both methods obtained for PSNR (2.59) are shown in Table 6.4.

Table 6.4: PSNR (dB) for LSBCT ( $T=160$ ), LSBDT, and ATD Dependence on $E C$ (BPP)

| EC (BPP) | LSBCT (T=160) | LSBDT | ATD |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 | 41.87 | 42.97 | 39.35 |
| 2.22 | 41.51 | 41.51 | 38.85 |
| 2.46 | 36.35 | 40.26 | 38.42 |
| 2.69 | 36.01 | 39.30 | 38.03 |
| 2.80 | 35.70 | 38.27 | 37.73 |
| 2.92 | 35.41 | 35.48 | 37.57 |
| 3.14 | 41.87 | 42.97 | 39.35 |



Figure 6.6: PSNR (dB) for ATD and LSBCT ( $\mathrm{T}=160$ ) and LSBDT Dependence on EC (BPP)

From the Table 6.4 and Figure 6.6, it is evident that the quality of the image for ATD is slightly affected by the increase of the embedding capacity. LSBCT and LSBDT have a high quality for the embedding capacity up to 2.22 BPP. LSBDT PSNR reaches 42.97 dB , while LSBCT reaches 41.87 dB for embedding capacity $E C=2$ BPP. For embedding capacity between 2.22 BPP and 2.46 BPP, LSBCT PSNR drops quickly to 36.35 dB . After that, it falls slightly and reaches 35.41 dB at $E C=3.14$ BPP.

ATD has a higher PSNR than LSBDT when embedding capacity is more than 3 BPP; this is because in LSBDT uses modules with values $\{8,16\}$ for the large-size secret messages. It means that in each pixel it embeds 3 or 4 bits according to the threshold, and the maximum possible distortion by embedding is 15 , and for ATD, the maximum possible distortion is 10 (e.g., when sub1 and sub2 are increased from 0 to 1 , and then sub1 and resulting pixel are again increased by 1 ; each increase of sub1, gives increase by 4 , an increase of sub2 and of the pixel results in increase by 2 ).

### 6.1.5 Comparison Versus Known Experiments Results

From the known experiments are shown in section 2.6, Table 2.1, Figure 2.17, and from our results in Table 6.4 and Figure 6.6, when we compare the ATD and LSBCT as in the known experiments we don't get the same result as in the paper [28]. Therefore, we modify the LSBCT to LSBDT to get the same result as in the paper [28].

### 6.2 Results for Color Images

In this section, we discuss the results of LSB, ALSBmax, ALSBmin, and ATD for different combinations of embedding into color scale images.

### 6.2.1 LSB and ALSBmax, ALSBmin Results

Cover color scale images with sizes of $512 \times 512$ pixels used in the experiments are shown in Figure 6.7. The secret message in this experiment is constant. The raw results are shown in Appendices D. 9 and E.3. The simulation steps show in Figure 6.8.


Figure 6.7: Cover Images Used for Experiments with ATD and LSB


Figure 6.8: Flowchart for Color Image Embedding by ATD, LSB, and ALSB Simulation Steps

Table 6.5 shows the PSNR of LSB for combinations (134, 143, 341, 314, 413, 431, 224, 242, and 422); and PSNR of Adaptive LSB in both cases the raw results are in

Appendices D. 9 and E.3.

Table 6.5: PSNR (dB) for LSB in Different Combinations and ALSBmax, ALSBmin

| LSB for different combinations |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :--- |
| ALSBmax | ALSBmin |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Color <br> Image | $4 \_2 \_2$ | $2 \_4 \_2$ | $2 \_2 \_4$ | $4 \_3 \_1$ | $3 \_4 \_1$ | $4 \_1 \_3$ | $1 \_4 \_3$ | $3 \_1 \_4$ | $1 \_3 \_4$ |  |  |
| Pepper | 36.15 | 33.9 | 36.97 | 35.64 | 35.68 | 35.75 | 35.58 | 36.35 | 36.46 | 35.58 | 36.46 |
| Lena | 35.95 | 36.15 | 36.63 | 35.46 | 35.68 | 35.57 | 34.3 | 36.05 | 34.6 | 36.05 | 34.6 |
| Baboon | 36.17 | 36.13 | 35.05 | 37.01 | 35.66 | 35.77 | 35.62 | 36.32 | 36.33 | 36.62 | 36.33 |
| Barbra | 33.16 | 36.1 | 34 | 36.63 | 35.66 | 35.76 | 35.62 | 36.3 | 36.31 | 35.63 | 36.31 |
| Balloon | 36.18 | 36.16 | 37.01 | 35.64 | 35.66 | 35.78 | 35.63 | 36.4 | 36.38 | 36.38 | 36.4 |
| Blue | 38.28 | 36.19 | 37.66 | 37.44 | 34.52 | 35.01 | 35.66 | 38.89 | 34.08 | 34.08 | 37.44 |
| Green | 34.46 | 36.39 | 36.85 | 34.1 | 35.58 | 34.24 | 33.08 | 35.99 | 36.29 | 34.1 | 34.1 |
| Red | 35.47 | 36.09 | 33.51 | 34.98 | 35.7 | 36.5 | 35.55 | 35.9 | 35.91 | 34.98 | 35.91 |



Figure 6.9: PSNR for LSB for Different Embedding Combinations and ALSBmax, ALSBmin

As we can see from the Table 6.5 and Figure 6.9, different LSB combinations for various images are in different relations while the embedding capacity is the same. $E C=8$ BPP. For example, for Lena, $\mathrm{PSNR}=35.95 \mathrm{~dB}$ in 422 combination is less than PSNR=36.15 dB for 242 combination, whereas for Blue, PSNR for 422 combination is greater than PSNR for 242 combination.


Figure 6.10: SNR for LSB for Different Embedding Combinations and ALSBmax, ALSBmin

From the other side, SNR (2.60) for LSB is less than PSNR dependent on the images but still two combinations on different images may be in inverse relationships (e.g., SNR for 431 on Barbara is less than SNR for 431, but on Balloon, SNR for 431 is greater than SNR for 431) as we can see in Figure 6.10.

### 6.2.2 ATD Results

In this algorithm as in gray scale, we convert the secret message to base 3 , and we embed in each pixel 4 ternary digits in different combinations 211, 121, and 112. For example, if we use 211 combination, it means that two ternary digits are embedded in red color component, one ternary digit in Green color component, and one ternary digit into Blue color component. Results are given in Table 6.6 and Figure 6.11; raw results are in Appendix F.3.

Table 6.6: PSNR (dB) for ATD for Different Combinations Result

| Cover Image | Combinations |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 211 | 121 | 112 |
| Peppers | 37.41 | 37.42 | 37.42 |
| Lena | 37.55 | 37.55 | 37.55 |
| Baboon | 37.56 | 37.56 | 37.56 |
| Barbara | 37.57 | 37.56 | 37.57 |
| Balloon | 37.42 | 37.43 | 37.43 |
| Blue | 37.55 | 37.54 | 37.54 |
| Green | 34.50 | 34.50 | 34.50 |
| Red | 36.77 | 36.76 | 36.77 |



Figure 6.11: PSNR for ATD for Different Embedding Combinations

From Figure 6.11 and Table 6.6, we see that PSNR for ATD is not affected by the combination but it depends on image; PSNR for this algorithm is in range from 34.50 dB to 37.57 dB ; we get the minimum value in the Green image for all combinations.


Figure 6.12: SNR for ATD in Different Embedding Combinations

For SNR we get the smallest value for Green image is 7.1 dB , and Lena image has the largest value of SNR, 16.5 dB , as Figure 6.12 shows.

### 6.2.3 ATD and LSB Comparison Results

Figure 6.13 shows ATD versus LSB comparison results using $512 \times 512$ cover images.


Figure 6.13: PSNR for ATD and LSB

As we can see from Figure 6.13, ATD has a large value of PSNR when we compare
it with LSB algorithm, except for the Green image. In this image, the ATD algorithm gets a small value of 34.5 dB . The value of PSNR for LSB algorithm changes between 35.4 dB and 36.7 dB .

On the other hand, SNR for ATD and LSB is very close to each other as we see in Figure 6.14 except for the Green image. The quality of ATD is less than LSB as shown in Figure 6.14 which drops to approximately 9 dB for LSB and to 7 dB for ATD.


Figure 6.14: SNR (dB) for ATD and LSB

### 6.2.4 Comparison Versus Known Experiments Results

From the known experiments are shown in section 2.5, Table 2.2, in [24] they implement LSB with combinations 134 on two cover images (Lena, Baboon), in addition, we implement LSB with 8 different combinations and on 8 cover images shown in figure 6.7. Also, we modify LSB to ALSB (ALSBmax, ALSBmin).

### 6.3 Study of the Quality Metrics

According to our experiments which we discussed in Section 6.2, when we embed 8
bits in each pixel, we obtain PSNR a different behavior for various combinations and images. We expect that good combinations shall depend on image and shall be little dependent on the combinations since all of them modify the same number of bits ( 8 bits).To solve this problem, we consider the following measures: MSNR (Mean Signal to Noise Ratio) and APSNR (Actual PSNR). MSNR (2.64) is calculated as the mean value of all image pixels and changing the possible peak signal value, which is 255 in equation (2.59), to the mean value of matrix. And APSNR (2.65) improves PSNR by considering actual peak signal instead of possible peak signal which is 255 in equation (2.59). Then we weigh MSNR and PSNR by three different groups of weights (group1values, $(0.4,0.243$, and 0.357$)$ ), we get as the follows:

From Figure 2.15, we get $h_{R}=0.35, h_{G}=0.3125$, and $h_{B}=0.2125$,
$H_{\text {sum }}=h_{R}+h_{G}+h_{B}=0.875$.
After normalizing:

$$
\begin{gathered}
\grave{h_{R}}=\frac{h_{R}}{H_{\text {sum }}}=\frac{0.25}{0.875}=0.4, \\
\grave{h_{G}}=\frac{h_{G}}{H_{\text {sum }}}=\frac{0.2125}{0.875}=0.243, \\
\grave{h_{B}}=\frac{h_{B}}{H_{\text {sum }}}=\frac{0.3125}{0.875}=0.357 .
\end{gathered}
$$

We have suggested two other group of weights (group 2 values, ( $0.4,0.3,0.3$ ), and group3 values ( $1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3)$ ).

### 6.3.1 MSNR and APSNR for Gray Scale Images

- ATD Results

APSNR for ATD dependence on embedding capacity is shown in Figure 6.15. APSNR decreases with the increase of the embedding capacity. It arrives at 37.07 dB when embedding capacity is equal to 3.1 BPP .


Figure 6.15: APSNR (dB) of ATD

MSNR for ATD dependence on embedding capacity is shown in Figure 6.16. We see that MSNR has the same form as PSNR and APSNR. It decreases from 32.85 dB when $E C=2$ BPP to 30.87 when $E C=3.1 \mathrm{BPP}$.


Figure 6.16: MSNR (dB) of ATD

## - LSBCT Results

APSNR for LSB with Constant Threshold algorithm reaches the maximum value
41.53 dB for embedding capacity, $E C=2 \mathrm{BPP}$ and minimum value 35.07 dB for 3.1 BPP as shown in Figure 6.17. For MSNR there is a severe decrease in the quality of the stego image when increasing the embedding capacity, it drops to 29.10 dB , shown in Figure 6.18.


Figure 6.17: APSNR (dB) for LSBCT


Figure 6.18: MSNR (dB) for LSBCT

## - LSBDT Results

APSNR and MSNR for LSBDT in Figures 6.19 and 6.20 reach the maximum value 42.62 dB and 36.58 dB respectively for the embedding capacity, $E C=2 \mathrm{BPP}$. So these values quickly drop to 34.99 dB and 29.09 dB , respectively.


Figure 6.19: APSNR (dB) for LSBDT


Figure 6.20: MSNR (dB) for LSBDT

- ATD, LSBCT and LSBDT Comparison Using MSNR and APSNR

From Figures 6.21 and 6.22 , we can see that MSNR and APSNR for the three
algorithms (LSBCT and LSBDT, and ATD), have the same form as of PSNR. LSBDT reaches 42.62 dB for APSNR, and 36.58 dB for MSNR, while LSBCT gets 41.53 dB for APSNR, and 35.52 dB for MSNR when $\mathrm{EC}=2 \mathrm{BPP}$. When EC increases from 2.2 BPP to 2.4 BPP , LSBCT quality drops quickly in all metrics it gets 36.01 dB for APSNR, and 30.02 dB for MSNR. After that, it falls slightly to reach 35.07 dB for APSNR, and 29.10 dB for MSNR.


Figure 6.21: APSNR (dB) for ATD and LSBCT and LSBDT


Figure 6.22: MSNR (dB) for ATD and LSBCT and LSBDT

### 6.3.2 WPSNR, MSNR, and WMSNR for Color Images

- LSB Results

From Figures 6.23-6.24, we see that PSNR after weighing for LSB with embedding capacity 8 BPP and the values of weight ( $0.4,0.243,0.357$ ) come from human color perception as in Section 6.3 and other weights $(0.4,0.3,0.3)$ and $(1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3)$ we take values close to that weight calculate from human color perception, for different combinations still fluctuates but as we see from figures 6.23-6.25 the PSNR with weights $(1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3)$, it has more plateau when we compare it with other weights ( $0.4,0.3,0.3$ ) and ( $0.4,0.243,0.357$ ), and PSNR.


Figure 6.23: Weighed PSNR (dB) by $(0.4,0.243$, and 0.357$)$ for LSB for Different Embedding Combinations


Figure 6.24: Weighed PSNR (dB) by ( $0.4,0.3,0.3$ ) for LSB for Different Embedding Combinations


Figure 6.25: Weighed PSNR (dB) by $(1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3)$ for LSB for Different Embedding Combinations and ALSBmax, ALSBmin

According to our result in PSNR and WPSNR for different weights, we consider MSNR as in Figure 6.26 and Table 6.7 show the value of MSNR for different combinations as we described in Chapter 5. We calculate the mean value of an image (2.64) and this changed the maximum possible value 255 in formula (2.59) by mean value of the image. With MNSR we get improvement in the result obtained by PSNR and WPANR as we show in Figure 6.26, MSNR has nearly one and the same value for different combinations with the same embedding capacity but we see there is
more improvement in the result obtained by considering WMSNR with three groups weights as Section 6.3.


Figure 6.26: MSNR (dB) for LSB for Different Embedding Combinations and ALSBmax, ALSBmin

Table 6.7: MSNR (dB) for LSB and ALSB Methods Result

| Cover <br> Image | LSB for different combinations |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $4 \_2 \_2$ | $2 \_4 \_2$ | $2 \_2 \_4$ | $4 \_3 \_1$ | $3 \_4 \_1$ | $4 \_1 \_3$ | $1 \_4 \_3$ | $3 \_1 \_4$ | $1 \_3 \_4$ |  |  |
| Pepper | 24.86 | 24.81 | 25.66 | 24.34 | 24.38 | 24.46 | 24.27 | 25.04 | 25.05 | 25.04 | 25.05 |
| Lena | 26.28 | 26.44 | 26.98 | 25.78 | 25.96 | 25.89 | 25.88 | 26.40 | 26.41 | 26.41 | 25.88 |
| Baboon | 25.84 | 25.79 | 26.61 | 25.30 | 25.32 | 25.44 | 25.28 | 25.99 | 25.99 | 25.30 | 25.99 |
| Barbra | 25.16 | 25.09 | 25.93 | 24.62 | 24.66 | 24.76 | 24.60 | 25.32 | 25.32 | 24.63 | 25.32 |
| Balloon | 26.28 | 26.20 | 27.12 | 25.74 | 25.73 | 25.89 | 25.68 | 26.50 | 26.49 | 25.73 | 25.68 |
| Blue | 21.05 | 18.96 | 19.5 | 20.21 | 18.28 | 20.38 | 18.40 | 18.65 | 18.92 | 18.92 | 20.21 |
| Green | 11.04 | 12.76 | 13.43 | 10.66 | 12.13 | 10.82 | 12.34 | 12.57 | 12.86 | 12.34 | 12.57 |
| Red | 27.79 | 28.60 | 28.90 | 27.31 | 28.20 | 27.46 | 28.08 | 28.28 | 28.30 | 27.46 | 28.30 |

To improve MSNR, we weigh MSNR similar as we have done for PSNR. Results obtained are shown in Figures 6.26-6.28.


Figure 6.27: Weighed MSNR (dB) by ( $0.4,0.3$, and 0.3 ) for LSB for Different Embedding Combinations and ALSBmax, ALSBmin


Figure 6.28: Weighed MSNR (dB) by ( $0.4,0.243$, and 0.357 ) for LSB for Different Embedding Combinations and ALSBmax, ALSBmin


Figure 6.29: Weighed MSNR (dB) by ( $1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3$ ) for LSB for Different Embedding Combinations and ALSBmax, ALSBmin

As we see from Figures 6.27-6.29, weighed MSNR with weight ( $1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3$ ) looks invariant for different combinations when we compare it with other weights $(0.4,0.3$, $0.3)$ and ( $0.4,0.243,0.357$ ). It behaves as we expect because embedding capacity for different combinations is constant where $E C=8 \mathrm{BPP}$, with a different number of bits embedded in Red, Blue, and Green components.

## - ATD Results

When we calculate MSNR (2.64) and we weigh MSNR with three different group weights $(1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3),(0.4,0.3,0.3)$ and $(0.4,0.243,0.357)$. From Figure 6.30 and Table 6.8, we see that, the value of MSNR and WMSNR in different weights for ATD in different combinations has the same value.

Table 6.8: MSNR (dB) for ATD for Different Combinations

| Cover Image | Combinations |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 211 | 121 | 112 |
| Peppers | 29.82 | 29.82 | 29.82 |
| Lena | 31.58 | 31.58 | 31.58 |
| Baboon | 30.93 | 30.92 | 30.92 |
| Barbara | 30.27 | 30.26 | 30.27 |
| Balloon | 30.22 | 31.22 | 31.22 |
| Blue | 24.02 | 24.01 | 24.01 |
| Green | 14.74 | 14.75 | 14.74 |
| Red | 32.79 | 32.97 | 32.97 |



Figure 6.30: MSNR (dB) for ATD for Different Combinations

- ATD and LSB Comparison Results Using WPSNR, MSNR and WMSNR

When we compare LSB and ATD according to WPSNR with different weights, we get that LSB algorithm has the best quality image according to WPSNR. The value of WPSNR for LSB is in between 40.60 dB and 40.20 dB for different weights as shown in Figure 5.31.


Figure 6.31: WPSNR (dB) for ATD and LSB with Different Weights ( $0.4,0.243$, $0.357),(0.4,0.3,0.3)$, and ( $1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3$ )


Figure 6.32: MSNR (dB) for ATD and LSB

For MSNR, the both algorithms LSB and ATD have the same curve form (see Figure 6.32). When we compare them, ATD has noticeably larger value than LSB for all images except 'green image' for this image; the LSB has a larger value of 16 dB ,
while ATD has a value of 14.74 dB . When we compare LSB and ATD for WMSNR, from Figure 6.33, we can see that LSB algorithm has a large value than ATD for all images just if we except Green image; for this image, where ATD has a large value, 15 dB , while LSB has approximately 5 dB .


Figure 6.33: WMSNR (dB) for ATD and LSB with Different Weights $(0.4,0.243$, $0.357),(0.4,0.3,0.3)$, and ( $1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3$ )

### 6.3.3. Evaluation of Different Metrics

- Evaluation of Different Metrics for LSB Algorithm

We measure the quality of the stego images in LSB algorithm by different criterion measure PSNR, and MSNR, WMSNR, and WPSNR with weights $(1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3),(0.4$, $0.3,0.3)$, and ( $0.4,0.243,0.357$ ). We compare between these metrics by using deviation of the results in each criterion the deviation is calculated according to (6.3):

$$
\begin{equation*}
\sigma=\sqrt{\frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^{N}\left(x_{i}-\bar{X}\right)^{2}} \tag{6.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

Where $\bar{X}$ is the mean value of the pixels of a cover calculated according to (2.62) and N is the number of elements. To compare between these metrics (PSNR, and MSNR, WMSNR, and WPSNR with weights $(1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3),(0.4,0.3,0.3)$, and $(0.4,0.243$, 0.357 ) we calculate deviation for each cover image in different combinations than average of the deviation over 8 cover images. The results are shown in Table 6.9.

Table 6.9: Deviation of Results in Each Metric for LSB Algorithm

| Metric | Deviation |
| :---: | :---: |
| PSNR | 0.92 |
| WPSNR $(0.4,0.243,0.357)$ | 1.07 |
| WPSNR $(0.4,0.3,0.3)$ | 0.896 |
| WPSNR (1/3,1/3,1/3) | 0.768 |
| MSNR | 0.663 |
| WPSNR (0.4, 0.243, 0.357) | 0.554 |
| WMSNR $(0.4,0.3,0.3)$ | 0.492 |
| WMSNR (1/3, $1 / 3,1 / 3)$ | 0.211 |



Figure 6.34: Deviation of Results in Each Metric for LSB Algorithm

When we compare result of deviation of the criteria as we show in Figure 6.34 and Table 6.8, the minimal deviation of the metrics for LSB algorithm we get in WMSNR with weight $(1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3)$ : the value of deviation is 0.211 , and maximum result is in WPSNR with weight ( $0.4,0.243,0.357$ ). These weights we get from human color perception in Figure 2.15 as shown at the beginning of Section 6.3. Overall, the best metric for stego images for LSB algorithm is MSNR with weights ( $1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3$ ).

- Evaluation of Different Metrics for ATD Algorithm:

We use different criteria to evaluation the quality of the stego images for ATD algorithm as PSNR, WPSNR with weights $(1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3),(0.4,0.3,0.3)$, and ( 0.4 , $0.243,0.357)$, MSNR, and WMSNR with weights $(1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3),(0.4,0.3,0.3)$, and ( $0.4,0.243,0.357$ ). Also for this algorithm, we compare between these criteria measures by calculating deviation (6.1) of result in each criterion measure for ATD algorithm.

Table 6.10: Deviation of Results with Different Metrics for ATD Algorithm

| Metric | Deviation |
| :---: | :---: |
| PSNR | 0.0040 |
| WPSNR (0.4, 0.243, 0.357) | 0.0039 |
| WPSNR $(0.4,0.3,0.3)$ | 0.0035 |
| WPSNR (1/3,1/3,1/3) | 0.0042 |
| MSNR | 0.088 |
| WPSNR (0.4, 0.243, 0.357) | 0.086 |
| WMSNR (0.4, 0.3, 0.3) | 0.079 |
| WMSNR (1/3,1/3,1/3) | 0.088 |



Figure 6.32: Deviation of Results for ATD

As we see from Figure 6.32 and Table 6.10, the best criterion measure to evaluation the quality of stego image is WPSNR with weight $(1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3)$ it has the minimal value of deviation.

### 6.4 Performance of ATD and LSB for Color Images Depending on

## the Embedding Capacity

We studied the performance of the both algorithm (ATD and LSB) for color scale images by using WMSNR with weight $(1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3)$ when changing the embedding capacity to 6 BPP and 10 BPP as shown in Figure 6.36.


Figure 6.36: WMSNR (dB) Dependence on Embedding Capacity for LSB and ATD.

As we can see in Figure 5.36, WMSNR decreases when embedding capacity increases that complies with our expectations.

### 6.5 Summary of Chapter 6

Thus, in this chapter we have discussed and compared the gray scale images and color scale images results with criteria. We also compared these results with known experiments [28] presented in Section 2.5. Results obtained are as follows:
$>$ For gray scale images:

1. We show PSNR for gray images for ATD and LSBCT, LSBDT.
2. We introduced such criteria as MSNR, APSNR, which have similar to PSNR curve shape.
$>$ For color images:
3. We found that PSNR for color scale images behaves not as expected: for the same embedding capacity but for different combinations embedding into the same image we get different PSNR values, and different relations between the combinations.
4. We introduced such criteria as WMSNR, WPSNR which show stable behavior for different combinations. By evaluation of different metrics by LSB the minimal deviation we get in WMSNR with weight $(1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3)$ the value of deviation is
0.211 and maximum result in WPSNR with weight $(0.4,0.243,0.357)$ this weight we get from human color perception in Figure 2.15 as explain in Section 6.3.
5. We showed that stability of WMSNR is preserved when varying embedding capacity, and it decreases with the increase of embedding capacity.

## Chapter 7

## CONCLUSION AND FUTURE WORK

In this thesis, analysis, implementation, and experiments on steganographic methods (ATD, LSB, and LSBT) for the gray scale and color images are conducted. The algorithms are explained in details and analyzed. It was found out that LSBT method may work incorrectly (counter-examples are constructed). The reasons of the problems are understood, and LSBT is modified as LSBT-M imposing certain constraints on the LSBT parameters: threshold, and moduli values. LSBT-M algorithm is considered in static (LSBCT) and dynamic (LSBDT) variants. Dynamic variant is introduced to have experimental results compatible with those published in [28] as for LSBCT. The experiments are conducted on ATD, LSBCT, and LSBDT for gray scale images, and on ATD and LSB-based (LSB, ALSBmin, and ALSBmax) for color images Known quality measures of stego-images (PSNR, SNR) and proposed (MSNR, APSNR WMSNR, and WPSNR) are studied.

For gray scale images, the results are obtained for 15 gray scale cover images and random secret messages. According to our experiments, LSBDT is better than ATD in the quality of stego images, PSNR, when the embedding capacity EC is less than or equal to 3 BPP. In [28], LSBDT performance is shown as the performance of LSBT, but we show that LSBT (or, LSBCT after modification) has worse performance (compare Figures 6.6 and 2.17). Also, when MSNR and APSNR are applied for the both algorithms (LSBT and ATD) the results have the same form as
that of PSNR.

For color images, the experiments are conducted with eight cover images with size $512 * 512$ pixels, and one binary message as a secrete message. LSB and ATD are implemented for different embedding combinations of 8 bits embedding in each color pixel. According to experiments, PSNR of LSB for color images has fluctuations in different combinations with the same embedding capacity 8 bits in each pixel while the PSNR of ATD is stable in different combinations. When we apply WPSNR and MSNR and weight it by three different groups of weights, the result show that, the value of PSNR with weights $(1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3)$ for LSB with different combinations is more plateaus than other weights. Also, the value of MSNR with weights $(1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3)$ for LSB with different combinations looks invariant for different combinations when compared with other weights. MSNR with different weights for ATD is stable in different combinations as PSNR. For LSB algorithm when comparison between different metrics was made by deviation evaluation of the metrics, we got the best metric for LSB algorithm as WMSNR with weights ( $1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3$ ) with the minimal deviation values as 0.211 , and the maximum deviation was obtained for WPSNR with weights $(0.4,0.243,0.357)$ that we got from human color perception. Thus, human color perception-originated weights are not appropriate for the images assessment, so we can conclude that human eyes and SNR-based metric presumably use different ways of image estimation.

Furthermore, when varying embedding capacity for LSB and ATD the results showed stability of WMSNR with weights $(1 / 3,1 / 3,1 / 3)$, and it decreases with the increase of embedding capacity (we considered $\mathrm{BPP}=6,8$, and 10).

In the future work, we want to study LSBDT more in order to improve performance of LSBT for high embedding capacity so that it could beat ATD for all embedding capacity values.

## REFERENCES

[1] Ankur, G., Gupta, S., \& Bhushan, B. (2012). Information Hiding Using Least Significant Bit Steganography and Cryptography. International Journal of Modern Education and Computer Science, pp. 27-34. Vol. 5. No. 2.
[2] Agrawal, D ., \& Samidha, D. (2013). Random Image Steganography in Spatial Domain. IEEE, International Conference. pp. 1-3. Vol. 12. No. 34.
[3] Acharya, U. D, Hemalatha, S, \& Renuka, A. (2015). Wavelet Transform Based Steganography Technique to Hide Audio Signals in Image. Procedia Computer Science, pp. 272-281. Vol. 47. No. 4.
[4] Acharya, U. D, Hemalatha, S, Renuka, A \& Kamath, P. R. (2013). A Secure Color Image Steganography in Transform Domain. International Journal on Cryptography and Information Security (IJCIS), pp. 1304-3313. Vol. 3. No. 1.
[5] Cheng, S. C., \& Wu, T. L. (2005). Sub Pixel Edge Detection of Color Images by Principal Axis Analysis and Moment-Preserving Principle. Pattern Recognition, pp. 527-537. Vol. 38. No. 4.
[6] Chang, C. C., Tai, W. L., \& Lin, C. C. (2006). A Reversible Data Hiding Scheme Based on Side Match Vector Quantization. IEEE Transactions on Circuits and Systems for Video Technology, pp.1301-1308. Vol. 16. No. 10.
[7] Chang, C. C., Chen, T. S., \& Chung, L. Z. (2002). A Steganographic Method

Based upon JPEG and Quantization Table Modification. Information Sciences, pp. 123-138. Vol. 141. No. 1.
[8] Chen, B., Zhang, W., Ma, K., \& Yu, N. (2014). Recursive Code Construction for Reversible Data Hiding in DCT Domain. Multimedia Tools and Applications, pp. 1985-2009. Vol. 72. No. 2.
[9] Chang, C. C., Hsiao, J. Y., \& Chan, C. S. (2003). Finding Optimal Least-Significant-Bit Substitution in Image Hiding by Dynamic Programming Strategy. Pattern Recognition, pp. 1583-1595. Vol. 36. No.7.
[10] Chan, C. K., \& Cheng, L. M. (2004). Hiding Data in Images by Simple LSB Substitution. Pattern recognition, pp. 469-474. Vol. 37. No.3.
[11] Cheddad, A., Condell, J., Curran, K., \& Kevitt, P. M. (2010). Digital Image Steganography: Survey and Analysis of Current Methods. Signal Processing, pp. 727-752. Vol. 90. No.3.
[12] Chen, W. Y. (2007). Color Image Steganography Scheme Using Set Partitioning in Hierarchical Trees Coding, Digital Fourier Transform and Adaptive Phase Modulation. Applied Mathematics and Computation, pp. 432-448. Vol 185. No. 1.
[13] El-Kilani, W. S, Haweel, R. T., \& Ramadan, H. H. (2014). A Fast Modified Signed Discrete Cosine Transform for Image Compression. IEEE International Conference on Computer Engineering \& Systems (ICCES), pp. 56-61. Vol. 9.

No. 22.
[14] Gupta, N., \& Sharma, N. (2013). Hiding Image in Audio Using DWT and LSB. International Journal of Computer Applications, pp. 11-14. Vol. 81. No. 2.
[15] Garg, S., \& Mathur, M. (2014). Chaotic Map Based Steganography of Gray scale Images in Wavelet Domain. IEEE, In Signal Processing and Integrated Networks (SPIN), pp. 689-694. Vol. 10. No. 7.
[16] Hegde, R \&Jagadeesha, S. (2015). Design and Implementation of Image Steganography by Using LSB Replacement Algorithm and Pseudo Random Encoding Technique. International Journal on Recent and Innovation Trends in Computing and Communication, pp. $4415-4420$. Vol. 3. No. 7.
[17] Hussain, M., Wahab, A. W. A., Ho, A. T., Javed, N., \& Jung, K. H. (2016). A Data Hiding Scheme Using Parity-Bit Pixel Value Differencing and Improved Rightmost Digit Replacement. Signal Processing: Image Communication, pp. 44-57. Vol. 50. No. 12.
[18] Jheng, Y. Z., Chen, C. Y., \& Huang, C. F. (2015) Reversible Data Hiding Based on Histogram Modification over Ternary Computers.Journal of Information Hiding and Multimedia Signal Processing, pp .938-955. Vol. 6. No. 4.
[19] Kiruba, K., \&Karthikeyan, S. (2013). Reliable Detection of Adaptive Pixel Pair Matching in Color and Grayscale Images. IEEE, International Conferenceon Information Communication and Embedded Systems (ICICES). pp. 943-946.

Vol. 5. No. 9.
[20] Kinoshita, S. (2013).Bionanophotonics: an Introductory Textbook. CRC Press.
[21] Lavania, S., Matey, P. S., \& Thanikaiselvan, V. (2014). Real-Time Implementation of Steganography in Medical Images Using Integer Wavelet Transform. IEEE, International Conference on Computational Intelligence and Computing Research (ICCIC), pp. 1-5. Vol. 102. No. 77.
[22] Maji, A. K., Pal, R. K., \& Roy, S. (2014). A Novel Steganographic Scheme Using Sudoku. IEEE, International Conference on Electrical Information and Communication Technology (EICT), pp. 1-6. Vol. 14. No. 28.
[23] RGB color model. (2017, January 12).Retrieved from https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/RGB_color_model.
[24] Singh, A., \& Singh, H. (2015). An Improved LSB Based Image Steganography Technique for RGB Images. IEEE, International Conference on Electrical, Computer and Communication Technologies (ICECCT), pp. 1-4. Vol. 16. No. 20.
[25] Taur, J. S., Lin, H. Y., Lee, H. L., \& Tao, C. W. (2012). Data Hiding in DNA Sequences Based on Table Lookup Substitution. International Journal of Innovative Computing, Information and Control, pp. 6585-6598. Vol. 8. No. 10.
[26] Wang, S. J. (2005). Steganography of Capacity Required Using Modulo

Operator for Embedding Secret Image. Applied Mathematics and Computation, pp. 99-116. Vol. 164. No. 11.
[27] Wang, R. Z., Lin, C. F., \& Lin, J. C. (2001). Image Hiding by Optimal LSB Substitution and Genetic Algorithm. Pattern recognition, pp. 671-683. Vol. 34. No. 3.
[28] Xu, W. L., Chang, C. C., Chen, T. S., \& Wang, L. M. (2016). An Improved Least-Significant-Bit Substitution Method Using the Modulo Three Strategy. Displays, pp.36-42. Vol. 42. No. 17.
[29] Yu, Y. H., Chang, C. C., \& Lin, I. C. (2007). A New Steganographic Method for Color and Grayscale Image Hiding. Computer Vision and Image Understanding, pp.183-194. Vol. 107. No. 3.
[30] Zhang, T., \& Ping, X. (2003). A New Approach to Reliable Detection of LSB Steganography in Natural Images. Signal Processing, pp.2085-2093. Vol 83. No. 10 .

## APPENDICES

## Appendix A: ATD Algorithm for Gray Scale Images



Figure A.1. Cover Images Used in Gray Scale Images

## A. 1 The main program

\% this program was written by Hajer A Al_aswed in 2016-2017 for ATD algorithm in gray scale [7] and its functions

1. clc
2. clear
3. cover_image=imread('C:IUsers\hajerlDesktoplthesislGRAY SCALEIATD for texthome.gif');\%Read cover image
4. [M N L]=size(cover_image);
5. S=sum(cover_image(:,:));
6. avg $=\operatorname{sum}(\mathrm{S}) /(\mathrm{M} * \mathrm{~N}) ; \%$ calculate the mean of cover image
7. start_length $=494288$; \%start length of secreat message
8. disp('
9. disp('cover_image PSNR Actual_PSNR MSNR MSE size_secret_data Bpp')
10. $\operatorname{disp}\left({ }^{\prime} \quad \mathrm{dB} \quad \mathrm{dB} \quad \mathrm{db}\right.$ ')
11. $\mathrm{p}=$ 'home.gif';
12. $\operatorname{disp}('$
13. for $\mathrm{h}=1: 11$
14. increase_size $=30000$;
15. start_length=start_length+increase_size;
16. secret_massege $=$ randi([0 1],1,start_length $) ; \%$ generate the secreat message
17. ternary_number=convertto__ternary(secret_massege); \%convert the secreat message to ternary
18. [q size_secret_massege]=size(ternary_number);
19. stego_image=Embbedding(cover_image,size_secret_massege,ternary_number);\%embedding function
20. MSE=0;
21. for $\mathrm{i}=1: \mathrm{M}$
22. for $\mathrm{j}=1: \mathrm{N}$
23. $\operatorname{MSE}=\operatorname{MSE}+(\text { double(cover_image(i,j))-double(stego_image(i,j))})^{\wedge} 2 ; \%$ calculate the MSE
24. end
25. end
26. $\mathrm{MSE}=\mathrm{MSE} /\left(\mathrm{M}^{*} \mathrm{~N}\right)$;
27. $\mathrm{PSNR}=10^{*} \log 10\left(255^{\wedge} 2 /(\mathrm{MSE})\right) ; \%$ calculate the PSNR
28. $\max \_$value $=\max (\max ($ cover_image(:,:))); \%calculate the maximum actual value
29. MSNR $=10 * \log 10$ (avg*avg/MSE);\%calculate the MSNR
30. $\mathrm{Bpp}=($ start_length $) /(\mathrm{M} * \mathrm{~N}) ; \%$ calculate the BPP
31. Actual_PSNR $=10^{*} \log 10$ (double(max_value)*double(max_value)/MSE); \%calculate the APSNR
32. disp(sprintf('\%s \%f \%f \%f \%f \%d\%2f',p,PSNR, Actual_PSNR,MSNR ,MSE,start_length,Bpp));
33. end
34. $\operatorname{disp}('==========================================================1)$
35. \%show the cover image and stego image
36. figure
37. subplot( $2,2,[1,3]$ );
38. imshow(cover_image);
39. title('Cover image')
40. subplot( $2,2,[2,4]$ );
41. imshow(stego_image);
42. title('Stego image')
43. output $=$ extraction ( stego_image,size_secret_massege );\%extraction function

## A. 2 Convert the secret message to the ternary

1. function [ output ] = convertto__ternary ( a )
2. [er]=size(a);
3. $\mathrm{k}=1$;
4. $\mathrm{kk}=1$;
5. b_s=64;
6. $w=\bmod \left(r, b \_s\right)$;
7. if ( $\mathrm{w}==0$ )
8. $\mathrm{n}=\mathrm{r} / \mathrm{b}$ _s;
9. else
10. $\mathrm{n}=(\mathrm{r}-\mathrm{w}) / \mathrm{b} \_\mathrm{s}$;
11. $\mathrm{n}=\mathrm{n}+1$;
12. end
13. for $\mathrm{i}=1: \mathrm{n}$
14. if $\left(k+b \_s-1\right)>=r$
15. $\mathrm{q}=\left(\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{b} \_\mathrm{s}-1\right)-\mathrm{r}$;
16. for $m=1: q$
17. $\operatorname{block}(\mathrm{m})=0$;
18. end
19. for $\mathrm{m}=\mathrm{q}+1: \mathrm{b}$ _s
20. $\operatorname{block}(\mathrm{m})=\mathrm{a}(\mathrm{k})$;
21. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
22. end
23. else
24. for $\mathrm{m}=1: \mathrm{b}$ _s
25. $\operatorname{block}(\mathrm{m})=\mathrm{a}(\mathrm{k})$;
26. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
27. end
28. end
29. aa=convert_binary_decmal(block);
30. ternary=convert_decmal_ternary(aa);
31. [o p]=size(ternary);
32. for $\mathrm{j}=1$ : p
33. output(kk)=ternary(j);
34. $\mathrm{kk}=\mathrm{kk}+1$;
35. end
36. end
37. end

## A.2.1 Convert the binary block to the decimal

1. function [ output ] = convert_binary_decmal( a )
2. $[\mathrm{qk} \mathrm{k}=\operatorname{size}(\mathrm{a})$;
3. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}-1$;
4. output=0;
5. for $\mathrm{i}=1: \mathrm{k}+1$
6. output=output+a(i)*power( $2, \mathrm{k}$ );
7. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}-1$;
8. end
9. end

## A.2.2 Convert the decimal to the ternary

1. function [ output ] = convert_decmal_ternary( input )
2. $\mathrm{kk}=1$;
3. $\mathrm{k}=1$;
4. while (input $\sim=0$ )
5. output $1(\mathrm{kk})=\bmod ($ input, 3$)$;
6. input=fix(input/3);
7. $k k=k k+1$;
8. end
9. $\mathrm{ss}=41-(\mathrm{kk}-1)$;
10. if ( $\mathrm{ss} \sim=0$ )
11. for $\mathrm{i}=1$ :ss
12. output $(\mathrm{i})=0$;
13. end
14. for $\mathrm{m}=\mathrm{ss}+1: 41$
15. output(m)=output $1(\mathrm{k})$;
16. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
17. end
18. else
19. for $\mathrm{m}=1: 41$
20. output $(\mathrm{m})=$ output $(\mathrm{k})$;
21. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
22. end
23. end
24. end

## A. 3 Embedding function

1. function [stego_image] = Embbedding( cover_image,size_secret_massege, ternary_number )
2. stego_image=cover_image;
3. $\mathrm{k}=1$;
4. [M N]=size(cover_image);
5. for $\mathrm{i}=1: \mathrm{M}$
6. for $\mathrm{j}=1: \mathrm{N}$
7. cover_pixel_binary = dec2bin(cover_image(i,j),8);
8. for $\mathrm{ii}=1: 6$
9. sub1(ii)=cover_pixel_binary(ii);
10. end
11. sub1_dec=bin2dec(sub1);
12. sub2=cover_pixel_binary(7:8);
13. sub2_dec=bin2dec(sub2);
14. if (sub1_dec==63)
15. sub1_dec=62;
16. end
17. if (sub1_dec==0)
18. sub1_dec=1;
19. end
20. if (sub2_dec==3)
21. sub2_dec=2;
22. end
23. if (sub2_dec==0)
24. sub2_dec=1;
25. end
26. if( $\mathrm{k}<=$ size_secret_massege)
27. if $\left(\bmod \left(\operatorname{sub} 1 \_d e c, 3\right)==\right.$ ternary_number $\left.(\mathrm{k})\right)$
28. sub1_stego=sub1_dec;
29. elseif(mod(sub1_dec+1,3)==ternary_number(k))
30. sub1_stego=sub1_dec+1;
31. else
32. sub1_stego=sub1_dec-1;
33. end
34. end
35. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
36. if(k<=size_secret_massege)
37. v=sub1_stego*4+sub2_dec;
38. if $(\bmod (\mathrm{v}, 3)==$ ternary_number $(\mathrm{k}))$
39. stego_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})=\mathrm{v}$;
40. elseif( $\bmod (\mathrm{v}+1,3)==$ ternary_number( k$)$ )
41. stego_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})=\mathrm{v}+1$;
42. else
43. stego_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})=\mathrm{v}-1$;
44. end
45. k=k+1;
46. end
47. end
48. end
49. end

## A. 4 Extraction function

1. function [ output ] = extraction( stego_image)
2. $\mathrm{k}=1$;
3. $\mathrm{q}=1$;
4. for $\mathrm{i}=1: 512$
5. for $\mathrm{j}=1: 512$
6. if ( $\mathrm{q}<=$ size_secret_image)
7. cover_pixel_binary $=$ dec2bin(stego_image( $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}), 8$ );
8. subl=cover_pixel_binary(1:6);
9. sub1_dec=bin2dec(sub1);
10. sub2=cover_pixel_binary( $7: 8$ );
11. sub2_dec=bin2dec(sub2);
12. output $1(\mathrm{k})=\bmod ($ sub1_dec,3);
13. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
14. output $1(\mathrm{k})=$ mod(stego_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}), 3)$;
15. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
16. $q=q+1$;
17. else
18. continue
19. end
20. end
21. end
22. [e r]=size(output1);
23. $\mathrm{k}=1$;
24. b_s=41;
25. $\mathrm{w}=\bmod \left(\mathrm{r}, \mathrm{b} \_\mathrm{s}\right)$;
26. if ( $\mathrm{w}==0$ )
27. n=r/b_s;
28. else
29. $\mathrm{n}=(\mathrm{r}-\mathrm{w}) / \mathrm{b} \_$s;
30. $\mathrm{n}=\mathrm{n}+1$;
31. end
32. for $\mathrm{i}=1: \mathrm{n}$
33. if $\left(k+b \_s-1\right)>=r$
34. $q=\left(k+b \_s-1\right)-r$;
35. for $m=1: q$
36. $\operatorname{block}(\mathrm{m})=0$;
37. end
38. for $\mathrm{m}=\mathrm{q}+1: \mathrm{b} \_\mathrm{s}$
39. $\operatorname{block}(\mathrm{m})=$ output $1(\mathrm{k})$;
40. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
41. end
42. else
43. for $\mathrm{m}=1: \mathrm{b} \_\mathrm{s}$
44. block(m)=output $1(\mathrm{k})$;
45. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
46. end
47. end
48. aa=conver_ternary_decimal(block);
49. output=convert_decmal_binary(aa);
50. end
51. end

## A.4.1 Convert_ternary to decimal function

1. function [ output] = conver_ternary_decimal(a)
2. $[\mathrm{qk} \mathrm{k}=\operatorname{size}(\mathrm{a})$;
3. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}-1$;
4. output=0;
5. for $\mathrm{i}=1: \mathrm{k}+1$
6. output=output $+\mathrm{a}(\mathrm{i}) *$ power $(3, \mathrm{k})$;
7. k=k-1;
8. end
9. end

## A.4.2 Convert decimal to binary function

1. function [ output ] = convert_decmal_binary( input )
2. $\mathrm{kk}=1$;
3. $\mathrm{k}=1$;
4. while (input $\sim=0$ )
5. output $1(\mathrm{kk})=\bmod ($ input, 2$)$;
6. input=fix(input/2);
7. $\mathrm{kk}=\mathrm{kk}+1$;
8. end
9. $\mathrm{ss}=64-(\mathrm{kk}-1)$;
10. if (ss~=0)
11. for $\mathrm{i}=1$ :ss
12. output(i) $=0$;
13. end
14. for $\mathrm{m}=\mathrm{ss}+1: 64$
15. output $(\mathrm{m})=$ output $(\mathrm{k})$;
16. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
17. end
18. else
19. for $\mathrm{m}=1: 64$
20. output $(\mathrm{m})=$ output $1(\mathrm{k})$;
21. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
22. end
23. end
24. end

## A. 5 Draw graph program

1. clc
2. clear
3. $\mathrm{pos}=\left[\begin{array}{lllllll}2 & 2.2 & 2.4 & 2.6 & 2.8 & 3 & 3.2\end{array}\right] ;$
4. PSNR_ATD=[39.32 38.86 38.44 38.04 37.87 37.69 37.41];
5. PSNR_T=[42.18 41.7536 .6436 .2836 .1135 .95 35.65];
6. PSNR_adapter_T=[43.21 41.76 40.0439 .0338 .5538 .05 35.60];
7. MSNR_ATD=[llll.06 32.6032 .1831 .7831 .6231 .28 31.15];
8. MSNR_T=[llll.93 35.4930 .3830 .0229 .8529 .69 29.39];
9. MSNR_adapter_T=[36.95 35.5033 .7832 .7732 .2931 .80 29.34];
10. A_PSNR_ATD=[39.34 38.86 38.4438 .0637 .8737 .7037 .40 ];
11. A_PSNR_T=[41.86 41.4236 .3235 .9335 .7535 .6035 .30 ];
12. A_PSNR_adapter_T=[42.85 41.4339 .6938 .6938 .2137 .70 35.28];
13. figure (1)
14. h1 = plot(pos,PSNR_ATD,'g','LineWidth',2,'Marker','*');

15 . hold on
16. h2 = plot(pos,PSNR_T,'b','LineWidth',2,'Marker','*');
17. hold on
18. h3 = plot(pos,PSNR_adapter_T,'k','LineWidth',2,'Marker',''*');
19. hold on
20. legend([h1,h2,h3],'PSNR ATD','PSNR T=160','PSNR adapter T','Location' ,'southwest');
21. $\operatorname{axis}\left(\left[\begin{array}{lll}1.95 & 3.3 & 30\end{array} 45\right]\right)$
22. title('PSNR for Lean image')
23. ylabel('PSNR(dB)');
24. xlabel('BPP');
25. grid
26. figure (2)
27. h3 = plot(pos,MSNR_ATD,'g','LineWidth',2,'Marker','*');
28. hold on
29. h4 = plot(pos,MSNR_T,'b','LineWidth',2,'Marker','*');
30. hold on
31. h5 = plot(pos,MSNR_adapter_T, 'k','LineWidth',2,'Marker','*');
32. hold on
33. legend([h3,h4,h5],'MSNR ATD','MSNR T=160','MSNR adapter T','Location' ,'southwest');
34. title('MSNR for Lean image')
35. ylabel('MSNR(dB)');
36. xlabel('BPP');
37. $\operatorname{axis}\left(\left[\begin{array}{lll}1.95 & 3.3 & 27\end{array} 40\right]\right)$
38. grid on;
39. figure (3)
40. h1 = plot(pos,A_PSNR_ATD,'g','LineWidth',2,'Marker','*');
41. hold on
42. h 2 = plot(pos,A_PSNR_T,'b','LineWidth',2,'Marker','*');
43. hold on
44. h3 = plot(pos,A_PSNR_adapter_T,'k','LineWidth',2,'Marker','*');
45. hold on
46. legend([h1,h2,h3],'APSNR ATD','APSNR T=160','APSNR adapter T', 'Location','southwest');
47. $\operatorname{axis}\left(\left[\begin{array}{lll}1.95 & 3.3 & 30\end{array} 45\right]\right)$
48. title('Actual PSNR for Lean image')
49. ylabel('APSNR(dB)');
50. xlabel('BPP');
51. grid on

## A. 6 Screenshots of ATD for gray scale images results for different cover images with size $512 \times 512$ <br> Results for Lena image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSNR db | MSE | size_secret_data | Bpp |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| lena. BMP | 39.341881 | 38.994399 | 33.082488 | 7.566452 | 524288 | 2.000000 |
| lena. BMP | 39.093979 | 38.746497 | 32.834586 | 8.010921 | 554288 | 2.114441 |
| lena. BMP | 38.863923 | 38.516441 | 32.604530 | 8.446720 | 584288 | 2.228882 |
| lena. BMP | 38.662911 | 38.315429 | 32.403518 | 8.846863 | 614288 | 2.343323 |
| lena. BMP | 38.435312 | 38.087830 | 32.175919 | 9.322861 | 644288 | 2.457764 |
| lena. BMP | 38.245145 | 37.897663 | 31.985753 | 9.740154 | 674288 | 2.572205 |
| lena. BMP | 38.055621 | 37.708139 | 31.796228 | 10.174622 | 704288 | 2.686646 |
| lena. BMP | 37.874323 | 37.526841 | 31.614930 | 10.608356 | 734288 | 2.801086 |
| lena. BMP | 37.695110 | 37.347628 | 31.435717 | 11.055271 | 764288 | 2.915527 |
| lena. BMP | 37.531930 | 37.184449 | 31.272538 | 11.478558 | 794288 | 3.029968 |
| lena. BMP | 37.396861 | 37.049379 | 31.137469 | 11.841160 | 824288 | 3.144409 |

## Results for Zelda image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{db} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | size_secret_data | Bpp |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| zelda.BMP | 39.337935 | 38.403841 | 32.097491 | 7.573330 | 524288 | 2.000000 |
| zelda.BMP | 39.099848 | 38.165754 | 31.859404 | 8.000103 | 554288 | 2.114441 |
| zelda.BMP | 38.864833 | 37.930739 | 31.624389 | 8.444950 | 584288 | 2.228882 |
| zelda.BMP | 38.628794 | 37.694700 | 31.388351 | 8.916634 | 614288 | 2.343323 |
| zelda.BMP | 38.431969 | 37.497875 | 31.191525 | 9.330040 | 644288 | 2.457764 |
| zelda.BMP | 38.242105 | 37.308011 | 31.001661 | 9.746975 | 674288 | 2.572205 |
| zelda.BMP | 38.060954 | 37.126860 | 30.820510 | 10.162136 | 704288 | 2.686646 |
| zelda.BMP | 37.853653 | 36.919559 | 30.613209 | 10.658966 | 734288 | 2.801086 |
| zelda.BMP | 37.697112 | 36.763018 | 30.456668 | 11.050175 | 764288 | 2.915527 |
| zelda.BMP | 37.518664 | 36.584570 | 30.278220 | 11.513676 | 794288 | 3.029968 |
| zelda.BMP | 37.396839 | 36.462745 | 30.156395 | 11.841221 | 824288 | 3.144409 |

## Results for Airplane image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | $\underset{d B}{\text { Actual_PSNR }}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{db} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | size_secret_data | Bpp |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| airplane. BMP | 39.329231 | 38.470667 | 36.264165 | 7.588524 | 524288 | 2.000000 |
| airplane. $\mathrm{BMP}^{\text {a }}$ | 39.098864 | 38.240300 | 36.033798 | 8.001915 | 554288 | 2.114441 |
| airplane.BMP | 38.871755 | 38.013191 | 35.806690 | 8.431499 | 584288 | 2.228882 |
| airplane. $\mathrm{BMP}^{\text {a }}$ | 38.654412 | 37.795848 | 35.589346 | 8.864193 | 614288 | 2.343323 |
| airplane. $\mathrm{BMP}^{\text {a }}$ | 38.448387 | 37.589823 | 35.383321 | 9.294834 | 644288 | 2.457764 |
| airplane. BMP | 38.238610 | 37.380046 | 35.173544 | 9.754822 | 674288 | 2.572205 |
| airplane. $\mathrm{BMP}^{\text {a }}$ | 38.054823 | 37.196259 | 34.989757 | 10.176491 | 704288 | 2.686646 |
| airplane. BMP | 37.852156 | 36.993592 | 34.787090 | 10.662640 | 734288 | 2.801086 |
| airplane. $\mathrm{BMP}^{\text {a }}$ | 37.686961 | 36.828397 | 34.621895 | 11.076035 | 764288 | 2.915527 |
| airplane. BMP | 37.528986 | 36.670422 | 34.463920 | 11.486343 | 794288 | 3.029968 |
| airplane. BMP | 37.393042 | 36.534478 | 34.327976 | 11.851578 | 824288 | 3.144409 |

Results for Baboon image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\underset{d B}{\text { Actual_PSNR }}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{db} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | size_secret_data | Bpp |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Baboon. BMP | 39.326553 | 38.727288 | 33.417389 | 7.593204 | 524288 | 2.000000 |
| Baboon. BMP | 39.072292 | 38.473027 | 33.163128 | 8.051025 | 554288 | 2.114441 |
| Baboon. BMP | 38.865209 | 38.265945 | 32.956046 | 8.444218 | 584288 | 2.228882 |
| Baboon. BMP | 38.644590 | 38.045326 | 32.735426 | 8.884262 | 614288 | 2.343323 |
| Baboon. BMP | 38.449114 | 37.849850 | 32.539951 | 9.293278 | 644288 | 2.457764 |
| Baboon. BMP | 38.251733 | 37.652468 | 32.342569 | 9.725391 | 674288 | 2.572205 |
| Baboon. BMP | 38.039026 | 37.439762 | 32.129863 | 10.213573 | 704288 | 2.686646 |
| Baboon. BMP | 37.871320 | 37.272056 | 31.962157 | 10.615692 | 734288 | 2.801086 |
| Baboon. BMP | 37.682522 | 37.083258 | 31.773358 | 11.087360 | 764288 | 2.915527 |
| Baboon. BMP | 37.535643 | 36.936378 | 31.626479 | 11.468750 | 794288 | 3.029968 |
| Baboon. BMP | 37.400327 | 36.801062 | 31.491163 | 11.831715 | 824288 | 3.144409 |

Results for Barbara image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{db} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | size_secret_data | Bpp |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| barbara.bmp | 39.333619 | 39.161615 | 33.250531 | 7.580860 | 524288 | 2.000000 |
| barbara.bmp | 39.095762 | 38.923758 | 33.012674 | 8.007633 | 554288 | 2.114441 |
| barbara.bmp | 38.868607 | 38.696603 | 32.785519 | 8.437614 | 584288 | 2.228882 |
| barbara.bmp | 38.648457 | 38.476454 | 32.565370 | 8.876354 | 614288 | 2.343323 |
| barbara.bmp | 38.435383 | 38.263379 | 32.352295 | 9.322708 | 644288 | 2.457764 |
| barbara.bmp | 38.230151 | 38.058147 | 32.147063 | 9.773842 | 674288 | 2.572205 |
| barbara.bmp | 38.051762 | 37.879759 | 31.968674 | 10.183666 | 704288 | 2.686646 |
| barbara.bmp | 37.865821 | 37.693818 | 31.782734 | 10.629143 | 734288 | 2.801086 |
| barbara.bmp | 37.693234 | 37.521230 | 31.610146 | 11.060047 | 764288 | 2.915527 |
| barbara.bmp | 37.533033 | 37.361030 | 31.449946 | 11.475643 | 794288 | 3.029968 |
| barbara.bmp | 37.422892 | 37.250889 | 31.339805 | 11.770397 | 824288 | 3.144409 |

## Results for Elain image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{db} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | size_secret_data | Bpp |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| elain. BMP | 39.341942 | 39.135125 | 33.904541 | 7.566345 | 524288 | 2.000000 |
| elain. BMP | 39.087558 | 38.880741 | 33.650157 | 8.022774 | 554288 | 2.114441 |
| elain. BMP | 38.870292 | 38.663475 | 33.432890 | 8.434341 | 584288 | 2.228882 |
| elain.BMP | 38.637765 | 38.430948 | 33.200363 | 8.898235 | 614288 | 2.343323 |
| elain.BMP | 38.427322 | 38.220506 | 32.989921 | 9.340027 | 644288 | 2.457764 |
| elain.BMP | 38.250305 | 38.043489 | 32.812904 | 9.728588 | 674288 | 2.572205 |
| elain.BMP | 38.053759 | 37.846942 | 32.616357 | 10.178986 | 704288 | 2.686646 |
| elain. BMP | 37.882564 | 37.675747 | 32.445162 | 10.588245 | 734288 | 2.801086 |
| elain. BMP | 37.703250 | 37.496433 | 32.265848 | 11.034569 | 764288 | 2.915527 |
| elain. BMP | 37.523998 | 37.317181 | 32.086597 | 11.499542 | 794288 | 3.029968 |
| elain.BMP | 37.384919 | 37.178103 | 31.947518 | 11.873764 | 824288 | 3.144409 |

Results for Goldhill image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSNR <br> db | MSE | size_secret_data | Bpp |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| goldhill. BMP | 39.342923 | 38.670360 | 32.181755 | 7.564636 | 524288 | 2.000000 |
| goldhill. BMP | 39.100264 | 38.427701 | 31.939095 | 7.999336 | 554288 | 2.114441 |
| goldhill. BMP | 38.858217 | 38.185653 | 31.697048 | 8.457825 | 584288 | 2.228882 |
| goldhill. BMP | 38.644797 | 37.972233 | 31.483628 | 8.883839 | 614288 | 2.343323 |
| goldhill.BMP | 38.443864 | 37.771300 | 31.282695 | 9.304520 | 644288 | 2.457764 |
| goldhill. BMP | 38.238009 | 37.565445 | 31.076840 | 9.756172 | 674288 | 2.572205 |
| goldhill. BMP | 38.038970 | 37.366406 | 30.877801 | 10.213707 | 704288 | 2.686646 |
| goldhill. BMP | 37.876530 | 37.203966 | 30.715361 | 10.602966 | 734288 | 2.801086 |
| goldhill. BMP | 37.689127 | 37.016563 | 30.527958 | 11.070511 | 764288 | 2.915527 |
| goldhill. BMP | 37.533489 | 36.860926 | 30.372321 | 11.474438 | 794288 | 3.029968 |
| goldhill. BMP | 37.391731 | 36.719167 | 30.230562 | 11.855156 | 824288 | 3.144409 |

Results for Peppers image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\underset{\mathrm{dB}}{\text { Actual_PSNR }}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{db} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | size_secret_data | Bpp |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| peppers.BMP | 39.318747 | 38.609300 | 32.793501 | 7.606865 | 524288 | 2.000000 |
| peppers.BMP | 39.089925 | 38.380479 | 32.564680 | 8.018402 | 554288 | 2.114441 |
| peppers.BMP | 38.861487 | 38.152041 | 32.336242 | 8.451458 | 584288 | 2.228882 |
| peppers.BMP | 38.639752 | 37.930305 | 32.114506 | 8.894165 | 614288 | 2.343323 |
| peppers.BMP | 38.426159 | 37.716713 | 31.900913 | 9.342529 | 644288 | 2.457764 |
| peppers.BMP | 38.235772 | 37.526325 | 31.710526 | 9.761200 | 674288 | 2.572205 |
| peppers.BMP | 38.043687 | 37.334241 | 31.518442 | 10.202618 | 704288 | 2.686646 |
| peppers.BMP | 37.855876 | 37.146430 | 31.330631 | 10.653511 | 734288 | 2.801086 |
| peppers.BMP | 37.688403 | 36.978956 | 31.163157 | 11.072357 | 764288 | 2.915527 |
| peppers. BMP | 37.530633 | 36.821187 | 31.005388 | 11.481987 | 794288 | 3.029968 |
| peppers. BMP | 37.403005 | 36.693558 | 30.877759 | 11.824421 | 824288 | 3.144409 |

Results for Lady image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{db} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | size_secret_data | Bpp |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| lady.tif | 39.292160 | 38.656323 | 32.618740 | 7.653576 | 524288 | 2.000000 |
| lady.tif | 39.072905 | 38.437068 | 32.399485 | 8.049889 | 554288 | 2.114441 |
| lady.tif | 38.839293 | 38.203456 | 32.165874 | 8.494759 | 584288 | 2.228882 |
| lady.tif | 38.620642 | 37.984805 | 31.947222 | 8.933388 | 614288 | 2.343323 |
| lady.tif | 38.404545 | 37.768708 | 31.731125 | 9.389141 | 644288 | 2.457764 |
| lady.tif | 38.209611 | 37.573775 | 31.536192 | 9.820175 | 674288 | 2.572205 |
| lady.tif | 38.012706 | 37.376869 | 31.339286 | 10.275661 | 704288 | 2.686646 |
| lady.tif | 37.832198 | 37.196361 | 31.158778 | 10.711754 | 734288 | 2.801086 |
| lady.tif | 37.665889 | 37.030052 | 30.992469 | 11.129906 | 764288 | 2.915527 |
| lady.tif | 37.494818 | 36.858981 | 30.821398 | 11.577068 | 794288 | 3.029968 |
| lady.tif | 37.368823 | 36.732986 | 30.695403 | 11.917854 | 824288 | 3.144409 |

## Results for House image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | PSNR <br> dB | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ & d B \end{aligned}$ | MSNR <br> db | MSE | size_secret_data | Bpp |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| house.tif | 39.303155 | 39.234761 | 32.832395 | 7.634224 | 524288 | 2.000000 |
| house.tif | 39.094649 | 39.026256 | 32.623890 | 8.009686 | 554288 | 2.114441 |
| house.tif | 38.856875 | 38.788482 | 32.386116 | 8.460438 | 584288 | 2.228882 |
| house.tif | 38.631489 | 38.563096 | 32.160730 | 8.911102 | 614288 | 2.343323 |
| house.tif | 38.414849 | 38.346456 | 31.944090 | 9.366890 | 644288 | 2.457764 |
| house.tif | 38.218322 | 38.149929 | 31.747563 | 9.800499 | 674288 | 2.572205 |
| house.tif | 38.017209 | 37.948816 | 31.546450 | 10.265011 | 704288 | 2.686646 |
| house.tif | 37.849750 | 37.781357 | 31.378991 | 10.668549 | 734288 | 2.801086 |
| house.tif | 37.687390 | 37.618997 | 31.216631 | 11.074940 | 764288 | 2.915527 |
| house.tif | 37.514217 | 37.445824 | 31.043458 | 11.525471 | 794288 | 3.029968 |
| house.tif | 37.390053 | 37.321660 | 30.919294 | 11.859737 | 824288 | 3.144409 |

Results for Home image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{db} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | size_secret_data | Bpp |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| home.gif | 39.252201 | 39.149409 | 27.894122 | 7.724319 | 524288 | 2.000000 |
| home.gif | 38.940786 | 38.837993 | 27.582707 | 8.298542 | 554288 | 2.114441 |
| home.gif | 38.701533 | 38.598740 | 27.343454 | 8.768536 | 584288 | 2.228882 |
| home.gif | 38.469623 | 38.366830 | 27.111544 | 9.249496 | 614288 | 2.343323 |
| home.gif | 38.269625 | 38.166833 | 26.911547 | 9.685406 | 644288 | 2.457764 |
| home.gif | 38.047403 | 37.944610 | 26.689324 | 10.193893 | 674288 | 2.572205 |
| home.gif | 37.811679 | 37.708887 | 26.453600 | 10.762482 | 704288 | 2.686646 |
| home.gif | 37.591511 | 37.488718 | 26.233432 | 11.322159 | 734288 | 2.801086 |
| home.gif | 37.408363 | 37.305570 | 26.050284 | 11.809841 | 764288 | 2.915527 |
| home.gif | 37.261233 | 37.158440 | 25.903154 | 12.216789 | 794288 | 3.029968 |
| home.gif | 37.119336 | 37.016543 | 25.761257 | 12.622540 | 824288 | 3.144409 |

Results for Camerman image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{db} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | size_secret_data | Bpp |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| camerman.tif | 39.330827 | 39.330827 | 32.660746 | 7.585735 | 524288 | 2.000000 |
| camerman.tif | 39.085099 | 39.085099 | 32.415019 | 8.027317 | 554288 | 2.114441 |
| camerman.tif | 38.854452 | 38.854452 | 32.184371 | 8.465160 | 584288 | 2.228882 |
| camerman.tif | 38.631104 | 38.631104 | 31.961024 | 8.911892 | 614288 | 2.343323 |
| camerman.tif | 38.444119 | 38.444119 | 31.774038 | 9.303974 | 644288 | 2.457764 |
| camerman.tif | 38.247682 | 38.247682 | 31.577601 | 9.734467 | 674288 | 2.572205 |
| camerman.tif | 38.046189 | 38.046189 | 31.376108 | 10.196743 | 704288 | 2.686646 |
| camerman.tif | 37.863604 | 37.863604 | 31.193523 | 10.634571 | 734288 | 2.801086 |
| camerman.tif | 37.700131 | 37.700131 | 31.030051 | 11.042496 | 764288 | 2.915527 |
| camerman.tif | 37.514888 | 37.514888 | 30.844808 | 11.523689 | 794288 | 3.029968 |
| camerman.tif | 37.405411 | 37.405411 | 30.735330 | 11.817871 | 824288 | 3.144409 |

## Results for Boy image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ & d \mathrm{~dB} \end{aligned}$ | MSNR <br> db | MSE | size_secret_data | Bpp |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| BOY.tif | 39.325992 | 39.325992 | 31.506344 | 7.594185 | 524288 | 2.000000 |
| BOY.tif | 39.079071 | 39.079071 | 31.259423 | 8.038467 | 554288 | 2.114441 |
| BOY.tif | 38.869261 | 38.869261 | 31.049613 | 8.436344 | 584288 | 2.228882 |
| BOY.tif | 38.643311 | 38.643311 | 30.823663 | 8.886879 | 614288 | 2.343323 |
| BOY.tif | 38.424377 | 38.424377 | 30.604729 | 9.346363 | 644288 | 2.457764 |
| BOY.tif | 38.235546 | 38.235546 | 30.415898 | 9.761707 | 674288 | 2.572205 |
| BOY.tif | 38.049001 | 38.049001 | 30.229353 | 10.190144 | 704288 | 2.686646 |
| BOY.tif | 37.858396 | 37.858396 | 30.038748 | 10.647331 | 734288 | 2.801086 |
| BOY.tif | 37.681897 | 37.681897 | 29.862250 | 11.088955 | 764288 | 2.915527 |
| BOY.tif | 37.509734 | 37.509734 | 29.690087 | 11.537373 | 794288 | 3.029968 |
| BOY.tif | 37.389279 | 37.389279 | 29.569631 | 11.861851 | 824288 | 3.144409 |

$\gg \mid$

## Results for Boat image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\underset{d B}{\text { Actual_PSNR }}$ | MSNR db | MSE | size_secret_data | Bpp |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| boat.gif | 39.332039 | 38.769193 | 33.880109 | 7.583618 | 524288 | 2.000000 |
| boat.gif | 39.088399 | 38.525553 | 33.636468 | 8.021221 | 554288 | 2.114441 |
| boat.gif | 38.856862 | 38.294016 | 33.404931 | 8.460464 | 584288 | 2.228882 |
| boat.gif | 38.645383 | 38.082537 | 33.193452 | 8.882641 | 614288 | 2.343323 |
| boat.gif | 38.438958 | 37.876112 | 32.987027 | 9.315037 | 644288 | 2.457764 |
| boat.gif | 38.235873 | 37.673028 | 32.783943 | 9.760971 | 674288 | 2.572205 |
| boat.gif | 38.043126 | 37.480280 | 32.591195 | 10.203938 | 704288 | 2.686646 |
| boat.gif | 37.875824 | 37.312978 | 32.423893 | 10.604691 | 734288 | 2.801086 |
| boat.gif | 37.688584 | 37.125738 | 32.236653 | 11.071896 | 764288 | 2.915527 |
| boat.gif | 37.522932 | 36.960087 | 32.071002 | 11.502365 | 794288 | 3.029968 |
| boat.gif | 37.397419 | 36.834574 | 31.945489 | 11.839638 | 824288 | 3.144409 |

## Results for Baby image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{db} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | size_secret_data | Bpp |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| BABY.png | 39.251485 | 39.148692 | 34.773021 | 7.725594 | 524288 | 2.000000 |
| BABY.png | 39.016886 | 38.914093 | 34.538422 | 8.154396 | 554288 | 2.114441 |
| BABY.png | 38.786774 | 38.683981 | 34.308310 | 8.598110 | 584288 | 2.228882 |
| BABY.png | 38.580066 | 38.477273 | 34.101602 | 9.017242 | 614288 | 2.343323 |
| BABY.png | 38.367881 | 38.265088 | 33.889417 | 9.468742 | 644288 | 2.457764 |
| BABY.png | 38.180176 | 38.077383 | 33.701712 | 9.886959 | 674288 | 2.572205 |
| BABY.png | 37.989785 | 37.886992 | 33.511321 | 10.330036 | 704288 | 2.686646 |
| BABY.png | 37.818354 | 37.715562 | 33.339890 | 10.745953 | 734288 | 2.801086 |
| BABY.png | 37.634706 | 37.531914 | 33.156242 | 11.210106 | 764288 | 2.915527 |
| BABY.png | 37.463726 | 37.360933 | 32.985262 | 11.660248 | 794288 | 3.029968 |
| BABY.png | 37.345623 | 37.242830 | 32.867159 | 11.981689 | 824288 | 3.144409 |

## Appendix B: LSB with Constant Threshold Algorithm for Gray Scale (LSBCT)

## B. 1 The main program

\% this program was written by Hajer A Al_aswed in 2016-2017
for LSB with Constant threshold algorithm in gray scale [8] and its functions

1. clc
2. clear
3. cover_image=imread('C:\Users\hajer\Desktop\thesis\GRAY SCALE\MA for textlhome.gif');\%Read cover image
4. [M N L]=size(cover_image);
5. S=sum(cover_image(:,:));
6. $\operatorname{avg}=\operatorname{sum}(\mathrm{S}) /(\mathrm{M} * \mathrm{~N}) ; \%$ calculate the mean of cover image
7. $\operatorname{disp}('==========================================================1)$
8. disp('cover_image Size_secret_data PSNR Actual_PSNR MSNR MSE Ml Mu T ')
9. disp('
dB
dB
db ')
10. p='home.gif';
11. $\operatorname{disp}(=$
12. $\mathrm{ml}=4$;
13. $m u=8$;
14. $\mathrm{T}=160$;
15. start_length $=494288$; \%start length of secreat message
16. increase_size $=30000$;
17. for $\mathrm{q}=1: 2$
18. start_length=start_length+increase_size;
19. secret_massege $=$ randi([0 1],1,start_length $) ; \%$ generate the secreat message
20. [e r]=size(secret_massege);
21. stego_image=Embedding ( $\mathrm{ml}, \mathrm{mu}, \mathrm{T}$, cover_image,secret_massege); \%embedding function
22. $\mathrm{MSE}=0$;
23. for $\mathrm{i}=1: \mathrm{M}$
24. for $\mathrm{j}=1: \mathrm{N}$

MSE=MSE+(double(cover_image(i,j))-double(stego_image(i,j)))^2; \%calculate the MSE
25. end
26. end
27. $\mathrm{MSE}=\mathrm{MSE} /\left(\mathrm{M}^{*} \mathrm{~N}\right)$;
28. $\mathrm{PSNR}=10^{*} \log 10\left(255^{\wedge} 2 /(\mathrm{MSE})\right) ; \%$ calculate the PSNR
29. $\max \_$value=$=\max (\max ($ cover_image(:,:))); \%calculate the maximum actual value
30. $\operatorname{MSNR}=10 * \log 10$ (avg*avg/MSE); \%calculate the MSNR
31. $\mathrm{Bpp}=($ start_length $) /(\mathrm{M} * \mathrm{~N}) ; \%$ calculate the BPP
32. Actual_PSNR $=10 * \log 10$ (double(max_value)*double(max_value)/MSE); \%calculate the APSNR
33. disp(sprintf('\%s \%d \%f \%f \%f \%f\%d \%d \%d' ,p,start_length,PSNR,

Actual_PSNR,MSNR,MSE,ml,mu,T));
34. end
35. $\mathrm{ml}=8$;
36. $m u=16$;
37. for $\mathrm{q}=1: 5$
38. start_length=start_length+increase_size;
39. secret_massege $=$ randi([01],1,start_length $)$; \% generate the secreat message
40. [e r]=size(secret_massege);
41. stego_image=Embedding ( $\mathrm{ml}, \mathrm{mu}, \mathrm{T}$, cover_image,secret_massege); \%embedding function
42. $\mathrm{MSE}=0$;
43. for $\mathrm{i}=1: \mathrm{M}$
44. for $\mathrm{j}=1: \mathrm{N}$

MSE=MSE+(double(cover_image(i,j))-double(stego_image(i,j)))^2; \%calculate the MSE
45. end
46. end
47. $\mathrm{MSE}=\mathrm{MSE} /\left(\mathrm{M}^{*} \mathrm{~N}\right)$;
48. $\mathrm{PSNR}=10^{*} \log 10\left(255^{\wedge} 2 /(\mathrm{MSE})\right) ; \%$ calculate the PSNR
49. $\max \_$value=$=\max (\max ($ cover_image(:,:)));\%calculate the maximum actual value
50. MSNR $=10 * \log 10($ avg*avg/MSE); \%calculate the MSNR
51. $\mathrm{Bpp}=($ start_length $) /(\mathrm{M} * \mathrm{~N}) ; \%$ calculate the BPP
52. Actual_PSNR=10* $\log 10$ (double(max_value)*double(max_value)/MSE); \%calculate the APSNR
53. disp(sprintf('\%s \%d \%f \%f \%f \%f\%d \%d \%d' ,p,start_length,PSNR,

Actual_PSNR,MSNR,MSE,ml,mu,T));
54. end
55. $\operatorname{disp}$ ('=============================================================')
56. \%show the cover image and stego image
57. figure
58. subplot( $2,2,[1,3]$ );
59. imshow(cover_image);
60. title('Cover image')
61. subplot (2,2,[2,4]);
62. imshow(stego_image);
63. title('Stego image')
64. output $=$ extraction $($ stego_image, $\mathrm{T}, \mathrm{mu}, \mathrm{ml})$;\%extraction function

## B. 2 Embedding function

1. function [ stego_image ] = Embedding ( ml,mu,T,cover_image,secret_massege)
2. [er]=size(secret_massege);
3. $[\mathrm{M} \mathrm{N} \mathrm{L]}=$ size(cover_image);
4. stego_image=cover_image;
5. $\mathrm{m}=0$;
6. $\mathrm{mm}=0$;
7. $\mathrm{k}=1$;
8. for $\mathrm{i}=1: \mathrm{M}$
9. for $\mathrm{j}=1: \mathrm{N}$
10. if ( $\mathrm{k}<=\mathrm{r}$ )
11. if (cover_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})>=\mathrm{T}$ )
12. $\mathrm{m}=\mathrm{m}+1$;
13. $\mathrm{EC}=\log 2(\mathrm{mu})$; \%how many bit will be embedding in the pixel
14. RES=mod(cover_image(i,j),mu);
15. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
16. $\mathrm{q}=(\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1)-\mathrm{r}$;
17. $\mathrm{s}=$ secret_massege $(\mathrm{k}: \mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1-\mathrm{q})$;
18. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
19. else
20. $s=$ secret_massege $(k: k+E C-1)$;
21. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
22. end
23. $\mathrm{a}=\operatorname{num} 2 \operatorname{str}(\mathrm{~s})$;
24. $\mathrm{DEC}=\operatorname{bin} 2 \operatorname{dec}(\mathrm{a})$;
25. $\mathrm{D}=\mathrm{abs}($ RES-DEC);
26. if (cover_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})>(255-(\mathrm{mu} / 2)+1)$ )
27. stego_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})=(255-\mathrm{mu}+1)+\mathrm{DEC}$;
28. end
29. if $((\mathrm{T}+(\mathrm{mu} / 2))<$ cover_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})<=(255-(\mathrm{mu} / 2)+1))$
30. if ( $\mathrm{D}>(\mathrm{mu} / 2)$ )
31. $A V=m u-D$;
32. if (RES $>$ DEC)
33. stego_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})=$ cover_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})+\mathrm{AV}$;
34. else
35. stego_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})=$ cover_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})$-AV;
36. end
37. end
38. $\operatorname{if}(\mathrm{D}<=(\mathrm{mu} / 2))$
39. $\mathrm{AV}=\mathrm{D}$;
40. if (RES>DEC)
41. stego_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})=$ cover_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})$-AV;
42. else
43. stego_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})=$ cover_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})+\mathrm{AV}$;
44. end
45. end
46. end
47. $\mathrm{if}(\mathrm{T}<=$ cover_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})<=(\mathrm{T}+(\mathrm{mu} / 2)))$
48. stego_image( $\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}$ )=cover_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})$-RES+DEC;
49. end
50. end
51. if (cover_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})<\mathrm{T}$ )
52. $\mathrm{mm}=\mathrm{mm}+1$;
53. $\mathrm{EC}=\log 2(\mathrm{ml})$;
54. RES=mod(cover_image( $\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}$ ),ml);
55. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
56. $\mathrm{q}=(\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1)-\mathrm{r}$;
57. $s=$ secret_massege( $k: k+E C-1-q)$;
58. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
59. else
60. $s=$ secret_massege(k:k+EC-1);
61. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
62. end
63. $\mathrm{a}=$ num2str(s);
64. $\mathrm{DEC}=\operatorname{bin} 2 \operatorname{dec}(\mathrm{a})$;
65. $\mathrm{D}=\mathrm{abs}($ RES-DEC $)$;
66. if (cover_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})<(\mathrm{ml} / 2)$ )
67. stego_image ( $\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}$ ) $=$ DEC;
68. end
69. $\mathrm{if}((\mathrm{ml} / 2)<=$ cover_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})<(\mathrm{T}-(\mathrm{ml} / 2)))$
70. if $(\mathrm{D}>(\mathrm{ml} / 2))$
71. $\mathrm{AV}=\mathrm{ml}-\mathrm{D}$;
72. if (RES>DEC)
73. stego_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})=$ cover_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})+\mathrm{AV}$;
74. else
75. stego_image ( $\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}$ )=cover_image( $\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}$ )-AV;
76. end
77. end
78. if( $\mathrm{D}<=(\mathrm{ml} / 2))$
79. $\mathrm{AV}=\mathrm{D}$;
80. if (RES>DEC)
81. stego_image( $\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}$ )=cover_image( $\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}$ )-AV;
82. else
83. stego_image( $\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}$ )=cover_image( $\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}$ )+AV;
84. end
85. end
86. end
87. $\mathrm{if}((\mathrm{T}-(\mathrm{m} / 2))<=$ cover_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})<\mathrm{T})$
88. stego_image( $\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}$ )=cover_image( $\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}$ )-RES+DEC;
89. end
90. end
91. end
92. end
93. end
94. end

## B. 3 Extraction function

1. function $[$ output $]=$ extraction (stego_image,T,mu,ml)
2. [M N]=size(stego_image);
3. $\mathrm{kk}=1$;
4. $\mathrm{k}=1$;
5. for $\mathrm{i}=1: \mathrm{M}$
6. for $\mathrm{j}=1: \mathrm{N}$
7. if ( $\mathrm{kk}<=\mathrm{r}$ )
8. if (stego_image (i,j)>=T)
9. $\mathrm{EC}=\log 2(\mathrm{mu})$;
10. RES=mod(stego_image(i, j$), \mathrm{mu})$;
11. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
12. $\mathrm{q}=(\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1)-\mathrm{r}$;
13. $s=$ dec $2 b i n($ RES,EC $-q$ );
14. for $\mathrm{g}=1: \mathrm{EC}-\mathrm{q}$
15. $\mathrm{a}=$ str2num(s(g));
16. output(kk)=a;
17. kk=kk+1;
18. end
19. else
20. s=dec2bin(RES,EC);
21. for $\mathrm{g}=1: \mathrm{EC}$
22. $\mathrm{a}=\mathrm{str} 2 \operatorname{num}(\mathrm{~s}(\mathrm{~g})$ );
23. output $(\mathrm{kk})=\mathrm{a}$;
24. kk=kk+1;
25. end
26. k=k+EC;
27. end
28. else
29. $\mathrm{EC}=\log 2$ (ml);
30. RES=mod(stego_image(i,j),ml);
31. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
32. $q=(k+E C-1)-r$;
33. $\mathrm{s}=\mathrm{dec} 2 \mathrm{bin}($ RES,EC-q);
34. for $\mathrm{g}=1: \mathrm{EC}-\mathrm{q}$
35. $\mathrm{a}=\mathrm{str} 2 \operatorname{num}(\mathrm{~s}(\mathrm{~g}))$;
36. output $(\mathrm{kk})=\mathrm{a}$;
37. kk=kk+1;
38. end
39. else
40. s=dec2bin(RES,EC);
41. for $\mathrm{g}=1: \mathrm{EC}$
42. $\mathrm{a}=\mathrm{str} 2 \operatorname{num}(\mathrm{~s}(\mathrm{~g}))$;
43. output $(\mathrm{kk})=\mathrm{a}$;
44. kk=kk+1;
45. end
46. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
47. end
48. end
49. end
50. end
51. end
52. end

## B. 4 Screenshots of LSBCT Algorithm, $\mathbf{T}=160$, for gray scale results for different

cover images with size $512 \times 512$
Results for Lena image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | $\underset{d B}{\text { Actual_PSNR }}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| lenaBMP.bnp | 524288 | 42.203832 | 41.856350 | 35.944439 | 3.914688 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| lenaBMP.bnp | 584288 | 41.771417 | 41.423935 | 35.512024 | 4.324528 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| lenaBMP.bnp | 644288 | 36.664771 | 36.317289 | 30.405378 | 14.015327 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| lenaBMP.bnp | 704288 | 36.279082 | 35.931600 | 30.019690 | 15.316944 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| lenaBMP.bnp | 734288 | 36.106057 | 35.758575 | 29.846664 | 15.939499 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| lenaBMP.bnp | 764288 | 35.947297 | 35.599815 | 29.687904 | 16.532963 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| lenaBMP.bnp | 824288 | 35.648520 | 35.301038 | 29.389127 | 17.710400 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Results for Zelda image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d \mathrm{~B} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| zelda.bmp | 524288 | 42.939214 | 42.005120 | 35.698770 | 3.304905 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| zelda.bmp | 584288 | 42.681026 | 41.746932 | 35.440582 | 3.507339 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| zelda.bmp | 644288 | 37.428747 | 36.494653 | 30.188304 | 11.754539 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| zelda.bmp | 704288 | 37.096911 | 36.162817 | 29.856467 | 12.687885 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| zelda.bmp | 734288 | 36.964019 | 36.029925 | 29.723575 | 13.082130 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| zelda.bmp | 764288 | 36.748948 | 35.814854 | 29.508504 | 13.746292 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| zelda.bmp | 824288 | 36.441192 | 35.507098 | 29.200748 | 14.755745 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Results for Airplane image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| airplane.bmp | 524288 | 40.217775 | 39.359211 | 37.152709 | 6.184475 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| airplane.bmp | 584288 | 39.785172 | 38.926608 | 36.720106 | 6.832241 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| airplane.bmp | 644288 | 34.543641 | 33.685077 | 31.478575 | 22.841061 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| airplane.bmp | 704288 | 34.220821 | 33.362257 | 31.155755 | 24.603577 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| airplane.bmp | 734288 | 34.060481 | 33.201917 | 30.995415 | 25.528912 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| airplane.bmp | 764288 | 33.912036 | 33.053472 | 30.846970 | 26.416592 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| airplane.bmp | 824288 | 33.587272 | 32.728707 | 30.522206 | 28.467754 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Results for Baboon image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB}^{-} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Baboon.bmp | 524288 | 41.955945 | 41.356681 | 36.046782 | 4.144630 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| Baboon.bmp | 584288 | 41.486587 | 40.887323 | 35.577423 | 4.617657 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| Baboon.bmp | 644288 | 36.553475 | 35.954210 | 30.644311 | 14.379139 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| Baboon.bmp | 704288 | 36.170410 | 35.571146 | 30.261246 | 15.705051 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| Baboon.bmp | 734288 | 35.985098 | 35.385834 | 30.075934 | 16.389683 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| Baboon.bmp | 764288 | 35.784355 | 35.185090 | 29.875191 | 17.165043 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| Baboon.bmp | 824288 | 35.431005 | 34.831741 | 29.521841 | 18.620007 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Results for Barbara image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret _data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d \mathrm{~dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| barbara.png | 524288 | 41.268970 | 41.096966 | 35.185882 | 4.854935 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| barbara.png | 584288 | 40.890622 | 40.718619 | 34.807534 | 5.296856 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| barbara.png | 644288 | 35.606039 | 35.434035 | 29.522951 | 17.884487 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| barbara.png | 704288 | 35.307640 | 35.135636 | 29.224552 | 19.156509 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| barbara.png | 734288 | 35.190916 | 35.018913 | 29.107829 | 19.678352 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| barbara.png | 764288 | 35.067682 | 34.895678 | 28.984594 | 20.244740 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| barbara.png | 824288 | 34.822927 | 34.650924 | 28.739840 | 21.418430 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

Results for Elain image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB}^{-} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| elain.bmp | 524288 | 41.833421 | 41.626604 | 36.396019 | 4.263226 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| elain.bmp | 584288 | 41.289746 | 41.082930 | 35.852345 | 4.831764 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| elain.bmp | 644288 | 36.548855 | 36.342038 | 31.111453 | 14.394444 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| elain.bmp | 704288 | 36.121415 | 35.914598 | 30.684013 | 15.883232 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| elain.bmp | 734288 | 35.904040 | 35.697224 | 30.466639 | 16.698456 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| elain.bmp | 764288 | 35.669586 | 35.462769 | 30.232184 | 17.624702 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| elain.bmp | 824288 | 35.289679 | 35.082862 | 29.852278 | 19.235897 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Results for Goldhill image in Figure A. 1



## Results for Peppers image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| peppers brop | 524288 | 41.931976 | 41.222530 | 35.406731 | 4.167568 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| peppers brip | 584288 | 41.409715 | 40.700269 | 34.884470 | 4.700119 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| peppers brop | 644288 | 36.395454 | 35,686008 | 29.870208 | 14.911968 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| peppers, bmp | 704288 | 36.065148 | 35.355702 | 29.539903 | 16.090351 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| peppers brmp | 734288 | 35.902141 | 35.192695 | 29.376896 | 16.705761 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| peppers brip | 764288 | 35.760191 | 35.050744 | 29.234945 | 17.260815 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| peppers brip | 824288 | 35.348516 | 34.639069 | 28.823270 | 18.977055 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

Results for Lady image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d \mathrm{BB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| lady.tif | 524288 | 41.160990 | 40.525153 | 34.487570 | 4.977158 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| lady.tif | 584288 | 40.771567 | 40.135731 | 34.098148 | 5.444069 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| lady.tif | 644288 | 35.443139 | 34.807302 | 28.769719 | 18.568058 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| lady.tif | 704288 | 35.136196 | 34.500359 | 28.462777 | 19.927864 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| lady.tif | 734288 | 34.953111 | 34.317275 | 28.279692 | 20.785919 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| lady.tif | 764288 | 34.798643 | 34.162807 | 28.125224 | 21.538528 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| lady.tif | 824288 | 34.598726 | 33.962889 | 27.925306 | 22.553181 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Results for House image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB}^{-} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| house.tif | 524288 | 42.789644 | 42.721251 | 36.318885 | 3.420708 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| house.tif | 584288 | 42.363169 | 42.294775 | 35.892409 | 3.773666 | . | 8 | 160 |
| house.tif | 644288 | 37.169895 | 37.101502 | 30.699136 | 12.476444 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| house.tif | 704288 | 36.889674 | 36.821280 | 30.418914 | 13.308006 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| house.tif | 734288 | 36.742684 | 36.674291 | 30.271925 | 13.766132 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| house.tif | 764288 | 36.613554 | 36.545161 | 30.142795 | 14.181591 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| house.tif | 824288 | 36.217127 | 36.148734 | 29.746368 | 15.537018 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Results for Home image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | 1 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| home.gif | 524288 | 43.779233 | 43.676440 | 32.421154 | 2.723686 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| home.gif | 584288 | 43.739767 | 43.636974 | 32.381688 | 2.748550 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| home.gif | 644288 | 38.723742 | 38.620950 | 27.365664 | 8.723808 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| home.gif | 704288 | 38.308204 | 38.205411 | 26.950125 | 9.599751 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| home.gif | 734288 | 38.123626 | 38.020833 | 26.765547 | 10.016541 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| home.gif | 764288 | 37.919640 | 37.816847 | 26.561561 | 10.498238 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| home.gif | 824288 | 37.780066 | 37.677273 | 26.421987 | 10.841110 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Results for Camerman image in Figure A. 1



## Results for Boy image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| BOY.tif | 524288 | 42.552515 | 42.552515 | 34.732867 | 3.612675 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| BOY.tif | 584288 | 42.110142 | 42.110142 | 34.290494 | 4.000057 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| BOY.tif | 644288 | 37.309155 | 37.309155 | 29.489507 | 12.082726 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| BOY.tif | 704288 | 36.808396 | 36.808396 | 28.988748 | 13.559410 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| BOY.tif | 734288 | 36.613498 | 36.613498 | 28.793850 | 14.181774 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| BOY.tif | 764288 | 36.386613 | 36.386613 | 28.566965 | 14.942356 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| BOY.tif | 824288 | 36.025221 | 36.025221 | 28.205574 | 16.238960 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Results for Boat image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{PSNR} \\ \mathrm{~dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | I |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| boat.gif | 524288 | 40.747378 | 40.184533 | 35.295448 | 5.474476 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| boat.gif | 584288 | 40.488976 | 39.926130 | 35.037045 | 5.810089 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| boat.gif | 644288 | 34.937442 | 34.374596 | 29.485512 | 20.861050 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| boat.gif | 704288 | 34.672112 | 34.109267 | 29.220182 | 22.175282 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| boat.gif | 734288 | 34.578281 | 34.015435 | 29.126350 | 22.659603 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| boat.gif | 764288 | 34.513507 | 33.950662 | 29.061577 | 23.000095 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| boat.gif | 824288 | 34.310001 | 33.747155 | 28.858071 | 24.103508 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

Results for Baby image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d \mathrm{~dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} M S N R \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| BABY.png | 524288 | 40.818714 | 40.715921 | 36.340250 | 5.385288 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| BABY.png | 584288 | 40.410863 | 40.308071 | 35.932399 | 5.915535 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| BABY.png | 644288 | 35.109098 | 35.006305 | 30.630634 | 20.052593 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| BABY.png | 704288 | 34.793511 | 34.690718 | 30.315047 | 21.563999 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| BABY.png | 734288 | 34.653730 | 34.550937 | 30.175266 | 22.269341 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| BABY.png | 764288 | 34.499533 | 34.396740 | 30.021069 | 23.074223 | 8 | 16 | 160 |
| BABY.png | 824288 | 34.198964 | 34.096171 | 29.720500 | 24.727715 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Appendix C: LSB with Dynamic Threshold Algorithm for Gray Scale (LSBDT)

## C. 1 The main program

\% this program was written by Hajer A Al_aswed in 2016-2017
for LSB with Constant threshold algorithm in gray scale [8] and its functions

1. clc
2. clear
3. cover_image=imread('C:\Users\hajer\Desktop\thesis\GRAY SCALE\MA for textlhome.gif');\%Read cover image
4. [M N L]=size(cover_image);
5. S=sum(cover_image(:,:));
6. $\operatorname{avg}=\operatorname{sum}(\mathrm{S}) /(\mathrm{M} * \mathrm{~N}) ; \%$ calculate the mean of cover image
7. $\mathrm{ml}=4$;
8. $\mathrm{mu}=8$;
9. $\operatorname{disp}('=============================================================1)$
10. disp('cover_image Size_secret_data PSNR Actual_PSNR MSNR MSE Ml Mu T ')
11. $\operatorname{disp}(' \quad d B \quad d B \quad d b ~ ')$
12. $\mathrm{p}=$ 'home.gif';
13. disp('============================================================')
14. start_length $=494288$; \%start length of secret message
15. increase_size $=30000$;
16. start_length=start_length+increase_size;
17. $\mathrm{Bpp}=$ start_length $/ \mathrm{M} * \mathrm{~N}$;
18. if (Bpp~=3.14)
19. $\mathrm{T}=160 *(3.14-\mathrm{Bpp})+10$;
20. else
21. $\mathrm{T}=160$;
22. end
23. if $(\bmod (T, 16) \sim=0)$
24. $\mathrm{T}=\mathrm{T}-\bmod (\mathrm{T}, 16)$;
25. end
26. Bpp_actual=((T/256)*( $\log 2(\mathrm{ml})))+(((256-\mathrm{T}) / 256) *(\log 2(\mathrm{mu})))$;
27. while (Bpp_actual<Bpp)
28. T=T-mu;
29. Bpp_actual $=((\mathrm{T} / 256) *(\log 2(\mathrm{ml})))+(((256-\mathrm{T}) / 256) *(\log 2(\mathrm{mu})))$;
30. end
31. secret_massege $=$ randi([0 1], 1 ,start_length $) ; \%$ generate the secreat message
32. [e r]=size(secret_massege);
33. stego_image=Embedding ( ml,mu,T,cover_image,secret_massege); \%embedding function
34. $\mathrm{MSE}=0$;
35. for $\mathrm{i}=1: \mathrm{M}$
36. for $\mathrm{j}=1: \mathrm{N}$

MSE=MSE+(double(cover_image(i,j))-double(stego_image(i,j)))^2; \%calculate the MSE
37. end
38. end
39. $\mathrm{MSE}=\mathrm{MSE} /\left(\mathrm{M}^{*} \mathrm{~N}\right)$;
40. PSNR $=10 * \log 10\left(255^{\wedge} 2 /(\mathrm{MSE})\right) ; \%$ calculate the PSNR
41. $\max \_$value $=\max (\max ($ cover_image(:,:))); \%calculate the maximum actual value
42. $\mathrm{MSNR}=10 * \log 10$ (avg*avg/MSE); \%calculate the MSNR
43. $\mathrm{Bpp}=($ start_length $) /\left(\mathrm{M}^{*} \mathrm{~N}\right) ; \%$ calculate the BPP
44. Actual_PSNR=10* $\log 10$ (double(max_value)*double(max_value)/MSE); \%calculate the APSNR
45. disp(sprintf('\%s \%d \%f \%f \%f \%f \%d \%d \%d' ,p,start_length,PSNR,

Actual_PSNR,MSNR,MSE,ml,mu,T));
46. end
47. $\operatorname{disp}$ ('=============================================================')
48. \%show the cover image and stego image
49. figure
50. subplot( $2,2,[1,3]$ );
51. imshow(cover_image);
52. title('Cover image')
53. $\operatorname{subplot}(2,2,[2,4])$;
54. imshow(stego_image);
55. title('Stego image')
56. output $=$ extraction( stego_image, $T, \mathrm{mu}, \mathrm{ml}) ; \%$ extraction function

Other functions are the same as shown in Appendices B.2, B. 3 for LSBCT
C. 2 Screenshots of LSBDT Algorithm for gray scale result for different cover images with size $\mathbf{5 1 2 \times 5 1 2}$

## Results for Lena image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d \mathrm{~B} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} M S N R \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | I |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| lena. BMP | 524288 | 43.203327 | 42.855845 | 36.943934 | 3.109909 | 4 | 8 | 192 |
| lena. BMP | 584288 | 41.739591 | 41.392109 | 35.480199 | 4.356335 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| lena. BMP | 644288 | 40.031265 | 39.683783 | 33.771872 | 6.455856 | 4 | 8 | 128 |
| lena. BMP | 704288 | 38.852524 | 38.505042 | 32.593132 | 8.468918 | 4 | 8 | 80 |
| lena. BMP | 734288 | 38.336860 | 37.989378 | 32.077467 | 9.536617 | 4 | 8 | 48 |
| lena. BMP | 764288 | 38.042626 | 37.695144 | 31.783233 | 10.205112 | 4 | 8 | 16 |
| lena. BMP | 824288 | 35.636526 | 35.289045 | 29.377134 | 17.759377 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

Results for Zelda image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d \mathrm{~B} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{MSNR} \\ \mathrm{~dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| zeldaBMP.bmp | 524288 | 44.133917 | 43.199824 | 36.893474 | 2.510086 | 4 | 8 | 192 |
| zeldaBMP.bmp | 584288 | 42.676404 | 41.742310 | 35.435960 | 3.511074 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| zeldaBMP. bmp | 644288 | 40.587183 | 39.653089 | 33.346739 | 5.680180 | 4 | 8 | 128 |
| zeldaBMP. bmp | 704288 | 38.972098 | 38.038004 | 31.731654 | 8.238926 | 4 | 8 | 80 |
| zeldaBMP. bmp | 734288 | 38.372418 | 37.438324 | 31.131974 | 9.458855 | 4 | 8 | 48 |
| zeldaBMP. bmp | 764288 | 38.060738 | 37.126644 | 30.820294 | 10.162640 | 4 | 8 | 16 |
| zeldaBMP .bmp | 824288 | 36.424963 | 35.490869 | 29.184519 | 14.810989 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Results for Airplane image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | $\underset{\substack{\text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d \mathrm{~B}}}{\text { and }}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| airplane. BMP | 524288 | 40.569041 | 39.710477 | 37.503976 | 5.703957 | 4 | 8 | 192 |
| airplane. BMP | 584288 | 39.791197 | 38.932633 | 36.726131 | 6.822769 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| airplane.BMP | 644288 | 39.231077 | 38.372513 | 36.166011 | 7.761982 | 4 | 8 | 128 |
| airplane. BMP | 704288 | 38.529906 | 37.671342 | 35.464840 | 9.121994 | 4 | 8 | 80 |
| airplane. BMP | 734288 | 38.284258 | 37.425694 | 35.219192 | 9.652828 | 4 | 8 | 48 |
| airplane. BMP | 764288 | 38.095727 | 37.237163 | 35.030662 | 10.081093 | 4 | 8 | 16 |
| airplane. BMP | 824288 | 33.566819 | 32.708255 | 30.501753 | 28.602139 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Results for Baboon image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d \mathrm{~B} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Baboon. BMP | 524288 | 43.632592 | 43.033328 | 37.723428 | 2.817223 | 4 | 8 | 192 |
| Baboon. BMP | 584288 | 41.475393 | 40.876129 | 35.566230 | 4.629574 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| Baboon. BMP | 644288 | 40.001092 | 39.401827 | 34.091928 | 6.500866 | 4 | 8 | 128 |
| Baboon. BMP | 704288 | 38.708346 | 38.109081 | 32.799182 | 8.754791 | 4 | 8 | 80 |
| Baboon. BMP | 734288 | 38.290367 | 37.691102 | 32.381203 | 9.639259 | 4 | 8 | 48 |
| Baboon. BMP | 764288 | 38.038973 | 37.439708 | 32.129809 | 10.213699 | 4 | 8 | 16 |
| Baboon. BMP | 824288 | 35.444204 | 34.844940 | 29.535040 | 18.563503 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Results for Barbara image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{MSNR} \\ \mathrm{~dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| barbaraBMP. bmp | 524288 | 42.017444 | 41.845441 | 35.934357 | 4.086353 | 4 | 8 | 192 |
| barbaraBMP .bmp | 584288 | 40.901915 | 40.729912 | 34.818828 | 5.283100 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| barbaraBMP .omp | 644288 | 40.067491 | 39.895488 | 33.984404 | 6.402229 | 4 | 8 | 128 |
| barbaraBMP .bmp | 704288 | 39.056830 | 38.884827 | 32.973743 | 8.079739 | 4 | 8 |  |
| barbaraBMP .omp | 734288 | 38.705408 | 38.533404 | 32.622320 | 8.760715 | 4 | 8 |  |
| barbaraBMP .bmp | 764288 | 38.108629 | 37.936626 | 32.025541 | 10.051189 | 4 | 8 |  |
| barbaraBMP .bmp | 824288 | 34.832107 | 34.660104 | 28.749020 | 21.373203 | 8 | 16 |  |

## Results for Elain image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| elainBMP bmp | 524288 | 42.935040 | 42.728224 | 37.497639 | 3.308083 | 4 | 8 | 192 |
| elainBMP.bmp | 584288 | 41.301537 | 41.094720 | 35.864135 | 4.818665 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| elainBMP bryp | 644288 | 39.797366 | 39.590550 | 34.359965 | 6.813084 | 4 | 8 | 128 |
| elainBMP brop | 704288 | 38.634517 | 38.427700 | 33.197116 | 8.904892 | 4 | 8 | 80 |
| elainBMP.bmp | 734288 | 38.227739 | 38.020922 | 32.790338 | 9.779270 | 4 | 8 | 48 |
| elainBMP.bmp | 764288 | 38.018896 | 37.812080 | 32.581495 | 10.261024 | 4 | 8 | 16 |
| elainBMP.bmp | 824288 | 35.307156 | 35.100339 | 29.869754 | 19.158646 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Results for Goldhill image in Figure A. 1



## Results for Pepper image in Figure A. 1



## Results for Lady image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB}_{\mathrm{B}} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| lady.bmp | 524288 | 42.084938 | 41.449101 | 35.411519 | 4.023338 | 4 | 8 | 192 |
| lady.bmp | 584288 | 40.773181 | 40.137344 | 34.099761 | 5.442047 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| lady.bmp | 644288 | 40.028353 | 39.392517 | 33.354934 | 6.460186 | 4 | 8 | 128 |
| lady.bmp | 704288 | 39.158543 | 38.522707 | 32.485124 | 7.892708 | 4 | 8 | 80 |
| lady.bmp | 734288 | 38.842559 | 38.206722 | 32.169140 | 8.488373 | 4 | 8 | 48 |
| lady.bmp | 764288 | 38.434155 | 37.798318 | 31.760735 | 9.325344 | 4 | 8 | 16 |
| lady.bmp | 824288 | 34.576679 | 33.940842 | 27.903260 | 22.667961 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Results for House image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d \mathrm{~dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} M S N R \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| house.bmp | 524288 | 43.789080 | 43.720686 | 37.318320 | 2.717518 | 4 | 8 | 192 |
| house.bmp | 584288 | 42.345827 | 42.277434 | 35.875068 | 3.788765 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| house bmp | 644288 | 40.160803 | 40.092409 | 33.690043 | 6.266140 | 4 | 8 | 128 |
| house bmp | 704288 | 38.754594 | 38.686201 | 32.283835 | 8.662056 | 4 | 8 | 80 |
| house bmp | 734288 | 38.358616 | 38.290222 | 31.887856 | 9.488964 | 4 | 8 | 48 |
| house.bmp | 764288 | 38.077619 | 38.009226 | 31.606860 | 10.123215 | 4 | 8 | 16 |
| house brip | 824288 | 36.220871 | 36.152478 | 29.750112 | 15.523628 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Results for Home image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d \mathrm{~dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| home bmp | 524288 | 43.787976 | 43.685183 | 32.429897 | 2.718208 | 4 | 8 | 192 |
| home bmp | 584288 | 43.730398 | 43.627605 | 32.372319 | 2.754486 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| home brip | 644288 | 42.884860 | 42.782067 | 31.526781 | 3.346527 | 4 | 8 | 128 |
| home bmp | 704288 | 41.044050 | 40.941257 | 29.685971 | 5.112995 | 4 | 8 | 80 |
| home bomp | 734288 | 39.219629 | 39.116836 | 27.861550 | 7.782471 | 4 | 8 | 48 |
| home bmp | 764288 | 38.388757 | 38.285964 | 27.030678 | 9.423336 | 4 | 8 | 16 |
| home bomp | 824288 | 37.776159 | 37.673366 | 26.418080 | 10.850868 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Results for Camerman image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| camerman. brp | 524288 | 43.982946 | 43.982946 | 37.312866 | 2.598877 | 4 | 8 | 192 |
| camerman. bmp | 584288 | 41.026481 | 41.026481 | 34.356401 | 5.133720 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| camerman. brp | 644288 | 39.733727 | 39.733727 | 33.063646 | 6.913654 | 4 | 8 | 128 |
| camerman. bmp | 704288 | 38.963994 | 38.963994 | 32.293913 | 8.254314 | 4 | 8 | 80 |
| camerman. brip | 734288 | 38.758218 | 38.758218 | 32.088137 | 8.654831 | 4 | 8 | 48 |
| camerman. bryp | 764288 | 38.480821 | 38.480821 | 31.810740 | 9.225677 | 4 | 8 | 16 |
| camerman. bmp | 824288 | 35.035104 | 35.035104 | 28.365024 | 20.397171 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Results for Boy image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d \mathrm{~dB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| BOY.bmp | 524288 | 43.269329 | 43.269329 | 35.449681 | 3.063004 | 4 | 8 | 192 |
| BOY.bmp | 584288 | 42.119935 | 42.119935 | 34.300287 | 3.991047 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| BOY. bmp | 644288 | 41.086417 | 41.086417 | 33.266769 | 5.063358 | 4 | 8 | 128 |
| BOY.bup | 704288 | 39.289935 | 39.289935 | 31.470287 | 7.657497 | 4 | 8 | 80 |
| BOY. bmp | 734288 | 38.899713 | 38.899713 | 31.080066 | 8.377396 | 4 | 8 | 48 |
| BOY. bmp | 764288 | 38.068592 | 38.068592 | 30.248944 | 10.144279 | 4 | 8 | 16 |
| BOY.bmp | 824288 | 36.035591 | 36.035591 | 28.215943 | 16.200233 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Results for Boat image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Actual_PSNR } \\ d \mathrm{BB} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{MSNR} \\ \mathrm{~dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | I |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| boat bmp | 524288 | 43.652195 | 43.089350 | 38.200265 | 2.804535 | 4 | 8 | 192 |
| boat.bmp | 584288 | 40.515495 | 39.952649 | 35.063564 | 5.774719 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| boat bmp | 644288 | 39.476645 | 38.913799 | 34.024714 | 7.335266 | 4 | 8 | 128 |
| boat. bmp | 704288 | 38.823799 | 38.260953 | 33.371868 | 8.525120 | 4 | 8 | 80 |
| boat.bmp | 734288 | 38.481351 | 37.918505 | 33.029420 | 9.224552 | 4 | 8 | 48 |
| boat. bmp | 764288 | 38.041905 | 37.479059 | 32.589975 | 10.206806 | 4 | 8 | 16 |
| boat. bmp | 824288 | 34.321530 | 33.758685 | 28.869600 | 24.039604 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

Results for Baby image in Figure A. 1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | $\underset{d B}{\text { Actual_PSNR }}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { MSNR } \\ d B \end{gathered}$ | MSE | M1 | Mu | I |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| BABY.png | 524288 | 41.819360 | 41.716568 | 37.340896 | 4.277050 | 4 | 8 | 192 |
| BABY.png | 584288 | 40.394614 | 40.291821 | 35.916150 | 5.937710 | 4 | 8 | 160 |
| BABY.png | 644288 | 39.411874 | 39.309081 | 34.933410 | 7.445484 | 4 | 8 | 128 |
| BABY.png | 704288 | 38.680160 | 38.577367 | 34.201696 | 8.811794 | 4 | 8 | 80 |
| BABY.png | 734288 | 38.349848 | 38.247055 | 33.871384 | 9.508141 | 4 | 8 | 48 |
| BABY.png | 764288 | 38.087992 | 37.985200 | 33.609528 | 10.099064 | 4 | 8 | 16 |
| BABY.png | 824288 | 34.217682 | 34.114890 | 29.739218 | 24.621365 | 8 | 16 | 160 |

## Appendix D: LSB Algorithm for Color Images



Figure D.1. Color Cover Images Used

## D. 1 The main program

\% this program was written by Hajer A Al_aswed in 2016-2017 for LSB with algorithm in color scale and its functions
1.clc
2.clear
3.cover_image=imread('C:IUsers\hajerlDesktop\thesislCOLOR SCALELLSB_colorlBalloon (512 x
512).jpg');
4.disp('========================================================')
5.disp('cover_image Size_secret_data PSNR MSE ')
6.disp(' dB ')
7.disp('=========================================================')
8.p='Balloon_color';
9.secrt_image=imread('C:IUsers\hajerlDesktop\thesis11.jpg');
10. [m n l]=size(secrt_image);
11. $\mathrm{k}=1$;
12. for $\mathrm{i}=1: \mathrm{m}$
13. for $\mathrm{j}=1: \mathrm{n}$
14. $\operatorname{str}=$ dec2bin(secrt_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}), 8)$;
15. for $\mathrm{q}=1: 8$
16. aa=str2num(str(q));
17. secret_massege(k)=aa;
18. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
19. end
20. end
21. end
22. [e r]=size(secret_massege);
23. [stego_image, y,u]=Embedding(cover_image,secret_massege);
24. [MSE_R,MSE_G,MSE_B ] = MSE( y,u,cover_image,stego_image);
25. mse $=($ MSE_R + MSE_B + MSE_G $) / 3$;
26. [PSNR,PSNR_R,PSNR_G,PSNR_B ] = PSNR(mse,MSE_R,MSE_G,MSE_B );
27. disp(sprintf('\%s \%d \%f \%f ',p,r,PSNR,mse));
28. $\operatorname{disp}($ sprintf('PSNR_R=\%f PSNR_G=\%f PSNR_B=\%f ',PSNR_R,PSNR_G,PSNR_B));
29. [MSNR,MSNR_R,MSNR_G,MSNR_B ] = MSNR(cover_image,MSE_R,MSE_G,MSE_B,mse);
30. disp(sprintf('MSNR_R=\%f MSNR_G=\%f MSNR_B=\%f ',MSNR_R,MSNR_G,MSNR_B));
31. $\operatorname{disp}\left(\right.$ sprintf('MSNR $\left.=\% \mathrm{f}^{\prime}, \mathrm{MSNR}\right)$ );
32. Actual_PSNR_weight = A_PSNR( cover_image,MSE_R,MSE_G,MSE_B );
33. disp(sprintf('Actual_PSNR_weight(1/3_1/3_1/3)=\%f ',Actual_PSNR_weight));
34. disp(sprintf('W_PSNR(0.4_0.243_0.357)=\%f',(0.4*PSNR_R+0.243*PSNR_G+0.357*PSNR_B)) );
35. disp(sprintf('W_PSNR(0.4_0.3_0.3)=\%f',(0.4*PSNR_R+0.3*PSNR_G+0.3*PSNR_B)));
36. $\operatorname{disp}($ sprintf('W_PSNR(1/3_1/3_1/3)=\%f',(1/3*PSNR_R+1/3*PSNR_G+1/3*PSNR_B)));
37. disp(sprintf('W_MSNR(0.4_0.243_0.357)=\%f',(0.4*MSNR_R+0.243*MSNR_G+0.357*MSNR_ B)));
38. disp(sprintf('W_MSNR(0.4_0.3_0.3)=\%f',(0.4*MSNR_R+0.3*MSNR_G+0.3*MSNR_B)));
39. $\operatorname{disp}($ sprintf('W_MSNR(1/3_1/3_1/3)=\%f',(1/3*MSNR_R+1/3*MSNR_G+1/3*MSNR_B)));
40. [var_orgR, var_noiseR] = snr(stego_image(:,:,1),cover_image(:,:,1));
41. [var_orgG, var_noiseG] = snr(stego_image(:,:,2),cover_image(:,:,2));
42. [var_orgB, var_noiseB] = snr(stego_image(:,:,3),cover_image(:,:,3));
43. $\mathrm{SNR}=10 * \log 10(($ var_orgR + var_orgG + var_orgB $) /($ var_noiseR + var_noiseG + var_noiseB $))$;
44. $\operatorname{disp}\left(\right.$ sprintf('SNR=\% $\left.=f^{\prime}, \mathrm{SNR}\right)$ );
45. $\operatorname{disp}$ ('=============================================================')
46. figure
47. subplot( $2,2,[1,3]$ );
48. imshow(cover_image);
49. title('Cover image')
50. subplot( $2,2,[2,4]$ );
51. imshow(stego_image);
52. title('Stego image')
53. output=extraction(stego_image);
D. 2 Embedding function

1. function [ stego_image, y,u ] = Embedding( cover_image,secret_massege)
2. $u=0$;
3. $\mathrm{y}=0$;
4. [e r]=size(secret_massege);
5. [M N L]=size(cover_image);
6. stego_image=cover_image;
7. $\mathrm{k}=1$;
8. for $\mathrm{i}=1: \mathrm{M}$
9. for $\mathrm{j}=1: \mathrm{N}$
10. if ( $k<=r$ )
11. $\mathrm{EC}=3$;
12. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
13. $\mathrm{q}=(\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1) \mathrm{r}$;
14. $s=$ secret_massege( $k: k+E C-1-q)$;
15. k=k+EC;
16. else
17. s=secret_massege(k:k+EC-1);
18. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
19. end
20. $\mathrm{a}=$ num $2 \operatorname{str}(\mathrm{~s})$;
21. $\mathrm{DEC}=\operatorname{bin} 2 \operatorname{dec}(\mathrm{a})$;
22. stego_image( $\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 3$ )=cover_image( $\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 3$ )-
$\left(\bmod \left(\right.\right.$ cover_image $\left.\left.(i, j, 3), 2^{\wedge} \mathrm{EC}\right)\right)+\mathrm{DEC}$;
23. $\mathrm{EC}=4$;
24. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
25. $\mathrm{q}=(\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1)-\mathrm{r}$;
26. s=secret_massege(k:k+EC-1-q);
27. $k=k+E C$;
28. else
29. s=secret_massege(k:k+EC-1);
30. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
31. end
32. $\mathrm{a}=\mathrm{num} 2 \operatorname{str}(\mathrm{~s})$;
33. $\mathrm{DEC}=\operatorname{bin} 2 \operatorname{dec}(\mathrm{a})$;
34. stego_image(i,j,2)=cover_image(i,j,2)-
$\left(\bmod \left(\right.\right.$ cover_image $\left.\left.(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 2), 2^{\wedge} \mathrm{EC}\right)\right)+\mathrm{DEC}$;
35. $\mathrm{EC}=1$;
36. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
37. $\mathrm{q}=(\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1) \mathrm{r}$;
38. s=secret_massege(k:k+EC-1-q);
39. k=k+EC;
40. else
41. s=secret_massege(k:k+EC-1);
42. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
43. end
44. $\mathrm{a}=$ num2str( s );
45. $\mathrm{DEC}=\mathrm{bin} 2 \operatorname{dec}(\mathrm{a})$;
46. stego_image(i,j,1)=cover_image(i,j,1)-
$\left(\bmod \left(\right.\right.$ cover_image $\left.\left.(i, j, 1), 2^{\wedge} E C\right)\right)+D E C ;$
47. $\mathrm{y}=\mathrm{i}$;
48. $u=j$;
49. end
50. end
51. end
52. end

## D. 3 Extraction function

1. function [ output ] = extraction(stego_image )
2. [M N L]=size(stego_image);
3. $\mathrm{k}=1$;
4. $\mathrm{kk}=1$;
5. for $\mathrm{i}=1: \mathrm{M}$
6. for $\mathrm{j}=1: \mathrm{N}$
7. if $(k<=r)$
8. $\mathrm{EC}=4$;
9. RES=mod(stego_image(i, $\left., \mathrm{j}, 3), 2^{\wedge} \mathrm{EC}\right)$;
10. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
11. $\mathrm{q}=(\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1)-\mathrm{r}$;
12. $\mathrm{s}=\mathrm{dec} 2 \mathrm{bin}($ RES,EC-q);
13. for $\mathrm{g}=1: \mathrm{EC}-\mathrm{q}$
14. $\mathrm{a}=\mathrm{str} 2$ num $(\mathrm{s}(\mathrm{g})$ );
15. output(kk)=a;
16. kk=kk+1;
17. end
18. else
19. $\mathrm{s}=\mathrm{dec} 2 \mathrm{bin}($ RES,EC $)$;
20. for $\mathrm{g}=1: \mathrm{EC}$
21. $\mathrm{a}=\operatorname{str} 2 \operatorname{num}(\mathrm{~s}(\mathrm{~g}))$;
22. output(kk)=a;
23. $\mathrm{kk}=\mathrm{kk}+1$;
24. end
25. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
26. end
27. end
28. if ( $k<=r$ )
29. $\mathrm{EC}=2$;
30. RES $=$ mod(stego_image(i, $\mathrm{j}, 2$ ), $2^{\wedge} \mathrm{EC}$ );
31. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
32. $\mathrm{q}=(\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1)-\mathrm{r}$;
33. $s=d e c 2 b i n($ RES,EC $-q$ );
34. for $\mathrm{g}=1: \mathrm{EC}-\mathrm{q}$
35. $\mathrm{a}=\operatorname{str} 2 \operatorname{num}(\mathrm{~s}(\mathrm{~g}))$;
36. output(kk)=a;
37. $\mathrm{kk}=\mathrm{kk}+1$;
38. end
39. else
40. $\mathrm{s}=\mathrm{dec} 2 \mathrm{bin}($ RES,EC $)$;
41. for $\mathrm{g}=1: \mathrm{EC}$
42. $\mathrm{a}=\mathrm{str} 2 \mathrm{num}(\mathrm{s}(\mathrm{g}))$;
43. output(kk)=a;
44. $\mathrm{kk}=\mathrm{kk}+1$;
45. end
46. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
47. end
48. end
49. if ( $k<=r$ )
50. $\mathrm{EC}=2$;
51. RES $=$ mod(stego_image(i,, 1 , $), 2^{\wedge}$ EC);
52. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
53. $\mathrm{q}=(\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1)-\mathrm{r}$;
54. $s=\operatorname{dec} 2 \operatorname{bin}($ RES,EC-q $)$;
55. for $\mathrm{g}=1: \mathrm{EC}-\mathrm{q}$
56. $\mathrm{a}=\mathrm{str} 2$ num $(\mathrm{s}(\mathrm{g})$ );
57. output(kk)=a;
58. kk=kk+1;
59. end
60. else
61. $\mathrm{s}=\mathrm{dec} 2 \mathrm{bin}(\mathrm{RES}, \mathrm{EC})$;
62. for $\mathrm{g}=1: \mathrm{EC}$
63. $\mathrm{a}=\operatorname{str} 2$ num $(\mathrm{s}(\mathrm{g})$ );
64. output(kk)=a;
65. kk=kk+1;
66. end
67. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
68. end
69. end
70. end
71. end
72. end

## D. 4 MSE function

1.function [ MSE_R,MSE_G,MSE_B ] = MSE ( y,u,cover_image,stego_image)
2.[M N L]=size(cover_image);
3.MSE_R=0;
4.MSE_G=0;
5.MSE_B=0;
6.for $\mathrm{i}=1: \mathrm{M}$
7.for $\mathrm{j}=1: \mathrm{N}$
8.MSE_R=MSE_R+(double(cover_image(i,j,1))-double(stego_image(i, $\mathrm{j}, 1)$ ))^2;
9.MSE_G=MSE_G+(double(cover_image(i,j,2))-double(stego_image(i,j,2))) ${ }^{\wedge} 2 ;$
10. MSE_B=MSE_B+(double(cover_image(i,j,3))-double(stego_image(i,j,3)))^2;
11. end
12. end
13. MSE_R=MSE_R/(((y-1)*512)+u);
14. MSE_G=MSE_G/(((y-1)*512)+u);
15. MSE_B=MSE_B/(((y-1)*512)+u);
16. end

## D. 5 PSNR function

1. function [PSNR,PSNR_R,PSNR_G,PSNR_B ] = PSNR(mse,MSE_R,MSE_G,MSE_B )
2. $\mathrm{PSNR}=10 * \log 10(255 * 255 / \mathrm{mse})$;
3. PSNR_R=10* $\log 10(255 * 255 / \mathrm{MSE}$ _R $)$;
4. PSNR_G $=10 * \log 10(255 * 255 / \mathrm{MSE}$ _G $)$;
5. PSNR_B $=10 * \log 10(255 * 255 / \mathrm{MSE}$ - $)$;
6. end

## D. 6 MSNR function

1. function [ MSNR,MSNR_R,MSNR_G,MSNR_B ] = MSNR(cover_image,MSE_R,MSE_G,MSE_B,mse)
2. [M N L]=size(cover_image);
3. $\mathrm{S}=$ sum(cover_image(:,:,1));
4. $\quad$ avg_R $=\operatorname{sum}(S) /(M * N)$;
5. S2=sum(cover_image(:,:,2));
6. avg_G=sum(S2)/(M*N);
7. S3=sum(cover_image(:,,;3));
8. avg_B=sum(S3)/(M*N);
9. MSNR_R $=10 * \log 10\left(\operatorname{avg}{ }_{-} R *\right.$ avg_R/MSE_R $)$;
10. MSNR_G $=10 * \log 10\left(a v g \_G * a v g \_G / M S E \_G\right) ;$
11. $\operatorname{MSNR} \_\mathrm{B}=10 * \log 10\left(\mathrm{avg} \_\mathrm{B} * \mathrm{avg}\right.$ _B/MSE_B);
12. mean_image $=(\operatorname{sum}(S 2)+\operatorname{sum}(S 3)+\operatorname{sum}(S)) /\left(\mathrm{M}^{*} N * L\right)$;
13. $\operatorname{MSNR}=10 * \log 10$ (mean_image*mean_image $/ \mathrm{mse}$ );
14. end

## D. 7 WAPSNR function

1. function [ Actual_PSNR_weight ]= A_PSNR(cover_image,MSE_R,MSE_G,MSE_B )
2. max_col_R= $\max ($ cover_image(:,:,1));
3. max_col_G= max(cover_image(:,:,2));
4. max_col_B= $\max ($ cover_image(:,:,3));
5. $\quad \max \_R=\max \left(\max \_c o l \_R\right)$;
6. $\max \_G=\max \left(\max \_c o l \_G\right)$;
7. $\max \_B=\max \left(\max \_c o l \_B\right)$;
8. Actual_PSNR_R=10* $\log 10$ (double(max_R)*double(max_R)/MSE_R);
9. Actual_PSNR_G=10* $\log 10$ (double(max_G)*double(max_G)/MSE_G);
10. Actual_PSNR_B $=10 * \log 10$ (double( $\left.\max \_B\right) *$ double(max_B)/MSE_B);
11. Actual_PSNR_weight=1/3*Actual_PSNR_R+1/3*Actual_PSNR_G+1/3*Actual_PSNR_B;
12. end

## D. 8 SNR function

1. function [var_cover_image, var_noise] = snr(stego_image, cover_image)
2. [m n l]=size(cover_image);
3. mean_original $=$ mean(cover_image(:));
4. tmp= cover_image - mean_original;
5. var_cover_image $=\operatorname{sum}\left(\operatorname{tmp}(:)^{\wedge} 2\right)$;
6. var_cover_image =var_cover_image/(m*n);
7. noise $=$ stego_image - cover_image;
8. mean_noise $=\operatorname{mean}($ noise $(:)$ );
9. tmp= noise - mean_noise;
10. $\quad$ var_noise $=\operatorname{sum}\left(\operatorname{tmp}(:)^{\wedge} 2\right)$;
11. var_noise =var_noise/(m*n);
12. end

## D. 9 Screenshots for LSB for color imges results for different embedding

combinations with 8 BPP for cover images with size $512 \times 512$

## Embedding combination 4_3_1




| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| green_color | 1280000 | 34.097726 | 25.310910 |
| PSNR_R=29.949828 | PSNR_G= |  | PSNR_B=51.606104 |
| MSNR_R=-15.897324 | MSNR_G |  | MSNR_B=6.221717 |

MSNR=14.344211
W_PSNR $(0.4-0.243-0.357)=39.700921$
W_PSNR (0.4_0.3_0.3) $=38.940294$
W_PSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=39.939234$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=2.605618$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4-0.3 \_0.3\right)=3.832764$
W_MSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=6.024996$


MSNR_R=29.951912 MSNR_G=32.786249
MSNR=31.185747
W_PSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) $=39.833720$
W_PSNR $(0.4$ __0.3_0.3) $=39.077844$
W PSNR (1/3 1/3 1/3) $=39.965274$
W MSNR $(0.40 .2430 .357)=36.002256$
W_MSNR $(0.4$ _-0.3_0.3) $=35.307759$
W_MSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=35.902853$
Embedding combination 4_1_3


| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { baboon_color } \\ & \text { PSNR_R=31.852268 } \\ & \text { MSNR_R=25.978631 } \\ & \text { MSNR=29.130734 } \\ & \text { W_PSNR }(0.4-0.243 \\ & \text { W_PSNR }(0.4-0.3-0 \\ & \text { W_PSNR }(1 / 3-1 / 3-1) \\ & \text { W_MSNR }(0.4-0.243 \\ & \text { W_MSNR }(0.4-0.3+0 \\ & \text { W_MSNR } \left.(1 / 3)^{1 / 3} 1 / 3\right) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 1280000 \\ P_{\text {PSNR_G }}= \\ \text { MSNR_G= } \\ 3.357)=38.995822 \\ 3)=39.703743 \\ 3)=40.576130 \\ 0.357)=32.336565 \\ 3)=33.112359 \\ 3)=33.904995 \end{gathered}$ | $35.770332$ | $\begin{gathered} 17.220556 \\ \text { PSNR_B=38.728226 } \\ \text { MSNR_B }=31.062970 \end{gathered}$ |
| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
|  | $\begin{aligned} & 1280000 \\ & \text { PSNR_G= } \\ & \text { MSNR_G= } \\ & 3)=39.696313 \\ & 3)=40.569178 \\ & 3.357)=31.726344 \\ & 3)=32.477512 \\ & 3)=33.164885 \end{aligned}$ | $35.760553$ | $\begin{gathered} 17.259373 \\ \text { PSNR_B=38.727965 } \\ \text { MSNR_B=30.012556 } \end{gathered}$ |
| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| Blue_color PSNR_R=34.260334 MSNR_R=3.226578 $M S N R=24.085856$ W_PSNR (0.4_0.243 W_PSNR (0.4_0.3_0 W_PSNR (1/3_1/3_1 W_MSNR (0.4_0.243 W_MSNR (0.4_0.3_0 W_MSNR (1/3_1/3_1 | $\begin{gathered} 1280000 \\ \text { PSNR_G= } \\ \text { MSNR_G }= \\ 3)=40.646879 \\ 3)=41.356495 \\ 357)=21.371749 \\ 3)=21.892793 \\ 3)=23.966817 \end{gathered}$ | $37.615874$ | 11.258823 <br> PSNR_B=38.637266 MSNR_B=29.766373 |
| cover_image | Size_secret_data | PSNR <br> dB | MSE |
| green_color <br> PSNR R=29.949828 <br> MSNR_R=-15.89732 <br> MSNR=14.482257 <br> W_PSNR (0.4_0.243 <br> W_PSNR (0.4_0.3_0 <br> W_PSNR (1/3_1/3_1/3 <br> W_MSNR (0.4_0.243 <br> W_MSNR (0.4_0.3_0 <br> w MSNR (1/3 1/3 $1 / 3$ | $\begin{gathered} 1280000 \\ \text { PSNR_G= } \\ \text { MSNR_G } \\ .3571=38.504613 \\ 3)=39.165198 \\ 3)=40.189128 \\ 3357)=1.409311 \\ 3)=4.057668 \\ 3)=6.274890 \end{gathered}$ | $34.235772$ | $\begin{gathered} 24.519023 \\ \text { PSNR_B=39.514179 } \\ \text { MSNR_B=-5.870208 } \end{gathered}$ |



Embedding combination 3_4_1




Embedding combination 3_1_4



| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| green_color | 1280000 | 35.9 | 16 |
| PSNR_R=36.849506 | PSNR_G |  | PSNR |
| MSNR_R=-8.997645 | MSNR_G |  | MSNR |
| MSNR $=16.236861$ |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR (0.4_0.243 | . 357 ) $=38.823254$ |  |  |
| W_PSNR (0.4_0.3_0 | ) $=39.874667$ |  |  |
| W_PSNR(1/3_1/3_1/ | $)=40.210796$ |  |  |
| W_MSNR (0.4_0.243 | .357) $=1.727951$ |  |  |
| W_MSNR (0.4_0.3_0 | ) $=4.767138$ |  |  |
| W_MSNR (1/3_1/3_1/ | ) $=6.296558$ |  |  |
| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| red_color | 1280000 | 35.901 | 16.7 |
| PSNR_R=37.613280 | PSNR_G |  | PSNR |
| MSNR_R=36.474215 | MSNR_G |  | MSNR |

MSNR=32. 105679
W_PSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) $=38.999992$
W PSNR $(0.4 \quad 0.3 \quad 0.3)=40.074220$
$W^{-}$PSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=40.347658$
W MSNR $(0.40 .2430 .357)=35.168528$
W_MSNR (0.4_0.3_0.3) $=36.304135$
W_MSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=36.285237$

## Embedding combination 1_3_4

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| peppers_color | 1280000 | 36.358849 | 15.038188 |
| PSNR_R=51.140669 | PSNR_G |  | PSNR_B=32.793890 |
| MSNR_R=46.134703 | MSNR_G |  | MSNR_B=20.734324 |
| MSNR $=28.760245$ |  |  |  |

W_PSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=41.383942$
W_PSNR (0.4_0.3_0.3) $=41.677467$
W_PSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=40.626000$
WIMSNR $^{-}\left(0.4^{-}-0.2 \overline{4} 3-0.357\right)=33.340505$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=33.914265$
W_MSNR $\left(1 / 3^{-} \_1 / 33^{-} 1 / 3\right)=32.556438$



| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| red_color | 1280000 | 35.913842 | 16.660813 |
| PSNR_R=51.141321 | PSNR_G |  | PSNR_B=32.291792 |
| MSNR_R=50.002256 | MSNR_G |  | MSNR_B=26.229280 |
| $M S N R=32.118301$ |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) =41.138404 |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR $(0.410 .3+0.3)=41.444938$ |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR $(1 / 3 \ldots 1 / 3 \ldots 1 / 3)=40.367562$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) $=37.306940$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR $\left(0.4+0.3 \_0.3\right)=37.674853$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR (1/3_1/3_1 | $)=36.305141$ |  |  |

## Embedding combination 1_4_3

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| peppers_color | 1280000 | 35.583196 | 17.978802 |
| PSNR_R=51.140669 | PSNR_G |  | PSNR_B=38.742708 |
| MSNR_R=46.134703 | MSNR_G |  | MSNR_B=26.683142 |
| MSNR=27.984593 |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) $=41.971760$ |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR (0.4_0.3_0.3) 0 41.565926 |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=40.502065$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) $=33.928322$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR (0.4_0.3_0.3) $=33.802724$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR (1/3_1/3_1/3) $=32.432504$ |  |  |  |
| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| lena_color | 1280000 | 35.594354 | 17.932671 |
| PSNR_R=51.141538 | PSNR_G= |  | PSNR_B=38.696715 |
| MSNR_R=48.122408 | MSNR_G= |  | MSNR_B=31.035337 |
| $\mathrm{MSNR}=29.624583$ |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) $=41.961144$ |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR (0.4_0.3_0.3) $=41.559211$ |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR (1/3_1/3_1/3) $=40.494508$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) $=36.022718$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR (0.4_0.3_0.3) $=35.589366$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR (1/3_1/3_1/3)=34.196806 |  |  |  |



MSNR $G=25.197739$
MSNR_B=31.062970
W_PSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=41.973333$
W PSNR $(0.40 .30 .3)=41.571142$
W_PSNR $(1 / 3-1 / 3$ _-1/3 $)=40.509325$
W_MSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) $=35.314076$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=34.979758$
W_MSNR $\left(1 / 3^{-}-1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=33.838190$


Embedding combination 2_2_4

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| peppers_color | 1280000 | 36.971273 | 13.060298 |
| PSNR_R=44.153184 | PSNR_G |  | PSNR_B=32.793890 |
| MSNR_R=39.147218 | MSNR_G |  | MSNR_B=20.734324 |
| MSNR $=29.372669$ |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) $=40.093999$ |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR (0.4_0.3_0.3) $=40.740560$ |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=40.361379$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) $=32.050561$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR (0.4_0.3_0.3) $=32.977358$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR (1/3_1/3_1/3)=32.291818 |  |  |  |


| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| lena_color | 1280000 | 36.626284 | 14.140083 |
| PSNR_R=44.138741 | PSNR_G |  | PSNR_B=32.400274 |
| MSNR_R=41.119610 | MSNR_G |  | MSNR_B=24.738896 |

MSNR $=30.656513$
W_PSNR $(0.4$ 0.243_0.357) $=39.952315$
W_PSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=40.622394$
$W^{-}$- PSNR $\left(1 / 3^{-} 1 / 3^{-} 1 / 3\right)=40.231689$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=34.013889$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=34.652549$
W_MSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=33.933987$


| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| lena_color | 1280000 | 36.626284 | 14.140083 |
| PSNR_R=44.138741 | PSNR_G |  | PSNR_B=32.400274 |
| MSNR_R=41.119610 | MSNR_G |  | MSNR_B=24.738896 |

MSNR $=30.656513$
$\mathrm{W} \operatorname{PSNR}(0.4 \quad 0.243 \quad 0.357)=39.952315$
W_PSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=40.622394$
W_PSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=40.231689$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=34.013889$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=34.652549$
W_-MSNR $\left(1 / 3^{-} \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=33.933987$



Embedding combination 2_4_2




$$
\begin{aligned}
& \mathrm{MSNR}={ }^{R}=36.70070 \\
& \mathrm{MSNR}=29.956436
\end{aligned}
$$

W_PSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=41.414007$
W PSNR $(0.4 \quad 0.3 \quad 0.3)=40.671375$
W_-PSNR $\left(1 / 33^{-} 1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=40.284767$
W_MSNR $(0.4$ _0. 243 __0.357) $=35.101289$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=34.294313$
W_MSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=34.026936$

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Blue_color | 1280000 | 36.193658 | 15.621206 |
| PSNR_R=44.008057 | PSNR_G |  | PSNR_B=44.695241 |
| MSNR_R=12.974301 | MSNR_G |  | MSNR_B=35.824347 |

MSNR $=22.663640$
MSNR_G=19.626284
MSNR_B=35.824347
W_PSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=41.308856$
W_PSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=40.578996$
$W^{-} \operatorname{PSNR}\left(1 / 3^{-} 1 / 3^{-} 1 / 3\right)=40.197989$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4-0.243 \_0.357\right)=22.748199$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=21.824910$
W_MSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=22.808311$



Embedding combination 4_2_2



| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| barbra_color | 1280000 | 36.163352 | 15.730596 |
| PSNR_R=31.840527 | PSNR_G=44.158293 |  | PSNR_B=44.840488 |
| MSNR_R=26.291158 | MSNR_G=36.210191 |  | MSNR_B=36.125079 |
| $\mathrm{MSNR}=28.866321$ |  |  |  |

W_PSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=39.474730$
W_PSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=39.435845$
W_PSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=40.279769$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=32.212193$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=32.217044$
W_MSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=32.875476$

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Balloon_color | 1280000 | 36.182630 | 15.660925 |
| PSNR_R=31.860033 | PSNR_G 44.168341 |  | PSNR_B=44.866037 |
| MSNR_R=24.409883 | MSNR_G=37.942241 |  | MSNR_B=39.768795 |

ISNR $R=24.409883$
MSNR_G=37.942241
MSNR_B=39.768795
MSNR=29.977765
W_PSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=39.494095$
W-PSNR $(0.4$-_0.3_0.3 3$)=39.454326$
W_PSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=40.298137$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4-0.243 \_0.357\right)=33.181378$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4\right.$ - $\left.0.3 \_0.3\right)=33.077264$
W_MSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=34.040306$

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Blue_color | 1280000 | 38.275298 | 9.672763 |
| PSNR_R=34.260334 | PSNR_G |  | PSNR_B=44.695241 |
| MSNR_R=3.226578 | MSNR_G= |  | MSNR_B=35.824347 |

$M S N R=24.745281$
W_PSNR $\left(0.4-0.243 \_0.357\right)=40.418318$
W-_PSNR $\left(0.4{ }^{-}-0.3 \_0.3\right)=40.394167$
W-PSNR $\left(1 / 3^{-1} 1 / 3^{-1} 1 / 3\right)=41.075704$
W MSNR $(0.40 .243 \quad 0.357)=21.857661$
W-MSNR $\left(0.4{ }^{-}-0.3 \_0.3\right)=21.640081$
W-MSNR $(1 / 3$ _-1/3_1/3) $=23.686026$


95191
MSNR_G=39.022898
MSNR_B $=38.600032$
$M S N R=31.672440$
W_PSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=39.075005$
W_PSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=39.037729$
W_PSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=39.920701$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4-0.243 \_0.357\right)=35.243541$
W_MSNR $(0.4-0.3-0.3)=35.267644$
W_MSNR $\left(1 / 3^{-} 1 / 3^{-} 1 / 3\right)=35.858281$

## Appendix E: Adaptive LSB Algorithm (ALSB) for Color Images

## E. 1 The main program

1. clc
2. clear
3. cover_image=imread('C:\Users\hajer\Desktop\thesis\COLOR SCALELLSB_color\red.jpg');
4. Red = cover_image(:.,:1);
5. Green = cover_image( $(,:, 2)$;
6. Blue = cover_image(:,:,3);
7. $[\mathrm{M} \mathrm{N} \mathrm{L]}=$ size(cover_image);
8. S=sum(cover_image(:,:,1));
9. $\quad \operatorname{avg} \_\mathrm{R}=\operatorname{sum}(\mathrm{S}) /\left(\mathrm{M}^{*} \mathrm{~N}^{*} \mathrm{~L}\right)$;
10. $\mathrm{S} 2=$ sum(cover_image (:,:,2));
11. $\quad$ avg_G=sum $(S 2) /\left(\mathrm{M}^{*} \mathrm{~N} * \mathrm{~L}\right)$;
12. $\mathrm{S} 3=$ sum(cover_image (:,:,3));
13. $\quad$ avg_B $=\operatorname{sum}(S 3) /\left(\mathrm{M}^{*} \mathrm{~N}^{*} \mathrm{~L}\right)$;
14. $\operatorname{disp}('=========================================================1)$
15. disp('cover_image Size_secret_data PSNR MSE ')
16. $\operatorname{disp}(' \quad \mathrm{~dB} \quad$ ')
17. $\mathrm{p}=$ 'red_color';
18. disp('===========================================================')
19. secrt_image=imread('C:\Users\hajer\Desktop\thesis\1.jpg');
20. [m n l] $=$ size(secrt_image);
21. $\mathrm{k}=1$;
22. for $\mathrm{i}=1: \mathrm{m}$
23. for $\mathrm{j}=1: \mathrm{n}$
24. $\quad \operatorname{str}=$ dec2bin(secrt_image $(i, j), 8)$;
25. for $\mathrm{q}=1: 8$
26. $\mathrm{a}=\mathrm{str} 2 \mathrm{num}(\operatorname{str}(\mathrm{q}))$;
27. secret_massege( k )=aa;
28. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
29. end
30. end
31. end
32. [e r]=size(secret_massege);
33. if $\left(\operatorname{avg} \_B>=a v g \_R\right) \& \&\left(a v g \_B>=a v g \_G\right) \& \&\left(\operatorname{avg} \_R>=a v g \_G\right) \% b=4 r=3 \mathrm{~g}=1$
34. $\%$ blue $=4$; red $=3$; green $=1$;
35. blue $=1$; red $=3$; green $=4$;
36. end
37. if $\left(\operatorname{avg} \_B>=a v g \_R\right) \& \&\left(a v g \_B>=a v g \_G\right) \& \&\left(\operatorname{avg} \_G>=a v g \_R\right) \% b=4 r=1 \mathrm{~g}=3$
38. \%blue $=4$; red $=1$; green $=3$;
39. blue $=1$; red $=4$; green $=3$;
40. end

41. $\%$ blue $=3$; red $=1$; green $=4$;
42. blue $=3$; red $=4$; green $=1$;
43. end

44. $\%$ blue $=1$; red=3; green $=4$;
45. $\quad$ blue $=4 ;$ red $=3$; green $=1$;
46. end
47. if $\left(\operatorname{avg} \_\mathrm{R}>=a v g \_B\right) \& \&\left(a v g \_R>=a v g \_G\right) \& \&\left(a v g \_G>=a v g \_B\right) \% b=1 r=4 \mathrm{~g}=3$
48. $\%$ blue $=1$; red $=4 ;$ green $=3$;
49. blue $=4$; red $=1 ;$ green $=3$;
50. end
51. if $\left(\operatorname{avg} \_\mathrm{R}>=\operatorname{avg} \_\mathrm{B}\right) \& \&\left(\operatorname{avg} \_\mathrm{R}>=\operatorname{avg} \_\mathrm{G}\right) \& \&\left(\operatorname{avg} \_\mathrm{B}>=\operatorname{avg} \_\mathrm{G}\right) \% \mathrm{~b}=3 \mathrm{r}=4 \mathrm{~g}=1$
52. $\%$ blue $=3 ;$ red $=4 ;$ green $=1$;
53. blue $=3 ;$ red $=1 ;$ green $=4$;
54. end
55. [stego_image, $\mathrm{y}, \mathrm{u}]=$ embedding(red,green,blue,cover_image,secret_massege);
56. [MSE_R,MSE_G,MSE_B ] = MSE (y,u,cover_image,stego_image);
57. $\mathrm{mse}=\left(\mathrm{MSE} \_\mathrm{R}+\mathrm{MSE} \_\mathrm{B}+\mathrm{MSE} \_\mathrm{G}\right) / 3$;
58. [PSNR,PSNR_R,PSNR_G,PSNR_B ] = PSNR(mse,MSE_R,MSE_G,MSE_B );
59. disp(sprintf('\%s \%d \%f \%f ',p,r,PSNR,mse));

60. disp(sprintf('PSNR_R=\%f PSNR_G=\%f PSNR_B=\%f ',PSNR_R,PSNR_G,PSNR_B));
61. [ MSNR,MSNR_R,MSNR_G,MSNR_B ] =

MSNR(cover_image,MSE_R,MSE_G,MSE_B,mse);
65. disp(sprintf('MSNR_R=\%f MSNR_G=\%f

MSNR_B=\% $\left.{ }^{\prime}, M S N R \_R, M S N R \_G, M S N R \_B\right)$ );
66. $\operatorname{disp}\left(\right.$ sprintf('MSNR $\left.=\% \mathrm{f}^{\prime}, \mathrm{MSNR}\right)$ );
67. Actual_PSNR_weight = A_PSNR( cover_image,MSE_R,MSE_G,MSE_B );
68. $\operatorname{disp}($ sprintf('Actual_PSNR_weight(1/3_1/3_1/3)=\%f',Actual_PSNR_weight));
69. disp(sprintf('W_PSNR(0.4_0.243_0.357)=\%f',(0.4*PSNR_R+0.243*PSNR_G+0.357*PSNR _B)));
70. $\quad$ disp(sprintf('W_PSNR(0.4_0.3_0.3)=\%f',(0.4*PSNR_R+0.3*PSNR_G+0.3*PSNR_B)));
71. $\quad \operatorname{disp}($ sprintf('W_PSNR(1/3_1/3_1/3)=\%f',(1/3*PSNR_R+1/3*PSNR_G+1/3*PSNR_B)));
72. disp(sprintf('W_MSNR(0.4_0.243_0.357)=\%f',(0.4*MSNR_R+0.243*MSNR_G+0.357*MS

NR_B)));
73. disp(sprintf('W_MSNR(0.4_0.3_0.3)=\%f',(0.4*MSNR_R+0.3*MSNR_G+0.3*MSNR_B)));
74. disp(sprintf('W_MSNR(1/3_1/3_1/3)=\%f',(1/3*MSNR_R+1/3*MSNR_G+1/3*MSNR_B)));
75. [var_orgR, var_noiseR] = snr(stego_image(:,:,1),cover_image(:,:,1));
76. [var_orgG, var_noiseG] = snr(stego_image(:,:,2),cover_image(:,:,2));
77. [var_orgB, var_noiseB] = snr(stego_image(:,:,3),cover_image(:,,:3));
78. $\mathrm{SNR}=10 * \log 10(($ var_orgR + var_orgG + var_orgB $) /($ var_noiseR + var_noiseG + var_noiseB));
79. $\operatorname{disp}($ sprintf('SNR=\%f',SNR));
80. $\operatorname{disp}$ ('=============================================================')
81. figure
82. subplot( $2,2,[1,3]$ );
83. imshow(cover_image);
84. title('Cover image')
85. subplot $(2,2,[2,4])$;
86. imshow(stego_image);
87. title('Stego image')

## E. 2 Embedding function

1. function [ stego_image,y,u]=embedding(red,green,blue,cover_image,secret_massege)
2. $\mathrm{u}=0$;
3. $\mathrm{y}=0$;
4. [e r]=size(secret_massege);
5. [M N L]=size(cover_image);
6. stego_image=cover_image;
7. $\mathrm{k}=1$;
8. stego_image $(1,1,3)=$ cover_image $(1,1,3)-\left(\bmod \left(\right.\right.$ cover_image $\left.\left.(1,1,3), 2^{\wedge} 3\right)\right)+$ blue;
9. stego_image $(1,1,2)=$ cover_image $(1,1,2)-\left(\bmod \left(\right.\right.$ cover_image $\left.\left.(1,1,2), 2^{\wedge} 3\right)\right)+$ green;
10. stego_image $(1,1,1)=$ cover_image $(1,1,1)-\left(\bmod \left(\right.\right.$ cover_image $\left.\left.(1,1,1), 2^{\wedge} 3\right)\right)+$ red;
11. for $\mathrm{j}=2: \mathrm{N}$
12. if ( $k<=r$ )
13. $\mathrm{EC}=\mathrm{blue}$;
14. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
15. $\mathrm{q}=(\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1)-\mathrm{r}$;
16. $s=$ secret_massege( $k: k+E C-1-q)$;
17. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
18. else
19. $\mathrm{s}=$ secret_massege( $\mathrm{k}: \mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1$ );
20. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
21. end
22. $\mathrm{a}=$ num2str( s );
23. $\mathrm{DEC}=\mathrm{bin} 2 \operatorname{dec}(\mathrm{a})$;
24. stego_image $(1, \mathrm{j}, 3)=$ cover_image $(1, \mathrm{j}, 3)-\left(\bmod \left(\right.\right.$ cover_image $\left.\left.(1, \mathrm{j}, 3), 2^{\wedge} \mathrm{EC}\right)\right)+\mathrm{DEC}$;
25. $\mathrm{EC}=$ green;
26. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
27. $\mathrm{q}=(\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1)-\mathrm{r}$;
28. $s=$ secret_massege(k:k+EC-1-q);
29. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
30. else
31. $\mathrm{s}=$ secret_massege( $\mathrm{k}: \mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1$ );
32. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
33. end
34. $\mathrm{a}=$ num2str( s$)$;
35. $\mathrm{DEC}=\operatorname{bin} 2 \operatorname{dec}(\mathrm{a})$;
36. stego_image $(1, \mathrm{j}, 2)=$ cover_image $(1, \mathrm{j}, 2)-\left(\bmod \left(\right.\right.$ cover_image $\left.\left.(1, \mathrm{j}, 2), 2^{\wedge} \mathrm{EC}\right)\right)+\mathrm{DEC}$;
37. $\mathrm{EC}=\mathrm{red}$;
38. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
39. $\mathrm{q}=(\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1)-\mathrm{r}$;
40. $s=$ secret_massege( $k: k+E C-1-q)$;
41. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
42. else
43. $\mathrm{s}=$ secret_massege( $\mathrm{k}: \mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1$ );
44. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
45. end
46. $\mathrm{a}=$ num2str( s$)$;
47. $\mathrm{DEC}=\mathrm{bin} 2 \operatorname{dec}(\mathrm{a})$;
48. stego_image $(1, \mathrm{j}, 1)=$ cover_image $(1, \mathrm{j}, 1)-\left(\bmod \left(\right.\right.$ cover_image $\left.\left.(1, \mathrm{j}, 1), 2^{\wedge} \mathrm{EC}\right)\right)+\mathrm{DEC}$;
49. end
50. end
51. for $\mathrm{i}=2: \mathrm{M}$
52. for $\mathrm{j}=1: \mathrm{N}$
53. if ( $k<=r$ )
54. $\mathrm{EC}=\mathrm{blue}$;
55. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
56. $\mathrm{q}=(\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1)-\mathrm{r}$;
57. $s=$ secret_massege( $k: k+E C-1-q)$;
58. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
59. else
60. $s=$ secret_massege( $k: k+E C-1$ );
61. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
62. end
63. $a=n u m 2 \operatorname{str}(\mathrm{~s})$;
64. $\mathrm{DEC}=\operatorname{bin} 2 \operatorname{dec}(\mathrm{a})$;
65. stego_imagee $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 3)=$ cover_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 3)$ )-(mod $($ cover_image( $\left.\left.\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 3), 2^{\wedge} \mathrm{EC}\right)\right)+\mathrm{DEC}$;
66. $\mathrm{EC}=$ green;
67. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
68. $\mathrm{q}=(\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1)-\mathrm{r}$;
69. $\mathrm{s}=$ secret_massege (k:k+EC-1-q);
70. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
71. else
72. $\mathrm{s}=$ secret_massege(k:k+EC-1);
73. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
74. end
75. $\mathrm{a}=$ num $2 \operatorname{str}(\mathrm{~s})$;
76. $\mathrm{DEC}=\operatorname{bin} 2 \operatorname{dec}(\mathrm{a})$;
77. stego_image( $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 2)=$ cover_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 2)$-(mod(cover_image( $\left.\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 2), 2^{\wedge} \mathrm{EC}\right)$ ) +DEC ;
78. $\mathrm{EC}=\mathrm{red}$;
79. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
80. $\mathrm{q}=(\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1)-\mathrm{r}$;
81. s=secret_massege(k:k+EC-1-q);
82. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
83. else
84. s=secret_massege(k:k+EC-1);
85. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
86. end
87. $\mathrm{a}=$ num $2 \operatorname{str}(\mathrm{~s})$;
88. $\mathrm{DEC}=\operatorname{bin} 2 \operatorname{dec}(\mathrm{a})$;
89. stego_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 1)=$ cover_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 1)-\left(\bmod \left(\right.\right.$ cover_image $\left.\left.(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 1), 2^{\wedge} \mathrm{EC}\right)\right)+\mathrm{DEC}$;
90. $\mathrm{y}=\mathrm{i}$;
91. $u=\mathrm{j}$;
92. end
93. end
94. end
95. end

## E3 Extraction function

1. function [ output ] = extraction( r ,stego_image )
2. $[\mathrm{M} \mathrm{N} \mathrm{L]}=$ size(stego_image);
3. $\mathrm{k}=1$;
4. $\mathrm{kk}=1$;
5. blue=mod(stego_image $\left.(1,1,3), 2^{\wedge} 3\right)$;
6. green=mod(stego_image $\left.(1,1,2), 2^{\wedge} 3\right)$;
7. red=mod(stego_image( $\left.(1,1,1), 2^{\wedge} 3\right)$;
8. for $\mathrm{j}=2: \mathrm{N}$
9. if $(\mathrm{kk}<=\mathrm{r})$
10. EC=blue;
11. $\mathrm{RES}=\mathrm{mod}$ (stego_image $\left.(1, \mathrm{j}, 3), 2^{\wedge} \mathrm{EC}\right)$;
12. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
13. $\mathrm{q}=(\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1)-\mathrm{r}$;
14. $s=\operatorname{dec} 2 \operatorname{bin}($ RES,EC $-q)$;
15. for $\mathrm{g}=1: \mathrm{EC}-\mathrm{q}$
```
16. a=str2num(s(g));
17. output(kk)=a;
18. kk=kk+1;
19. end
20. else
21. s=dec2bin(RES,EC);
22. for g=1:EC
23. a=str2num(s(g));
24. output(kk)=a;
25. kk=kk+1;
26. end
27. k=k+EC;
28. end
29. EC=green;
30. RES=mod(stego_image(1,j,2), 2^EC);
31. if (k+EC-1)>=r
32. q=(k+EC-1)-r;
33. s=dec2bin(RES,EC-q);
34. for g=1:EC-q
35. a=str2num(s(g));
36. output(kk)=a;
37. kk=kk+1;
38. end
39. else
40. s=dec2bin(RES,EC);
41. for g=1:EC
42. a=str2num(s(g));
43. output(kk)=a;
44. kk=kk+1;
45. end
46. k=k+EC;
47. end
48. EC=red;
49. RES=mod(stego_image(1,j,1),2^EC);
50. if (k+EC-1)>=r
51. q=(k+EC-1)-r;
52. s=dec2bin(RES,EC-q);
53. for g=1:EC-q
54. a=str2num(s(g));
55. output(kk)=a;
56. kk=kk+1;
57. end
58. else
59. s=dec2bin(RES,EC);
60. for g=1:EC
61. a=str2num(s(g));
62. output(kk)=a;
63. kk=kk+1;
64. end
65. k=k+EC;
66. end
67. end
```

68. end
69. for $\mathrm{i}=2: \mathrm{M}$
70. for $\mathrm{j}=1: \mathrm{N}$
71. if ( $\mathrm{kk}<=\mathrm{r}$ )
72. $\mathrm{EC}=$ blue;
73. RES $=$ mod(stego_image $(i, j, 3), 2^{\wedge} E C$ );
74. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
75. $\mathrm{q}=(\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1)-\mathrm{r}$;
76. $s=d e c 2 b i n(R E S, E C-q)$;
77. for $\mathrm{g}=1$ :EC-q
78. $\mathrm{a}=\operatorname{str} 2 \mathrm{num}(\mathrm{s}(\mathrm{g}))$;
79. output( kk ) $=\mathrm{a}$;
80. $\mathrm{kk}=\mathrm{kk}+1$;
81. end
82. else
83. $\mathrm{s}=\mathrm{dec} 2 \mathrm{bin}(\mathrm{RES}, \mathrm{EC})$;
84. for $\mathrm{g}=1: \mathrm{EC}$
85. $\mathrm{a}=\operatorname{str} 2 \mathrm{num}(\mathrm{s}(\mathrm{g}))$;
86. output(kk)=a;
87. $k k=k k+1$;
88. end
89. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
90. end
91. $\mathrm{EC}=$ green;
92. RES=mod(stego_image(i, $\left.\mathrm{j}, 2), 2^{\wedge} \mathrm{EC}\right)$;
93. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
94. $\mathrm{q}=(\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}-1)-\mathrm{r}$;
95. $s=d e c 2 b i n(R E S, E C-q) ;$
96. for $\mathrm{g}=1$ : $\mathrm{EC}-\mathrm{q}$
97. $\mathrm{a}=\operatorname{str} 2 \mathrm{num}(\mathrm{s}(\mathrm{g}))$;
98. output $(\mathrm{kk})=\mathrm{a}$;
99. $\mathrm{kk}=\mathrm{kk}+1$;
100. end
101. else
102. $s=\operatorname{dec} 2 \mathrm{bin}($ RES,EC $)$;
103. for $\mathrm{g}=1$ : EC
104. $\mathrm{a}=\mathrm{str} 2 \mathrm{num}(\mathrm{s}(\mathrm{g})$ );
105. output(kk)=a;
106. kk=kk+1;
107. end
108. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
109. end
110. $\mathrm{EC}=$ red;
111. $\mathrm{RES}=\bmod$ (stego_image( $\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 1$ ), $2^{\wedge} \mathrm{EC}$ );
112. if $(k+E C-1)>=r$
113. $q=(k+E C-1)-r$;
114. $s=\operatorname{dec} 2 \operatorname{bin}($ RES,EC-q);
115. for $\mathrm{g}=1: \mathrm{EC}-\mathrm{q}$
116. $\mathrm{a}=\mathrm{str} 2 \mathrm{num}(\mathrm{s}(\mathrm{g})$ );
117. output(kk)=a;
118. kk=kk+1;
119. end
120.else
120. s=dec2bin(RES,EC);
121. for $\mathrm{g}=1: \mathrm{EC}$
122. $\mathrm{a}=\mathrm{str} 2 \mathrm{num}(\mathrm{s}(\mathrm{g})$ );
123. output(kk)=a;
124. kk=kk+1;
125. end
126. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+\mathrm{EC}$;
127. end
129.end
128. end
129. end
130. end

Other functions are the same as shown in Appendices D.4, D.5, D.6, D. 7 and D.8.

## E. 4 Screenshots of Adaptive LSB for color images results for different

embedding combinations for cover images with size $\mathbf{5 1 2 \times 5 1 2}$

## Results for ALSBmin



MSNR $=29.629634$
W_PSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=41.963610$
W_PSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=41.561958$
W_PSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=40.497370$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=36.025185$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=35.592113$
W_MSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=34.199667$


| cover_image | MSE |
| :---: | :---: |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { green_color } \\ & \text { avg_R }=0.433572 \\ & \text { PSNR_R }=29.949523 \\ & \text { MSNR_R }=-15.897628 \\ & M S N R=14.481995 \\ & \text { W_PSNR }(0.4-0.243 \\ & \text { W_PSNR }(0.4-0.3-0 . \\ & \text { W_PSNR }(1 / 3-1 / 3-1 / \\ & \text { W_MSNR (0.4-0.243 } \\ & \text { W_MSNR (0.4-0.3_0. } \\ & \text { W_MSNR }\left(1 / 3+1 / 3 \_1\right) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 24.520503 \\ \text { avg_B=0.457298 } \\ \text { PSNR_B=39.514467 } \\ \text { MSNR_B=}=-5.869920 \end{gathered}$ |
| cover_image | MSE |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { red_color } \\ & \text { avg_R=74.553097 } \\ & \text { PSNR_R=51.149553 } \\ & \text { MSNR_R }=50.010489 \\ & \text { MSNR=32.116000 } \\ & \text { W_PSNR (0.4-0.243_- } \\ & \text { W_PSNR (0.4-0.3_0. } \\ & \text { W_PSNR (1/3-1/3 } 1 / \\ & \text { W_MSNR (0.4-0.243 } \\ & \text { W_MSNR (0.4-0.3_0. } \\ & \text { W_MSNR (1/3_1/3_1/ } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 16.669640 \\ \text { avg_B=42.295417 } \\ \text { PSNR_B=32.290911 } \\ \text { MSNR_B=26.228399 } \end{gathered}$ |

## Results of ALSBMax

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| peppers_color | 1280000 | 35.618598 | 17.832841 |
| avg_R=47.766188 | avg_G=37.347483 |  | avg_B=21.205114 |
| PSNR_R=31.808135 | PSNR_G=38.078363 |  | PSNR_B=51.177328 |
| MSNR_R=26.802168 | MSNR_G=30.935212 |  | MSNR_B=39.117761 |

$M S N R=28.019995$
W_PSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=40.246602$
W_-PSNR $\left(0.4{ }^{-} 0.3 \_0.3\right)=39.499961$
$\mathrm{N} \operatorname{PSNR}(1 / 31 / 31 / 3)=40.354609$
W MSNR $(0.4-0.243 \quad 0.357)=32.203164$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4+0.3 \_0.3\right)=31.736759$
W_MSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=32.285047$

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| lena_color | 1280000 | 35.558127 | 18.082883 |
| avg_R=60.043004 | avg_G=3 |  | avg_B=35.184392 |
| PSNR_R=31.601155 | PSNR_G |  | PSNR_B=38.697698 |
| MSNR_R $=28.582025$ | MSNR_G |  | MSNR_B=31.036320 |

MSNR $=29.588356$
W_PSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=38.887012$
W_PSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=39.597267$
W_PSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=40.485724$
W MSNR $(0.40 .2430 .357)=32.948586$
W MSNR $(0.4 \quad 0.3 \quad 0.3)=33.627422$
W_MSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=34.188022$

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| baboon_color <br> avg_R=43.225210 <br> PSNR_R=31.847124 <br> MSNR_R=25.973488 <br> $M S N R=28.992500$ <br> W_PSNR (0.4_0. 243 <br> W_PSNR (0.4_0.3_0 <br> W_PSNR (1/3_1/3_1 <br> W_MSNR (0.4_0.243 <br> W_MSNR (0.4_0.3_0 <br> W_MSNR (1/3_1/3_1 | $\begin{gathered} 1280000 \\ \text { avg_G=40 } \\ \text { PSNR_G= } \\ \text { MSNR_G }= \\ .357)=40.230857 \\ 3)=39.480505 \\ 3)=40.328659 \\ .357)=33.571600 \\ 3)=32.889121 \\ 33.657524 \end{gathered}$ | $35.632098$ | $\begin{gathered} 17.777493 \\ \text { avg_B=35.168683 } \\ \text { PSNR_B=51.151457 } \\ \text { MSNR_B=43.486201 } \end{gathered}$ |
| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| barbra_color <br> avg_R=44.869422 <br> PSNR_R=31.852410 <br> MSNR_R=26.303041 <br> $M S N R=28.343246$ <br> W_PSNR (0.4_0.243 <br> W_PSNR (0.4_0.3_O <br> W_PSNR (1/3_1/3_1 <br> W_MSNR (0.4_0.243 <br> W_MSNR (0.4_0.3_0 <br> W_MSNR (1/3_1/3_1 | $\begin{gathered} 1280000 \\ \text { avg_G=34 } \\ \text { PSNR_G= } \\ \text { MSNR_G= } \\ .357)=40.237274 \\ 3)=39.488207 \\ 3)=40.336629 \\ 357)=32.96 .969406 \\ 3)=32.932336 \end{gathered}$ | $35.640277$ | $\begin{gathered} 17.744047 \\ \text { avg_B=31.163663 } \\ \text { PSNR_B=51.149499 } \\ \text { MSNR_B=42.434090 } \end{gathered}$ |
|  |  | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { Balloon_color } \\ & \text { avg_R=36.050513 } \\ & \text { PSNR_R }=51.158755 \\ & \text { MSNR_R=43.708606 } \\ & \text { MSNR=30.178445 } \\ & \text { W_PSNR }(0.4-0.243 \\ & \text { W_PSNR }(0.4-0.3-0 \\ & \text { W_PSNR }(1 / 3-1 / 311 \\ & \text { W_MSNR }(0.4-0.243 \\ & \text { W_MSNR }(0.4-0.3-0 \\ & \text { W_MSNR }\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 311 .\right. \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} \begin{array}{c} 1280000 \\ \text { avg_G=41 } \\ \text { PSNR_G } \\ M S N R \_G= \\ .357)=41.394232 \\ 3)=41.681183 \\ 3)=40.628120 \\ 3.357)=35.081514 \\ 3)=35.304121 \\ 3)=34.370289 \end{array} \end{gathered}$ | $36.383310$ | ```14.953725 avg_B=47.266870 PSNR_B=32.845685 MSNR_B=27.748443``` |
| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PSNR } \\ & \text { dB } \end{aligned}$ | MSE |
| blue_color <br> avg_R=2.386333 <br> PSNR_R $=51.122496$ <br> MSNR_R=20.088740 <br> $M S N R=22.554684$ <br> W_PSNR (0.4_0.243 <br> W <br> PSNRR(0.4_0 0.3_0 <br> w <br> _PSNR (1/3_ $1 / 3$ $\square$ <br> w <br> MSNR (0.4_0 . 243 <br> w <br> MSNR (0.4_0 0.3 <br> w <br> MSNR | $\begin{array}{r} 1280000 \\ \text { avg_G=20. } \\ \text { PSNR_G } \\ M S N R \_G= \\ -357,=41.245969 \\ )=41.558443 \\ 3=40.495771 \\ -357,=22.685312 \\ )=22.804358 \\ \text { 3) }=23.106093 \end{array}$ | $36.084702$ | $\begin{gathered} 16.018071 \\ \text { avg_B=.610770 } \\ \text { PSNR_B=32.441405} \\ M S N R \_B=23.570511 \end{gathered}$ |
| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
|  | $\begin{gathered} 1280000 \\ \text { avg_G=25 } \\ \text { PSNR_G } \\ \text { MSNR_G }= \\ 0.357)=42.281501 \\ 3)=41.839737 \\ 3)=40.806340 \\ 0.357)=5.186198 \\ 3)=6.732208 \\ 3)=6.892102 \end{gathered}$ | $35.818776$ | $\begin{gathered} 17.029533 \\ \text { avg_B=0.457298} \\ \text { PSNR_B=39.51446\% } \\ \text { MSNR_B }=-5.869920 \end{gathered}$ |



## Appendix F: ATD Algorithm for Color Images

## F. 1 The main program

1. clc
2. clear
3. cover_image=imread('C:\Users\hajer\Desktop\thesis\COLOR SCALE\ATD colorlpeppers_color (512 x 512).jpg');
4. $\operatorname{disp}('========================================================1)$
5. disp('cover_image Size_secret_data PSNR MSE ')
6. $\operatorname{disp}(' \quad \mathrm{~dB} \quad$ ')
7. $\operatorname{disp}(=$
8. $\mathrm{p}=$ 'peppers_color.jpg';
9. secrt_image=imread('C:\Users\hajer\Desktop\thesis\1.jpg');
10. [m n l] $=$ size(secrt_image);
11. $\mathrm{k}=1$;
12. for $\mathrm{i}=1: \mathrm{m}$
13. for $\mathrm{j}=1: \mathrm{n}$
14. $\operatorname{str}=$ dec2bin(secrt_image $(i, j), 8)$;
15. for $q=1: 8$
16. $\mathrm{aa}=\operatorname{str} 2 \mathrm{num}(\operatorname{str}(\mathrm{q}))$;
17. secret_massege $(k)=a a$;
18. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
19. end
20. end
21. end
22. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}-1$;
23. ternary_number=convertto__ternary(secret_massege);
24. [q size_secret_massege]=size(ternary_number);
25. [stego_image, y,u]=Embbedding(cover_image,size_secret_massege,ternary_number);
26. [MSE_R,MSE_G,MSE_B ] = MSE( y,u,cover_image,stego_image);
27. $\mathrm{mse}=\left(\mathrm{MSE} \_\mathrm{R}+\mathrm{MSE} \_\mathrm{B}+\mathrm{MSE} \_\mathrm{G}\right) / 3$;
28. [PSNR,PSNR_R,PSNR_G,PSNR_B ] = PSNR(mse,MSE_R,MSE_G,MSE_B );
29. disp(sprintf('\%s \%d \%f \%2f',p,k,PSNR,mse));
30. disp(sprintf('PSNR_R=\%f PSNR_G=\%f PSNR_B=\%f ',PSNR_R,PSNR_G,PSNR_B));
31. [ MSNR,MSNR_R,MSNR_G,MSNR_B ] = MSNR(cover_image,MSE_R,MSE_G,MSE_B,mse);
32. $\operatorname{disp}($ sprintf('MSNR_R=\%f MSNR_G=\%f MSNR_B=\%f ',MSNR_R,MSNR_G,MSNR_B));
33. $\operatorname{disp}\left(\right.$ sprintf('MSNR $\left.=\% \mathrm{f}^{\prime}, \mathrm{MSNR}\right)$ );
34. disp(sprintf('W_PSNR(0.4_0.243_0.357)=\%f',(0.4*PSNR_R+0.243*PSNR_G+0.357*PSNR_B)));
35. disp(sprintf('W_PSNR( $\left.\left.0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=\% \mathrm{f}^{\prime},\left(0.4 * P S N R \_R+0.3 * P S N R \_G+0.3 * P S N R \_B\right)\right)$ );
36. disp(sprintf('W_PSNR( $\left.1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=\% \mathrm{f}$ ',( $1 / 3$ *PSNR_R+1/3*PSNR_G+1/3*PSNR_B)));
37. disp(sprintf('W_MSNR(0.4_0.243_0.357)=\%f',(0.4*MSNR_R+0.243*MSNR_G+0.357*MSNR_B)));
38. disp(sprintf('W_MSNR(0.4_0.3_0.3)=\%f',(0.4*MSNR_R+0.3*MSNR_G+0.3*MSNR_B)));
39. disp(sprintf('W_MSNR(1/3_1/3_1/3)=\%f ',(1/3*MSNR_R+1/3*MSNR_G+1/3*MSNR_B)));
40. Actual_PSNR_weight = A_PSNR( cover_image,MSE_R,MSE_G,MSE_B );
41. disp(sprintf('Actual_PSNR_weight( $1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3$ )=\%f ',Actual_PSNR_weight));
42. [var_orgR, var_noiseR] = snr(stego_image(:,:,1),cover_image(:,:,1));
43. [var_orgG, var_noiseG] = snr(stego_image (:,:,2),cover_image $(:,:, 2)$ );
44. [var_orgB, var_noiseB] = snr(stego_image(:,:,3),cover_image(:,:,3));
45. $\mathrm{SNR}=10 * \log 10(($ var_orgR + var_orgG + var_orgB $) /($ var_noiseR + var_noiseG + var_noiseB));
46. $\operatorname{disp}\left(\operatorname{sprintf}\left(\right.\right.$ ('SNR $\left.=\% \mathrm{f}^{\prime}, \mathrm{SNR}\right)$ );
47. $\operatorname{disp}('======================================================1)$
48. figure
49. subplot( $2,2,[1,3]$ );
50. imshow(cover_image);
51. title('Cover image')
52. subplot( $2,2,[2,4]$ );
53. imshow(stego_image);
54. title('Stego image')
55. output = extraction ( stego_image,size_secret_massege);
56. [ nn mm ]=size(output);
57. for $\mathrm{i}=1: \mathrm{mm}$
58. e(i)=output(i)-ternary_number(i);
59. end
60. output2=convert_to_Binary(output);
61. [ nn mm ]=size(secret_massege);

## F. 2 Embedding function

1. function [ stego_image, $\mathrm{y}, \mathrm{u}$ ] = Embbedding( cover_image,size_secret_massege,ternary_number )
2. stego_image=cover_image;
3. $\mathrm{k}=1$;
4. [M N L]=size(cover_image);
5. $\mathrm{y}=0$;
6. $\mathrm{u}=0$;
7. for $\mathrm{i}=1: \mathrm{M}$
8. for $\mathrm{j}=1: \mathrm{N}$
9. cover_pixel_binary $=$ dec2bin(cover_image(i,j,3),8);
10. for $\mathrm{ii}=1: 6$
11. sub1(ii)=cover_pixel_binary(ii);
12. end
13. sub1_dec=bin2dec(sub1);
14. sub2=cover_pixel_binary(7:8);
15. sub2_dec=bin2dec(sub2);
16. if (sub1_dec==63)
17. sub1_dec=62;
18. end
19. if (sub1_dec==0)
20. sub1_dec=1;
21. end
22. if (sub2_dec==3)
23. sub2_dec=2;
24. end
25. if (sub2_dec==0)
26. sub2_dec=1;
27. end
28. if(k<=size_secret_massege)
29. if $\left(\bmod \left(\operatorname{sub} 1 \_d e c, 3\right)==\right.$ ternary_number $\left.(\mathrm{k})\right)$
30. sub1_stego=sub1_dec;
31. elseif( $\bmod \left(\operatorname{sub} 1 \_d e c+1,3\right)==$ ternary_number(k))
32. sub1_stego=sub1_dec+1;
33. else
34. sub1_stego=sub1_dec-1;
35. end
36. end
37. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
38. if(k<=size_secret_massege)
39. $\mathrm{v}=$ sub1_stego*4+sub2_dec;
40. if $(\bmod (\mathrm{v}, 3)==$ ternary_number $(\mathrm{k}))$
41. stego_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 3)=\mathrm{v}$;
42. elseif( $\bmod (\mathrm{v}+1,3)==$ ternary_number $(\mathrm{k})$ )
43. stego_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 3)=\mathrm{v}+1$;
44. else
45. stego_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 3)=\mathrm{v}-1$;
46. end
47. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
48. $\mathrm{y}=\mathrm{i}$;
49. $u=$;
50. end
51. cover_pixel_binary = dec2bin(cover_image(i, $\mathrm{i}, 2$, $), 8$ );
52. for $\mathrm{ii}=1: 6$
53. sub1(ii)=cover_pixel_binary(ii);
54. end
55. sub1_dec=bin2dec(sub1);
56. sub2=cover_pixel_binary(7:8);
57. sub2_dec=bin2dec(sub2);
58. if (sub1_dec==63)
59. sub1_dec=62;
60. end
61. if (sub1_dec==0)
62. sub1_dec=1;
63. end
64. if (sub2_dec==3)
65. sub2_dec=2;
66. end
67. if (sub2_dec==0)
68. sub2_dec=1;
69. end
70. if(k<=size_secret_massege)
71. if $(\bmod ($ sub1_dec,3 $)==$ ternary_number(k) $)$
72. sub1_stego=sub1_dec;
73. elseif( $\bmod ($ sub1_dec $+1,3)==$ ternary_number(k))
74. sub1_stego=sub1_dec+1;
75. else
76. sub1_stego=sub1_dec -1 ;
77. end
78. end
79. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
80. if(k<=size_secret_massege)
81. v=sub1_stego*4+sub2_dec;
82. if $(\bmod (\mathrm{v}, 3)==$ ternary_number $(\mathrm{k}))$
83. stego_image( $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 2)=\mathrm{v}$;
84. elseif( $\bmod (\mathrm{v}+1,3)==$ ternary_number $(\mathrm{k})$ )
85. stego_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 2)=\mathrm{v}+1$;
86. else
87. stego_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 2)=\mathrm{v}-1$;
88. end
89. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
90. $\mathrm{y}=\mathrm{i}$;
91. $u=j$;
92. end
93. if(k<=size_secret_massege)
94. cover_pixel_binary = dec2bin(cover_image(i,j,1),8);

95 . for $\mathrm{ii}=1: 6$
96. sub1(ii)=cover_pixel_binary(ii);
97. end
98. sub1_dec=bin2dec(sub1);
99. sub2=cover_pixel_binary(7:8);
100. sub2_dec=bin2dec(sub2);
101. if (sub1_dec==63)
102. sub1_dec $=62$;
103. end
104. if (sub1_dec==0)
105. sub1_dec=1;
106. end
107. if (sub2_dec==3)
108. sub2_dec=2;
109. end
110. if (sub2_dec==0)
111. sub2_dec=1;
112. end
113. if(k<=size_secret_massege)
114. if $(\bmod ($ sub1_dec, 3$)==$ ternary_number $(k))$
115. sub1_stego=sub1_dec;
116. elseif(mod(sub1_dec+1,3)==ternary_number(k))
117. sub1_stego=sub1_dec+1;
118. else
119. sub1_stego=sub1_dec-1;
120. end
121. end
122. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
123. stego_image $(i, j, 1)=$ sub1_stego $* 4+$ sub2_dec;
124. $\mathrm{y}=\mathrm{i}$;
125. $u=j$;
126. else
127. stego_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 1)=$ cover_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 1)$;
128. end
129. end
130. end

## F. 3 Extraction function

1. function [ output ] = extraction( stego_image,size_secret_image)
2. $\mathrm{k}=1$;
3. $\mathrm{q}=1$;
4. for $\mathrm{i}=1: 512$
5. for $\mathrm{j}=1: 512$
6. if ( $\mathrm{k}<=$ size_secret_image)
7. cover_pixel_binary $=$ dec2bin(stego_image(i,j,3),8);
8. sub1=cover_pixel_binary(1:6);
9. sub1_dec=bin2dec(sub1);
10. sub2=cover_pixel_binary(7:8);
11. sub2_dec=bin2dec(sub2);
12. output(k)=mod(sub1_dec, 3 );
13. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
14. $q=q+1$;
15. output( k )=mod(stego_image $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}, 3), 3)$;
16. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
17. $q=q+1$;
18. else
19. continue
20. end
21. if ( $\mathrm{k}<=$ size_secret_image)
22. cover_pixel_binary $=$ dec2bin(stego_image(i,j,2),8);
23. subl=cover_pixel_binary(1:6);
24. sub1_dec=bin2dec(sub1);
25. sub2=cover_pixel_binary(7:8);
26. sub2_dec=bin2dec(sub2);
27. output( k )=mod(sub1_dec,3);
28. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
29. $\mathrm{q}=\mathrm{q}+1$;
30. else
31. continue
32. end
33. if ( $k<=$ size_secret_image)
34. cover_pixel_binary = dec2bin(stego_image(i,j,1),8);
35. sub1=cover_pixel_binary(1:6);
36. sub1_dec=bin2dec(sub1);
37. sub2=cover_pixel_binary(7:8);
38. sub2_dec=bin2dec(sub2);
39. output $(\mathrm{k})=\bmod ($ sub1_dec, 3$)$;
40. $\mathrm{k}=\mathrm{k}+1$;
41. $\mathrm{q}=\mathrm{q}+1$;
42. else
43. continue
44. end
45. end
46. end
47. end

Other functions are the same as for ATD for gray scale images given in

## Appendix A.

## F. 4 Screenshots of ATD for color images results for different embedding

ternary digits combinations with 8 BPP for cover images with size $512 \times 512$

## Embedding combination 1_1_2



| cover_image Size_secret_data PSNR | MSE |
| :---: | :---: |
| ```lena_color.jpg 1280000 37.548064 PSNR_R=37.610816 PSNR_G=37.643593 MSNR_R=34.591686 MSNR_G=29.430994 MSNR=31.578293 W_PSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) \(=37.541392\) W_PSNR (0.4_0.3_0.3) \(=37.555617\) W_PSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=37.549483\) W_MSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) \(=31.602967\) W_MSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=31.585771\) W_MSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=31.251781\) Actual_PSNR_weight (1/3_1/3_1/3) \(=36.912974\)``` | $\begin{gathered} 11.435995 \\ \text { PSNR_B=37.394040 } \\ \text { MSNR_B=29.732663 } \end{gathered}$ |
| cover_image Size_secret_data PSNR | MSE |
|  | $\begin{gathered} 11.389301 \\ \text { PSNR_B=37.395864 } \\ \text { MSNR_B=28.680456 } \end{gathered}$ |
| cover_image Size_secret_data PSNR | MSE |
| ```baboon_color.jpg 1280000 37.560003 PSNR_R \(=37.655576\) PSNR_G=37.658859 MSNR_R=31.781940 MSNR_G=31.184348 MSNR \(=30.920405\) W_PSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) \(=37.555090\) W_PSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=37.571449\) W_PSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=37.562101\) W_MSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) \(=30.895833\) W_MSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=30.980064\) W_MSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=30.890967\) Actual_PSNR_weight (1/3_1/3_1/3)=36.919372``` | $\begin{gathered} 11.404600 \\ \text { PSNR_B=37.371869} \\ M S N R \_B=29.706613 \end{gathered}$ |



## Embedding combination 1_2_1

| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \mathrm{dB} \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| peppers_color.jpg | 1280000 | 37.415784 | 11.789680 |
| PSNR_R=37.653454 | PSNR_G= |  | PSNR_B=37.364136 |
| MSNR_R=32.647487 | MSNR_G= |  | MSNR_B=25.304570 |
| $\mathrm{MSNR}=29.817180$ |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) $=37.449712$ |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR (0.4_0.3_0.3) $=37.442640$ |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=37.419216$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) $=29.406275$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR $\left(0.4{ }^{-} 0.3{ }^{-} 0.3\right)=29.679438$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=29.349655$ |  |  |  |
| Actual_PSNR_weight (1/3_1/3_1/3)=36.726881 |  |  |  |



| cover_image | cret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| lena_color.jpg | 128000037.553098 |  | 11 |
| PSNR_R=37.610816 | PSNR_G $=37.400283$ |  | PSNR |
| MSNR_R=34.591686 | MSNR_G=29.187683 |  | MSNR |
| MSNR $=31.583327$ |  |  |  |
| W__PSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) $=37.574511$ |  |  |  |
| W__PSNR (0.4_0.3_0.3) $=37.560139$ |  |  |  |
| W_PSNR (1/3_1/3_1/3) $=37.554508$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR (0.4_0.243_-0.357) $=31.636086$ |  |  |  |
| W_MSNR (0.4_0.3_0.3) $=31.590294$ |  |  |  |
| W MSNR (1/3 1/3 1/3) $=31.256806$ |  |  |  |
| Actual_PSNR_weight (1/3_1/3_1/3) $=36.917999$ |  |  |  |


| cover_image | Size_secret_data | $\begin{gathered} \text { PSNR } \\ \text { dB } \end{gathered}$ | MSE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| barbra_color.jpg | 1280000 | 37.559048 |  |
| PSNR_R=37.644377 | PSNR_G |  | NR |
| MSNR_R=32.095008 | MSNR_G |  | SNR |

MSNR G=37.38585 MSNR_B=28.936825

W_PSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=37.584362$
W_PSNR (0.4_0.3_0.3) $=37.569178$
W_PSNR $\left(1 / 3-1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=37.560823$
W_MSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) $=30.321825$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4-0.3 \_0.3\right)=30.350378$
W_MSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=30.156530$
Actual__PSNR_weight (1/3_1/3_1/3)=37.000845

| cover_image Size_secret_data PSNR | MSE |
| :---: | :---: |
| ```baboon_color.jpg 1280000 37.563321 PSNR_R=37.655576 PSNR_G=37.405493 MSNR_R=31.781940 MSNR_G=30.930982 MSNR=30.923723 W_PSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) \(=37.586864\) W_PSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=37.573877\) W_PSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=37.564800\) W_MSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) \(=30.927607\) W_MSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=30.982493\) W_MSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=30.893665\) Actual_PSNR_weight (1/3_1/3_1/3) \(=36.922071\)``` | $\begin{gathered} 11.395891 \\ \text { PSNR_B=37.633330 } \\ \text { MSNR_B=29.968074 } \end{gathered}$ |
| cover_image Size_secret_data PSNR | MSE |
| ```Balloon_color.jpg 1280000 37.429199 PSNR_R=37.530423 PSNR_G=37.361126 MSNR_R=30.080274 MSNR_G=31.135025 MSNR=31.224335 W__PSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) \(=37.441962\) W_PSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=37.439868\) W_PSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=37.429806\) W_MSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) =31.129244 W_MSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=31.062805\) W_MSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=31.171975\) Actual_PSNR_weight (1/3_1/3_1/3) \(=37.429806\)``` | $\begin{gathered} 11.753317 \\ \text { PSNR_B=37.397868 } \\ M S N R \_B=32.300626 \end{gathered}$ |


| cover_image Size_secret_data PSNR | MSE |
| :---: | :---: |
| ```Blue_color.jpg 1280000 37.538776 PSNR_R=37.556763 PSNR_G=37.415684 MSNR_R=6.523007 MSNR_G=25.151299 MSNR=24.008758 W_PSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=37.554702\) W_PSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=37.541516\) W_PSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=37.539822\) W_MSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=18.994045\) W_MSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=18.787430\) W_MSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=20.150144\) Actual_PSNR_weight \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=28.500469\)``` | $11.460478$ <br> PSNR $B=37.647019$ MSNR_B=28.776125 |
| cover_image Size_secret_data PSNR | MSE |
|  | $\begin{gathered} 23.051382 \\ \text { PSNR_B=33.575594} \\ \text { MSNR_B=-11.808793 } \end{gathered}$ |
|  | MSE |
| ```red_color.jpg 1280000 36.762699 PSNR_R=36.336424 PSNR_G=36.819426 MSNR_R=35.197359 MSNR_G=31.833742 \(M S N R=32.967158\) W_PSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=36.752460\) W_PSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=36.732305\) W_PSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=36.776291\) W_MSNR \((0.4\) _-0.243_0.357) \(=32.920996\) W_MSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=32.962220\) W_MSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=32.713871\) Actual_PSNR_weight \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=36.776291\)``` | $\begin{gathered} 13.702837 \\ \text { PSNR_B=37.173024 } \\ M S N R \text { _B }=31.110512 \end{gathered}$ |

## Embedding combination 2_1_1





W__PSNR $(0.4$ _0. 243_0.357) $=37.548533$
W_PSNR $(0.4$-_0.3_0.3 $)=37.547857$
W_PSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=37.564264$
W_MSNR $(0.4$ _-0.243__0.357) $=30.285996$
W_MSNR $\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=30.329056$
W_MSNR $\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=30.159971$
Actual_PSNR_weīght $\left(1 / 3 \ldots 1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=37.004286$

| cover_image Size_secret_data ${ }^{\text {c }}$ PSNR ${ }^{\text {dB }}$ MSE |
| :---: |
| ```baboon (512 x 512)_color.jpg 1280000 37.565751 11.389517 PSNR_R=37.405435 PSNR_G=37.663087 PSNR_B=37.633330 MSNR_R=31.531799 MSNR_G=31.188577 MSNR_B=29.968074 MSNR=30.926152 W_PSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) \(=37.549403\) W_PSNR (0.4_0.3_0.3) \(=37.551099\) W_PSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=37.567284\) W_MSNR \((0.4\) _0. 243 _0.357) \(=30.890146\) W_MSNR \(\left(0.4{ }^{-} 0.3 \_0.3\right)=30.959715\) W_MSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=30.896150\) Actual_PSNR_weight (1/3_1/3_1/3) \(=36.924555\)``` |
|  |
| cover_image Size_secret_data PSNR MSE |
| ```Blue_color.jpg 128000037.546540 11.440010 PSNR_R=37.328058 PSNR_G=37.673112 PSNR_B=37.647019 MSNR_R \(=6.294302\) MSNR_G=25.408728 MSNR_ \(\bar{B}=28.776125\) \(\mathrm{MSNR}=24.016522\) W_PSNR (0.4_0.243_0.357) \(=37.525775\) W__PSNR \((0.4\) _0.3_0.3) \(=37.527262\) W_PSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=37.549396\) W_MSNR \((0.4\) _-0.243_0.357) \(=18.965118\) W_MSNR \((0.4\) _0.3_0.3 \()=18.773176\) W_MSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=20.159718\) Actual_PSNR_weight (1/3_1/3_1/3) \(=28.510044\)``` |


| cover_image Size_secret_data PSNR | MSE |
| :---: | :---: |
| ```green_color.jpg 1280000 34.498175 PSNR_R=33.425356 PSNR_G=37.657753 MSNR_R=-12.421795 MSNR_G=27.146577 \(M S N R=14.744660\) W_PSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=34.507464\) W_PSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=34.740147\) W_PSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=34.886235\) W_MSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=-2.587839\) W_MSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=-0.367383\) W_MSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=0.971997\) Actual_PSNR_weight (1/3_1/3_1/3) \(=22.442047\)``` | $\begin{gathered} 23.081436 \\ \text { PSNR_B=33.575594} \\ \text { MSNR_B=-11.808793 } \end{gathered}$ |
| cover_image Size_secret_data PSNR | MSE |
| ```red_color.jpg 1280000 36.766376 PSNR_R=36.152324 PSNR_G \(=37.046617\) MSNR_R=35.013259 MSNR_G=32.060933 \(M S N R=32.970835\) W_PSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.243 \_0.357\right)=36.734027\) W_PSNR \((0.4\) _0.3_0.3) \(=36.726822\) W_PSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=36.790655\) W_MSNR \((0.4\) _0. 243 __0.357) \(=32.902563\) W_MSNR \(\left(0.4 \_0.3 \_0.3\right)=32.956737\) W_MSNR \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=32.728235\) Actual_PSNR_weight \(\left(1 / 3 \_1 / 3 \_1 / 3\right)=36.790655\)``` | $\begin{aligned} & 13.691241 \\ & \text { PSNR_B=37.173024 } \\ & M S N R \_B=31.110512 \end{aligned}$ |

