

**The Changing Policy of Kazakhization and Its  
Effects on Minority Rights and Foreign Policy  
Orientations in Kazakhstan**

**Aliya Abdam**

Submitted to the  
Institute of Graduate Studies and Research  
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts  
in  
International Relations

Eastern Mediterranean University  
April 2016  
Gazimağusa, North Cyprus

Approval of the Institute of Graduate Studies and Research

---

Prof. Dr. Cem Tanova  
Acting Director

I certify that this thesis satisfies the requirements as a thesis for the degree of Master of Arts in International Relations.

---

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Erol Kaymak  
Chair, Department of Political Science and  
International relations

We certify that we have read this thesis and that in our opinion it is fully adequate in scope and quality as a thesis for the degree of Master of Arts in International Relations.

---

Asst. Prof. Dr. John Turner  
Supervisor

---

Examining Committee

1. Asst. Prof. Dr. Ibryamova Nuray

---

2. Asst. Prof. Dr. Berna Numan

---

3. Asst. Prof. Dr. John Turner

---

## **ABSTRACT**

The collapse of the Soviet Union and gaining of independence of Kazakhstan has forced the country to pass the stages of state building and nation-building. Soviet Union's policy left a mark in the minds of the Kazakh people. The attempt by the Soviet Union in the collectivization policy, the destruction of the Kazakh intelligentsia, and development of virgin lands for the purpose of Russification led to the transformation of Kazakh nation as well as the loss of its culture, language and customs. During the collapse of the Soviet Union, Kazakhstan was the only country where the titular nation was a minority in comparison with the Russian population. The factors listed above and the low population was a determining factor in the construction of Kazakhstan's state policy which has received the informal name "Kazakhization".

Policy of "Kazakhization" became the basic nationalistic policy of Kazakhstan, which aims to restore national values and strengthening the role of the titular nation that was lost during the Soviet policies. New political course of Kazakhstan became the impetus for the transformation of the republic and changed the ethnic composition. Kazakhization included increasing the role of the titular population in all spheres of life that has caused a negative reaction from the Russian population which has not been ready for the new reforms in the country. In connection with the introduction of policy Kazakhization increased outflow of the Russian population that has led to revisions of some laws.

On adoption of Kazakhization influenced by Soviet policy that has a negative impact on the democratization process in all post-Soviet countries. The authoritarian regime, oppressive notion has led to the emergence of feelings of ethnic nationalism and this reflected in the policies of the former Soviet Union countries and Kazakhstan. Despite the prevalence of latent feelings of ethnic nationalism, cooperation of Kazakhstan with Russia is still in a priority. Growth of discontent on the part of Russian population did not lead to a deterioration of relations on the contrary it is strengthened the cooperation between two countries. At the same time, there is a high probability of deterioration which could lead to a repetition of scenario of annexation in Ukraine and Georgia.

**Keywords:** kazakhization, nationalism, ethnic composition, cooperation.

## ÖZ

Sovyetler Birliđinin çöküşü sırasında, Kazakistan nüfusu Rus nüfusuna göre azınlık gösteren tek ülke oldu. Dolayısıyla Kazakistanın Sovyet politikaları sırasında kaybolan, milletin kökünü güçlendirmeye amaçlayan yeni siyaseti "Kazakization" oldu.Kazakistanın bu yeni siyaseti cumhuriyetin dönüşümünü hızlandırdı ve etnik yapısı deđiştirdi. Rusların bu politikaya olumsuz tepki vermesine rağmen Rusya ile Kazakistanın işbirliđi devam etmektedir.

Tüm Post Sovyet ülkelerinde demokratikleşme sürecine olumsuz etkimlikler gösteren Sovyet politikası "Kazakization" politikasını da olumsuz gördü. Kazakization kabülü üzerine milliyetçilik duygularının ortaya çıkmasına sebep olmuştur. Fakat Kazakization Rusya ile ilişkilerin bozulmasına neden olmadı tersine işbirliđini kuvvetlendirdi. Aynı zamanda Ukrayna ve Gürcistan'da İlhak senaryonun bozulmaya yol açabilecek ihtimal yüksek.

**AnahtarKelimeler:** kazakization, milliyetçilik, etnikyapısı, işbirliđi.

## **ACKNOWLEDGMENT**

I would like to thank my advisor, Asst. Prof. Dr. John Turner, for his guidance and support.

I would like to express my gratitude to the all members of the Department of Political Science and International relations.

I am thankful to my family for the support in the process of my Master Program.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT.....	iii
ÖZ.....	v
ACKNOWLEDGMENT.....	vi
1 INTRODUCTION .....	1
1.1 Importance of the Topic .....	1
1.2 Definitions of Key Terms.....	4
1.3 Research Questions .....	6
1.4 Hypothesis .....	7
1.5 Methodology .....	8
1.6 Literature Review .....	9
2 KAZAKH NATIONAL BUILDING.....	16
2.1 Russification of Kazakh Nation During the Soviet Period.....	16
2.2 Khazakhization.....	20
2.3 Reaction of Minorities to the Policy of “Khazakhization” .....	24
2.4 Revision in “Kazakhization”, Policy of “Nur-Otan” Party .....	27
2.5 Conclusion.....	29
3 POLITIC STATUS OF MINORITIES .....	31
3.1 Language Policies as a Vehicle of Institutionalizing New Ethnic Relations ...	31
3.2 Migration Policy.....	36
3.3 Civil Service .....	41
3.4 Conclusion.....	43
4 KAZAKHSTAN FOREIGN POLICY IN RUSSIAN CONTEXT .....	45
4.1 Relationship between Russia and Khazakhstan .....	45

4.2 Russia Reach to Ethnic Conflict through Protecting of Russian Minorities on the Example of South Osetiya, Crimea .....	49
4.3 Possible Reaction of Russia to Ethnic Oppression in Kazakhstan.....	55
4.4 Conclusion.....	60
5 CONCLUSION .....	62
REFERENCES .....	66



# Chapter 1

## INTRODUCTION

### 1.1 Importance of the Topic

The collapse of the Soviet Union has led to radical changes in the official approaches towards the relationship between people and state in the post-Soviet territories. The Soviet regime, which supported the Russian population, was destroyed and this led to uncertainty in the position of Russian people. The dominant position of the Russian population has deteriorated on the backdrop of a new regime of Independent States.

The newly independent country is the result of a wave of nationalist manifestations in the whole entire of Soviet Union. Long existence under the influence of USSR led to the possibility of building own independent state which has increased the level of ethnic identification, building ethnocratic society, politicization of ethnicity and increasing of ethnic nationalism. Multination states and empires under influence of external power inherited the feeling of ethnic nationalism, because the policy of external forces aimed at changing ethnic identity, culture and language, which have formed during the wave of mobilization in the countries of the former Soviet Union. For example, “the Russian empire sought to make non-Russians Russian through Russification; Britain made many Scots, Welsh and Irish 'English' through Anglicisation.” In the USSR, several of the Soviet Republics were in turmoil with nationalist demands for independence, mass demonstrations, rioting, violence, bloodshed and deaths. The troubles ranged geographically from the Asian Republics

such as Kazakhstan and Uzbekistan, the Caucasus (Armenia, Azerbaijan, Georgia) and Moldova near the Black Sea, to the Baltic Sea (Estonia, Latvia, Lithuania).<sup>1</sup>

For the regions of Soviet Union such as Central Asia and Eastern Europe, ethnic nationalism was the basis for the mobilization. The roots of modern Kazakhstan were not allowed to grow until 1960, only after coming to power Dinmukhamed Kunaev, who served as the first secretary of the Communist Party of Kazakhstan. Thus, wave of mobilization of Kazakhstan took place in December 1986. This wave had a nationalistic character, which gave impetus to the creation of an independent state. 1960 to 1980 was marked as the beginning of Kazakhization and started the process of formation of the Kazakh national identity.

In the new independent ethnic factor was transferred to the political sphere.<sup>2</sup> Like all post-communist states, Kazakhstan also employed nationalism as a politico-ideological instrument and a policy towards building its independent statehood. Kazakh nationalism turned into a chauvinist ideology.<sup>3</sup> Chauvinist ideology manifests itself in national policy of Kazakhization which raised the question about dominant position of ethnic Kazakh. Kazakh nationalism is a reaction to Soviet policy, which had the goal to russified Kazakh population by force. This led to the construction of a model of the state, which is based on the position of the titular nation which is meant “a nation which constitutes a majority.”<sup>4</sup> It emerged as a new idea among the political elites in the Soviet Republic of Kazakhstan challenging to

---

<sup>1</sup>Krishna-Hensel, "James G. Kellas, The Politics Of Nationalism And Ethnicity," *Nationalism & Ethnic Politics* 5, no.1353-7113 (1999): 59.

<sup>2</sup>Guboglo, "Identification of identity," *Ethno-sociological sketches* (2003), 199.

<sup>3</sup>Smith, *The Nationalities Question In The Post-Soviet States* (Longman Group Limited: 1996), 318

<sup>4</sup>Zurcher, *The Post-Soviet Wars: Rebellion, Ethnic Conflict, And Nationhood In The Caucasus* (NEW YORK UNIVERSITY PRESS, 2007), 27

the policies of Sovietization. This idea led to the creation of nationalist politics Kazakhization which has the aim to expel Russian population, Russian language and culture from the Kazakh society. It became possible through the waging a campaign of renaming, marking the spaces by replacing by Kazakh symbols as being an attempt to erase the historical memory of the Russian presence and their impact on the territory of Kazakhstan.

Kazakhization is a national policy, which is aimed at reviving the Kazakh nation. Kazakhization policy which was held since independence manifests itself almost in all the political and social spheres of life by providing the special status of the Kazakh nation as the main state-forming nation among the population of Kazakhstan. Thus, in April 1992 by Nursultan Nazarbayev was made a policy statement were the first time at the highest state level was proclaimed the idea that: “Kazakhstan is a state of self-determined Kazakh nation.” The thesis of the president was legally enshrined in the preamble to the Constitution adopted in 1993.<sup>5</sup>

Statement of President was the reason for raised concerns from Russian population. The new states sought to create a policy in favor to the titular nation largely without taking into account the interests of Russian, which has led to the migration process. In order to maintain a balance within the non-titular nations were amended the constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The constitutions of 1993 and 1995 enshrined various freedoms of speech, assembly, language-use, and religious practice that offered certain protections against particularly overt forms of state

---

<sup>5</sup>Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan (1993) accessed December 20, 2015 <https://ru.wikisource.org/wiki>

ethnicization.<sup>6</sup> Instead unprecedented the definition of Kazakhstan as a self-generated state of the Kazakh nation, in the new constitution it was replaced by the using civil formula “the people of Kazakhstan.”<sup>7</sup>

As in all other countries of the former Soviet Union's policies Kazakhization is a hidden process, except for Ukraine. For example, these are Russification in the Russian Federation, Uzbekization in Uzbekistan. In any country this policy is implicit, no one talks about the primacy of a policy, it's not indicated in any official document, but the authorities of any country require its implementation. This process is a common state practice to build a nation-state.

## 1.2 Definitions of Key Terms

**Ethno-nationalism** - ethnicity is so intimately connected to nationalism that we are best served using the term ethno-nationalism to refer to such phenomenon. It is the increased contact between ethnic collectivities that comes with the late-modern period that forces group members to develop a significant sense of subjective self-awareness and identity.<sup>8</sup>

**Ethnocentrism** - Ethnocentrism is a nearly universal syndrome of attitudes and behaviors. The attitudes include seeing one's own group (the in-group) as virtuous

---

<sup>6</sup>Edward A. D. Schatz, "Framing Strategies And Non-Conflict In Multi-Ethnic Kazakhstan", *Nationalism And Ethnic Politics* 6, no. 2 (2000): 71-94

<sup>7</sup>Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan (1995), (December 21, 2015), accessed from [http://www.akorda.kz/ru/official\\_documents/constitution](http://www.akorda.kz/ru/official_documents/constitution)

<sup>8</sup>Conversi, "Ethnonationalism In The Contemporary World: Walker Connor And The Study Of Nationalism", *Canadian Journal of Sociology Online* (July-August 2003):302, accessed online 10 November, 2015

[https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Daniele\\_Conversi/publication/30527218\\_Ethno-nationalism\\_in\\_the\\_Contemporary\\_World\\_Walker\\_Connor\\_and\\_the\\_Study\\_of\\_Nationalism/links/09e4150ee7e384cacb000000.pdf](https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Daniele_Conversi/publication/30527218_Ethno-nationalism_in_the_Contemporary_World_Walker_Connor_and_the_Study_of_Nationalism/links/09e4150ee7e384cacb000000.pdf)

and superior and an out-group as contemptible and inferior. The attitudes also include seeing one's own standards of value as universal.<sup>9</sup>

**Khazakhization-** informal term used for the name of the national policy in Kazakhstan, whose goal is the revival of “national values”, strengthening the role of the titular nation (in this case the Kazakh ethnic group) in public administration. The efforts to establish the new ethnic relations in Kazakhstan turned to what was labeled a process of kazakhization (phrase widely used by scholars such as Kolstø, Dave, Laitin and others). Kazakhization was the process of ascendance of Kazakhs as a national group on the expense of other national groups, mainly Russians. This process was perceived by many Kazakhs as a way to “pay back” for the years of Russian domination.<sup>10</sup>

**Nationalism-** is primarily a political principle, which holds that the political and the national unit should be congruent. It “is a theory of political legitimacy”.<sup>11</sup> Nationalism derives its power from the real feelings of ethnically defined peoples 'rooted', not least through the 'anchoring' or 'territorializing' forces of nationalism, in the social landscape of the modern world and its values.<sup>12</sup>

**Kazakh nationalism-** transformed in the early 1900s. A full-fledged nationalist intelligentsia emerged, Kazakh written literature gained great influence, and Western

---

<sup>9</sup>Axelrod and Hammond, “The Evolution Of Ethnocentric Behavior”, Midwest Political Science Convention (2003):2

<sup>10</sup>Matuszkiewicz, “The Language Issue In Kazakhstan—Institutionalizing New Ethnic Relations After Independence”, *Economic And Environmental Studies*, no. 102 (2010): 211-227

<sup>11</sup>Gellner, “Nations and Nationalism”, (1983), accessed online 2 November, 2015 from <http://www.people.fas.harvard.edu/~plam/irnotes07/Gellner1983.pdf>

<sup>12</sup>Mac Laughlin, *Reimagining the Nation-state, The Contested Terrains Of Nation-Building*, Pluto Press (2001):36

political ideas developed Kazakh form and content.<sup>13</sup> It is intensified, as the Russian peasantry swarmed over the best lands at the peak of colonization, while the government not only facilitated their invasion; it arbitrarily denied the Kazakhs the newly-found freedom to criticize it.<sup>14</sup>

**Nation-building-** is the most common form of a process of collective identity formation with a view to legitimizing public power within a given territory. This is an essentially indigenous process which often not only projects a meaningful future but also draws on existing traditions, institutions, and customs, redefining them as national characteristics in order to support the nation's claim to sovereignty and uniqueness.<sup>15</sup>

**Russification-** refers to an active policy that aims to replace a population's native culture with Russian, is the demand by the Russian government that the Russian language must be used in administration, natural process whereby certain individuals take on Russian culture and language, usually over several generations.<sup>16</sup>

**Titular nation-** is meant a nation which constitutes a majority.<sup>17</sup>

### 1.3 Research Questions

1. What were the effects of Kazakhization policy on the society?

---

<sup>13</sup>Fisher, Lyn R. "Qazaqjylyq Nationalism and revolution in Kazakhstan, 1900-1920", University of Montana ScholarWorks (1989):48

<sup>14</sup>Ibid., 64

<sup>15</sup>Armin von Bogdandy et al., "State-Building, Nation-Building, And Constitutional Politics In Post-Conflict Situations: Conceptual Clarifications And An Appraisal Of Different Approaches", Max Planck Yearbook Of United Nations Law Online 9, no. 1 (2005): 579-577

<sup>16</sup>Weeks, Theodore R. "Russification: word and practice 1863-1914", Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society (2004): 471-489.

<sup>17</sup>Zurcher, The Post-Soviet Wars: Rebellion, Ethnic Conflict, And Nationhood In The Caucasus (NEW YORK UNIVERSITY PRESS, 2007), 27

2. What was the impact of the disintegration of Kazakh independence following the collapse of the USSR?

3. What are the implications and comparisons to similar cases in Ukraine and Georgia?

### **1.4 Hypothesis**

The collapse of USSR led to the difficulties in coexistence of minorities in Kazakhstan. New policy of Kazakhization which was favor to titular nation can lead to the threat of disintegration of society.

The policy of Kazakhization created negative reactions from Russian speaking minority since the Kazakh state began to reformulate the nation building process in 1995 through incorporation new elements into Kazakhization policy. In order to reduce the flow of migration and possible disintegration of society there was an attempt to make changes in national policy of Kazakhization, a balanced policy for the benefit of all ethnic groups. The reformulation of Kazakhization policy could be understood in such areas as constitution revision, the creation of Assembly of People of Kazakhstan. Assembly of Peoples of Kazakhstan contributed to the recovery of international climate, which implements the program's in the sphere of interethnic and interreligious harmony. Changes in the constitution concerning language policy defined the legal framework for the free use of languages in Kazakhstan, which provides respectful attitude to all languages. In Kazakhstan, President Nazarbayev has tried to bargain for ethnic peace by promising the large Russian (and other Slav) minority a combination of cultural autonomy and equal citizenship and voting rights. A balanced policy of Kazakhstan helps to avoid inter-ethnic issues. Kazakhization

not expressed openly as in Ukraine or Georgia. In the case of open-discriminatory policies Kazakhstan will have to deal with aggression from the Russian Federation.

## **1.5 Methodology**

The initial task of the thesis is to study of the two historical identity transformation initiatives, namely the policies of Russification and Kazakhization. This requires the use of primary and secondary sources to explain the dimensions, motives and results of Russification and the perceptions against Russification through the new policy of Kazakhization.

Primary sources will include analysis of legal regulations, constitutional amendments, the “Law on the Assembly of People of Kazakhstan”, “Law about Languages”, “Law about migration”. Secondary resources including books and articles published in Kazakh, Russian and English will be used for this purpose.

Firstly, thesis will summarize the data from literature review and will focus mainly on documentary analysis which will obtain data from official documents, books and articles. Observational methods of collecting data will help to reflect full picture of particular period.

Secondly, since one of the objectives is to study future developments in the relations between Russia and Kazakhstan the thesis will focus on the legal regulations such as treaties and agreements (“Treaty of Friendship, Cooperation and Mutual Assistance”, “Declaration of Eternal Friendship and Alliance in the XXI Century”<sup>18</sup> between the

---

<sup>18</sup>Embassy of Russian Federation, “Russia-Kazakhstan” accessed online 1 November, 2015 from [http://www.rfembassy.kz/eng/lm/dvustoronnie\\_otnosheniya/rossiya-kazakhstan/](http://www.rfembassy.kz/eng/lm/dvustoronnie_otnosheniya/rossiya-kazakhstan/)



two states. Discriminative policies will also be studied through published works in Kazakh, Russian and English.

Comparative-historical method in the analysis of the thesis will be an important part of the study, which will provide specific and general provision Russian and Kazakhs in certain periods of time.

## **1.6 Literature Review**

The collapse of the Soviet Union has a great importance in the transformation of the Kazakhstan. This was due to a complex processes such as approval and development of the Kazakhstan as independent subject of international relations, determination of nation-building processes and the definition of the foreign policy of the country.

Long existence of Central Asian countries as part of USSR has forced to make a transition from one political regime to another. It was characterized by the transition from a communist system to a democracy. The Soviet regime exercised a deep cultural impact on its non-Russian inhabitants.<sup>19</sup> Therefore transformation was accompanied by the nationalist demands, high proportion of migration, revisions of laws.

The main force that tore the Soviet Union apart was the fact that most of its people continued to identify more strongly with their ethnic groups than they did with the Soviet Union.<sup>20</sup> Soviet legacy has forced to build new state through nationalist demands. The idea of nationalism and the ideal of the 'nation-state' were not necessarily based on ethnicity. Rather they stressed the voluntary coming together of

---

<sup>19</sup>Beissinger, "Nationalis Mobilization and the Collapse of the Soviet State" (Cambridge University Press, 2002),53

<sup>20</sup>Barner-Barry, Hody, "The Political change. The transformation of the Former Soviet Union", New York (St. Martin's Press Inc. 1995),83

people in a state with a shared culture.<sup>21</sup> In a case of Kazakhstan, the idea of nationalism was close interrelated with ethnic issues in order to show that Kazakh nation deserve self-affirmation as an independent entity.

Ethnic tensions have become so significant a feature of politics in parts of the post-communist world that some commentators believe they are both the distinguishing feature of post-communism and that they constitute a major threat to the development of civic society.<sup>22</sup>

For Kazakhstan, nationalism become the roots for construction of independence but further developing of state based on dilemma between civic and ethnic nationalism. At the heart of every nationalism lies a profound dualism – a tension between civic and ethnic elements.<sup>23</sup> Soviet legacy has forced to create a policy of Kazakhization that directly oriented on ethnic nationalism. There are two levels of national identification. The Soviet legacy has left a trace in determining the identification of the Kazakh people. The first is political and civic consciousness of Kazakh people, which is perceived as a collection of all the citizens of Kazakhstan. This idea was put forward by the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan.<sup>24</sup> The second level is the ethnic identity of the Kazakhs as the main title of the nation.<sup>25</sup> Also, integration of Kazakhstan, revisions in Law and Constitution in order to preserve ethnic harmony is basis of civic elements. Kazakhstan faces a difficult nation-building project as it is not only divided by language but is also a bi-ethnic state with roughly equal numbers

---

<sup>21</sup>Kellas, “The Politics of Nationalism and Ethnicity” (MACMILLAN PRESS LTD,1991):51

<sup>22</sup>Holmes, “Post-Communism. An introduction”, Polity Press, UK (1997):283

<sup>23</sup>Carothers, “The end of the transition paradigm”, Journal of Democracy, Vol.13, Number 1 (2002):337

<sup>24</sup>Vezhbitski, “Prospects of formation of Kazakhstani people”, Journal of Eurasia (2006): 49, accessed online 10 November,2015 from:<http://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/perspektivy-formirovaniya-kazahstanskogo-naroda>

<sup>25</sup>The bulletin of the National academy of science of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2012, accessed November 11, 2015 [http://www.rmebrk.kz/journals/59/0%20\(4\).pdf](http://www.rmebrk.kz/journals/59/0%20(4).pdf)

of Russians and Kazakhs.<sup>26</sup> After independence, the Kazakhs, Russian and other nations involved in the complex inter-ethnic interaction and the nation-building should be taken into account given features. Nation-building process in Kazakhstan was also characterized as division between democracy and authoritarian regime. On the one hand one hand official status as democratic, unitary, secular state. In terms of its official rhetoric and policy pronouncements, the Nazarbayev leadership showed an unwavering commitment top reserving interethnic stability and promoting harmonization of ethnic relations.<sup>27</sup> On the other hand the nationalist project of Kazakhization. The most appropriate definition can be delegate democracy. Considered a delegative democracy, possessing the trappings of a democratic system but in practice constituted as an authoritarian state the nature of ethnic relations and the impact that state formation has had on these relations remains a pressing concern to this day.<sup>28</sup>

In the process such as of nation-building is important to show and to determine the degree of integration within the country between residents and representatives of different nations. The idea of nation-building is inherent in all the countries that were colonies, and also for post-communist countries that have been dependent on foreign power and had no experience of building an independent, democratic society. The collapse of the Soviet Union gave impact to the formation of its own territory, the national language of the state, the legal framework and culture. The process of

---

<sup>26</sup>Kuzio, "History, memory and nation building in the post-Soviet colonial space." Nationalities Papers 30.2 (2002):258

<sup>27</sup>The OMRI Annual Survey of Eastern Europe and the Former Soviet Union, "Building Democracy" New York (Open Media Research Institute, 1995),273

<sup>28</sup>Ó Beacháin and Kevlihan, "State-building, Identity and Nationalism in Kazakhstan: Some Preliminary Thoughts", Working Papers in International Studies, Centre for International Studies' No 1. (2011):3

nation-building also includes a choice of language, migration processes, the selection and establishment of public holidays, the establishment of the national history of the nation.

Nation-building was based on some of the important factors is the language policy. The state has developed a series of programs that implementation language policy. Further construction of independent Kazakhstan aimed the increase total number of Kazakh population through migration processes. The process of nation-building and state building are inextricably linked, as one of the more common problems in modern democracy for government is construction projects which aimed specifically at assimilation or integration of immigrants in the national "family".<sup>29</sup> States will create conditions for migrants through a resettlement program. Large-scale migrations are not a merely modern phenomenon; a migratory people may take over political control of an area or merely enter it in a manner subservient to its existing order.<sup>30</sup> In Kazakhstan, through migration of Kazakh Diaspora which is strengthening the role of Kazakh people in society in order to change imbalance in a number of population during the collapse of soviet system. Follow the Judith T. Shuval:

The term Diaspora refers today not only to such classic groups as Jews, Greeks Armenians, but too much wider categories which reflect processes of politically motivated uprooting and moving of populations, voluntary migration, global communications and transport.<sup>31</sup>

---

<sup>29</sup>Wayne, *NEGOTIATING NATIONALISM Nation-Building, Federalism, And Secession In The Multinational State*(OXFORD University Press, 2006), 39

<sup>30</sup>Hastings, "The construction of Nationhood. Ethnicity, religion and nationalism", Cambridge University Press (1997):170

<sup>31</sup>Shuval, "Diaspora Migration: Definitional Ambiguities and a Theoretical Paradigm International Migration", Blackwell Publishers Ltd. Vol.38 (5) (2000):42

Policy of Kazakhstan motivated Kazakh Diaspora living outside of Kazakhstan to come back on historical land. Thus, through migration the population of Kazakhstan was converted from minority to majority. Process of migration in the post-Soviet states can be accompanied by the many factors viewed as stimulation. They include:

The attempts by the majority of the leaderships of the CIS and the Baltic states to form nation-states on the basis of the ethnic definition of nationality and the deliberate policies favoring titular nationalities and discriminating against the ethnic minorities.

- the loss of status and privileges by the Russian-speaking elites and general population, causing their dissatisfaction with the new political regimes;
- the increasing linguistic and cultural differentiation among the ethnic groups, resulting from the resurgence of nationalism and the official emphasis on languages and cultures of the titular nations.<sup>32</sup>

Policy of Kazakhization through migration has created a positive atmosphere for returning of ethnic Kazakhs. There were certain tasks in politics of Kazakhization and the problem of low level of population was successfully solved. Decisions regarding immigration and naturalization also affect the viability of societal cultures; immigration can strengthen a national group.<sup>33</sup> Thus, the state strengthens our nation, creating all the conditions for the titular nation. Resettlement program has been undertaken to increase the number of Kazakhs, as during the collapse of the Soviet Union, the Kazakh population was minority compared with the Russian majority. As a result of mass migration Kazakhstan increased the number of Kazakh population and still in republic occupies more than one hundred ethnic communities, which

---

<sup>32</sup>Korobkova, Zaionchkovskaia, "The changes in the migration patterns in the post-Soviet states: the first decade", Elsevier, *Communist and Post-Communist Studies* 37 (2004): 487

<sup>33</sup>Ben-Ami, Peled, Spektorowski, "Ethnic Challenges to the Modern Nation State", Palgrave, New York (2000):15

constitute the majority of Kazakhs, Russian ranks second in number. The rest of the populations are Germans, Uzbeks, Koreans, Uighurs, and the Ingush.<sup>34</sup>

Nevertheless, Kazakhstan is not really a multi-cultural society, but may more aptly be characterized as a bi-cultural society.<sup>35</sup> During the collapse of the Soviet Union and today the general populations were Kazakh and Russian. When the structure of the nation's interests must be taken into account besides the titular nation should take into account the interests of other minorities.

Despite the attempted policy of Kazakhization in nation-building, Kazakhstan maintains close political and economic ties with Russia, trying to integrate between policies of Kazakhization and promote ethnic harmony. From the very beginning, Kazakhstan viewed integration tendencies both as the “first principle” that guides the driving forces of today’s world and as a tool in everyday work.<sup>36</sup> The independence faced with the need for a well-developed foreign policy in order to avoid deterioration of the situations inside of the country. To analyze the relevance of new forms of cooperation for Central Asian regional security and the effects of the interaction between external powers and regional security dynamics, it is useful to employ the concepts of a “regional security complex” and “security dynamics.”<sup>37</sup> The process of nation-building, which is based on the principles of Kazakhization may lead to a worsening of relations with Russia, as the Russian population is the second

---

<sup>34</sup>Jumageldinov, "Ethnic Identification, Social Discrimination And Interethnic Relations In Kazakhstan", *Procedia - Social And Behavioral Sciences* 114 (2014):411

<sup>35</sup>Pål Kolstø, "Anticipating Demographic Superiority: Kazakh Thinking On Integration And Nation Building", *Europe-Asia Studies* 50, no. 1 (1998): 52

<sup>36</sup>Bertsch, Craft, Jones, Beck, "Crossroads and Conflict Security and Foreign Policy in the Caucasus and Central Asia", Great Britain ( Routledge, 2000): 240

<sup>37</sup>Allison, Jonson, "Central Asian Security. The New International context", London (Royal Institute of International Relations 2000):5

most populous after the Kazakhs. Despite the undertaken policy of Kazakhization, government still maintains a balance in order to preserve security. It is important to maintain equilibrium policy in order to disbalance the harmony and peace in the country. One example that springs to my mind is case of Ukraine where policy of Ukrainianization took an aggressive form.

By the way, it could be said that there is a balance in the policy of Kazakhstan in order to avoid repetition of phenomenon in Ukraine, Georgia, where the oppression of the Russian population has led to open aggression by the Russian Federation. To avoid such a scenario, the process of nation-building in Kazakhstan should take into account the interests of all ethnic groups, particularly the Russian population.

Processes of state-building, nation-building and democratization are a complex process which needs a time in order to implement a real transition from one system to another. For European countries it took decades to reach a level of democratization and state structure, which is based on the principles of democracy. For the countries, of Central Asia should be established a real effective system of institutions, eliminating principles of clans, regionalism and the inclinations of the old Soviet system. Currently CIS countries are on the way towards democracy but nevertheless in a short period of time there have been significant changes in the transition from communist system. It is turning point for the countries of Central Asia which were almost seventy years been under pressure of the Soviet system, deprived of the right to self-determination and state structure.

## Chapter 2

### KAZAKH NATIONAL BUILDING

#### 2.1 Russification of Kazakh Nation During the Soviet Period

The Russian colonial policy and close borders of Kazakhstan and Russia had a negative impact. The colonial legacy of the tsarist regime in Kazakhstan in the second half of 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> centuries had serious consequences for the Kazakh nation. The behavior of Russian colonizers in Kazakhstan had a lot in common with the character of the Europeans in their colonial territories. On the 1<sup>st</sup> World Forum of Kazakhs noted: “Colonialism of Tsarist Russia is in no way inferior, if not superior to other colonial system.”<sup>38</sup>

The colonization of Kazakhstan includes the following steps. The initial phase (18<sup>th</sup> – beginning of 19<sup>th</sup> centuries) was to establish a Russian protectorate over the territory of Kazakhstan. This period was characterized by the active construction of Russian forts and cities on the Kazakh-Russian border. Colonial aggression in Kazakhstan was characterized by the military, political and economic expansion. Military

---

<sup>38</sup>The first World Forum of Kazakhs, Kazakhstan truth, “Institute of History and Ethnology at the Name of C.C. Valikhanov”, Z.T. Sadvokasova study spiritual expansion in the context of the colonial policy of tsarism in Kazakhstan as a scientific problem”, *“History of state”*, 2007. – № 3, accessed online 15 November, 2015 [http://www.ii.kz/?page\\_id=408&lang=ru](http://www.ii.kz/?page_id=408&lang=ru)



expansion comprised of the armed resistance of the Kazakhs, the construction of garrisons. Political expansion was aimed at establishing Russian control systems, the elimination of the Khan's power and other administrative measures, which led to the restriction of political rights of Kazakhs. Economic expansion had the goal of turning Kazakhstan into a raw materials appendage of the Russian Empire. This included the seizure of Kazakh land and exploitation of natural resources of Kazakhstan. The fourth element of the expansion was Russification, assimilation with the Russian people and spiritual expansion. Spiritual expansion came through the Russification of the local population and the prevalence of the Russian language in educational system, the forced Christianization. The fourth element of Russian expansion was the most effective, and left a deep imprint on the consciousness of the Kazakh people. Russification policy found further active development in the period of the Soviet Union and became the main course in the construction of the Soviet regime.<sup>39</sup>

Russification was a policy of the Soviet Union that began in pre-revolutionary Russia. The goal of the policy was homogenizing the multilingual society was aimed at the active dissemination of the Russian language. Russification policy has the character of an ideology of the Soviet period. Soviet policy was aimed at strengthening the dominant role of the Russian culture and language in order to disregard the rights of the socialist republics and their territorial integrity and sovereignty.

The idea of Russification policy had roots that belonged to V.I. Lenin, which was based on the merging of nations through a free, fraternal union. The further

---

<sup>39</sup>Andreas, "The Ambiguities of Russification", Slavica Publishers , Explorations in Russian and Eurasian History, Volume 5, Number 2(2004): 293

implementation of the idea of merging of the nation had been applied by I.V. Stalin through a violent method. The idea had the character of Russification of all the people of the Soviet Union.<sup>40</sup>

Firstly, we need to consider which areas the policy manifested and the nature of Russification ideology. Initially, the Russification of the Soviet Union had an implicit character, without a law that confirms an official status. It was based on the ideology mono-languages, which was distributed throughout the entire space of the Soviet Union. Russification policy actively manifested in government regulation programs and has mandatory execution. Hidden belittling had been pronounced against the Turkic languages. The Soviet Union's policy was based on the axiom that "there is ancient Turkic alphabets but the Kazakhs, Uzbeks, Kyrgyz have nothing to do with."<sup>41</sup> This statement contradicts to the reality. In fact, Turkic languages have a long history and ancient writing, which occupied an important position in the history of the Turkic people, but at that time the Soviet Union's policy was aimed at the elimination of pluralism with regard to other languages. The Kazakh language had a little role in the social sphere and was not used in the public, diplomatic, military sectors and in the field of education. Range of the Kazakh language had been used in a domestic area. It reduced the ability of a person who did not speak Russian.

Another way of implementing the Russification policy was a massive migration of the Slavic population, which had been associated with national oppression. Migration

---

<sup>40</sup>Yesimova, ""The Influence Of Migration Flows For Ethnic Picture Of The Northern Region Kazakhstan During Development Of Virgin Lands."" , Accessed 13 March 2016 from <http://www.enu.kz/repository/repository2013/VLIANIE-MIGRACIONNYH-POTOKOV.pdf>

<sup>41</sup>Suleymenova, "Russification As Language Homogenization Of Multilingual Kazakhstan", Russian Language Journal 60 (2010): 234

had an unprecedented scale and unpredictable consequence, such as forced deportation of repressed people.<sup>42</sup> The process of rapprochement of people was carried out through forced migration with the planned reallocation of labor and rational distribution of productive forces in order to develop the country's natural wealth.

Another tool of Russification was the education system, which had developed a common educational space and sample programs based on the Russian language. Education reforms were carried out by the introduction of compulsory Russian language. The Russian language was a language of international influence which allowed the Russian language to have immense power and Russian language skills become a prerequisite for success and social advancement in society.<sup>43</sup>

Furthermore, programs have been created such as the Soviet Union dekulakization, collectivization and sedentarization campaigns, which took place in the period 1928-1934. Nearly 1.5 million Kazakhs died during that period, the other half have moved to Mongolia, China due to extreme violence towards the Kazakhs. As a result, the Kazakh population fell from 91.4% in this territory in 1850 to 57.1% in 1926.<sup>44</sup> Between 1928 and 1934 the number of Kazakh population declined from 5.9 million in 1930 to just 2.5 million in 1933. This was the greatest tragedy of the Kazakh people. One Kazakh historian even cited "the famous Anglo-American historian"

---

<sup>42</sup>Anderson, Silver, "Estimating Russification of Ethnic Identity Among Non-Russians in the USSR", *Demography*, Vol. 20, No. 4 (1983): 461

<sup>43</sup>Silver, "Social Mobilization and the Russification of Soviet Nationalities", *American Political Science Association* Vol. 68, No. 1 (1974):48

<sup>44</sup>Hale, "Cause Without A Rebel: Kazakhstan's Unionist Nationalism In The USSR And CIS", *Nationalities Papers* 37, no. 1 (2009):4-6

Robert Conquest to argue that Kazakhs as a group lost at least 49% of their population through collectivization.<sup>45</sup>

The process of Russification was most pronounced in Kazakhstan since the beginning of 1990 was the most Kazakhs sovietized, russified ethnic group in the USSR. The process of Russification was increasingly being implemented in all areas of life and caused significant changes in the cultural identity of Kazakhs. The current population of Kazakhstan is a result of the influx of a large number of migrants from other parts of the country during the second half of the twentieth century. The migration of other people in Kazakhstan in the period of virgin land was an effective tool of the Soviet colonialism which sought to inhibit the development of the historical heritage of the Kazakh nation and the Kazakh people for an end to the aspirations of statehood. Anti-popular policy of the Soviet Union did not give any opportunities for the development of the Kazakh people as the owner of their land and turn the Kazakh ethnic group from the majority of the national minority in their own homeland. The result of Russification policy was the undertaken Kazakhization program which was introduced after independence.

## **2.2 Khazakhization**

The process of disintegration of the Soviet Union can be described as the disintegration of the former territories which was amplified in the year 1990 and has a tendency of integration and reunification of ethnic groups. Due to the long presence in the Soviet Union, Moscow's brutal policies led to the transformation of Kazakh society. Kazakh people have undergone massive ruthless political, cultural, social

---

<sup>45</sup>Ibid.,4-6

measures enforced by the Soviet authorities. Moscow's policy was a result of the fact that Kazakh society was the most russified people from all Soviet republics.

In 1991, Kazakhstan was the only independent republic in which the titular nationality was a minority furthermore its large Russian minority and the deep Russification / Sovietisation of society weakened the Kazakh state at the national level.<sup>46</sup> The demographic preponderance of the Russian population had an impact on the Kazakh people. An Uzbek proverb: “if you want to become a Russian, first become a Kazakh,” captures the profound impact of Russian language and culture on the Kazakhs. The disappearance of the traditional nomadic culture, the elimination of the Kazakh intelligentsia, almost forgotten knowledge of the Kazakh language, culture and literature led to the construction of the new Kazakh society in favor of the Kazakh ethnic group.<sup>47</sup> So, after gaining independence, Kazakhstan has made an attempt to introduce Kazakhization policy, which involves strengthening the position of the Kazakh language, which took place against the backdrop of a gradual reduction of the Russian language. Construction of an independent state was dictated by the principle of linguistic policy of Kazakhstan. Kazakhization policy mainly focused on support of the Kazakh language, the specific status of ethnic Kazakhs, Kazakhization of public administration, the economic sector and the exclusion of Russian from public sector.<sup>48</sup>

---

<sup>46</sup>Peyrouse, "Nationhood And The Minority Question In Central Asia. The Russians In Kazakhstan", *Europe-Asia Studies* 59, no. 3 (2007): 481-501

<sup>47</sup>Dave, "Minorities and Participation In Public Life: Kazakhstan". *UN Commission On Human Rights: Sub-Commission On Promotion And Protection Of Human Rights, Working Groups On Minorities* (2003):7

<sup>48</sup>Gang, Schmillen, “Sometimes, Winners Lose: Economic Disparity and Indigenization in Kazakhstan”. *Econstor IOS Working Papers*, No. 345 (2014):2

In the process of policy of Kazakhization Kazakh intelligentsia split into different points of view but all shared the goal of the Kazakh nation *Qazaqjylyq*.<sup>49</sup> This means creating conditions for the prosperity and welfare of the Kazakh people. It is worth noting that Kazakhization policy has a dual policy. The first is to ensure conditions for the confirmation of the Kazakh public without violating the multiethnic population's right and the second is to create a new Kazakh nation that will be the basis for the Kazakh statehood.

Tools of Kazakhization include state planning, state personnel policy and social engineering. Each of the tools is the key to creating conditions in favor of the Kazakh ethnic group. For example, state planning and social engineering is used to allow the Kazakhs to dominate society for a long period. State planning provided Kazakh people public administrative and elected places. Evidenced by the 1994 the Cabinet and presidential administration that comprised of 75 per cent of ethnic Kazakhs.

The second instrument of Kazakhization was reforms in the use of language and rewriting of history. The introduction of the policy enabled the renaming of streets and in most cities renaming of geographical places into Kazakh names also wider use of the Kazakh language in the official press conferences and the media. In May 6, 1998 a new capital Akmola «white tomb» was renamed to Astana meaning "capital". As a result of renaming the streets, during 1991-2005 names in three areas were changed, 12 cities, and 53 districts of the region, 7 areas of cities, 43 railway stations, as well as 957 small settlements. Three areas were changed, 12 cities, 14 districts, 76 railway stations and 22 small settlements. In total, by 2005 the country had renamed

---

<sup>49</sup>Davenel, "Cultural mobilization in post-Soviet Kazakhstan: views from the state and from non-titular nationalities compared". Central Asian Survey (2012):19

nearly 60 percent of the geographical objects, the set of which were founded by Russian.<sup>50</sup>

The third component of the tool was the demographic policy. In order to change the demographic balance in favor of the Kazakh population the government of the republic of Kazakhstan transferred the capital from Almaty to Astana in order to prevent secession to Russia to the northern regions of the country. The Northern region of the country at the time of independence was a Russian-speaking. Main part of Russians population inhabit at the northern region of Akmola (Astana current name), Kokshetau, Kostanay, and Pavlodar, Karaganda. The official reason for moving the capital was seismic hazards and the muddy environment in the old capital. In 1997, President Nazarbayev suggested the real reason for moving the capital:

I have to tell the truth: we should move people from here to Akmola, the youth should be genuine patriots since we do all this for them. This is there, our Kazakh land. This is solely a Kazakh policy pursued for the benefit of the Kazakh's.<sup>51</sup>

Thus, it became known that the transfer of the capital was made in order to change the demographic balance with a view of settling the country's northern regions by Kazakh ethnos. Mixing with the Russian population will help in improving the language, the cultural sphere as the northern region of the country was considered the most Russified area with a specific magnitude of the Russian population.

---

<sup>50</sup>Rotar Igor "After Crimea is no necessity to learn Kazakh language", Rosbalt (26 November, 2015) Retrieved from <http://www.rosbalt.ru/exussr/2014/04/08/1254081.html>

<sup>51</sup>Martha Brill Olcott , "Kazakhstan: Unfulfilled Promise", Washington (Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, 2010), 101

The fourth tool was to increase the number of Kazakh schools. During the Soviet era Kazakh schools were banned, as explained above, their numbers declined sharply as a result the Kazakh language has been gradually forgotten. The new trend in recent years have been positive developments as more “russified” parents try to teach their children in Kazakh schools by creating a vital language shift in the new generations.

Reviewing all of these tools had a great impact on the Kazakhization policy and an ambiguous conclusion was made. Thus, according to the researchers the ethno-cratic Kazakhstan is a state that is based on the preferences that favor the state building ethnos. According to the French CNRS researchers: “in Kazakhstan society is built on the principles of ethnic groups, but not social.”<sup>52</sup> This means that there is a “pyramid” and on top is ethnic Kazakhs were located, other nations occupied positions below as the entire state power and financial resources were concentrated in the hands of ethnic Kazakhs. Long dominance of Russian Kazakh population led to an increased sense of national identity. Providing favorable conditions for living and prosperity of the Kazakh ethnic groups was the priorities of the state. Preserving the integrity of the Kazakh culture stood opposed to infiltrators of Russification. To eradicate the Russification all of these tools had an impact on additional elements.

### **2.3 Reaction of Minorities to the Policy of “Kazakhization”**

With the collapse of the Soviet Union, the Russian population in 1991, who lived across the former Soviet Union suddenly found themselves as people living abroad. Transformation of state borders, the formation of new states with new systems increased concern among Russian speakers. The attempt by the Kazakhization

---

<sup>52</sup>Teslenko, "Dilemmas of sociocultural identification of Young Kazakhs", Vestnik of Udmurt University (2014):13



government policy provoked a reaction from the part of the Russian population. The Kazakhization policy and the proclamation of Kazakh as the sole state language evoked a strong concern on part of the Russian and Russian-speaking population in Kazakhstan and prompted them to think about the state and prospects for themselves and their children.

The first reaction was in response to the adoption of the Law on Languages, which forced Russians migrated out from Kazakhstan. Linguistic Policy is the greatest discontent. Kazakhstan produced a changes since independence. Changes occurred in the change of the special status of ethnic Kazakhs, officialising the Kazakh language. The reaction of the Russian population about the deterioration of their political status was reflected in the mass emigration to Russia. After the adoption of the law on the languages, Kazakhstan lost a large number of the indigenous population of the country that was not profitable for Kazakhstan due to the small proportion of the Kazakh population. According to statistics, the non-titular population fell by two million people since independence. The mass exodus was accompanied by harassment that allegedly exposed part of the Russian society. Following research carried out under the auspices of the Federal Migration Service of the Russian Federation it was concluded that the circumstances that encouraged migration include adverse factors which were created within the state. This includes economic, political, socio-psychological factors.<sup>53</sup>

A second reason for dissatisfaction was noted in the Constitutional amendments. The 1993 Constitution caused dissatisfaction towards the Russians as the 1993

---

<sup>53</sup>Kruglov, "Russian question in Kazakhstan", Ng.Ru (21 November, 2015)  
Retrieved from  
[http://www.ng.ru/cis/2001-05-24/5\\_kazakhstan.html](http://www.ng.ru/cis/2001-05-24/5_kazakhstan.html)

Constitution asserts that the Republic of Kazakhstan is an expression of will of the Kazakh people in the form of the state. The Constitution gave the ethnic Kazakhs a privileged status. After the mass migration of Russian population, in response to the constitution of 1993, a decision was made by the state to attempt to appease the popular discontent on the part of Russians and to reduce the number of migrants therefore they adopted a new Constitution of 1995, which was stated that: "We, the people of Kazakhstan, united with common historical destiny, creating statehood on the ancient Kazakh land."<sup>54</sup> The new constitution has provided to all of the of Kazakhstan, without singling out the special status of Kazakhs. The old constitution put on a secondary plan the Russian population itself and forced them to feel as the target of the new government policy.<sup>55</sup>

Despite the adoption of a new constitution in 1995 Kazakhstan had not given up on Kazakhization and continued to actively promote it in all areas of life. For the Russian people a direct statement from the President angered them because proposed policies of Kazakhization came to life. For example, the leader of Kazakhstan has noted that.

Kazakh language is the state, and in the future it should be a way of all Kazakhstanis. "Children should all learn. When we will train the children, as I said to 2025 from 1 to 10 classes and release them - then there will be a conversation the others. We must be very vigilant. Questions of international relations are a thin membrane. The advantage over others never led to good we know it well with you."<sup>56</sup>

---

<sup>54</sup>Official site of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan (2 December, 2015)  
Retrieved from [http://www.akorda.kz/ru/official\\_documents/constitution](http://www.akorda.kz/ru/official_documents/constitution)

<sup>55</sup>Peyrouse, "Nationhood and the Minority Question In Central Asia. The Russians In Kazakhstan", *Europe-Asia Studies* 59, no. 3 (2007): 481-501

<sup>56</sup>Russian adapt to Kazakhization, *Politics* 2011 (25 December, 2015)  
Retrieved from <http://maxpark.com/community/politic/content/2663231>.

Statements by the President expressed the inevitable future of Kazakhization and caused a response from the Russian population who saw the Kazakhization policy's shades of discrimination. The reaction of the Russian population was clear but it must not be forgotten that Kazakhstan is a new state, and should be built on the principles of tolerance to all opposing nations but also to actively promote ethnic Kazakhs in all political and economic circumstances.

## **2.4 Revision in “Kazakhization”, Policy of “Nur-Otan” Party**

The modern political system of Kazakhstan has the features of authoritarian and democratic regimes. Undeveloped democratic resources, the immaturity of civil society, the weakness of the legal framework and strong opposition in power structures complicated Kazakhstan's development in a democratic direction. Kazakhstan's policy is a dilemma of choice, for example, Kazakhization policy had features of an authoritarian regime but the further establishment of the Assembly of Peoples of Kazakhstan spoke about the democratic mood. The stabilization of inter-ethnic relations was a fundamental value of the Kazakhstani society. To stabilize the relationship a lot of activities were carried out that included the review and amendment of the constitution in favor of the two main nations Kazakh and Russian, a change in the law on the languages was the second step is creation of the Assembly of People of Kazakhstan in 1995 by the president of the republic in order to calm the growing concerns of some minorities. Creating Assembly talks of democratic trends in the policy of Kazakhstan. The Assembly of People of Kazakhstan made a significant contribution to the improvement and enhancement of the inter-ethnic climate. Activities of Assembly based on the principles of the dominance of national

and state interests, equality of all citizens and a fair resolution of any questions regarding national issues.<sup>57</sup>

Despite the current political situation in the country, Russians living in Kazakhstan have a lot of political demands, but growing authoritarianism in the country leaves no option for Russians to be members of political processes and to create official level parties. The Russians demanded political and social concessions, but the political authorities refused them. They were also the first to criticise the process of 'Kazakhisation' and to denounce what they called the 'ethnocratisation' of the country.<sup>58</sup> It is impossible to talk about the complete exclusion of Russian political life since at the moment there are two parties that represent the Russian society, Lad-ROSD (Respublikanskoe obshchestvennoe slavyanskoe dvizhenie) and the 'Russian community' (Russkaya obshchina). The two parties are leading the movements for the protection and defence of the rights of Russian but at the official level, the party not registered.

The political system of modern Kazakhstan is a hybrid with hints of Soviet-era institutions. By its nature, politics is characterized by opacity of personal networks and informal practices that work in the medium of formal institutions. At the top is the exclusive right of the President to the government who supervises the work of all the political institutions, the ruling party Nur Otan.<sup>59</sup> The right to public assembly

---

<sup>57</sup>Kesici, "The Dilemma in the Nation-Building Process: The Kazakh or Kazakhstani Nation?", *Journal on Ethnopolitics and Minority Issues in Europe* Vol 10, No 1 (2011): 51

<sup>58</sup>Knox, "Kazakhstan: modernizing government in the context of political inertia", *International Review of Administrative Sciences* Vol.74 (3), (2008):484

<sup>59</sup>Dave, *Kazakhstan / Nations in Transit 2011*, (23 October, 2015) accessed online from [https://freedomhouse.org/sites/default/files/inline\\_images/NIT-2011-Kazakhstan.pdf](https://freedomhouse.org/sites/default/files/inline_images/NIT-2011-Kazakhstan.pdf)

and parties remains severely restricted in Kazakhstan, and is recognized as a result of unauthorized forms such a political system in which the president's party has the exclusive right to exist in Kazakhstan and it is occupy dominant position. In Kazakhstan, today there are various political parties, but they are barely existant and policies do not meet the level of institutionalization.<sup>60</sup> If we characterize the political parties as the power centers it must be noted that they do not become real actors in decision-decisions at the state level.

## **2.5 Conclusion**

These features in the Russification policy demonstrate the effectiveness of the management policy and the strong influence of Soviet ideology as propagandist machine. It should be noted that even after several decades, there is a high efficiency of the Soviet policy of Russification and effective force. Russification policy can be termed as successful as it has become a powerful resource of mobilization. Russification policy success has been made possible due to the current demographic situation. Also, the influence of language and cultural homogenization is a powerful tool that left a mark in the countries of the former Soviet Union. Russification results remain an inertial force in Kazakhstan that resulted from the introduction of Kazakhization policy. The language problem in Kazakhstan remains one of the most important, as the optimal solution to language problems is a factor in the harmonization of interethnic relations, strengthening the consolidation of peoples and inter-ethnic harmony.

---

<sup>60</sup>Matveeva, "Democratization, Legitimacy and Political Change in Central Asia", Wiley on behalf of the Royal Institute of International Affairs Vol. 75, No. 1 (1999): 25

For the Russian minority's situation in Kazakhstan, it is as a struggle between Kazakhs and Russians which is the result of the struggle for a place in the economic or administrative field. Since the beginning of the process Kazakhization, majority of Russian population have chosen a different part and preferred to infiltrate and to adapt to the new political system. The growth of authoritarianism that is inherent to the Central Asian countries discriminates against Russians in Kazakhstan that creates a problem in determining the policy rate. On the one hand there is the preponderance towards democratization, it can be observed in connection with the establishment of the Assembly but on the other hand there is a tendency in the direction of authoritarianism which tends to be inclusive role of the party president's Nur-Otan.

## Chapter 3

### POLITIC STATUS OF MINORITIES

#### 3.1 Language Policies as a Vehicle of Institutionalizing New Ethnic Relations

Language serves as a policy tool in many ways. It is starting from a political ideology and is rhetoric, ending with the consolidation and the formation of a nation that will act as the subject of the political process. Language Policy Strategy is usually designed and implemented by the state, but the choice of strategy does not occur randomly, since the prevailing linguistic situation is connected with the trends and processes within the state.<sup>61</sup> In the case of Kazakhstan, the processes in the country are the result of Russification as a result of disappeared from the political, economic, social, cultural areas except from small towns Kazakh language.<sup>62</sup>

It should be noted that the language is not only an instrument in the policy implementation of any state but also with the help of language it maintains the horizontal integration of ethnic and vertical intra-ethnic segregation. This process is inherent in all post-Soviet countries, particularly in Kazakhstan where the language issue is keenly felt after the collapse of the Union. Temirkhan Medetbevko, a Kazakh poet, lamented that: “Kazakh language space has receded more than the Aral Sea,

---

<sup>61</sup>Dyatlenko, “Language Policy And Language Reforms In The State And Nation-Building”, *AnaliticheskiiObzor. SotsiologicheskoeObozrenie*, no. 63 (2007):49

<sup>62</sup>Henry E. Hale, "Cause Without A Rebel: Kazakhstan's Unionist Nationalism In The USSR And CIS", *Nationalities Papers* 37, no. 1 (2009): 1-32

and its atmosphere has been more destroyed and polluted than uranium production site after a bomb blast.”<sup>63</sup>

Also, the Minister of Culture Mukhtar Kul-Muhammed said:

In the Soviet era, and sometimes even now, dialogue in Kazakh language was considered a sign of backwardness, ignorance of the Russian language. And now we have to neutralize these negative stereotypes and to form an idea that knowledge of the Kazakh language - is a sign of success, freedom, excellence and professional benefits.<sup>64</sup>

So, after the collapse of the Soviet Union for 2/3 Kazakhs, Russian language was their mother tongue, 60.5% of the population recognized the Russian language as the second language and of those 60% actually Russian was the first language. This fact is confirmed by the fact that in 1989 the number of students in Russian schools was 2.2 times more than students in the Kazakh language schools.<sup>65</sup> The positions of the Russian language was also strongly supported by the northern and eastern regions of the country and ranged from 69% to 80.5%.<sup>66</sup> Language policy has become one of the key factors in Kazakhization policy and has become a crucial factor of national identity in Kazakhstan.

---

<sup>63</sup>Matuszkiewicz, "The Language Issue In Kazakhstan—Institutionalizing New Ethnic Relations After Independence", *Economic And Environmental Studies*, no. 102 (2010): 211-227

<sup>64</sup>Benefits Of Rusification- From Pribaltics to Kazakhstan, Radio Azattyk (04 December, 2015)

Retrieved from

<http://rus.azattyq.org/content/plody-rusifikatsii-ot-pribaltiki-do-kazahstana/25329033.htm>

<sup>65</sup>Khazanov, "After the USSR. Ethnicity, Nationalism, and Politics In The Commonwealth Of Independent States", The University Of Wisconsin Press, (1996):159

<sup>66</sup>Panarin, "Russian-Speaking Russian At The External Borders: Challenges And Responses (On Example Kazakhstan)*Diaspory*, no. 2-3 (1999): 145-146.



A new basis for the definition of new ethnic relations was the two constitutions. These constitutions in 1993, 1995, the new Law on Languages in 1997, two important presidential laws, the 1996 Concept of Language Policy, and the 1998 Presidential Decree on Functioning and Development of Languages and the draft of the “State program of functioning and development of languages for 2011-2020” which sets the task to increase the number of people who speak the Kazakh language, up to 95 percent.<sup>67</sup>

Changes occurred in the 1993 Constitution, when the Kazakh language was assigned the status of state language but Russian language was declared under the constitution, the language of inter-national communication. Subsequent changes at legislative level occurred in 1997 with acceptance of the Law on Languages of the Republic of Kazakhstan.<sup>68</sup> The Kazakh language still occupies a priority position, endowed with the status of the state language it is clearly defined in the law and the context of use covers unlimited provision (Article 7 of the Constitution). Russian language in this law takes the position of the official language and there are no restrictions on the use of the Russian language but there are some differences.<sup>69</sup>

Firstly, was stressed the priority status of the Kazakh language. The new law had the task of translating the entire office into the Kazakh language. The reasons for the translation workflow into the Kazakh language were the fact that by 1990 more than

---

<sup>67</sup>Benefits Of Rusification- From Pribaltics to Kazakhstan, Radio Azattyk (04 December, 2015). Retrieved from <http://rus.azattyq.org/content/plody-rusifikatsii-ot-pribaltiki-do-kazahstana/25329033.htm>

<sup>68</sup>Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan from July, 11th, 1997 № 151-I About languages in the Republic of Kazakhstan <http://www.kaznu.kz/ru/1969>

<sup>69</sup>Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan [http://www.akorda.kz/ru/official\\_documents/constitution](http://www.akorda.kz/ru/official_documents/constitution)

half of office was conducted in Russian language. The process of translation workflow is carried out slowly with minor modifications.

Secondly, the Kazakh language was introduced in areas such as the media, on TV, on TV and radio channels. The use of the Kazakh language implies an increase in the scope of use of the native language and the gradual replacement of Russian into Kazakh language.

Thirdly, there was a change in education sphere. This included an increase in Kazakh schools; the reason for increasing the number of Kazakh schools was also the Soviet past. In 1960, with the efforts of the Soviet government schools with Kazakh language learning were closed.<sup>70</sup> There is an increase in the number of kindergartens, the methods of teaching the Kazakh language and the replacement of the alphabet with Latin alphabet.

Despite the leading position of the Russian language at the moment and its dual status, and other languages. Violation of language rights is prohibited under Article 14 of the Constitution and Article 7 of the Law on Languages. Every citizen of Republic of Kazakhstan has the right to use his / her native language, freely choose his / her language of communication, childrearing, education and creative activities.<sup>71</sup>

---

<sup>70</sup>Henry E. Hale, "Cause Without A Rebel: Kazakhstan's Unionist Nationalism In The USSR And CIS", Nationalities Papers 37, no. 1 (2009): 1-32

<sup>71</sup>Smagulova, "KAZAKHSTAN: Language, Identity And Conflict". *Innovation 19*, no. 3-4 (2006): 303-320

Nevertheless, despite the legal regulations were recorded cases of discrimination, for instance: “as Rosbalt wrote in 2013 passenger of Kazakh airline, hit the Russian flight attendant because she had no knowledge of Kazakh. Also, Nurlan Nogayev who is the head of West Kazakhstan region chastised the Director of airlines for the fact that his employees do not know the Kazakh language.”<sup>72</sup>

The language policy of Kazakhstan in spite of the democratic shell is mandatory. According to the law on languages in Article 4 reads as follows: “It is the duty of every citizen of the Republic of Kazakhstan to master the state language” and is supported by a statement by the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan: “This is a tribute to the fact that in the past, the evil, the issue of development of the Kazakh language and culture has been damaged,” - he said at the meeting of the Assembly of People of Kazakhstan. He stressed that it is a necessary “goal - to ensure that the state language is mastered by all the citizens of Kazakhstan to the government.”<sup>73</sup>

“The challenge is that by 2017 the number of Kazakhs who have mastered the state language, has reached at least 80%, and by 2020 - at least 95%. After 10 years, 100% of school graduates will possess state language.”<sup>74</sup> For any state language policy it takes a lot of time and effort but it remains unchanged position of the Kazakh language in the Constitution. Article 7 of the Constitution provides the Kazakh

---

<sup>72</sup>After Crimea there is no necessity to learn Kazakh language, Rosbalt (26 November, 2015). Retrieved from <http://www.rosbalt.ru/exussr/2014/04/08/1254081.html>.

<sup>73</sup>Benefits Of Rusification- From Pribaltics to Kazakhstan, Radio Azattyk (04 December, 2015). Retrieved from <http://rus.azattyq.org/content/plody-rusifikatsii-ot-pribaltiki-do-kazahstana/25329033.htm>

<sup>74</sup>Trukhachev, "Kazakhstan speeds up de-Russification", Pravda. Ru, 2011 (12 November, 2015). Retrieved from <http://www.pravda.ru/world/formerussr/other/28-01-2011/1065025-kazakhstan-0/>.

language the status of state language and Russian language leaves this position unclear.<sup>75</sup> Language policy has progressed slowly but has a positive change. Despite elevating Russian from a language of inter-ethnic communication the Kazakh elite and government firmly insist on Kazakh being the sole state language. The aim of this legislation is to improve the status of Kazakh in relation to Russian on the basis that Kazakh has been treated as a minority language in its own titular republic.<sup>76</sup>

In fact, language is a tool of state policy impact on people and however, the Russian minority criticizes the fact that the ongoing nationalization in the country is not only linguistic, but also ethnic.<sup>77</sup> Kazakh people are the Russian-speaking people, despite the policy of the state. They are actually much more a Russian-speaking than a Kazakh-speaking people. For most people, the status and the position of the language does not matter as the inter-ethnic harmony in the country remains stable and the Russian people for the Kazakh people is a close but the language problem remains one of the major unsolved problems of the state.

### **3.2 Migration Policy**

Political, social and economic transformation in the territory of the former Soviet Union took place in the last decade of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. Formation of a new state in the Republic of Kazakhstan led to a sharp intensification of migration processes. An important objective of the policy was the Kazakhization migration policy. In the

---

<sup>75</sup>Kurganskaya, "Kazakhstan: Language Problem In The Context Of Inter-Ethnic Relations"(02 December, 2015) accessed online <http://www.ca-c.org/journal/cac-06-1999/kurganskaja.shtml>

<sup>76</sup>Smagulova, "KAZAKHSTAN: Language, Identity And Conflict". *Innovation* 19, no. 3-4 (2006): 303-320

<sup>77</sup>Sébastien, "Nationhood And The Minority Question In Central Asia. The Russians In Kazakhstan". *Europe-Asia Studies* 59, no. 3 (2007): 481-501

Address of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan to the people of Kazakhstan dated in March 1, 2006:

Kazakhstan Strategy of entering the 50 most competitive countries of the world. Kazakhstan on the threshold of a new leap forward in its development, the need for a modern migration policy concept was put forward as the main priority the promotion of Kazakhstan among the most competitive and dynamically developing countries of the world.<sup>78</sup>

By 1989 the share of the title, the Kazakh population was the lowest compared to the other states of the former Soviet Union. The total number was 39.7%. The low number of ethnic Kazakhs were due to historical factors and a further reduction in the population was due to the emigration of Russian population. Between 1989 and 1999, 1 million 400 thousand of Russians have left Kazakhstan, while the overall out-migration during that period was 1 million 800 thousand. Kazakhstan's population shrank; a state of 17 million before the Independence became a state of 15 million after the Independence.<sup>79</sup> Only by 1999, according to the first national census, the share of the Kazakh population increased to 53.4% and the share of Russian population decreased to 40.2%. Also, the proportion of urban Kazakh population which was 45.1% and the share of Kazakh population in the north of the country increased from 24.6 to 34.1%, in the east - from 38.9 to 48.5%. Gradual population growth led to this by 2007 according to the National Statistics Committee of the Kazakh population increased to 59.1%.<sup>80</sup>

---

<sup>78</sup>Galimova, "Questions of State Regulation of Migration Processes Of Repatriation in The Republic Of Kazakhstan", Reporter of Tomsk State University (2011):116

<sup>79</sup>Matuszkiewicz, "The Language Issue In Kazakhstan—Institutionalizing New Ethnic Relations After Independence", Economic And Environmental Studies, no. 102 (2010): 211-227

<sup>80</sup>Panarin, "Modern Kazakhstan: Social And Cultural Factors Of Changes In The Position Of The Russian Language", Reporter of Eurasia, no. 4 (2008): 67

Population growth was characterized by a sharp increase in interstate migration, emigration of ethnic Kazakhs from abroad to their homeland and increased flow from the countryside to the cities. According to information from 1991 to 2011 824,170 people have returned to Kazakhstan. The main flow of oralmans comes from neighboring countries, where there are a large number of Kazakh diaspora like Uzbekistan - 126,790 families, PRC - 25764, Mongolia - 22124 Turkmenistan - 16232, Russia - 11065, Tajikistan - 2756 families.<sup>81</sup>

The Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan adopted laws regulating migration processes. These include the Law "On Citizenship" of 20 December 1991, Presidential Decree "On the Legal Status of Foreign Citizens in the Republic of Kazakhstan" dated 19 June 1995, Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On the procedure for granting political asylum to foreign citizens and persons without citizenship in the Republic of Kazakhstan" dated 15 July 1996, Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On the order of consideration of issues related to the citizenship of Kazakhstan" dated September 27, 1996.<sup>82</sup>

---

<sup>81</sup>Bokayev, Nurlanovich and Zharkynbekova, "Returnees Kazakhstan: Ethnolinguistic Identity and Integration into Society. Sociological searchers, no. 11 (2011): 54-60

<sup>82</sup>Law of the republic of Kazakhstan "On migration" (with alterations and amendments as of 11.24.2015), (20 October,2015) accessed online from [http://online.zakon.kz/Document/?doc\\_id=31038298](http://online.zakon.kz/Document/?doc_id=31038298)

Law of the republic of Kazakhstan "On population migration" of December 13, 1997 N 204-I as amended by the laws of RK dated 01.03.01, N 160-II; from 10.11.01, N 255-II, from 12.24.01, N 276-II, from 27.03.02, N 313-II, (20 October,2015) accessed online from

<http://reflaw.narod.ru/HTMLs/lows/kazakh/migr.htm>

Law of the republic of Kazakhstan "On population migration came into force", December 17, 1997 (20 October,2015) accessed online from

<https://www.google.ru/url>

One of the first decisions that regulate the migration process and the development of migration processes in Kazakhstan was the adoption of the Cabinet of the Kazakh SSR decrees of Ministers № 711 “On the procedure and conditions for resettlement in the Kazakh SSR persons of indigenous nationality who have expressed a desire to work in rural areas, from other republics and foreign countries”, dated November 18, 1991. This law provides for the grant of benefits for persons of the indigenous nationality who arrived from other republics in the collective state farms and businesses. This was an auxiliary process to fill the workforce deficiencies which were acute in connection with the emigration of Russian-speaking population from the country. Under this law through the labor agreement in Kazakhstan during the period from 1991 to 1992, came to 13 188 families or 61 609 people.<sup>83</sup>

The following law was enacted June 26, 1993 Law "On Immigration" which laid the foundations of the migration policy in Kazakhstan after independence. Under the law persons of the Kazakh Diaspora who have returned to connect with their historical homeland were given refugee status. For another group of people who were indigenous but left the territory of Kazakhstan as a result of historical events such as repression, violent persecution measures were given the status of repatriated refugees. Another group of people had the status of immigrants. Kazakh state created favorable conditions of stay for all three groups of people This included the right to receive assistance for each family member including payments to pensioners in the

---

<sup>83</sup>Bonnenfant, “Constructing the homeland: Kazakhstan's discourse and policies surrounding its ethnic return-migration policy”, *Central Asian Survey* Vol. 31, No. 1 (2012):

amount of the estimated figure of 50% of the minimum wage, providing medical care and temporary residence in certain places of residence.<sup>84</sup>

Period from 1997-2004 was the next step in matters of public policy on the regulation of migration flows.<sup>85</sup> Migration policy is reflected in state Kazakhstan's development strategy which has the name "Kazakhstan – 2030". Migration processes have become one of the top priorities of Kazakhstan's policy that provided the impetus for optimizing the national legislation in the field of migration.

Further development of the legal framework has led to the adoption of the Act of 1997 "On migration of population" which was to cover a wider range of migration issues in the country and take into account the international legal acts in the area of migration and emigration. In the new law there is such a term as "Oralman", which means "returnee".<sup>86</sup> In accordance with the new law have been allocated quotas and compensation. The new law provided for the adjusted system of reception of repatriates as the envisaged measures aimed for adoption in Kazakhstan, such as resettlement, adaptation, already defined settlement areas.<sup>87</sup>

Migration policy in Kazakhstan can be considered a success since a large number of Kazakhs were returned to their historic homeland; favorable conditions for their

---

<sup>84</sup>Kasten, "Recruiting for the Nation: Post-Soviet Transnational Migrants in Germany and Kazakhstan", *Rebuilding Identities* (2005): 164

<sup>85</sup>Diener, "Kazakhstan's Kin State Diaspora: Settlement Planning and the Oralman Dilemma", *Europe-Asia Studies*, Vol. 57, No. 2 (2005): 334

<sup>86</sup>Cerny, "Going where the grass is greener: China Kazaks and the Oralman immigration policy in Kazakhstan", *Practical Action Publishing* Vol. 1 No. 1 (2010): 223

<sup>87</sup>Galimova, "Questions Of State Regulation Of Migration Processes Of Repatriation In The Republic Of Kazakhstan". *VestnikTomskogoGosudarstvennogoUniversiteta*, (2011):114



development in the new location were provided and led to the increasing of Kazakh population.

### **3.3 Civil Service**

One of the conditions of language policy in Kazakhstan was the introduction of the Kazakh language in the sphere of public service and was to be one of the conditions for employment. Presidential Concept of the Language Policy 1996 outlined steps for the promotion of the Kazakh language in a dominant position. The document envisaged that a list of professions and positions should be prepared for which the knowledge of the state language would be necessary. This list should then be set forth in the laws of the Republic. This was an attempt to create strong economic and social incentives for people to master Kazakh language, but also it could be a tool of excluding those, who failed to master it.<sup>88</sup>

In response to the introduction of the Kazakh language in certain areas of the public service and in employment drew criticism. Thus, Nurbulat Masanov, one of the most well known opponents of the president, had often criticised the building of an 'ethnocracy'. By marginalising the Russian minority, the Kazakh elite monopolise many positions in the economy and in the cultural field that were formerly occupied by Russians. Such discrimination also guarantees social promotion to part of the Kazakh population, making them trust the political authorities in a period of economic difficulties and deterioration of the standard of living.<sup>89</sup>

---

<sup>88</sup>Matuszkiewicz, "The Language Issue In Kazakhstan—Institutionalizing New Ethnic Relations After Independence", *Economic And Environmental Studies*, no. 102 (2010): 211-227

<sup>89</sup>Sébastien. "Nationhood and the minority question in Central Asia. The Russians in Kazakhstan." *Europe-Asia Studies* 59.3 (2007): 481-501.

Criticism can not be considered unreasonable because if you look at the real picture we can see that according to the results of the data of sociologists which were based on the ethnic division of labor, the overall picture is a that is currently in control of the Kazakhs share is 80%. Thus, 80% of jobs in administrative and academic circles occupied by Kazakhs. For Kazakh population it is a favorable condition for realization themselves in different spheres but for the Russian-speaking population, this means the loss of vacancies and partial discrimination. Difficulties has appeared towards Russian-speaking population in the process of implementation. According to the officials under the guise of monitoring the implementation of the law on languages violate social justice, prejudice the rights of national minorities. The language question becomes the result of the division of society into "us" and "them". In cases in employment especially in management, scientific and educational structure, while advancing through the ranks, "his" in the opinion of non-titular nations have the advantage over them because the overall picture is a predominance of the indigenous nationality in the civil service and in the higher echelons of power . According to the Russian-speaking population the Language Act provides for the promotion of only indigenous nation and the South Kazakhstan region is an example of ethnic discrimination in employment.

We can not exclude cases where the Kazakh language is the main criteria and conditions for admission to the civil service that automatically excludes Russian-speaking population from the list of candidates for the post. Proficient knowledge of Kazakh (the level of proficiency is determined by a special committee) is required

for the positions of President and the Chair of the parliament.<sup>90</sup> However, this creates unequal conditions for candidates to work in the state bodies that secures its leadership of the Kazakh ethnic group in the labor market.<sup>91</sup>

### **3.4 Conclusion**

Kazakhization policy include changes in a language policy, immigration policy and changes in the position of hiring in the public service. Due to the language policy there is a gradual return of the native language in the masses and more widespread use of the Kazakh language that was lost during the Soviet era. Migration policy has provided the demographic growth of the population which is also a result of the brutal policy of the share of Kazakh population was reduced. Migration policy contributes to transforming of population to a mono-ethnic state, returns the Kazakhs to their historical homeland by providing natural increase of the Kazakh population.

Kazakhstan has chosen a policy that ensures the Kazakh population with all necessary conditions for a favorable rate. In considering the various models, strategies, methods, implementation of the language policy must take into account the relationship with the linguistic identity of the ethnic, cultural and regional citizens belonging. Therefore language policy consequences could be an extremely dangerous tool in politics. Despite the current policy Kazakhization Kazakhstan is gently working towards language in order to meet the interests of all ethnic groups of the population.

---

<sup>90</sup>Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan of July 23, 1999 № 453-I, ‘About Civil Service’(14 October, 2015) accessed online from: [http://online.zakon.kz/Document/?doc\\_id=1013958](http://online.zakon.kz/Document/?doc_id=1013958)

<sup>91</sup>Kurganskaya, "Kazakhstan: Language Problem In The Context Of Inter-Ethnic Relations"(02 December, 2015) accessed online: <http://www.ca-c.org/journal/cac-06-1999/kurganskaja.shtml>

The language situation that has developed in Kazakhstan tied in a tight knot of the most acute problems of interethnic relations. Law on Languages and regulations often become a tool of discrimination on linguistic grounds, regardless of the purposes of the sincere desire of the Government. The language issue is a catalyst for ethnic confrontation in other social spheres. As we can observe one of the criteria to the political position to the state apparatus is necessary knowledge of the state language. In general, it cannot be considered as a way of rejection or other Russian population. This policy is carried out in order to increase the number of people who own official language. Attempts by the state to re-create a new model of the state which will be restored disappeared status of the Kazakh people will ultimately be successful. Incremental steps will bring tangible results in the implementation of the planned course of Kazakhization.

## Chapter 4

### KAZAKHSTAN FOREIGN POLICY IN RUSSIAN CONTEXT

#### 4.1 Relationship between Russia and Kazakhstan

Before the collapse of the Soviet Union led by Russia policy towards Central Asia had an aggressive policy which was aimed at increasing the influence for the purpose of Russification region but as a consequence of the internal contradictions the Soviet Union fell apart. Since then, all efforts by Russia tries to regain its former position in the region.<sup>92</sup>

The collapse of the Soviet Union, which turned the Central Asian countries into independent states left difficulties in of national interests, foreign policy priorities, had no experience of statehood traditions, experience of independent foreign policy was formed. Also, the collapse of the Soviet Union led to volatility and instability of the international situation in post-Soviet Central Asia and Kazakhstan in particular it transformed the region in the intersection of the interests of neighboring countries, which led the Central Asian countries to exacerbating addiction balancing external influences. Special importance is attached to international relations in the Russian context as the central Asian region to Russia in particular, Kazakhstan is one of the

---

<sup>92</sup>Lifan and Din, "Geopolitical Interests of Russia, The US And China In Central Asia". Central Asia and Caucasus, no. 3 2004, (14 January,2016)  
Accessed online from [http://www.ca-c.org/journal/2004/journal\\_rus/cac-03/17.lifrus.shtml](http://www.ca-c.org/journal/2004/journal_rus/cac-03/17.lifrus.shtml)

most important directions of foreign policy. For Russia, the Central Asian region is considered in the context of the overall strategy in the CIS which has been put forward by Russian President “Affirming the strategic course of the Russian Federation with the states of the Commonwealth of Independent States” of 14 February 1995. According to the document in the CIS are concentrated the most important vital interests of Russia which includes the area of the economy, security, defense, protection of the rights of Russian citizens. For Russia, cooperation in the field of security is the most advanced area of foreign policy. This fact can be explained by the fact that Central Asian countries are in close proximity to Afghanistan and until the Afghan center of instability threat of proliferation in Central Asia is fixed no country can feel safe.<sup>93</sup> The Russian leadership is well aware of this fact has been active in the policy of rapprochement with Central Asian countries and Kazakhstan and is a mandatory attribute of outward orientation that is certainly appropriate despite the fact that for 1990 Kazakhstan and other Central Asian countries tended to reduce Russia's ability to provide the country's influence to this day remain a reliable ally of Russia especially Kazakhstan.

The basic factor that has had an impact on the formation of foreign policy of Kazakhstan presence of long borders with Russia, and a high proportion of Slav population which by early 1992 totaled 7.3 million people (43.4%) of the population.<sup>94</sup> Preserving the territorial integrity of the country through to develop as an independent sovereign state, it was announced the main purpose of strategy of

---

<sup>93</sup>Nikonov, “Russia's Policy In Central Asia”. Central Asia and Caucasus”, no. 8 (1997) (15 January, 2016) accessed online from [http://www.ca-c.org/journal/08-1997/st\\_12\\_nikonov.shtml](http://www.ca-c.org/journal/08-1997/st_12_nikonov.shtml)

country. New international relations with neighboring countries such as Russia demanded a skilful foreign policy and maneuvering that was intended to balance the interests of Russia in relation to Kazakhstan. The formation of Kazakhstan's foreign policy can not but mention the skill of the Kazakh leader Nazarbayev and Foreign Minister K.K. Tokayev, who maintaining close economic ties with Russia in the sphere of military security and ensuring the safety of loyalty to Moscow, they have actually consent of the Russian leadership to build a mono-ethnic state in Kazakhstan, Russia's refusal to have the idea of dual citizenship for Russian-speaking population.<sup>95</sup>

Despite the fact that Kazakhstan identifies itself as a “Central Asian state with obvious signs of Eurasianism” builds a close, special relationship with Russia. Close relations with Russia have value for Kazakhstan and served primarily as a tool to maintain stability of the regime and strengthening the country's sovereignty. Kazakhstan is seen through the lens of the geopolitical interests of the vast country that has a favorable geostrategic position. Russia is well aware that Kazakhstan is rich in natural resources that can ensure future needs are not only of one nation.<sup>96</sup> For Russia, Kazakhstan is a priority in its foreign policy. This trend is caused by the fact that the territory of Kazakhstan is home to the largest number- Russian compatriots, since the USSR had invested resources to develop it, it has the longest land border with Russia, the nature of the Kazakh economy which has a liberal and dynamic development, Kazakhstan also focuses an important object space infrastructure called Cosmodrome which uses Russians on loan. Russia is connected

---

<sup>95</sup>Troitsky, "Kazakhstan's Foreign Policy: FORMATION AND DEVELOPMENT", Reporter of Toms State University, 337, (2010):18

<sup>96</sup>Babak, "Astana in the Triangle of Moscow-Washington-Beijing". Central Asia and Caucasus 5, no. 6 (1996):6

with Kazakhstan closer economic cooperation, migration flows, and for Russia to preserve and consolidate its influence is a necessary part of the efforts aimed at strengthening the position in the international arena. For Russia, an important element is to maintain the security of the Kazakh-Russian border are directly connected on the developments in the entire region of Central Asia.

Kazakhstan and Russia do not only have a military alliance but mainly economic ties. So, in 2006, it was formally established Eurasian Development Bank in order to promote economic development, expand trade, promote direct investment and exemption territory of Kazakhstan and Russia from any tax duties and taxes.<sup>97</sup> Among all the countries of the former Soviet Union, Kazakhstan is the most active participant of integration processes and association with Russia. This includes the Eurasian Economic Community, Customs Union, CSTO, is involved in the formation of a single economic space.<sup>98</sup> Kazakhstan and Russia at the moment there are 120 agreements. For example, such agreements as the Treaty on Friendship, Cooperation and Mutual Assistance between the Russian Federation and the Republic of Kazakhstan (Moscow, 05/25/92), Agreement between the Russian Federation and the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan on free trade (Moscow, 10/22/92), Agreement between the Russian Federation and the Republic of Kazakhstan on the principles of mutual technical and material support of the Armed Forces of the Russian Federation and the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Minsk, 01.22.93), the Treaty on Further Deepening of Integration and

---

<sup>97</sup>Ziyadullayev, "Russia's Cooperation with Central Asia In The Framework Of Regional Organizations (Eurasec, SCO And Others.)".

RossiskiVneshneekonomicheskiVestnik, no. 10 (2006): 36

<sup>98</sup>Dolenko, Konichenko and Petukhov, "CIS As A Priority Of Russia", Social-political science, no. 1 (2012):135-138



Economic Cooperation between the Russian Federation and the Republic of Kazakhstan. Moscow, 03/28/94 and others.<sup>99</sup>

## **4.2 Russia Reach to Ethnic Conflict through Protecting of Russian Minorities on the Example of South Osetiya, Crimea**

USSR is a complex issue towards to ethnic structure. The end of “Cold War” brought the growth of internal armed conflicts in the former Soviet republics. Increase the growth of ethnic conflicts. The problem of inter-ethnic conflict is the most urgent in the last decades. Such conflicts are intractable and a source of political instability. The main focus of the spread of inter-ethnic clashes became the North and South Caucasus, and at the present stage to the problems of inter-ethnic relations was added Ukraine. It is important to note that in its genesis and forms of occurrence of ethnic conflicts in the former Soviet Union exhibit considerable similarities. All these conflicts have been caused by the territorial disintegration of the USSR and the collapse of the communist ideology, which came to replace the ideology of ethnic nationalism; they have resulted in armed confrontation and resulted in human casualties and refugee flows.<sup>100</sup>

The collapse of the world socialist system has led to a sharp aggravation of contradictions, political instability, and it affected those countries and regions which have multi-ethnic composition of the population. An important role in exacerbating conflicts plays a national self-determination. During the conflicts in South Ossetia

---

<sup>99</sup>Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Russia, 05/26/2008, “Operating agreements between Russian Federation and Kazakhstan”, Archive.Mid.Ru, (18 January, 2016) accessed online from <http://archive.mid.ru/ns-rsng.nsf/6bc38aceada6e44b432569e700419ef5/f80788b30b300de8c32574550047304e?OpenDocument>

<sup>100</sup>Bolshakov, "Frozen Conflicts, Post-Soviet Space: Puffins International Peacekeeping", *Politiya*, no. 1 (2008): 27-37

and Ukraine national self-determination has become a growth link. In addition to displays of affection national identity plays an important role manifestation of nationalism which can be called protective nationalism. Protective nationalism is inherent to the peoples and ethnic groups who have suffered from the oppression of other ethnic groups. This nationalism, is understanding and sympathetic, but also conceals the danger of breaking the bonds between neighbors, conflicts of various types.<sup>101</sup>

First we need to understand the meaning of "conflict" term. According to D.P. Zerkin: "conflict is a confrontation between public entities in order to implement their conflicting interests, attitudes, values and attitudes."<sup>102</sup> The most appropriate definition of conflict given A.Y. Antsupova and A.I. Shipilov: "A conflict is understood the sharpest way of resolving significant contradictions arising in the process of interaction, which consists in opposing the subjects of the conflict and is usually accompanied by negative emotions."<sup>103</sup>

Inter-ethnic conflicts are conflicts that occur between the individual members of a particular ethnic group or nation groups of different ethnicities and it is a confrontation between two or more ethnic groups. Inter-ethnic conflicts are usually sudden; they mature for a long time accompanied by specific historical events or phenomena. The causes of ethnic conflicts can be varied. Ethnic conflicts in the CIS

---

<sup>101</sup>Obertyayeva and Teslenko, "Ethnocentrism And Migration In The Multiethnic Russian Society." Vestnik Voronezhskogo Gosudarstvennogo Tehnicheskogo Universiteta, no. 102 (2014) (26 January, 2016) accessed online from <http://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/etnotsentrizm-i-migratsiya-v-polietnicheskom-rossiyskom-obschestve>

<sup>102</sup>Zerkin, "Basics of Conflict: Lectures". Feniks, no. 480 (1998): 38

<sup>103</sup>Antsupov and Shipilov, "Conflict: A Textbook for High Schools.".Unity, no. 551 (2000): 81

countries are always accompanied by the intervention of Russia and external forces such as the US. Firstly, consider the conflict in South Ossetia.

The conflict in South Ossetia has historical roots. The most important feature is the presence of a complex hierarchy of relations between small and large ethnic groups, elites. Ethnic conflict has two features in the region. The first of these is the historical conflict between the ethnic groups of the Caucasus; the second one is the denial of the possibility of ethnic groups within the boundaries of the new republic proclaimed on the basis of allegations that the new boundaries were established without the consent of a particular ethnic group. In our case, it is the South Ossetia ethnos. As a result of the collapse of the Soviet Union for the Ossetia people it was impossible to live together with Georgians because of fears of harassment and loss of identity. Since the early 1990s after the collapse of the Soviet Union in the new environment of confrontation between the new government of Georgia and the peoples of South Ossetia increased desire for separation from Georgia. It is meant to be an independent state separate from Georgia and to establish federal relations with Russia that is to join Russia. The obligation to respect the territorial integrity of lying is on Russia in 1996 and since 2005 on the basis of the UN Charter and general international law.<sup>104</sup>

During the period of the independent existence of Georgia aggravated relations between the Georgian titular nation and other ethnic groups. Inter-ethnic conflicts have led to the storming of Tskhinvali in 2008. The desire to separate South Ossetia from Georgia is contrary to the plans of Saakashvili who pursued the idea of

---

<sup>104</sup>Shtol. "Ukraine: Reform Or Collapse", Observer 5, 2014, 6-33

rebuilding Georgia. So, while the five-day war in 2008, Russia took the side of South Ossetia in 2004, when the Georgian leadership without permission under the pretext of fighting smuggling has introduced the special squad MVD of Georgia. By doing so, the Georgian leadership has sought to transfer the conflict from Georgian-Ossetia to Georgian-Russian in order to exclude Russia's role as a guarantor of peace in the region. In response to the actions of Saakashvili, the Russian government did not want to lose and lose South Ossetia region which may have an impact on Georgia takes the side of the unrecognized republic.

August 8, 2008 was marked by the decisive date of the conflict. Inter-ethnic conflicts have led to the invasion of Georgian troops in South Ossetia that provoked a reaction on the part of Russia. A fundamental factor also was the presence of Russian nationality, 95% of the citizens of South Ossetia. The presence of Russian citizenship and the presence on the territory of South Ossetia, Russians were the reason for the intervention of Moscow and the lever for the escalation of the conflict. This is what benefited Russian authorities saying that "cannot remain indifferent to the fate of the Russian citizens which components absolute majority of the population of South Ossetia."<sup>105</sup>

Hostilities led to a "five-day war" which has put in a difficult impasse international community. The conflict in Georgia has demonstrated the absence of mechanisms for conflict regulation. The resolution of the conflict contributed to the Russian intervention which put an end to the fighting. During the hostilities, the Georgian parliament recognized the peacekeeping missions and actions of Russia as an

---

<sup>105</sup>Jerman "Abkhazia and South Ossetia: the clash of Russian and Georgian interests", The program of searching in Russia and CIS (2006), accessed online 14 January, 2015 <https://www.google.com.cy/url>

undisguised annexation. War was the result of a natural recognition of the independence of Abkhazia and South Ossetia.<sup>106</sup>

The situation in Ukraine has a similarity with Georgia where mingled interests of states and inter-ethnic problems. As we know, in Ukraine live many nationalities but the main two groups are Ukrainians and Russian. Russian population settled in the territory of Ukraine for a long time since the Russian ancestors lived for centuries on the territory of Ukraine and, therefore, to say that the Russian people are not be strangers. The war in Ukraine has outgrown the stage of ethnic cleansing and Russian-speaking citizens.<sup>107</sup>

Events in Ukraine can be termed as illegitimate coup with the assistance of the special services and the United States authorities in cooperation with NATO. Initially the coup was directed against government corruption slogans but the further idea is to destroy the Russian began to appear among the claims. Under the guise of protests against corruption in the country and declining living standards was an active policy of Russophobia that has become the main ideology of the new Kiev leadership.<sup>108</sup> Russian began to be prosecuted on the basis of national loyalty. Slogans which read state, one nation, and one language have been put forward. One of the first decisions of the illegitimate government was depriving the Russian language regional status

---

<sup>106</sup>Markedonov, "Inter-Ethnic and Civil Conflicts And Xenophobia In The New Independent States Of The Former Soviet Union". *Academia*, no. 260 (2010): 40-47

<sup>107</sup>Conflict in Ukraine overgrown to the phase of the ethnic cleansing of Russian-speaking citizens- Security Council of Russia, *Vedomosti.Ru*, 2014, (1 September,2015). Retrieved from <https://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2014/07/17/konflikt-na-ukraine-pereros-v-stadiyu-etnicheskoj-chistki>.

<sup>108</sup>Markedonov, "Inter-Ethnic and Civil Conflicts And Xenophobia In The New Independent States Of The Former Soviet Union". *Academia*, no. 260 (2010): 40-47

even.<sup>109</sup> Against the background of this situation, cases of Russian death, burned alive, and of shooting were reported. Not having adequate resources and the inability to defend their rights pushed Ukraine to the Russian Lugansk and Donetsk region to take up arms and defend their interests. The result of an open harassment and discrimination become a requirement Russian Ukrainian federalization of Ukraine and consolidation of Russian as the state language status. As a result of the referendum was announced the creation of Donetsk and Lugansk republics as a historical region of Russia with further name is Novorussia.

February-March 2014 was a turning point for the Ukrainian-Russian relations and relations towards Russia. Occupation by the Russian Federation which is a permanent member of the UN Council of Safety part of the territory of Ukraine passed into the illegal annexation.<sup>110</sup> Ukrainian crisis the first thing had consequences for the Crimea. As a result of the war there was formation of the Crimean Federal District and Sevastopol, which has become the subject of the Russian Federation on the basis of the Decree of the President of Russia. The main argument served as a legitimizing factor of expression of the will of the people of Crimea. Russian methods were evaluated and the countries of Western Ukraine as an intervention in the internal borders of the state.<sup>111</sup>

---

<sup>109</sup>War in Donbas it is inter-ethnic conflict of russian people of Ukraine and fascist Ukrainian Nationalists, Buzina. Org, (15 October, 2016). Retrieved from <http://www.buzina.org/blogs/entry/>

<sup>110</sup>Zadorozhnyi, "The Consequences of The Annexation Of The Crimea By The Russian Federation For The International Legal Order". National Judicial Journal, (2014): 292-296

<sup>111</sup>Govrilov and Govrilov, "ACCESSION CRIMEAN UKRAINIAN RUSSIAN AS A CAUSE Aporia With The West." Reporter of Tomsk State University Phylosophy, Sociology, Politiogy 3 (31), (2015):91-92

### **4.3 Possible Reaction of Russia to Ethnic Oppression in Kazakhstan**

During the period of Soviet Union, millions of Russian living in Kazakhstan and did not feel a sense of discomfort or discrimination. Almost all local people spoke in Russian, studied textbooks on general as well as in Russia, there was a mixture of Russian people and the peoples of Asia and so far a significant part of Central Asia remain committed to the Russian culture. Even after the collapse of the Soviet Union, Kazakhstan's elite showed delicacy and great care in dealing with human rights issues in spite of the national identity. No state has gone the way of overt discrimination but nevertheless, this did not prevent mass migration and the discontent of Russian-speaking population due to manifestations of everyday nationalism. Household nationalism manifested in the search for work in non-Kazakh nation dismissal from their positions in the state apparatus. The outflow of the Russian-speaking population creates difficulties to some extent in Russia in connection with the resettlement of migrants in Kazakhstan in connection with the loss of qualified professionals and of course in the relations between states.

The problem of Russian-speaking population in Kazakhstan and other Central Asian countries are sensitive to Russia, and especially the State Duma that takes any statements on almost every real or perceived violations of the rights of Russian-speaking population in the host country. To this should be no less painful reaction of the leaders of the region and the growing perception of the Russian language as the "hand of Moscow". Ultimately, this perception could create a real problem in the relations between states. Much influenced by the Russian media that openly state about the problems in the neighboring countries of Central Asia and Kazakhstan that does not cause delight from the Central Asian countries where the media and

freedom of expression is limited. There is a question of maintaining a single information space. Even a supporter of integration, as the President of Kazakhstan Nursultan Nazarbayev has doubts its necessity if Central Asian countries in this area are not presented or presented in a negative light.<sup>112</sup>

Statements about Kazakhstan by Russian deputies have repeatedly appear especially after the annexation of Crimea to Russia. For example:“Speaking at a rally on February 23 in a live TV channel "Russia 24" deputy Vladimir Zhirinovskiy urged to deprive the independence of the Central Asian states.”<sup>113</sup>

Another example is the reaction of the Russian leadership is speech of the Russian President Putin. Quotes from the Russian leader Vladimir Putin, raise questions about the policy regarding national minorities as it is sworn to protect ethnic Russian around the world. This means that under the Putin doctrine might be millions of Russian, especially in countries of the former USSR. According to the program, Moscow has the right and obligation to protect the interests of Russian around the world.”<sup>114</sup> So, voiced by Vladimir Putin, the concept of "Russian World" is positioned by these forces as a declaration of the rights of Russia to interfere in the

---

<sup>112</sup>Nikonov, "Russia's Policy In Central Asia". Central Asia and Caucasus, no.8 (1997), (03 December, 2015) accessed online from

[http://www.ca-c.org/journal/08-1997/st\\_12\\_nikonov.shtml](http://www.ca-c.org/journal/08-1997/st_12_nikonov.shtml)

<sup>113</sup>Russian Foreign Ministry asked not to draw parallels between Crimea and Kazakhstan, 25 апреля 2014 , (02 December, 2015). Retrieved from

<http://www.rosbalt.ru/main/2014/04/25/1261671.html>

<sup>114</sup>Benefits Of Rusification- From Pribaltics to Kazakhstan, Radio Azattyk (04 December, 2015). Retrieved from

<http://rus.azattyq.org/content/plody-rusifikatsii-ot-pribaltiki-do-kazahstana/25329033.htm>



affairs of sovereign states under the pretext of protecting the rights of Russian-speaking citizens.<sup>115</sup>

Statement by the Russian leader could be called a direct threat to the countries who try to violate the rights of Russian at home. As we can see on the example of Ukraine, Georgia, the Russian government in the case of discrimination against the Russian population will make every attempt to invade the internal borders of the country guided by the fact that they want to protect the Russian population. Such a statement can be called a threat to Kazakhstan because Kazakhstan is home to the largest number of Russian-speaking population especially in the northern regions of the country. There are several possible scenarios, the most classical of which is predicated on the Kosovo, Ossetia pattern, when the local Russian population holds a plebiscite which affirms the creation of a Russian autonomy in the North of Kazakhstan.<sup>116</sup>

For example, even follow another source was recorder the case of possible annexation of Kazakhstan. According to Martha Brill Olcott: "After Ukraine most likely the target of Putin will be Kazakhstan. However, according to the scientist, this "intervention", is unlikely to happen until at the helm remains Nazarbayev maintains very close economic ties with Russia."<sup>117</sup>

---

<sup>115</sup>Mirzayan, "How to Kazakstan escape from Ukrainian scenario", Expert.Ru, 2014, (21 october, 2015). Retrieved from

<http://expert.ru/2014/09/26/ukrainskij-pretседent-ne-rabotaet-dlya-kazahstana/>

<sup>116</sup>Alec, "A propos of the Georgian war: reflections on Russia's revanchism in its near abroad: Themes." Journal of Balkan and Near Eastern Studies 11.1 (2009): 9-27

<sup>117</sup>After Crimea there is no necessity to learn Kazakh language, Rosbalt (26 November, 2015). Retrieved from

<http://www.rosbalt.ru/exussr/2014/04/08/1254081.html>.

In contrast to the countries of the former Soviet Union, such as Ukraine, Georgia, Kazakhstan has chosen a policy of maneuver with regard to national minorities, between cooperation with Russia and keeping Kazakhization policy that puts the interests of the public way the Kazakh people above all else. It is possible to assume that Kazakhization policy can cause a reaction on the part of the Russian leadership but until today the manifestation of any outbreak of discontent Kazakhstan tries to calm down a national minority. Revision in law about language, creating Assembly of People of Kazakhstan helps to reduce the likelihood of adverse reaction on the part of Russia but there is a risk in the northern areas of the country. Kazakhstan even experienced some significant secessionist trends in the mid1990s.<sup>118</sup> Secessionist trends have been taken by the Russian population. From this it follows that Kazakhstan remains vulnerable in matters of national minorities. According to official statistics, in 7 of 12 border regions, the Kazakhs are evidently the dominant ethnic group; in 2 of 12 regions this group remains numerically strong. The Russians form majorities in three northern regions: Kostanai, Pavlodar, and Northern Kazakhstan region.

After the conflict in Georgia and Ukraine, leadership of the former Soviet Union was concerned about the manifestation of such a reaction on the part of Russia. The consequences of the events in Ukraine may become a problem for Kazakhstan too. However, Putin's recent rhetoric and the heightened fear of a possible land grab put Kazakhstan at risk. The main condition of the Crimea Model that places Kazakhstan at risk is Kazakhstan's large ethnic Russian population. Kazakhstan has the largest

---

<sup>118</sup>Sébastien Peyrouse, "The "Imperial Minority": An Interpretative Framework Of The Russians In Kazakhstan In The 1990S", Nationalities Papers 36, no. 1 (2008): 105-123

ethnic Russian population in the Former Soviet Union, 25% of a 17.6 million population.<sup>119</sup>

Despite the large number of Russian population in contrast to other countries of the former Soviet Union, Kazakhstan leads in the last two years, the most successful foreign policy. Not wishing to antagonize, Kazakhstan expressed its "understanding" of the annexation of the Crimea, at the same time calling for the territorial integrity of Ukraine, Kazakhstan proves that balance to the two sides of the conflict.<sup>120</sup> After the conflict in Ukraine, there is a great probability of repetition of the scenario.

Also, because of the high number of Russian population in Kazakhstan by one of the Russian politicians was made a proposal. In February, politician Vladimir Zhirinovskiy, who was born in Kazakhstan, said: "the country should join to Russia as a "Central Asian Federal Region"." And a number of pro-Kremlin analysts have drawn analogies comparing Kazakhstan to Ukraine. "Northern Kazakhstan, which is primarily populated by Russians, could suffer the same fate of the southeast of Ukraine."<sup>121</sup>

Despite the greater the likelihood of Russia's invasion of Kazakhstan in the case of a bright flash of aggression towards the Russian one should not forget about the economic relations between the two countries. It is a strategically important partner for Russia to Kazakhstan. Rich reserves of Kazakhstan, such as oil, gas, Baikonur

---

<sup>119</sup>Brletich, "The Crimea Model: Will Russia Annex The Northern Region Of Kazakhstan?", *Geopolitics, History And International Relations*, no. 71 (2015): 11

<sup>120</sup>Ibid., 11

<sup>121</sup>Kucera, "North Kazakhstan Isn't The Next Crimea — Yet", *Aljazeera America*, (11 January, 2016). Retrieved from <http://america.aljazeera.com/articles/2014/6/19/north-kazakhstanisntthenextcrimeaayet.html>

cosmodrome will deter Russia from invading the territory of Kazakhstan. Kazakhstan in its turn is a dual policy that ensures the interests of the titular nation and at the same time is close co-operation with Russia because Russia has a military capability that is not available in Kazakhstan and carries out economic and political agreements. Russia is well aware of the value of the Kazakh-Russian relations and, therefore, the annexation of the northern regions of the country is disadvantageous for Russia. However, despite the official pronouncements, the future of Kazakhstan's Russian population remains a divisive issue between the two countries.<sup>122</sup>

#### **4.4 Conclusion**

Summing up the results of the above it can be said that the Soviet legacy has left the country in a difficult position. Population policy mix, forced migration made a certain part of the ethnic group reside in the territory of the country to which they do not wish to belong. Thus, ethnic self-determination process that was started with the collapse of the USSR and was formed by the Soviet model of power and control is still not over. Until final settlement of ethno-political conflicts in the former Soviet Union and the recognition of new boundaries, taking into account the desires of ethnic groups it can not be considered finally complete. The countries of the former Soviet Union are still in an incomplete process of the state and the real independence of the transition to democracy. This we can see in the example of Ukraine and Georgia, where in spite of the status of the country's independence remain heavily dependent on Russia. Well ill-considered steps such as open discrimination can lead to interference in internal affairs. Thus, the Russian intervention in the conflicts in Georgia and Ukraine causes loss of Georgian and Ukrainian authorities. In both

---

<sup>122</sup>Alec. "A propos of the Georgian war: reflections on Russia's revanchism in it's near abroad: Themes." *Journal of Balkan and Near Eastern Studies* 11.1 (2009): 9-27

cases, Russia has achieved independence and secession from the state in which they were. Russia could prove the seriousness and validity of their claims and once again dokazalasvoey status of a regional power in the region of the Greater Caucasus and throughout the former Soviet Union. Regarding Kazakhstan's assumption done early while there is a high probability of repetition of the scenario in Ukraine and South Ossetia. A sound policy of Kazakhstan at the moment leaves no choice but to cooperate. Despite the large proportion of the Russian population of Kazakhstan there is a policy of peaceful co-existence of all ethnic groups. Even the introduction of Kazakhization policy in response to dissatisfaction on the part of the Russian population attempted of revision. In turn, for Russia at the moment cooperation with Kazakhstan is above the issues of inter-ethnic problems.

## Chapter 5

### CONCLUSION

Kazakhstan is a young and dynamically developing state. Among all the countries of the former Soviet Union, Kazakhstan has the highest rate of the economy, diverse cooperation with various countries, the invested great space and favorable conditions for living. After the collapse of the Soviet Union, each state has developed in its principle as the USSR did not exist, there was no strict framework for development as it was in Soviet times, and each state has chosen its policy for the development of the state and people. Important role in the state is given to international relations in connection with a diverse ethnic composition.

The state policy of Kazakhstan based on the principles of the ethnic, cultural and religious diversity in the sphere of international relations and trying at the same time to create conditions for the development of the Kazakh language and culture. The main quality of the Kazakh people is tolerance, responsibility and unity of all peoples. The state policy of Kazakhstan carried out in the sphere of international relations is built in accordance with all international standards of human rights. Since the days of the USSR, Kazakhstan is a country that has been called the "the Laboratory of friendship of peoples."

The collapse of the Soviet Union led to the problem of choosing the model of inter-ethnic relations. Despite the fact that Kazakhstan has always been a state favorable

for the country of residence to all the peoples but the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan had to make some changes in the face of new Kazakhization policy. In Kazakhstan due to its small period of creating an ethnic card is not fully formed and it is caused by factors such as the rapid increase in the proportion of ethnic Kazakhs, Russian migration and the return of repatriates. Accelerating the pace of the program's Kazakhization lead to a mono-ethnic composition of the population with a small number of Russian leading to a constant dilemma in choosing a model of development pushed Kazakhstan to build a model of gradual steps where the ethnic population is highly valued. Maintaining the titular nation in all areas has become a priority and supported by the government and the president of the republic. Perhaps the reason was the Soviet past but we can see the tendency of maintaining friendly relations with Russia. Integration processes contribute to the development of the country. Among all the countries of the former Soviet Union integration processes in the republic is well developed. Integration potentials and opportunities is an integral vector of development of the state in the era of globalization.

Nevertheless, to nowadays there is a dilemma in the policy of Kazakhstan. It is torn between building a civic nation and ethnicity. On the one hand Kazakhstan chose the model in favor of an ethnic nation but revisions in the law says about the choice in favor of a civil nation. Each model has its pros and cons. For example, for the process of building of ethnic nation we can observe the possible deterioration of the situation of national minorities and first of all the Russian population. In the process of building the civil nation interest of ethnic nation is not fully accounted which is the contrary to the trend in the growing number of ethnic Kazakhs. For Kazakhstan, the reason of problems has causes due to Russian population of the country. Since Soviet times, has developed idea that the Russian people have always put their own

interests above others, Moscow's policy is fully supported by the dominant position of Russian and even contributed to the maintenance of such trend. Russian people are not accustomed to the role of a secondary nation because of the Soviet past and for Russian are difficult to accept that the current post-Soviet states have the goal of maintaining the titular nation. In all the countries of the former Soviet Union, Russian tend to dissatisfaction and can openly express their requirements but expressed dissatisfaction with Kazakhstan brighter than in other countries. The reason for this was the soft policy of Kazakhstan in comparison with other CIS countries which openly eradicate the Russian language from all spheres of life. In Kazakhstan, it happens gradually. Russian population as practice shows, is not ready for drastic changes, and is unlikely to be. For this reason, Kazakhstan can be considered among all the countries of post-Soviet state as a model of the solution of the national question.

Compared to other countries in Central Asia, ethnic atmosphere in the country seems to be a favorable and positive evaluation. The overall situation in the country in the sphere of interethnic relations is stable with the exception of local conflicts at the household level. Any outbreak growing discontent instantly solved by the president of the republic as it was in connection with the outflow of Russian population and adoption of a new constitution or acceptance of the Assembly of Peoples of Kazakhstan. It should be noted that Kazakhstan is the only country in the CIS where there were no clashes or conflicts in the national soil.

Despite the country's progress in the field of regulation of international issues, integration issues the authorities must continue to work hard in order to improve and development. Well thought-out policy is the key to the success of any nation and the



state must take into account the interests of all segments of the population and the interests of all peoples. The government and political structures must ensure provide at the state level the same rights and protection of rights for all citizens.

## REFERENCES

- [1] Antsupov, A., & Shipilov, A. (2000). Conflict: a textbook for high schools. *Unity* 4(551), 81.
- [2] After Crimea there is no necessity to learn Kazakh language. (2015, November 26 ). Retrieved from <http://www.rosbalt.ru/exussr/2014/04/08/1254081.html>.
- [3] Astrid, C. (2010). Going where the grass is greener: China kazakhs and the oralman immigration policy in Kazakhstan, practical action publishing. *Practical Action Publishing*, 1(1), 218-247.
- [4] The evolution of ethnocentric behavior. (2015, November 1). Retrieved from [http://wwwpersonal.umich.edu/~axe/research/AxHamm\\_Ethno.pdf](http://wwwpersonal.umich.edu/~axe/research/AxHamm_Ethno.pdf)
- [5] Babak, V. (1996). Astana in the triangle of Moscow-Washington-Beijing. *Central Asia and Caucas*, 2(6), 3-15.
- [6] Barbara, A. A. & Brian, D. S. (1983). Estimating russification of ethnic identity among non-russians in the USSR. *Demography*, 20(4), 461-489.
- [7] Midwest political science convention. (2015, November 1). Retrieved from [http://wwwpersonal.umich.edu/~axe/research/AxHamm\\_Ethno.pdf](http://wwwpersonal.umich.edu/~axe/research/AxHamm_Ethno.pdf).

- [8] Benefits of rusification-from Pribaltics to Kazakhstan. (2015, December 04). Retrieved from <http://rus.azattyq.org/content/plody-rusifikatsii-ot-pribaltiki-do-kazakhstanana/25329033.htm>
- [9] Kazakhstan, nations in transit. (2015, October 23). Retrieved from [https://freedomhouse.org/sites/default/files/inline\\_images/NIT-2011Kazakhstan.pdf](https://freedomhouse.org/sites/default/files/inline_images/NIT-2011Kazakhstan.pdf)
- [10] Bokayev, B., N. & Zharkynbekova Sh. (2010). Returnees Kazakhstan: ethnolinguistic identity and integration into society. *Sociological searchers*, 2(11), 54-60.
- [11] Bolshakov, A. (2008). Frozen conflicts post-soviet space: puffins international peacekeeping. *Politiya*, 23(1), 27-37.
- [12] Brian, S. (1974). Social mobilization and the russification of Soviet nationalities. *American Political Science Association*, 68 (1), 45-66.
- [13] Brletich, S. (2015). The Crimea model: will Russia annex the northern region of Kazakhstan?. *Geopolitics, History and International Relations*, 7(1), 11-29.
- [14] Carol, B. B., & Hody, S. A. (1995). *The Political change, the transformation of the former Soviet Union*. New York, NY: St. Martin's Press Inc.
- [15] Conflict in Ukraine overgrown to the phase of the ethnic cleansing of russian-speaking citizens - security council of Russia. (2015, September 1). Retrieved from

<https://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2014/07/17/konflikt-na-ukraine-pereros-v-stadiyu-etnicheskoj-chistki>.

[16] Constitution of the republic of Kazakhstan of 1993. (2015, December 20).

Retrieved from <https://ru.wikisource.org/wiki/>

[17] Constitution of the republic of Kazakhstan of 1995. (2015, December 21).

Retrieved from [http://www.akorda.kz/ru/official\\_documents/constitution](http://www.akorda.kz/ru/official_documents/constitution)

[18] Ethno-nationalism in the contemporary world. (2015, November 10). Retrieved

from [https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Daniele\\_Conversi/publication](https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Daniele_Conversi/publication)

[19] Colin, K. (2008). Kazakhstan: modernizing government in the context of political inertia. *International review of administrative sciences*, 74 (3), 477-496.

[20] Dave, B. (2003). Minorities and participation in public life: Kazakhstan. *UN Commission on human rights: sub-commission on promotion and protection of human rights, working groups on minorities*.

[21] Dolenko, D., Konichenko, Zh., & Petukhov, A. (2012). CIS as a priority of Russia. *Social-political science*, 2(1), 35-138.

[22] Diener, C. A. (2005). Kazakhstan's kin state diaspora: settlement planning and the oralman dilemma. *Europe-Asia studies*, 57 (2), 327-348.

- [23] Donnacha, Ó. B., & Kevlihan, R. (2011). State-building, identity and nationalism in Kazakhstan: some preliminary thoughts. *Working papers in international studies*. Centre for international studies.
- [24] Dyatlenko, P. (2007). Language policy and language reforms in the state and nation-building. *Analiticheskii obzor, sotsiologicheskoe obozrenie*, 6(63), 30-51.
- [25] Embassy of the Russian Federation to the republic of Kazakhstan, Russia-Kazakhstan. (2015, November 1). Retrieved from <http://www.rfembassy.kz/eng/lm>
- [26] Asserting statehood: Kazakhstan's role in international organizations. (2015, November 02). Retrieved from <http://www.silkroadstudies.org/publications/silkroad-papers-and-monographs/item/13178-asserting-statehood-kazakhstans-role-in-international-organizations.html>
- [27] Erich, K. (2005). *Recruiting for the nation: Post-Soviet transnational migrants in Germany and Kazakhstan*. Rebuilding identities. (2016, January 29). Retrieved from <http://www.siberian-studies.org/publications/PDF/ridarieva.pdf>
- [28] Fisher, L. R. (1989). Qazaqjylyq Nationalism and revolution in Kazakhstan, 1900-1920. *University of Montana Scholar Works*, 17(33), 48-215.
- [29] Galimova, A. (2011). Questions of state regulation of migration processes of repatriation in the Republic of Kazakhstan. *Vestnik Tomskogo Gosudarstvennogo Universiteta*, 4(32), 110-125.

- [30] Gang, I. N., & Schmillen, A. (2014). Sometimes, winners lose: economic disparity and indigenization in Kazakhstan. *Working Papers*, Econstor IOS No. 345.
- [31] Gary, K. B. & Cassady C. & Scott A. J. & Beck, M. (2000). *Crossroads and conflict security and foreign policy in the Caucasus and Central Asia*. Great Britain: Routledge.
- [32] Nations and Nationalism of Ernest Gellner. (2015, November 2). Retrieved from <http://www.people.fas.harvard.edu/~plam/irnotes07/Gellner1983.pdf>
- [33] How to Kazakhstan escape from Ukrainian scenario. (2015, October 21). Retrieved from <http://expert.ru/2014/09/26/ukrainskij-pretседent-ne-rabotaet-dlya-kazahstana/>
- [34] Govrilov, I. & Govrilov, A. (2015). Accession Crimean Ukrainian russian as a case aporia with the west. *Reporter of Tomsk State University. Phylosophy, sociology, politiogy*, 3(31), 91-120.
- [35] Guboglo, M. (2003). *Identification of identity, ethno-sociological sketches*. Moscow: The science.
- [36] Hale, H. E. (2009). Cause without a rebel: Kazakhstan's unionist nationalism in the USSR and CIS. *Nationalities Papers*, 37(1), 4-32.
- [37] Hastings, A. (1997). *The construction of nationhood. Ethnicity, religion and nationalism*. London: Cambridge University Press.

- [38] Isik, K. B. (2012). Constructing the homeland: Kazakhstan's discourse and policies surrounding its ethnic return-migration policy. *Central Asian Survey*, 31 (1), 31–44.
- [39] Jumageldinov, A. (2014). Ethnic identification, social discrimination and interethnic relations in Kazakhstan. *Procedia, social and behavioral sciences*, 114(2014), 410-414.
- [40] Judith, T. S. (2000). Diaspora migration: definitional ambiguities and a theoretical paradigm of international migration. *Blackwell publishers ltd*, 38 (5), 41-56.
- [41] Kappeler, A. (2004). The ambiguities of russification. *Slavica Publishers, Explorations in Russian and Eurasian history*, 5(2), 291-297.
- [42] Kellas, J. G. (1991). *The politics of nationalism and ethnicity*. London: MACMILLAN PRESS LTD.
- [43] Khazanov, A. M. (1996). After the USSR. ethnicity, nationalism, and politics in the commonwealth of independent states. *The UniTy. of Wisconsin Press*, 30(2), 150-399.
- [44] Kolsto, P. (1998). Anticipating demographic superiority: kazakh thinking on integration and nation building. *Europe-Asia studies*, 50 (1), 51-69.

- [45] Korobkova, A. V., & Zaionchkovskaia, Zh. A. (2004). The changes in the migration patterns in the post-soviet states: the first decade. *Elsevier. Communist and Post-Communist studies*, 37(4), 481-508.
- [46] Krishna-Hensel, S. F. (1999). *James G. Kellas, The politics of nationalism and ethnicity*. New York: Nationalism & ethnic politics .
- [47] Kazakhstan: Language problem in the context of inter-ethnic relations. (2015, December 02). Retrieved from [http://www.ca-c.org/journal/2004/journal\\_rus/cac-03/17.lifrus.shtml](http://www.ca-c.org/journal/2004/journal_rus/cac-03/17.lifrus.shtml)
- [48] Law of the republic of Kazakhstan “on migration”. (2015, October 20). Retrieved from [http://online.zakon.kz/Document/?doc\\_id=31038298](http://online.zakon.kz/Document/?doc_id=31038298)
- [49] Law of the republic of Kazakhstan “on population migration”. (2015, October 20). Retrieved from <http://reflaw.narod.ru/HTMLs/lows/kazakh/migr.htm>
- [50] Law of the republic of Kazakhstan from July, 11th, 1997 “about languages”. (2015, October 20). Retrieved from <http://www.kaznu.kz/ru/1969>
- [51] Law of the republic of Kazakhstan “on population migration came into force”. (2015, October 20). Retrieved from <https://www.google.ru/url>
- [52] Law of the republic of Kazakhstan of July 23, 1999 ‘about civil service’. (2015, October 14). Retrieved from [http://online.zakon.kz/Document/?doc\\_id=1013958](http://online.zakon.kz/Document/?doc_id=1013958)



- [53] Leslie, H, (1997). *Post-Communism. An introduction*. UK: Polity press.
- [54] Geopolitical interests of Russia, the US and China in Central Asia. (2016, January 14). Retrieved from [http://www.ca-c.org/journal/2004/journal\\_rus/](http://www.ca-c.org/journal/2004/journal_rus/)
- [55] Ministry of foreign affairs of Russia, 05/26/2008, operating agreements between Russian Federation and Kazakhstan. (2016, January 18). Retrieved from <http://archive.mid.ru//nsrsng.nsf/6bc38aceada6e44b432569e700419ef5/f80788b30b300de8c32574550047304e?OpenDocument>
- [56] Mac Laughlin, J. (2001). *Reimagining the nation-state the contested terrains of nation-building*. London: Pluto press.
- [57] Mark, R. B. (2002). *Nationalist mobilization and the collapse of the Soviet state*. London: Cambridge University Press.
- [58] Markedonov, S. (2010). Inter-ethnic and civil conflicts and xenophobia in the new independent states of the former Soviet union. *Academia*, 74(260), 40-47.
- [59] Matuszkiewicz, R. (2010). The language issue in Kazakhstan. institutionalizing new ethnic relations after independence. *Economic and environmental studies*, 10(2), 211-227.
- [60] Matveeva, A. (1999). Democratization, legitimacy and political change in Central Asia. *Wiley on behalf of the Royal institute of international affairs*, 75(1), 23-44.

- [61] Melvin, N. (1995). *Russians beyond Russia the politics of national identity*. London, United Kingdom: Royal institute of international affairs.
- [62] Russia's policy in Central Asia by Vechaslav Nikonov. (2016, January 15). Retrieved from [http://www.ca-c.org/journal/08-1997/st\\_12\\_nikonov.shtml](http://www.ca-c.org/journal/08-1997/st_12_nikonov.shtml)
- [63] Ethnocentrism and migration in the multiethnic Russian society. (2016, January 26). Retrieved from <http://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/etnotsentrizm-i-migratsiya-v-polietnicheskom-rossiyskom-obschestve>
- [64] Olcott, M. B. (2010). *Kazakhstan: unfulfilled promise*. Washington: Carnegie endowment for international peace.
- [65] Official site of the president of the republic of Kazakhstan. (2015, December 02). Retrieved from [http://www.akorda.kz/ru/official\\_documents/constitution](http://www.akorda.kz/ru/official_documents/constitution)
- [66] Özgecan, K. (2011). The dilemma in the nation-building process: the kazakh or kazakhstani nation?. *Journal on ethnopolitics and minority issues in Europe*, 10(1), 31-58.
- [67] Panarin, S. (1999). Russian-speaking russian at the external borders: challenges and responses on example Kazakhstan. *Diaspory*, 2(3), 130-150.
- [68] Panarin, S. (2008). Modern Kazakhstan: social and cultural factors of changes in the position of the russian language. *Reporter of Eurasia*, 2(4), 68-70.

- [68] Peyrouse, S. (2007). Nationhood and the minority question in Central Asia, the russians in Kazakhstan. *Europe-Asia Studies*, 59(3), 481-501.
- [69] Rasizade, A. (2009). A propos of the georgian war: reflections on russia's revanchism in its near abroad. *Journal of Balkan and Near Eastern studies*, 11(1), 9-27.
- [70] Renata, M. (2010). The language issue in Kazakhstan—institutionalizing new ethnic relations after independence. *Economic and environmental studies*, 10(2), 211-227.
- [71] After Crimea there is no necessity to learn kazakh language. (2015, November 26). Retrieved from <http://www.rosbalt.ru/exussr/2014/04/08/1254081.html>.
- [72] Roy, A. & Jonson, L. (2000). *Central Asian security. The new international context*. London: Royal institute of international relations.
- [73] Russian adapt to «kazakhization. (2015, December 25). Retrieved from <http://maxpark.com/community/politic/content/2663231>.
- [74] Russian foreign ministry asked not to draw parallels between Crimea and Kazakhstan. (2015, December 02). Retrieved from <http://www.rosbalt.ru/>
- [75] Sarsembayev, A. (1999). Imagined communities: kazakh nationalism and kazakification in the 1990s. *Central Asian Survey*, 18(3), 319-346.

- [76] Schatz, E. (2000). Framing strategies and non-conflict in multi-ethnic Kazakhstan. *Nationalism and ethnic politics*, 6(2), 71-94.
- [77] Sébastien, P. (2008). The “imperial minority”: an interpretative framework of the russians in Kazakhstan in the 1990s. *Nationalities papers*, 36(1), 105-123.
- [78] Shlomo, B. A. & Yoav, P. & Spektorowski, A. (2000). *Ethnic challenges to the modern nation state*. New York: Palgrave.
- [79] Shtol, V. (2014). Ukraine: reform or collapse. *Observer*, 4(5), 6-33.
- [80] Smagulova, J. (2006). Kazakhstan: language, identity and conflict. *Innovation*, 19(3-4), 303-320.
- [81] Smith, G. (1996). *The Nationalities question in the post-Soviet states*. United States of America, New York: Longman Group Limited.
- [82] Suleymenova, E. (2010). Russification as language homogenization of multilingual Kazakhstan. *Russian language journal*, 5(60), 210-240.
- [83] Surucu, C. (2002). Modernity, nationalism, resistance: identity politics in post-Soviet Kazakhstan. *Central Asian survey*, 21(4), 385-402.
- [84] Teslenko, A. (2014). Dilemmas of sociocultural identification of young kazakhs. *Vestnik Udmurt university*, 10(1), 5-26.

- [85] The first world forum of kazakhs “kazakhstan truth”. (2015, November 15). Retrieved from [http://www.iie.kz/?page\\_id=408&lang=ru](http://www.iie.kz/?page_id=408&lang=ru).
- [86] The bulletin of the national academy of sciences of the republic of Kazakhstan. (2015, November 11). Retrieved from <http://www.rmebrk.kz/journals/pdf>
- [87] *The OMRI annual survey of Eastern Europe and the former Soviet Union. Building democracy*. New York: Open media research institute 1995.
- [88] Thomas, C. (2002). The end of the transition paradigm. *Journal of democracy*, 13 (1), 330-339.
- [89] Abkhazia and South Ossetia: the clash of russian and georgian interests. (2015, January 14). Retrieved from <https://www.google.com.cy/url>
- [90] Troitsky, V. (2010). Kazakhstan's foreign policy: formation and development. *Reporter of Tomsk state university*, 4(337), 18-30.
- [91] Kazakhstan speeds up de-russification. (2015, November 12). Retrieved from <http://www.pravda.ru/world/formerussr/other/28-01-2011/1065025-kazakhstan-0/>.
- [92] Prospects of formation of Kazakhstani people. (2015,10 November). Retrieved from <http://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/perspektivy-formirovaniya-kazahstanskogo>
- [93] Von, B., & Armin, S. H., Utz, R., & Hanschmann, F. (2005). State-Building, nation-building, and constitutional politics in post-conflict situations: conceptual

clarifications and an appraisal of different approaches. *Max Planck Yearbook of United Nations Law Online*, 9 (1), 577-579.

[94] War in Donbas it is inter-ethnic conflict of russian people of Ukraine and fascist ukrainian nationalists. Buzina's works (2016, October 15). Retrieved from <http://www.buzina.org/blogs/entry/>

[95] Wayne, N. (2006). *Negotiating nationalism: nation-building, federalism, and secession in the multinational state*. New York: OXFORD University press.

[96] Weeks, T. R. (2004). Russification: word and practice 1863-1914. *Proceedings of the American philosophical society*, 148(4), 471-489.

[97] The influence of migration flows for ethnic picture of the northern region Kazakhstan during development of virgin lands. (2016, March 13). Retrieved from <http://www.enu.kz/repository/repository2013/VLIANIEMIGRACIONNYHPOTOK>

[98] Russian question in Kazakhstan. (2015, November 21). Retrieved from [http://www.ng.ru/cis/2001-05-24/5\\_kazakhstan.html](http://www.ng.ru/cis/2001-05-24/5_kazakhstan.html).

[99] Zadorozhnyi, A. (2014). The consequences of the annexation of the Crimea by the Russian federation for the international legal order. *National judicial journal*, 45(3), 292-296.

[100] Zerkin, D. (1998). Basics of conflict: lectures. *Feniks*, 480(4), 30-54.

[102] Ziyadullayev, N. (2006). Russia's cooperation with Central Asia in the framework of regional organizations (Eurasec, SCO and others.). *Rossiski Vneshneekonomicheski Vestnik*, 1(10), 32-40.

[103] Zurcher, C. (2007). *The post-Soviet wars: rebellion, ethnic conflict, and nationhood in the Caucasus*. New York and London: New York university press.